City University of New York (CUNY)
CUNY Academic Works

Publications and Research
John Jay College of Criminal Justice

2015

The Intermediate Sphere in North Indian Music Culture: Between and Beyond 'Folk' and 'Classical'

Peter L. Manuel
CUNY Graduate Center

How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!

More information about this work at: https://academicworks.cuny.edu/jj_pubs/300
Discover additional works at: https://academicworks.cuny.edu

This work is made publicly available by the City University of New York (CUNY).
Contact: AcademicWorks@cuny.edu

The Intermediate Sphere in North Indian Music Culture: Between and Beyond "Folk" and "Classical"

Peter Manuel / John Jay College and the Graduate Center of the City University of New York

Abstract. If in discourse about traditional music in North India, the notions of "folk" and "classical" continue to be widely used, in this essay I posit the existence of an "intermediate sphere," comprising a heterogeneous set of traditional music genres that, in different ways, shares features with both folk and classical realms. I suggest five categories in this socio-musical stratum and provide brief glimpses of some of their constituents and distinguishing features, including the distinctive sorts of theory they embody and elite patronage that sustains them. I conclude with observations about historical changes in the status of this sphere in general.

In the music culture of North India, there exists a vast and rich stratum of traditional music genres that resist facile categorization as either classical or folk. Some of these idioms are typically referred to as light-classical or semi-classical; or they are described as being "between folk and classical," or they are likened to a "regional classical music," or they are noted to be in some way related or similar to classical music, while being clearly distinct from it. Other genres are not commonly spoken of in such terms but can in fact be seen to exhibit, to some marked degree, certain of the features that distinguish art music. This congeries of entities is internally heterogeneous, its constituents varying widely not only in form, style, region, and status but also in the specific *sorts* of affinities they may have to art music, which may or may not involve such particular features as presence of rāg and tāl. Not surprisingly, there is no indigenous umbrella term for this set of diverse music forms.

© 2015 by the Society for Ethnomusicology

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

At the same time, this stratum of music, I contend, is not entirely resistant to being ordered, theorized, and even historicized, in a way that justifies its being designated by a specific term, for which I propose the admittedly inelegant label "intermediate sphere." In this article I do not attempt a comprehensive survey of genres in this category, as such an endeavor would be well beyond my expertise; nor do I seek to somehow dignify this stratum of music, although I do hope to suggest, first, its validity as a coherent, if diverse, taxonomic entity, and second, its importance in North Indian music culture. Above all, my intent is to impose some sort of conceptual order on what is otherwise an unruly aggregation of idioms. Hence, I present a set of categories that aspires to accommodate the diverse genres that merit inclusion in this sphere; I briefly discuss representative genres in each category; and I offer some more general observations about them, especially in terms of their uses of nomenclature, the form of music theory in which they are grounded, their changing historical status, and other matters. I focus in particular on genres which, if related to Hindustani music, have existed as parallel rather than derivative forms, and also on genres that are informed by a kind of music theory that is *distinct* from mainstream rāg and tāl theory. I conclude by suggesting how two quite different modern genres occupy some of the socio-musical space formerly filled by traditional intermediary genres, while illustrating how the realm of "the folk" itself diminishes as Indian society continues to modernize.

Definitions, Criteria, Continua

In discourse about music in North India, notions of "classical" and "folk" music—in North Indian languages, *shāstriya sangīt* and *lok gīt* (lit., folk song)—have long been in widespread and conventional usage, and indeed would be regarded as indispensable, commonplace, and unproblematic taxonomies by most who use them. However, in recent years, scholars—both Indian and Western—have problematized this dyad, and especially the idea of "the classical," questioning its historical depth, its analytical usefulness, and its imbrication in power dynamics. For its part, the utility of categorizing any music as folk music could be questioned in the context of contemporary societies penetrated by the mass media, modern education systems, and typically modern self-consciousness about "tradition." Such interrogations could be seen as heightening, rather than obviating, the call by Stuart Blackburn and A.K. Ramanujan, in an oft-cited 1986 volume, for "new ways of conceptualizing the folk/classical continuity in India" (p. 19). In this article, in focusing on the intermediate sectors of this continuity in the realm of traditional musics, I invoke rather than seek to destabilize the folk/classical distinction, but I also endeavor to indicate with some specificity and rigor the particular socio-musical continua and criteria that define this

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

gamut, with the aim of ordering some of the varied genres that lie around the centers rather than at the antipodes.

In 1980 Harold Powers offered a set of cross-cultural criteria for traditional art music that has since often been cited and may be applied here as well. In brief, his "diagnostic questions" would seek to distinguish as "classical" a music tradition which is purveyed by performers who are regarded as specialists and who have been extensively trained, and whose art "conforms to a music-theoretical norm which is part of a Great Tradition," implying a textually grounded pan-regional standard; this music, further, is "conceived as an independent domain that can stand on its own as the centerpiece of a cultural performance," and it is patronized by an elite whose members profess connoisseurship (1980:11). Powers proceeded to illustrate how the "Great Traditions" of Hindustani and Karnatak music cohere to these criteria, in contrast to putative counterparts elsewhere in the Muslim world.

In the South Asian context at least two other, somewhat more restrictive emic criteria have traditionally been employed in distinguishing the realm of art music. While grounding in some sort of theory constitutes a basic cross-cultural criterion, in South Asia one can note a more particular theoretical base, specifically, that pertaining to rāg and tāl. In Powers's formulation, it is this theoretical basis, rather than style, that is the most salient feature of art music. Thus, in his magisterial 1981 *New Grove* entry on India, he writes: "Musical style and artistic value are not in question for this criterion: a simple, virtually unadorned Telegu devotional song in an accepted south Indian raga is 'classical', while an elaborate rendition on the sitar of the tune for a Bengali devotional *kirtan* is not" (1981:IX, 72).

While this criterion has its logic, in Indian musical discourse and thought an elaborate style is often associated with art music, however problematic it may be as a systematic "diagnostic criterion"; hence the sitar rendering of a Bengali kīrtan tune that is regarded as being "in a classical [or light-classical] style" would have certain distinctive features, including a soloistic presentation, a level of technical polish and virtuosity, and the presence of some degree of improvisation. That such features might also be abundant in performances of non-classical vernacular musics does not necessarily invalidate their currency as informal emic markers of classicism.

Another somewhat distinctively South Asian criterion involves the degree of emphasis on lyric content rather than manipulation of formal features such as melody and rhythm. This hierarchy of vocal music genres can be seen as a pyramid, with abstractly musical classical genres at the apex, and overwhelmingly text-driven (*shabd-pradhān*) genres on the "light" or folk base. In the "pure" classical khyāl, the text, although lexical, in performance constitutes little more than a concatenation of syllables, such that the aesthetic emphasis

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 84 1/6/15 10:37 AM

lies overwhelmingly on exposition of rāg and tāl. Such a focus is diametrically distinct from traditional folk genres such as strophic women's wedding songs or narrative epics in which the melody is often a simple repeated stock tune serving as a scaffolding on which to hang the lyrics.

In contrast to art music, "folk music" is generally defined in negative terms, especially as that traditional or neo-traditional music which is not dependent on elite patronage, and is not grounded in a body of explicit theory, such as might be articulated by performers or patrons. Conventional conceptions might further situate folk music in hierarchic rather than classless societies, such that, for example, it would not be customary to think of pre-modern New Guinean highland music as "folk music." Likewise, while folk music may persist in modern societies, it is perhaps best conceived of as originating in societies, or sectors thereof, that have not been penetrated by modern commercial mass media, which exponentially enhance exposure to other forms of music, including commercial popular ones, and which may engender such dramatically new and expanded forms of collective and socio-musical self-awareness. Thus, in modern societies, the utility of the category of folk music may be increasingly dubious, as surviving traditional genres become increasingly sustained by institutions and frozen as staged "folklore," folk music's once celebrated role as "people's music" is usurped by commercial popular music,[1] and new forms of participatory music evolve in processes easily documented by the mass media and comfortably transcending class distinctions. While these and other considerations inspired Bohlman (1988:xviii), in his monograph on folk music, to opt not to hazard a definition of the category, in such a country as India, it remains a useful designation for a vast and diverse body of music conforming to the criteria I have suggested.

In India, much traditional music falls unproblematically into the conventional categories suggested here; the khyāl sung in a concert hall neatly fulfills all the criteria of classical music, while the melodically repetitive work-song droned by peasant women in a field meets all the qualifications of folk music. However, all the criteria which categorize these musics are best regarded not as establishing antipodal binaries, but rather as continua, or hierarchic pyramids, whose central sectors accommodate a great variety and abundance of music types. Thus, for example, in the intermediate sectors of the gamut pertaining to relative importance of the text can be found a range of genres that are text-driven to different degrees and in different ways.

Hence, proceeding "downward" from the strictly classical khyāl, in light-classical thumri the text has some semantic importance, but only insofar as it is musically interpreted in the process of melodic-affective improvisation called *bol banāo* (discussed below). Somewhat lower in the hierarchy would lie the ghazal-song, with its greater emphasis on text and its typically less extensive bol banāo. *Tarannum*—in which the ghazal's melodic rendering consists merely of

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

an unadorned stock tune—is even further removed from the realm of art music. As I shall argue, however, in genres like *Hathrasi rasiya* the prosodic element, though in many respects predominant, is highly theorized in ways that inform the melodic rendering and could be said to constitute an aspect of music theory per se.

In a similar sort of continuum, while Powers's notion of "elite" would apply quintessentially to groups such as the Mughal nobility or the modern Indian upper class, in the village context the gentry might consist of the land-owning Brahman family that has a brick-and-mortar (*pakka*) house instead of a mud hut, and that employs a sweeper and a cook. By the same token, a degree of "connoisseurship" might be imputed not only to the educated urban aesthete, but also, in its way, to the drunken, cavorting farmer who slaps a ten-rupee note onto the sweaty forehead of a tassa drummer at a wedding procession, or, conversely, who hurls a half-eaten banana at an out-of-tune *nauṭanki* singer. Even the Ahir farmer who kicks an errant *nagāra* drummer in the head may be displaying a sort of discernment that would not be operant in his reactions to, for instance, a work song being droned by some laborers in a field. Further—and without engaging the arguably oxymoronic notion of "implicit theory"[2]—the scope of explicitly articulated theory might be extended to include such entities as: elaborate prosodic theory that has musical ramifications and applications; the extensive use of standardized names for different melodies and rhythms (even if performers are unable to describe these in terms of scale degrees, numbers of beats, and the like); the inclusion, in this nomenclature, of terms that are based on formal features (e.g., *deṛhtāl*—"one-and-a-half tāls/rhythms"); and a certain sort of evident historical and/or formal relation to Hindustani music. As I shall stress below, several genres in the intermediate sphere can be seen to exhibit forms of theory that, rather than representing diluted or jumbled versions of Hindustani rāg and tāl, are thoroughly distinctive. Some may also involve archaic or regional rāgs or modal entities (such as forms of Gujarati *ḍhāl*[3]) that did not enter into the rāg repertoire that became relatively standardized in the twentieth century.

At the same time, the genres in this intermediate sphere, in contrast to Hindustani music, tend to be regional rather than pan-regional, less grounded in explicitly articulated theory, more text-driven, and in some cases, rather than being presented as autonomous arts, as musical entities they are often ancillary to ritual or narrative action. Finally, some of them are emically categorized, whether problematically or not, as "folk song" (*lok gīt*) by commentators. I believe that it is most fruitful to envision the intermediate sphere as comprising genres that either (like *haveli sangīt*) may be informed by conventional rāg and tāl theory but have for centuries constituted distinct, parallel traditions to Hindustani music, or else (like Hathrasi rasiya) are grounded in a form of theory that is wholly separate from that of North Indian classical music.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 86 1/6/15 10:37 AM

I also delimit the category to traditional genres whose origins predate the advent of the electronic mass media (in the form of phonographs, around 1900). These various criteria thus exclude the stage bhajan whose singer who introduces classical flourishes, and the *Rabindra sangīt* song (or, for that matter, the film tune) loosely based on a rāg like Pīlu. Of particular interest, I would contend, are the various genres that are informed by a sort of music theory that is wholly distinct from that of Hindustani music. In some senses, my conception of the category corresponds roughly to that articulated by Kathryn Hansen in reference to nauṭanki theater, which, she clarifies, is "intermediary" in terms of its "intermediate level of complexity . . . between simpler village-based forms and either an elaborate classical or an urban theater," and secondly, in its functioning "as a mediating agency between different populations, regions, classes, and ways of life" (1992:43).

The survey presented in the following pages does not pretend to be comprehensive. Rather, it draws from secondary sources, and from my own fieldwork conducted in India, off and on, over the course of the last thirty-five years. Some of the genres in question, such as haveli sangīt, *samāj gāyan*, and Rajasthani Langa/Manganiyār music, are well documented. Others, such as Hathrasi rasiya, have garnered only cursory description in inaccessible writings and have been subjects of my own research. I do draw extensively on traditions that I have personally studied, including thumri and ghazal, music of the Braj region, Banarsi nagāra drumming, Maharasthrian ḍhol-tasha drumming, and also Indo-Caribbean local-classical music and tassa drumming, which, I argue, are worthy constituents of the intermediate sphere of broader North Indian music culture. The range of my focus excludes not only South India, but also vast areas of North and central India, though I suspect that regional experts could point out several counterparts to some of the genres I discuss that could be found in these areas.

The Intermediate Sphere: Categories

The numerous genres that merit inclusion in the intermediate category are diverse not only in region and form, but also in the ways that they conform to the criteria I have adumbrated above. However, most of the genres in question lend themselves to being grouped, with various qualifications and ambiguities, into five categories. A few of these overlap with a taxonomy proposed by folklorist Vijay Verma in reference to Rajasthani music, especially genres in which, as he puts it, "the folk meets the classical" (1987:5–7). Like Verma, I invoke, in some of my categories, the notion of stylistic "sophistication," which is judiciously eschewed in Powers's scheme, but would be a common enough criterion in informal South Asian discourse.

The categories I propose are the following:

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 87 1/6/15 10:37 AM

1. *Light-classical music*, comprising the core genres of thumri and ghazal, as well as elaborated, stage renditions of folk-derived genres such as *kajri* and *lāvni*.[4] Since the mid-twentieth century, in many respects this semi-classical category—especially as represented by thumri—has been largely absorbed into the realm of classical music, grounded, however loosely, in rāg and tāl, and performed as stage concert items by specialists well versed in theory, usually as a light "dessert" following a khyāl. However, as I shall discuss, music in this category occupied its own autonomous milieu before this period.
2. *Sophisticated professional folksong*, as performed by trained (usually hereditary) specialists, such as Langas, Manganiyārs, qawwāls, and—in the Indic Caribbean—"local-classical" singers, often in a display-oriented virtuoso style with some stylistic, theoretical, and structural elements derived from Hindustani music, alongside other features distinct from that music.[5]
3. *Dhrūpad-related devotional genres*, especially Vaishnavite haveli sangīt and samāj gayan, Assamese *borgīt*, and Sikh *gurmat sangīt*. Stylistically, these may range from, on the one hand, items which are quite close to classical concert dhrūpad (or, occasionally, khyāl), to, on the other hand, congregational or domestic hymns rendered in a plain, unadorned style. Nevertheless, they share a use of compositions grounded in Hindustani rāgs (albeit often archaic or idiosyncratic versions thereof), as well as structural and historical links to dhrūpad. Due to their considerable antiquity, they are best seen as parallel entities to Hindustani music—and especially as members of a broader dhrūpad family—rather than being derivative forms.
4. *Sophisticated prosody-driven genres*, grounded in forms of poetic and metrical theory with melodic ramifications; particularly prominent in this category are such genres as Hathrasi rasiya, Mirzapuri kajri, and related forms of vernacular theater music (especially that of the *nauṭanki/swāng/bhagat/khyāl* complex).
5. *Sophisticated drum traditions*, as performed by specialists (whether professional or not), whose repertoire includes an extensive set of named rhythms, skilled rendering of which is valued by connoisseurs. This category could be regarded as a subset of number two above, except that some of the distinctive features, such as latent theoretical concepts, may be wholly distinct from those of classical music.

These five categories and some of their representative constituents merit more expansive discussion. My goal in this section is not to provide a descriptive survey of these genres, but rather to first provide cursory comments on the nature of their status in the intermediate sphere, followed by some interpretive perspectives.

Light-Classical Music

The most familiar and perhaps quintessential category within the intermediate sphere is light-classical or semi-classical vocal music, whose most characteristic genres since the early 1800s have been thumri, ghazal, and *dādra*. As vocal idioms, these genres have as their core expressive technique the process of bol

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

banāo (lit., to make or decorate the text), in which nuances of sentiment latent in a given text fragment are brought out via melodic elaboration (Manuel 1989: 121–44). Thus, for example, the singer might repeat a phrase such as "*piya bina*" ("without my lover") in different melodic patterns, suggesting, in the process, different affective shades of latent meaning and interpretation.[6] The emphasis on bol banāo rather than purely abstract elaboration of rāg, or virtuoso display, defines these genres as light in comparison to khyāl and dhrūpad. For their part, as mentioned above, the light-classical genres themselves differ in the extent to which they are word-oriented. In thumri, the text is short (two to four lines) and is not expected to be of such literary merit that it could stand on its own as poetry; it is effective only as a vehicle for bol banāo, which is executed in an elaborate, leisurely manner—informed by rāg development in *baṛā khyāl*—which requires considerable melodic resources, knowledge of appropriate rāg, and improvisatory skill. Ghazal, by contrast, is more text-driven and places accordingly less demands on the singer. The ghazal lyric itself is longer (typically four to six couplets), is intended to be able to stand by itself as a literary work, and is typically of some poetic merit (though even inferior, hackneyed verses are not only common, but might make effective song texts). The bol banāo in ghazal is usually shorter, and is often limited to a few quasi-improvised flourishes rendered on the first line in each couplet after the initial one (Manuel 1988–89).

Thumri and ghazal enjoyed a prodigious heyday stretching from the nineteenth-century Lucknow nawabi period through the mid-twentieth century. Together with other light items, the two genres constituted central salon genres in a distinct socio-musical milieu of music and dance soirées, patronized by connoisseurs and performed by specialists (most typically courtesans) in these arts. While in the nineteenth century these genres may not have been explicitly described as they are now, as "light-classical," contemporary chronicles (e.g., Imam 1959) do indicate their intermediate status, below that of khyāl and dhrūpad. From the mid-twentieth-century decades, however, this socio-musical realm largely evaporated as the urban music scene polarized into dichotomous realms of concert classical music and less prestigious idioms. In the process, the two sister genres parted ways, as the classical concert format accommodated a gentrified form of thumri as a light "dessert," and ghazal was exiled altogether. The courtesan world itself disappeared or degenerated, as the best singers reinvented themselves as classical "artistes," and those unable to make this transition often had to resort to prostitution in order to survive, thereby further denigrating their status. From the 1970s a new, bowdlerized form of "crossover" ghazal came into vogue, combining aspects of light-classical and commercial pop styles; such items are still performed in concerts (perhaps alongside "stage" bhajans and other light genres) and in mass-mediated contexts such as Urdu-language television channels (Manuel 1991, 2010).

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

After or in place of thumri—and in earlier times, ghazal—, a light-classical set might also include stylized renditions of regional genres, such as kajri and *mānḍ*. In the Hindustani concert context, these items would exhibit a certain stylistic homogeneity, in their folk-like emphasis on a catchy, relatively simple tune, with a lively rhythmic feel, usually set to medium-tempo *kaharva* or dādra tāl. These salon or courtly versions of mānḍ and kajri also evolved in similar fashions for their respective elites, primarily of Rajasthan and the Banaras region, as stylized, sophisticated renderings of local folk idioms. In other respects, and aside from their respective use of Marwari and Bhojpuri regional languages, these two genres differ. Mānḍ is primarily a mode or light rāg, evolving as abstracted from a set of core traditional songs (such as the familiar "*Kesariya bālum*") sharing a distinctive melodic character. From the nineteenth century, courtly musicians in Rajasthan, Gujarat and elsewhere composed original songs in this "mānḍ," which they would render in light-classical style, with improvised flourishes and tāns. Mānḍ thus came to be regarded as a genre, though it is not distinctive in terms of style per se (see Verma 1987:81–82). Classical instrumentalists and vocalists from any region may perform it as a light rāg, though as a vocal idiom it should have a text in a Western Indian vernacular—most typically Marwari—rather than Braj Bhāsha. Kajri, by contrast, is a rainy-season folksong genre of the Bhojpuri region. Like mānḍ, it came to be performed in stylized, light-classical form in stage and salon contexts by singers from the *pūrab* region (eastern Uttar Pradesh and Bihar), most characteristically—but not invariably—using folk-derived melodies. Other pan-regional genres, such as stage bhajans, as well as regional genres such as Marathi lāvni, could also be performed in a loosely classicized style, in which a trained soloist interjects improvised flourishes and tans conforming to rāgs.

From a simplistic and distorting perspective, thumri, ghazal, and related genres could be regarded as distinct from pure classical music primarily in *quantitative* senses according to their positions on the diagnostic continua suggested above. That is, for example, thumri may involve rāg and tāl, step-by-step melodic development, and elements of virtuoso style, but to a quantitatively lesser degree than khyāl. In other respects, however, thumri and ghazal are not merely lighter than khyāl, but they are also *qualitatively* distinct. The process of bol banāo, for example, is completely absent in khyāl, and, as mentioned, thumri and ghazal in their heyday were focal genres in their own socio-musical milieu (which might retrospectively be termed light-classical), rather than simply being lesser genres in the classical concert scene. Further, the technique of bol banāo has its own distinctive sort of theoretical basis, which many singers and cognoscenti are able or inclined to verbally articulate in their own manner. In my own research on thumri, various performers, such as Munawar Ali Khan, readily offered such verbal descriptions, and Rita Ganguly did so at prodigious length. The excerpt

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

I quoted in print (Manuel 1990:141–42) constituted only a tiny portion of her insightful, extended, and in many ways systematic discursus; in that discussion she expressed her annoyance with khyāl singers who butchered thumri by treating it merely as a "light" genre in which one can take indulgent liberties with rāgs, rather than understanding it as a genre with its own distinctive expressive basis, specifically in bol banāo. In this sense, thumri and ghazal exhibit a significant feature of intermediate sphere genres that, I will argue, is even more apparent in other constituents of this category. Specifically, while these idioms may or may not share some theoretical grounding with Hindustani music (as does thumri in its use of rāg and tāl), they may also be informed by a certain sort of theory that is wholly distinct.

Sophisticated Professional Folksong

Vijay Verma, mentioned above, offered his own four-part taxonomy of the heterogeneous entities comprising folk music, *viz*.: (1) "true or pure folk," quintessentially comprising relatively simple songs, performed collectively by nonspecialists for their own enjoyment, without a sense of display or elaboration, and without any particular relation to Hindustani rāg and tāl; (2) "sophisticated folk," as represented by "improved" versions of such songs performed solo, for an audience, by urban specialists versed in Hindustani music; this category could include light-classical versions of kajri and mānḍ; (3) "common professional" music, connoting the traditional music performed by such hereditary professionals as *ḍhāḍhis, jogis, kalbelias*, and others, which, though perhaps sophisticated in its way, lacks any relation to classical music or elements of theory in general; and (4) finally, "sophisticated professional" music, performed with conscious elements of display, elaboration, and virtuosity by professionals who have some smattering of classical theory, or whose music reflects some historical engagement with it (Verma 1987:5–6).

In my own proposed taxonomy, I subsume Verma's "sophisticated folk" into the category of light-classical music, while also including in the intermediate sphere his final category of "sophisticated professional" music, with its showy, virtuosic style and perhaps idiosyncratically absorbed elements of Hindustani music theory. As Verma notes, such features are conspicuous in the music of the Langas and Manganiyārs (Manganhārs) of western Rajasthan, who thus constitute exemplars of this latter category. Langa and Manganiyār music has been well documented by scholars, who have taken due interest in its affinities with Hindustani music. As discussed especially by Verma (1987:6–7) and Neuman et al. (2006:93–111), these include: rāg theory, involving many modal cognates with North Indian counterparts; a rāg-time theory; conceptions of pitch hierarchies within given rāgs; use of classical-style *tān* and *gamak*, often displayed in a

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

virtuoso manner; inclusion of some Hindustani compositions in the repertoire; and connoisseurship on the part of patrons, some of whom constitute local elites (see Kothari, in Bharucha 2003:225). Moreover, while Manganiyārs and Langas typically perform at life-cycle events such as weddings, their presentations are in most respects autonomous musical events and are appreciated as such. At the same time, as has been noted (e.g., by Neuman et al. 2005:94–5), Langa and Manganiyār music cannot be regarded as classical per se. For example, the aforementioned elements of explicitly articulated theory are unevenly known and inconsistently verbalized, they generally do not encompass such entities as scalar degrees and beat-counts, and the rāgs are better regarded as modal categorizations of existing songs rather than abstract bases for elaboration.

Langa and Manganiyār music evolved as the product of a particular historical condition, in which, on the one hand, some musicians over the generations had some contact, however irregular and partial, with Hindustani performers, but on the other, they operated in a social and geographical milieu isolated in such a way that their art evolved along parallel rather than simply derivative lines. Hence, the presence of "marginal survivals" in the rāg repertoire of these musicians.[7] Given the distinctive circumstances of its evolution, this music does not necessarily have close counterparts in other regions of South Asia. A somewhat similar but idiosyncratic confluence of classical and folk elements can be found in the *kāfi* music of Sindh (Qureshi 1981), which, like western Rajasthan, has been in many ways isolated from the Indian hinterland, though traditionally dotted with provincial courts and shrines that might employ both local singers as well as visiting Hindustani musicians. The modal repertoire of Sindhi kāfi and *wāi* singers includes over thirty rāgs (or *surs*), which appear to derive from regional folksongs (e.g., "Hīr-Rānjho"), regional rāgs (e.g., Rāno, Āsā), and distinctive (and in some cases archaic) versions of Hindustani rāgs (e.g., Husaini, Pirbhāti, and Shri in Khamāj ṭhāṭ)(Brian Bond, p.c.).

Geographical isolation also conditioned the development of another genre that I would place in the sophisticated professional category, namely, the "local-classical" music of Trinidad and Guyana. As I have discussed elsewhere (Manuel 2000a, 2000b), this music evolved among indentured immigrants from India (arriving during 1845–1917) and their descendants. Somewhat like Langa/Manganiyār music, it can be seen as the idiosyncratic product of musicians, geographically isolated from the North Indian hinterland, who had some partial exposure to and familiarity with Hindustani music. In particular, this exposure came in the form of immigrants possessing some fragmentary knowledge of classical and light-classical music, coupled with phonograph records from the early twentieth century and Hindi songbooks published in the decades around 1900. The music then evolved in its own idiosyncratic neo-traditional fashion, without any particular subsequent influence either from Afro-Caribbean creole culture or Hindustani music.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 92 1/6/15 10:37 AM

Like Langa/Manganiyār music, Indo-Caribbean local-classical music exhibits clear affinities with North Indian music. These include idiosyncratic forms of dhrūpad and thumri, performance as an autonomous musical art form, and a tradition of connoisseurship among knowledgeable patrons. Also like Langa/Manganiyār music, this music exhibits some vestigial marginal survivals from pre-modern art music, including terms and entities idiosyncratically adapted from nineteenth-century immigrants and songbooks. At the same time, local-classical musicians, like their Rajasthani counterparts, generally do not conceptualize their art in terms of such formal features as beat-counts or scalar degrees (except insofar as the latter involve positions on instruments).[8]

While further comments will be made about the genres in this category, at this point it may be useful to reiterate two aspects of their musicality. First, these genres can be performed and enjoyed as autonomous, stand-alone entities, rather than being purely ancillary to, for example, worship or music theater. Secondly, a considerable (if unquantifiable) portion of their aesthetic appeal lies precisely in the way in which they incorporate formal musical features bearing affinities to Hindustani music. As vocal songs with texts, a Langa rendering of "Hīchki" or a Trinidadian thumri could be said to be text-driven to some extent, but unlike the genres in the light-classical category, there is no process of bol banāo. At the same time, the Hindustani-like features of a rendition of "Hīchki" (e.g., its virtuoso tans) or of a Trinidadian thumri (e.g., its formal structure) are not mere decorative add-ons to a text-driven folksong or devotional song, but instead are structural elements. In this respect they differ from genres in the subsequent category, which, however, have their own sort of quasi-classical elements that distinguish them as constituents of the intermediate sphere.

Dhrūpad-Related Devotional Musics

Hinduism, Islam, and Sikhism—the three primary religions of North India—have each fostered devotional music genres that exhibit diverse sorts of structural (rather than purely stylistic) affinities with Hindustani music and can be said to constitute significant members of the intermediate sphere of South Asian music. Particularly prominent in this regard are two forms of Vaishnavite devotional song which are best regarded as members of a dhrūpad family of genres, of which the "classical" dhrūpad of court and concert hall constitutes the most public, pan-regional, and elaborate constituent, but is not necessarily the original and seminal form.

Vaishnavaite havelī sangīt (or simply *kīrtan*) and samāj gāyan, are associated, respectively, with the Pushṭimārg and Rādhāvallabh *sampradāyas* (sects) originating in the Braj region (around Mathura). Both genres have been documented thoroughly (especially Ho 2013, Beck 2011, Thielemann 1998, 2001, Gaston 1997, Bhatt 1983) and need not be extensively described here. Both appear to have emerged

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 93 1/6/15 10:37 AM

in a roughly contemporaneous fashion as regional, devotional counterparts to the predominantly secular dhrūpad which, after coalescing in the court of Man Singh Tomar (1486–1518) of Gwalior, went on to become the predominant pan-regional art music genre of the Mughal courts. Both are worthy constituents of what should be considered as the broader dhrūpad family of genres, sharing that idiom's four-part composition structure (*sthāī-antara-sancārī-abhog*), predominant use of *cautāl* and *dhamār* tāls, and solid grounding in classical rāg, with associated time-theory. Both genres have evolved in a largely parallel rather than derivative fashion, although they are historically related to mainstream court and concert dhrūpad (in ways that remain enigmatic; but see Ho 2013). Hence, for example, the Vaishnavite modal repertoire includes idiosyncratic and archaic versions of current Hindustani rāgs. Pushṭimārg havelī sangīt is most typically performed by a solo singer with *pakhāwaj* accompaniment; it is generally, but not invariably, rendered in a less elaborate style than concert dhrūpad, and its performers, even if occasionally trained in Hindustani music, insist on the primacy of devotional sentiment rather than abstract exposition of rāg and tāl. It is performed primarily as ritual music in Pushṭimārg temples in the Braj region, Gujarat, and Rajasthan. As Ho observes,[9] several haveli sangīt singers explicitly identify their art as a Braj classical music tradition, and more specifically, as a variety of dhrūpad which is as legitimate as the courtly and concert dhrūpad with which it was once closely linked.

For its part, samāj gāyan is generally sung congregationally, often in a responsorial format, in an unelaborated manner, and thus bears less stylistic affinity with concert dhrūpad. Further, its texts are often longer than those of the latter, and it may be set to tāls other than cautāl and dhamār. It is daily heard in the Rādhāvallabh temples in the Braj region, and regularly in branch temples elsewhere in North India. Like Hindustani music, both Vaishnavite genres evolved under the patronage of elites, being historically performed not only in well-endowed Pushṭimārg and Rādhāvallabh temples but also for local gentries and holy men who enjoyed pontifical lifestyles.

A similarly classicized devotional song tradition is Sikh gurmat sangīt. Like Vaishnavite kīrtan and samāj gāyan, the gurmat sangīt tradition commenced in the sixteenth century, as Guru Nanak (1469–1539), the founder of Sikhism, composed several hundred devotional songs set to nineteen contemporary rāgs, as first compiled in the *Adi Granth*. Several of his successors in the line of gurus further enriched the repertoire with hundreds of new hymns, which, together with verses by Hindu and Muslim saints, were compiled under Guru Gobind Singh (1666–1708), the tenth and last guru, as the *Shri Guru Granth Sahib* (*SGGS*), which constitutes the central scripture in Sikhism.

The hymns (*shabd*) use a variety of musical, metrical, and poetic forms (as well as languages), and are set to some thirty-one rāgs (to be performed at their appropriate times of day) and several dozen tāls. As with haveli sangīt and samāj

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

gāyan, several of the rāgs are archaic or regional, and many of the tāls appear to be unique to the gurmat sangīt tradition. The terminology of the *SGGS* is also distinctive and idiosyncratic, comprising a variety of prosodic names, and musicological terms such as *ghar* (lit., house), which appears to categorize types of tāl. Many of the hymns reflect structural affinities to dhrūpad. Several are in four-part form (sthāi-antara-sancāri-abhog), set to tāls such as *āda cautāl* and *cartāl*, and would traditionally be accompanied by mrdangam or pakhāwaj. Several twentieth-century *kīrtanīs* (singers) of Amritsar were disciples of the Talwandi *gharāna* of *kandar bāni* dhrūpad (Kalra n.p. ch. 4).[10]

The *SGGS* hymns are sung today in a variety of styles. Most commonly, a solo vocalist sings to the accompaniment of harmonium and tabla, in a relatively unadorned style in which the devotional sentiment rather than purity of rāg or virtuoso display is foregrounded. Use of film tunes is common, however disparaged by purist revivalists. In competitions, Sikh hymns may be performed by trained classical vocalists, in a dhrūpad or *choṭā khyāl* style, with obvious emphasis on virtuosity and exposition of rāg (see Mansukhani 1982: part II). As with haveli sangīt, one can thus posit a continuum of gurmat sangīt styles, ranging from those clearly emphasizing devotional sentiment, and adhering to the distinctive *SGGS* rāg repertoire, to those unambiguously in the realm of modern Hindustani music.

Vaishnavite borgīt of Assam might also be regarded as a subsidiary member of this genre group, deriving from the songs of Assamese saint Srimanta Sankardeva, who made pilgrimages to North India during the same seminal period of the late 1400s. Assamese scholars such as Gogoi regard borgīt as a form of dhrūpad, noting its grounding in rāg and tāl theory, the associations of these rāgs with times of day, the short ālāps that precede songs, and other factors (Gogoi n.d.).[11] The rāgs themselves appear to comprise idiosyncratic, regional, or archaic versions of Hindustani counterparts.[12]

In a somewhat different category of sophisticated devotional music is qawwāli. Unlike the other genres mentioned in this category, qawwāli songs have no evolutionary relationship to dhrūpad (although there is a historical link to khyāl), nor are they necessarily set to any particular rāg. Although some qawwālis and certainly passages therein might be sung to particular rāgs, there is no independent rāg repertoire such as can be found in genres like haveli sangīt. The prevailing tāl is what Hindustani musicians would call kaharva rather than any tāl used in mainstream classical music. Further, qawwāli, in its quintessential and most traditional form, is Sufi devotional music, archetypically performed in the courtyard of a shrine. Moreover, the text retains a certain primacy in all forms of qawwāli, even in the substantial amount of qawwāli that is secular rather than devotional. However, many qawwāls have some familiarity with Hindustani music, and may enliven their singing with virtuoso *tāns* and *sargam* passages. A few qawwāls, such as Nusrat Fateh Ali Khan, have also sung khyāl on occasion.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 95 1/6/15 10:37 AM

Sophisticated Prosody-driven Genres

Thus far the genres we have looked at qualify as constituents of the intermediate sphere by virtue of their exhibiting some affinities with North Indian classical music, most notably in the realm of rāg and tāl theory, compositional structure, and certain stylistic features, such as virtuoso tāns. North India is also host to various music genres that are grounded in varieties of prosodic theory that bear no relation to Hindustani music theory, although they are rooted in their own classical poetic tradition. Although this theory primarily concerns texts rather than abstract musical parameters, insofar as it does have musical ramifications it can be considered, by extension, an incipient or ancillary form of music theory. Coupled with a showy, soloistic vocal style, professional stage performance format, and traditional patronage by local elites, such theory differentiates these music genres from less elaborated forms of folk music and qualifies them for inclusion in the intermediate sphere.

In the North Indian heartland, perhaps the prime example of such a genre is Hathrasi rasiya. Mirzapuri kajri and Haryanvi rāgini also exhibit some features which might qualify them for inclusion in this category, but these genres appear to be less formalized, and further, have never, to my knowledge, been studied as musical entities, either in Hindi or English publications. I will hence largely confine my remarks to Hathrasi rasiya, which has been briefly described, without musical analysis, in a few Hindi writings (Banerjee 1986, Patrakar 1983, 1988), and was a subject of my own fieldwork in 1989–90, some of whose findings I summarized in earlier publications (especially Manuel 1994).[13] Rasiya is a category of Braj folksong. It can be sung in a variety of styles and formats, many of which are associated with Krishna and are especially popular during Holi season. A set of stock tunes recurs in rasiyas, although other tunes may also be used if similar in structure and style. Many renditions of these are unambiguously "folk" in character, as when women sing simple strophic rasiyas among themselves during Holi season. With the advent of cassettes, a folk-pop hybrid style of rasiyas emerged, typically with ribald lyrics (Manuel 1993:196–235). Of interest in the present article is a highly cultivated style of rasiya known as Hathrasi rasiya (after the town north of Agra which constitutes its epicenter) or "*akhāra-bāzi*" rasiya, referring to the *akhāras* or clubs that perform it semi-professionally. Hathrasi rasiya appears to have emerged and flourished from the last decades in the nineteenth century; at the time of my research, it was regarded as being in decline, but several akhāras remained active, and a few performances I witnessed had audiences numbering in the thousands.

Hathrasi rasiya is often performed by a sole akhāra at a wedding or other festivity, during which the group sings verses composed by present or previous akhāra members, some of which may have been published in chapbooks.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 96 1/6/15 10:37 AM

However, the quintessential performance format is a duel (*dangal*) between two akhāras. A wealthy patron will set up a stage and amplification system at some capacious intersection or plaza, and the rival akhāras will compete from late evening through the night, entertaining a substantial crowd of men and—usually in a separate section—women that are able to free themselves from domestic responsibilities. Each akhāra consists of a lead singer, a poet who quickly composes verses for him, a few instrumental accompanists, and a chorus that repeats final stanza lines. The event typically opens with the first vocalist heaping abuse on the rival akhāra in song, and eventually presenting a narrative that concludes with a question or riddle. The rival akhāra then responds in song, ideally answering the question, perhaps extending the narrative, and eventually posing its own question. In many cases, the responding akhāra must match the metrical and rhyme scheme used by the opposing group. The topics might be political, historical, or mythological.[14] Most audience members enjoy the event for its spontaneous versification, its combination of humor and erudition, and the lively singing. A spirit of connoisseurship prevails among cognoscenti, who appreciate the skillful deployment of a variety of prosodic and melodic frameworks.

Hathrasi rasiya, in fact, is solidly grounded in a rich corpus of theory, though this pertains primarily to prosody and only secondarily to melody. This poetic art is based on the tradition of classical Braj-bhāsha poetry, which was widely cultivated throughout North India since the late sixteenth century as the preeminent vehicle for Krishnaite and quasi-secular *riti* verse. Leading poets in that tradition clearly sought to establish their art form as a courtly, pan-regional, classical idiom comparable in prestige to Sanskrit verse; hence, for example, the production of several erudite treatises about Braj prosody and poetics, such as the *Kavipriya* of Keshavdas, and the *Chandmālā* (1602), an anthology in which that same poet explicitly sought to dignify the tradition by using a great abundance of esoteric meters (see Busch 2011:41, 44).

While such prosodic theory did not explicitly involve music, the derivative theory used in modern Hathrasi rasiya does in fact comprehend musical dimensions. Thus, for instance, several prosodic forms in Hathrasi rasiya—such as *jikri rasiya, ṭhaḍḍa rasiya, caukaria, chand*, *caubola,* and *bahr-e-tavīl*, are commonly associated with specific tunes that accommodate their particular poetic meters.[15] The common *deṛh tukiya rasiya* (rasiya of one and a half lines) indicates couplets each consisting of a line of thirteen or fourteen prosodic mātras—again sung to a conventional tune—followed by a slightly shorter line that must be melodically extended by means of a standardized melisma (or "*ālāp*"). Thus, akhāra poets write verses in these specific prosodic forms with the intent that they be sung in the corresponding tune and rhythm.[16]

Other specific melodies include *kāsganji bahr, rohtaki bahr, mewati rasiya, bancāri dhun* (named after places or communities), *Ghāsi Rām kā tarz* (named

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

after a personage), *sāvan, jhulna,* and *jhūmar* (named after folksong genres with stock tunes). Still other terms describe textual/melodic lines, such as the common Hindi term *ṭek* (refrain, like "*sthāī*"), *tuk* (rhyming verse line), and *milān* (which leads to a reprise of the ṭek). The numerous core akhāra members I interviewed were well familiar with all such theoretical concepts and were readily able to demonstrate them. They were also conversant with the basic tāls of kaharva, dādra, and *khemṭa*, although they were not able to describe them in terms of mātra counts; similarly, they did not articulate notions of sargam nor attempt to relate their music to Hindustani rāgs in any form.

Thus, Hathrasi rasiya theory, such as it exists, is distinct from that of Hindustani music, constituting a prosodic theory with secondary musical dimensions, which are not themselves explicitly articulated. In my experience, akhāra members did not attempt to describe their art as a *shāstriya sangīt* or "classical music," just as, for example, a Hindi article about the genre (Patrakar 1988) unproblematically characterized it as folksong (*lok gīt*). At the same time, the genre's idiosyncratic grounding in theory, its patronage by the Braj upper class (*seṭh log,* in local parlance), and the sense of connoisseurship shared by elites and performers, together distinguish it from the realm of "common folk music" and mark it as fit for inclusion in a distinctive intermediate sphere.

Hathrasi rasiya theory and practice overlap with that of the music theater forms which, in their regional manifestations, are variously called nauṭanki, sāng, swāng, sāngīt, bhagat, or khyāl. (Krishnaite rāslīla shares certain features with this spectrum of genres but is in other ways distinct.)[17] In their heyday, stretching roughly from the latter nineteenth to the mid-twentieth centuries, these forms of what Hansen termed "intermediary theater" (op. cit.:43) served as important conduits between folk and classical realms. Mixing dialogue, fights, and comic interludes, nauṭankis would include many music and dance scenes. These could variously feature regional folk items as well as simplified versions of kathak dance and light-classical ghazal and thumri, the latter usually emphasizing a long-winded text (perhaps designed to accompany dance) rather than refined bol banāo. Many song sets were structured in the *doha-caubola-daur* format that was idiosyncratically adapted into other forms of professional folk music.[18] Like rāslīlā, the nauṭanki/sāngīt complex is best seen as a theater genre many of whose musical constituents comprise members of the intermediate sphere.

Sophisticated Drum Traditions

Throughout North India one finds an abundance of drummers, whether amateur, semi-professional, or fully professional, who perform ḍhol, ḍholak, and tassa (tāsa, tāsha), or similar regional drums for various occasions. Of these drums,

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ḍholak most commonly accompanies singing, while the larger and louder ḍhol and tassa are often used in outdoor processional contexts, whether alone or as parts of brass bands or other ensembles. At the risk of crudely over-generalizing, it may be stated that most of this drumming, however adept and effective in its way, constitutes fairly straightforward renditions of a very few basic meters, especially corresponding to what classical drummers would call kaharva and dādra tāls, along with the loping Punjabi *bhāngra* rhythm that has also come to achieve pan-regional status. There are many professional drummers, from Rajasthani ḍholis to Bihari tassa players, who have no need for any repertoire extending beyond these rhythms, nor for any particular nomenclature or theory.

Meanwhile, however, there also exists a number of percussion traditions that may be termed more "sophisticated" in their greater number and variety of meters (especially composite ensemble rhythms) and a correspondingly extensive set of terms to designate these meters and, in some cases, their constitutive elements. Accordingly, a certain sense of connoisseurship may exist among enthusiasts of these percussion traditions. At the same time, these genres fall well short of meeting Powers's diagnostic criteria of art music; they are not dependent on elite patronage, they are not necessarily performed as autonomous art forms, they are regional rather than pan-regional entities, and whatever rudimentary theory can be articulated by their performers, seldom extends to such basic abstract notions as mātra counts, and may have little relation to Hindustani tāl theory and practice. Finally, in the case of, for example, the *Camār* nagāra drummers of the Banaras area, the performers' social status could scarcely be lower.

On the whole, the genres in this category conform to what Verma terms "sophisticated folk music" (as opposed to "common folk music"), and could be paired with my "sophisticated professional folksong" considered above. However, as percussion genres with their own, exclusively rhythmic forms and quasi-theoretical formulations, they may merit constituting an independent category. While a few regional percussion genres with which I am unfamiliar might qualify for inclusion in this category, in these pages I shall mention only three, namely, nagāra drumming of the Banaras area, Muharram ḍhol-tassa traditions of the Delhi/Agra regions (and their offshoots in Pakistan), and Trinidadian tassa drumming, which I regard as essentially North Indian in character (see Manuel 2015: ch. 5).

The nagāra (*naqqāra, nakāra*) drum-pair has a long and hoary history in South Asia, and is currently played in various formats throughout much of North India. In some locales, it still accompanies shahnāī, as it did in the naubat music of Mughal courts. It has long been the standard percussion instrument in nauṭanki theater. Nagāra players may also be hired to play solo for various miscellaneous occasions. If drummers accompanying shahnāī tend to play simple

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

versions of classical tīntāl, it has been my experience that the repertoire of many other nagāra drummers tends to be restricted to the basic meters played by other "folk" drummers, *viz*., what some would call kaharva, dādra, and bhangra. However, in Banaras and its environs, nagāra drummers—playing in an ensemble of two nagāra pairs, *dafla* frame drum, and a metallophone of some sort—perform a considerable variety of composite rhythms. Some of these accompany dancing by Ahir men at weddings and other festivities; others are performed at temple functions, funeral processions, and other events.

In 2009 I sat several times with a drummer, one Natey Ustad, reputed to be the top nagāra player in Banaras, and his accompanists, gathering data that largely cohered with that presented in an earlier publication by an Indian researcher (Prasad 1987:54–60). The musicians we consulted were innocent of Hindustani tāl theory; hence they did not count beats, and used only informal onomatopoeic names (e.g., *tak, ti na*) to designate strokes. Their terms for "tāl" or meter were also inconsistent and, to this researcher confusing; while "*lakrī*" (lit., wood) was the most common term, they also seemed to interchangeably use such terms as *tarz, dhun* (otherwise meaning "tune"), and *jati* ("type").[19]

At the same time, I found that the drummers did systematically designate composite rhythms by specific names, and were readily able, for example, to demonstrate such meters on request. Some of the meter names, such as *lācāri, devi kī gīt,* and *jhūmar*, designate the song forms whose accompaniment patterns they imitate in stylized form; some, such as *khari kalaiya*, accompany specific dance moves; "nauṭanki" reproduces the standard rhythmic pattern used in that theatrical context; and other rhythmic terms, like *khemṭa, rela,* and *bhartāla*, are strictly musical terms.[20] Most of these rhythms are roughly quadratic (and might be imprecisely called "kaharva" by an uninformed Hindustani musician); a few are ternary, and khemṭa follows a "limping" long-short-short pattern with irregular beat lengths. Like much folk drumming, Banarsi nagāra playing is often performed in contexts where it may be regarded as essential but at the same time, not worthy of special attention or esteem. However, I was assured that in certain contexts—especially sessions of spirited dancing by inebriated Ahir men—enthusiasts might merrily "spray" drummers with rupee notes or, conversely, physically assail them if their playing was deemed unsatisfactory. Such attention could arguably constitute a certain sort of "connoisseurship," however differently expressed from the genteel sigh or subdued "vah vah!" of an audience member at a classical concert.

Indo-Trinidadian tassa drumming exhibits a similar kind and degree of quasi-theoretical discourse, along with a similarly substantial repertoire of composite rhythms. Like Indo-Caribbean local-classical music, Trinidadian tassa drumming evolved largely as an orthogenetic neo-traditional Indian art form, shaped and eventually standardized by generations of drummers

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

who built upon the folk traditions—including Bhojpuri-region nagāra playing and Delhi/Agra-region tassa drumming—brought by their ancestors. A Trinidadian tassa group typically consists of four drummers, playing lead tassa (a kettle drum, hanging at waist level and struck with flexible sticks), a supporting tassa, a large ḍhol (or "bass"), and *jhānjh* cymbals. Tassa groups are indispensable at Hindu weddings and are common at other functions. Formal tassa competitions are also held, institutionalizing the lively and often rivalrous sense of connoisseurship and competition that the drumming inspires. At such competitions, knowledgeable judges will assess groups on the basis not only of subjective features such as "showmanship," but also in accordance with punctilious standards and norms, especially as pertaining to proper execution of the several composite meters, or "hands." In playing nagara hand, for example, a group will certainly be penalized if it fails to play the three distinct cadential figures, or if, for example, the lead drummer plays patterns more redolent of other hands like tikora or caubola.

Like Banarsi *nagārcīs*, Trinidadian tassa drummers have no particular familiarity with Hindustani classical music, nor do they have any need for counting beats or codifying pedagogy. At the same time, professional drummers must have a solid command of a substantial repertoire of composite meters. As with Banarsi nagāra playing, the names for these meters derive variously from song genres (Kabir bhajan, thumri), or from rhythms associated with other drums (nagara), or are (or have long been) purely musical terms (e.g., chaubola, tikora, khemṭa, tin chopra, wedding hand, and nādīdin). Terms for internal sections in hands include "theka" (a basic initial pattern), "tal" (here, a cadential figure), and "barti" or "daur" (an accelerated interlude or finale). Some tassa meters, including khemṭa, use the aforementioned irregular "long-short-short" cell found in the khemṭa of Banarsi nagāra drumming.[21] A few distinctive hands—especially the Muharram rhythm "tin chopra" and the common "wedding hand"—have ostinato sections consisting of an asymmetrical bass drum pattern followed by an indeterminate number of filler beats (usually five, six, or seven).[22]

Such patterns appear to derive from similar rhythms played during Muharram by South Asian tassa drummers researched by Richard Wolf in Delhi, and by drummers in Hyderabad, Pakistan, whose ancestors had migrated from Bharatpur (near Agra) during Partition (1947). Wolf (2000, 2014:81–114) analyzes in considerable depth the distinctive features of such drum traditions, which bear affinities to those informing Trinidadian tassa and Banarsi nagāra styles. Of particular relevance here is the idiosyncratic sort of theory and nomenclature used. While a few entities suggest connections with the classical tāl system (perhaps in the form of an influential player, a few generations ago, who played tabla), most aspects of the rhythms, and their associated nomenclature

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

and concepts, are more suggestive of a vernacular, intermediate realm of drumming with its own distinctive features. Hence, for example, Wolf notes how drum patterns may be organized on principles other than fixed numbers of pulses, such as a set of stressed beats, or a repeated motive, or a verbal formula. (Such, I have argued, is the case with the "tin chopra" and "wedding hand" rhythms of Trinidadian tassa, whose asymmetrical bass patterns presumably derive from a rhythmic rendering of an Arabic phrase such as the *kalma*, whose lexical meaning has long been forgotten [see Wolf 2000:114–15.])

Basing meters on strokes of irregular lengths—as in the long-short-short of khemṭa—or on an asymmetrical verbal phrase is a practice foreign to modern Hindustani music, in which tāls are based on fixed numbers of mātrās of equal length (occasional microrhythmic nuances notwithstanding). Such entities reflect how drumming in this intermediate sphere cannot be regarded as a degraded or jumbled version of classical music; rather, it has its own unique features. Indeed, such irregular and asymmetrical rhythms, which have their own expressive power, could be said to flourish precisely in a genre unimpeded by a codified classical theory—based on beat counts—with which they would be inconsistent.

One parallel to such irregular rhythms can be found in the archaic and now seldom heard *langṛā* (limping) style of playing tabla to accompany thumri, which I discussed in an earlier publication (Manuel 1989:145–52). Most typically in this practice, the drummer plays the theka of *dīpcandi/jat* (dha dhin - dhadha dhin- / ta tin- tata tin -) while distending the mātra lengths to the extent that the beats cannot be enumerated. As tabla playing became more systematized in the twentieth century, the langṛa style has largely disappeared, although confusion may persist as to whether the terms dīpchandi and jat denote tāls of fourteen or sixteen mātras.[23] Effectively, the langṛa style was characteristic of an intermediate sphere with its own rhythmic conventions and aesthetics; as thumri became more classicized in the decades after mid-century, mātra lengths evened out and counts became standardized, such that dīpchandi/jat is played in either fourteen or sixteen mātras, rather than as an elastic theka that defies enumeration.

Historicizing the Intermediate Sphere

In recent decades scholars have made important strides in historicizing the processes by which Hindustani and Karnatak musics became "classical" in the modern sense. Soneji (2012), Subramaniam (2006), Allen (1998), Weidman (2006), Bakhle (2005) and others have explored how the modernization of art music cultures in North and South India entailed not only the now well-documented processes of standardization, systematization, and sanitization, but also new notions of audience comportment, performance format, and other

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

practices and ideas pertinent to defining and delimiting the realm of "the classical."[24] At the same time, responding to the argument that the very notion of classical status is a modern import from the West (where it is argued not to have predated the Romantic era), Katherine Butler Schofield, in an important article (2010), illustrates with great erudition how art music in the Mughal period clearly cohered to the diagnostic criteria of classical music outlined by Powers.[25]

The intermediate stratum of Indian music is in similar need of diachronic perspectives which would historicize not only the trajectories of individual genres, but also of entire socio-musical milieus which, insofar as they can be documented, can often be seen to be in considerable flux over the generations. In many cases, one can note the twin phenomena—so common in South Asian culture—of, on the one hand, formidable historical depth and continuity, and on the other, perpetual change and instability. Thus, for example, counterparts to thumri—light, amatory songs sung by courtesans, typically accompanying interpretive dance, and not strictly bound by mode—can be found in the *lāsya* dance songs described in the *Nātya Shāstra* and many subsequent texts; thumri itself, however, was not recognized as any sort of genre until the early 1800s and did not emerge in its recognizably modern bol banāo form until the decades around 1900.

In a general sense, the existence of the intermediate sector itself is well documented over the millennia. This performative realm would presumably include not only lāsya dance songs described in the *Nātya Shāstra,* but also most of the courtesan arts of the Gupta period onwards, as well as the *desi* forms distinguished from pure classical *mārg* entities in the ninth-century *Brhddesi* and twelfth-century *Sangītratnākara*. Sarngadev, in the latter work, specifically identifies the "middle" (*madhyam*) stratum of singers who are adept in text and tune (*mātu* and *dhātu*) but lack some of the finer points of the most skilled artists.[26] He does not disparage such singers or their art, nor does he associate them with the enumerated faults (*gunas*) of some singers. Meanwhile, the various regional desi and *chāyalag* (mixed) rāgs, tāls, and dances were in a constant process of being incorporated into mainstream court music. Accordingly, imperial courts themselves were sites not only for genteel art music, but also for all manner of rustic and ribald folk entertainment, sometimes promoted with the active involvement of nobility. Hence, for example, the books authored by Lucknow nawab Wajid Ali Shah included both elegant thumris and ghazals as well as astonishingly vulgar and lewd vignettes (possibly to be performed as skits by *bhānds*).[27]

If the diverse constituents of the intermediate sphere differ in style, form, and the nature of their intermediate status, they also exhibit different sorts of historical relationships to classical music. As might be expected, a diachronic perspective shows that entities have flowed in both directions over the centuries.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

Many musical forms have percolated upward into Hindustani music from regional folk or vernacular traditions. As mentioned, thumri appears to have emerged as a quasi-folk modal entity in the 1600s before evolving into a semi-classical genre. Māṇḍ, a category of Rajasthani folksong types, also became a light Hindustani rāg. Even dhrūpad was a regional genre—of the sixteenth-century Gwalior court—before it developed into a core component of the pan-regional Hindustani "Great Tradition." Conversely, many aspects of vernacular theory and practice have clearly been adapted, usually in idiosyncratic form, from classical music.

Such adaptations might derive from different sorts of contact, such as the nineteenth-century songbooks used by Indo-Caribbean singers, or the occasional interaction between Manganiyār singers in Jaisalmer and visiting classical artists, or, as Wolf (2014:188–221) plausibly imagines, the participation, in a ḍhol-tasha group, of a tabla player who invented a set of rhythms involving specific beat counts, which went on to be scrambled, jumbled, and then idiosyncratically standardized by subsequent generations of players. Hence, for example, the dhrūpads and *caturangs* of Indo-Caribbean singers, or the sargam passages or the odd Hindustani *bandish* rendered, in however garbled a form, by Manganiyār musicians.[28] At the same time, however, intermediate sphere genres, once established, tend to operate and evolve in their own socio-musical strata, in a manner parallel to classical music rather than constantly engaging with it. Such independence, which may be intensified by geographical isolation, also enables the intermediate sphere to abound in curious anachronisms or marginal survivals. Hence, for instance, the archaic versions of Hindustani rāgs found in haveli sangīt, samāj gāyan, Assamese borgīt, and Langa/Manganiyār music, and the obscure terminology (e.g., tikora, daur) encountered in Indo-Caribbean music.

Genres in the intermediate sphere, in fact, are not only conduits for transmission of musical entities between social strata, but are often themselves in a state of constant flux and tension. Given their typical orientation toward a wide range of social strata and their relative lack of grounding in canonized theory, they are often sites of conflicting incentives to be popular and accessible, on the one hand, and sophisticated and elaborate on the other. The latter tendency may be expressed in various ways. In some cases, elite patrons may explicitly encourage systematization and standardization. In the late-sixteenth-century *Nartananirnaya*, Pandarika relates how he wrote his treatise on the encouragement of Emperor Akbar, who, after seeing a performance of dancers in mixed mārg and desi styles, commented, "Why are there contradictions and numerous departures in the practice and theory of this dance? Let the enlightened experts make it consistent in both practice and theory" (in Pandarika 1998:III, 377).

In 1989 I witnessed a different sort of eulogy of theory at a performance of Hathrasi rasiya, consisting of an open-air dangal between two akhāras, attended

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

by an audience of over a thousand. I presume that most of the listeners would not have noticed if, for example, one singer's rendering of a deṛh tukiya verse were deficient in syllable count, and my informants reiterated to me how most of the general public increasingly preferred catchy film tunes over esoteric prosodic and melodic schemes. However, on occasion the vocalists themselves stressed the importance of codification and sophistication. At one point the singer of one akhāra insultingly challenged the other (led by Vijandar Sharma), singing in chand format:

> Listen Vijandar, I will make a monkey of you,
> I will spit in your face,
> Your singing is primitive and backward. . . .

He then declaimed to the audience: "He stole our version of the *churi bhajan* from us, and now I will make him struggle, I will show him how it should be sung."

The conflicting tendencies toward classicist and populist approaches are often contested explicitly, as has been the case with Sikh *shabd kīrtan*. Purists who render these forms of gurbāni sangīt have attempted to adhere to a vernacular dhrūpad style and the (often archaic) rāgs specified in headings to the songs in the *Adi Granth*. However, as mentioned, it has long been common for singers to set verses to popular tunes, especially—in modern times—film tunes, accompanied by harmonium rather than traditional stringed instruments. Revivalists have sought to counter these populist trends and promote both a more traditional style as well as the rāg settings specified in the *SGGS,* whether through formal competitions, through guidelines issued in a 1931 reformist manifesto,[29] or more recently through the edicts of the *Shiromani Gurdwara Prabhandak* committee, which oversees functions at the Golden Temple and many gurdwāras (Kalra forthcoming: ch. 4). Such contradictory incentives—whether to codify for connoisseurs, or to perform in an intuitive and populist manner for the unwashed masses—have presumably conditioned music in the intermediate sphere for millennia, and may account for the ongoing migration of terms and forms between socio-musical strata.

The very popularity and status of the intermediate sphere—along with the nature of its particular constituent genres—can also be seen to have varied from era to era. Most conspicuous is the extraordinary vigor of light-classical song—especially thumri and ghazal—in a dynamic century stretching from nawabi-era Lucknow through the 1950s. As mentioned earlier, during this period these genres flourished not as lighter fare concluding "serious" classical concerts, but as independent, focal genres of an intermediate semi-classical sphere, performed by courtesan specialists for connoisseurs steeped in the elegant niceties of bol banāo, mimetic dance, and Urdu poetry. In the early

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

twentieth century, courtesan diva Gauhar Jan achieved a mass stardom, the likes of which no subsequent light-classical or classical vocalist could ever afterwards duplicate. A generation later, a variety of factors precipitated the evaporation of this intermediate sphere and its courtesan performers, as North Indian music culture polarized into classical and non-classical realms, with the former banishing ghazal and accommodating thumri only in a saccharine, pristine form, cleansed of its interpretive gestures and subtle, refined eroticism.[30] The advent of modernity—and especially cinema—also vitiated nauṭanki theater, which had occupied a different sector of the intermediate sphere; insofar as nauṭanki has survived, it has done so by resorting to an unprecedented degree of lewdness which, while guaranteeing a reliable lower-class male audience, renders the genre unsuitable for women and the bourgeoisie. In their own ways, Hathrasi rasiya, Mirzapuri kajri, and Langa/Manganiyār music also represented a vital, socially integrated realm of sophisticated vernacular music that could entertain both discriminating elites and commoners, especially in provincial towns where Hindustani music did not have a strong presence. Like nauṭanki/swāng/khyāl theater, they have undergone similar declines, as regional elites have increasingly withdrawn patronage from local vernacular arts, deeming them rustic, incompatible with reformist bourgeois nationalism, and inferior to both modern pop culture and pan-regional high culture. (See Frietag 1989 in reference to Banaras.)

The causes of these developments have been several, including the advent of a commercial entertainment industry associated with the mass media, and a newly restrictive and self-conscious conception of "the classical" informed by Western culture. Collectively, as I have discussed elsewhere (Manuel 2010), the changes invite comparison with Theodor Adorno's description of a nineteenth- and twentieth-century polarization of highbrow and lowbrow arts in the West, and the accompanying decline of an intermediate cultural realm previously represented by works such as Mozart's *The Magic Flute* (Adorno 1976:228). At the same time, while modernity, in its various dimensions, has vitiated certain intermediary genres, it has also granted them a sort of afterlife, in however reduced a capacity. Thumri and ghazal, though marginalized in some respects, enjoy ample dissemination via the mass media. Vaishnavite samāj gāyan and haveli sangīt not only survive in their traditional niches but attract a new sort of attention from interested classical singers (Ho 2013:22). Rajasthani Langa and Manganiyār music, though losing many of their traditional patrons, finds new audiences as staged folklore in urban India and the West. And even nauṭanki, in a degraded capacity, seems to be enjoying a modest revival as disseminated on commercial VCDs and DVDs.

The sorts of intermittent and unsystematic contact between some intermediary genres and courtly art music over the centuries are reflected in the idiosyn-

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 106 1/6/15 10:37 AM

cratic and divergent uses of terms in these genres. Several term meanings—such as "thumri"—can be seen to change diachronically. Many of the sorts of terms and quasi-theoretical notions employed in the diverse intermediate sphere genres may resemble each other insofar as they derive from Hindustani music. However, in many cases, the terms and concepts are regional and genre-specific, deriving as they do from particular sources, such as classical Braj-bhasha poetry or Bhojpuri folksong rhythms.

Often, nomenclature is used inconsistently within a given genre, especially when an abstract notion is being denoted, as with the various terms used to denote "meter" (or tāl) by vernacular drummers. Meanings morph further as terms migrate horizontally between intermediate genres in different regions; "lāvni" denotes one genre in Maharashtra, and an entirely different one in the Braj region; "*sher*" (Urdu couplet), "*rekhta*" (Urdu poetry), and "*kawwāli*" all denote kinds of prosodic meter in Haryanvi sāng/swāng theater; and the khyāl and rāgini of Rajasthan and Haryana, respectively, have nothing to do with their namesakes in Hindustani music discourse. A term such as jikri or bahr may have a specific and clear meaning in one genre, such as Hathrasi rasiya, and different meanings in another (not to mention in the sixteenth-century *Ain-i-Akbari*). In the absence of precise modal and metrical analytics, terms such as chand and caubola come to accrue a plethora of distinct meanings, variously denoting different kinds of melody type, prosodic meter, or rhythmic accompaniment.[31] Terms are thus particularly likely to be used inconsistently and unsystematically in the case of abstract entities for which rigorous theoretical concepts are lacking (and not needed by musicians).[32] Meanwhile, strategies for naming entities, although often idiosyncratic, may also find parallels in classical music. Thus melodies or modes—whether in vernacular music or Hindustani music—may be named after individuals (Ghasi Ram kā tarz, Bilāskhānī Todi), places (kāsganji bahr, Brindāvanī Sārang), or formal features (jikri bhajan, Komal Rishab Asāvari).

Beyond Folk, Classical, and the Intermediate Sphere Itself

The intermediate sphere I have described consists of traditional and neo-traditional art forms that find themselves in various sorts and stages of transition and destabilization as modernity unevenly pervades Indian culture. Perhaps more conspicuous is the emergence of new, quintessentially modern forms of music which, whether participatory or presentational, in some ways fill the void left by the evaporation of the traditional intermediate sphere while transcending—rather than straddling—the categories of folk, popular, and classical. These new genres have nothing in particular to do with classical or commercial popular music, and are only loosely rooted in folk traditions. Although substantially middle- or

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

lower-middle-class in their audience and membership, they are in many ways "classless" and unmoored in caste or sectarian associations. Their recent origins, largely urban provenance, incorporation of well-educated performers, and ample mass-media dissemination (but not marketing) further distance them from "folk" culture. Indeed, they are precisely the sort of modern cultural entity that, together with commercial pop culture, renders the notion of "folk music" immaterial and archaic.

In this context I will briefly mention only two representative (though quite different) genres of this sort, confident that several others from different regions could be similarly identified. One genre is the ḍhol-tāsha drumming of Maharashtra associated with the annual Ganesh festival (*Ganesh Utsav*). This genre was essentially invented in Pune (Poona) in the years around 1970, by renowned educator, social activist, and amateur musician Appasaheb Pendse.[33] Pendse, collaborating with trained percussionists, created a set of standardized rhythmic medleys for students at schools and clubs to perform in ḍhol-tāsha ensembles, especially at the Ganesh festival, which had itself been popularized by anti-colonial activist and social reformer Balgangadhar Tilak in the 1890s.

In the late 1900s, the ḍhol-tāsha groups (or *pathaks*) came to proliferate in Pune and other cities throughout the state and became iconic features of the festival and modern Maharashtrian culture. In Pune alone each year around a hundred groups—most numbering over a hundred players each—form to play in processions and other events during the festival. The groups accommodate a wide range of participants, including schoolboys and girls, middle-class workers in the IT industry, handfuls of amateur tabla players, and other miscellaneous enthusiasts of diverse backgrounds. Most players are relatively young, and many, even if conversant only in Marathi and Hindi, have a cosmopolitan familiarity with a wide range of musics, from Bollywood to Beyoncé. In its recent creation by known innovators, its only tenuous relation to traditional musics, and its support from a broad spectrum of performers, it resists categorization as "folk music" and is more typical of a modern society in which that term is obsolete.

A second representative genre is *rāgini*, a song style of Haryana, the state and linguistic region to the west and north of Delhi. Rāgini was the narrative song form in traditional swāng theater, which flourished primarily in the first half of the twentieth century. In the 1980s, with swāng (like nauṭanki) in steep decline, a new form of rāgini emerged as a topical, often "spicy," and somewhat generic Haryanvi song type. In subsequent decades, this reincarnated rāgini, though nourished in stylized form by commercial cassettes and, later, VCDs and DVDs, thrived in particular as performed in open-air competitions typically attended by thousands of enthusiasts. Both performers and audiences have hailed from diverse backgrounds, including many female college students, Brahmans, and educated urbanites comfortably familiar with local, Mumbai-based, and foreign

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

ETM 59_1 text.indd 108 1/6/15 10:37 AM

popular culture (even if not conversant in English). Like Maharashtrian ḍhol-tasha drumming, modern rāgini has lost associations with any particular class or caste, except for a certain loose middle-class or bourgeois character, which itself reflects and promotes a new kind of shared, classless modern culture.[34] Accordingly, as this new rāgini has become further detached from its earlier namesake—whether in style or subject matter—like Pune ḍhol-tasha it cannot be conceived as "folk music"; instead, it exemplifies a new kind of modern, inclusive popular cultural form, cultivated by and for local cosmopolitans, which cannot be shoehorned into the conventional folk/classical/pop trichotomy, nor even into a stratum of traditional intermediary genres.

I conclude this essay with some general observations. The intermediate sphere, I contend, has long constituted an important but unacknowledged stratum of Indian music culture. In accordance with its hierarchic locus between folk and classical realms, certain of its constituent forms, such as thumri, combine features that can clearly be linked to sources in Hindustani music or regional folk music. At the same time, many features of intermediate genres are unique to that category and lack counterparts in other cultural realms. Thus, for example, if some of the modes, meters, and stylistic features of thumri can be regarded as deriving in some manner from classical or folk musics, the central process of bol banāo is largely unique to this stratum of semi-classical song. Similarly, some of the rhythmic features of tassa drumming—in Trinidadian and certain North Indian traditions—are to a certain extent exclusive to vernacular drumming and cannot be regarded either as simplifications of classical music or as refinements of folk playing. That is, the quasi-"classical" character of traditions like Banarsi nagāra drumming or Hathrasi rasiya derives not from specific affinities to Hindustani music (such as use of particular rāgs and tāls) but from more general features, such as the presence of a certain sort of theory, whether based on prosody or only partially formulated.

The intermediate sphere—like the folk and classical forms that surround it in the status hierarchy—is best regarded as consisting of traditional and neo-traditional music genres. As societies like India continue to modernize, the mass media increasingly penetrate all levels of society and promote new sorts of shared sensibilities, especially in the form of an essentially bourgeois ideology. Particularly in urban society, the realm of "the folk" increasingly diminishes and acquires an archaic character, though its constituent genres may be rearticulated into new commercial pop idioms. Meanwhile, new cultural sensibilities generate new expressive genres, including not only commercial popular ones but also broadly participatory vernacular entities that provide a new sort of shared culture that typically transcends class, caste, and sectarian divisions. New genres like Maharashtrian ḍhol-tāsha are almost entirely free of the baggage attending traditional folk musics, including the various

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

restrictions pertaining to gender and caste and the entire conception of being traditional and of anonymous origin. Hence ḍhol-tāsha can be embraced by its participants as unproblematically, even exuberantly, modern and fashionable, while at the same time being distinctly local. And while it may fill some of the socio-musical space formerly occupied by local intermediate genres, its status is not "intermediate," since the "folk" with which it might be counterposed has relatively little presence either in the new social milieu or in the worldview that animates it. Ḍhol-tāsha—like other such genres as Panjabi bhangra dance and Gujarati rās and garba—represents a thoroughly modern tradition, even as the uneven forms and pace of other sectors of Indian society sustain idioms that are best characterized as intermediate.

Notes

1. Meanwhile, in contexts such as the 1960s Greenwich Village café, the term "folk music"—i.e., singer-songwriter guitar-and-voice songs—becomes a stylistic rather than socio-musical distinction. Conventional American-based definitions of folk music (e.g., orally transmitted music, of anonymous origin, played by non-professionals) are particularly unworkable in cross-cultural contexts. For purposes of this article, I define commercial popular music as that whose style can be seen to have evolved in connection with distribution by the mass media and sale as a commodity.

2. In some academic circles, an "implicit theory" is said to inform the performance of any music, whether theoretical concepts are verbally articulated by its makers or not. I would insist, however, on the significance of the distinction between such inchoate notions of theory, on the one hand, and, on the other, the ability of performers to explicitly describe music in terms of abstract parameters such as mode, meter, scale degree, beat, and the like. Thus, in the Indian context, one could note the significant difference between the folk musician who, when asked why he sings a particular note, replies, "That's how it goes," or "That's how I learned it," and, by contrast, the Hindustani singer, who might reply, "Well, this is rāg Pūrvi, and that note, shuddh mā, must be present, otherwise it would sound like Puriya Dhanāshri; but the note must appear only in passing, and only in this particular fashion, otherwise the character of the rāg will not shine, and it may sound like Bhairav or Rāmkali instead."

3. See Thompson 1995.

4. The latter sort of "improved" folk songs, which might be rendered by urban radio singers and the like, correspond to what Verma terms "sophisticated folk" (1987:5).

5. This category is also proposed by Verma, who contrasts it with the typically less elaborate musics of lower-status rural professionals such as jogis, ḍoms, kalbelias, assorted bards, and the like.

6. Bol banāo is not to be confused with bol bānt (lit., word division), an articulation technique in khyāl and dhrūpad.

7. For example, the Khamāj-ṭhāṭ version of Rajasthani rāg Paraj would appear to correspond to that described in sixteenth-century treatises such as Locana's *Rāg Tarangani* (see Manuel 1981:30).

8. Thus, Indian harmonium players and singers may speak of "*pahla safed*," "*dūsrā kāli*" (first white, second black) etc., just as Rajasthani *sārangi* and *kamāicha* players identify scalar degrees in accordance with finger positions (Neuman et al. 2006:94).

9. 2006 and personal correspondence. I am grateful to Ho and Beck for information they shared with me in correspondence (and also to Neuman for commenting on an earlier version of this article). The term "haveli sangīt" is a neologism applied by All India Radio in the 1970s (Ho 2013:232) and is not preferred by exponents of the tradition. However, for our purposes it is

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

certainly useful in distinguishing this genre from the many other North Indian vernacular genres also called "kīrtan."

10. Aside from Kalra's informative forthcoming work, some information on gurmat sangīt is available in the essays, "Some technical terms used in the Gurbani," at http://www.gurbani.org/articles/webart231.htm, and "An Introduction to Gurmat Sangeet," at http://www.gurmatsangeetproject.com/pages/ArticlesPapers.asp (accessed 8/2014).

11. I am grateful to Utpola Borah for exposing me to borgīt and sharing her knowledge with me.

12. These would include: rāg Kedār with komal Ga and Ni (as in Locana's 16th-17th c. *Rāgtarangani* [in Bhatkhande 1957–58, I: 108]), Suhāi (Cf. medieval *Suhavi*) in Khamāj ṭhāṭ (Bhatkhande 1951–57, IV:137–138), Shri rāg resembling its modern Karnatak version (and some North Indian archaic forms) in modern Kāfi ṭhāṭ; and most curiously, "Mahur," which would seem to correspond to the Persian modal namesake, which enjoyed some presence in Mughal courts, as suggested, for example, by Pandarika's reference to it in his *Rāgmanjari* (in Sarmadee 1996:xxv).

13. During that period I interviewed a few dozen performers and specialists in Hathrasi rasiya, gathering a considerable amount of data. Only in recent months have I belatedly processed these materials into a publishable article (Manuel n.p.), which is currently under review. I have never encountered any literature, in Hindi or English, covering Mirzapuri kajri, a significant genre that may disappear without a trace. Some data on traditional rāgini can be found (in Hindi) in Sharma 2001, the relevant chapter being accessible online at: http://www.haryanavimusic.com/literature/development%20of%20saang.pdf

14. Thus, in 1989 singers told me of a recent dangal in which, in the middle of the night, one akhāra concluded its turn by asking the other an obscure detail from the Mahabharata. Stumped, the rival akhāra, while stalling by singing abuse verses, sent a member to bang on the door of an erudite local pandit to find the answer.

15. In an earlier publication (Manuel 1994), I presented a few of these melodies. Terms such as caubola and bahr-e-tavīl derive from nauṭanki theater, for which see also Hansen 1992: ch. 8. Several vernacular prosodic forms have associated standard melodies. For instance, in the Braj region the verse form *savaiyya* is typically recited (e.g., by mendicants) in a particular stock tune, such that in certain discursive contexts "savaiyya" could easily come to denote the tune rather than the poetic meter.

16. Such is also the case with the song genre chowtāl (cautāl, not to be confused with the tāl by that name), whose idiosyncratically repetitive verse structure makes sense only when sung, and whose poetic meters are designed to be rendered in specific rhythms by an ensemble in tight coordination (see Manuel 2009). In this sense, chowtāl shares features with a genre like Hathrasi rasiya and Mirzapuri kajri, but has less of a tradition of elite patronage and stage performance, for an audience, by semi-professionals.

17. The homeland of nauṭanki (which is also called sāngīt [not to be confused with *sangīt*]) has been the Gangetic plain, especially Uttar Pradesh. Usage is inconsistent, but "swāng," or less often, "sāng" (the root word, meaning "acting, gesture") generally denotes the Haryanvi counterpart, while the related Rajasthani and Agra forms are known as khyāl and bhagat, respectively. These genres flourished from the late 1800s, but have all declined since the mid-twentieth century, primarily due to competition from cinema, though rāslīla still flourishes in Brindavan. For analytical studies, see Agarwal (1976) and especially Hansen (1992) regarding nauṭanki, and Thielemann (1998) regarding rāslīlā.

18. See Hansen (1992: ch. 8) for discussion of this format. Doha is a Hindi couplet sung in free rhythm, to one of a set of conventional tunes; caubola denotes the subsequent verses, with their own characteristic tunes; and daur is the fast, metered conclusion. The terms caubola and daur are widely and inconsistently used in North Indian (and Indo-Caribbean) vernacular music.

19. Wolf (2014: ch. 3) discusses in detail such terms as used in various South Asian percussion traditions.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

20. Scenes of Banarsi nagāra drumming can be seen in my documentary video *Tassa Thunder: Folk Music from India to the Caribbean* (posted on YouTube and Vimeo), from 9:30.

21. This pattern, if decelerated, may reveal itself to correspond to 4+3+3, but musicians certainly do not conceive of it thusly, and its tempo is too brisk to make such enumeration logical. It could alternately be regarded as a 2/4 beat consisting of a quarter-note—slightly shortened—followed by two eighths, but given its three-stroke pattern, it is more likely to be heard as 3/4, with a slightly elongated first beat.

22. For further information on Trinidadian tassa drumming, see my book *Tales, Tunes, and Tassa Drums* (2015: ch. 5) and my aforementioned video.

23. When I played an example of langṛa accompaniment from an old thumri recording for a prominent tabla player, he scoffed and dismissed the style as typical of illiterate and innumerate drummers of an earlier era.

24. For that matter, the coalescence of Hindustani and Karnatak systems into two neatly demarcated pan-regional entities is itself a historical rather than primordial and timeless codification. It was only in the early twentieth century that the repertoire and styles standardized in Madras became established as pan-regional norms of "Karnatak" music. As Jairazbhoy (1980:108) noted, "One tends to think of classical traditions as having been homogeneous, whereas the evidence seems to indicate that they were a conglomerate of interacting regional traditions sharing only broad musical features. Thus it was probable that one of the reasons for this musical literature was to communicate the musical features of one tradition to those outside it."

25. One might add that medieval Sanskrit treatises, from the *Sangitratnākara* onwards, demonstrated a similar recognition of art music as a distinct category by their overwhelming focus on music grounded in rāg and tāl, that is, modal and metrical theory—precisely the element lacking in other musics of less prestige.

26. See, e.g., Sarmadee 2003, I: 281, 283. Sarngadev's categorization of musicians was reiterated in subsequent texts such as the *Ain-i-Akbari.*

27. Personal communication from Richard Williams, in reference to the nawab's book *Bani*.

28. See, e.g., Neuman et al. 2006: 105–06.

29. See the Sikh Rehat Maryada, accessible at: http://SGPC.net/rehat_maryada/section_three_chap_five.html

30. Another casualty of this polarization was the effective disappearance of a rich repertoire of light rāgs, such as Kasūri, Banjārā, Rāsra, Mārvāri, Lūm, Zilla, Jangla, Barhans, and hybrids like Pahāri-Jhinjhoti and Khambāg-Jogia, such as abound in nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century song-text compendiums like the *Brahmanand Bhajan Māla*.
Similar processes precipitated the evaporation of an intermediate sphere of South Indian song and dance, especially as performed by courtesans. See Allen 1998 and Subramaniam 2006: ch.'s 3 and 4.

31. Chand—a venerable term, like caubola—can mean prosodic meter, or prosody in general, or, in some contexts, a specific prosodic meter. In Hathrasi rasiya it denotes a specific four-line verse form and, by extension, the characteristic tune in which that verse is sung (see Manuel 1994). Forms of chand in sāngīt/nauṭanki are the subject of an entire chapter in Agarwal's study (1976).

32. Terminological inconsistencies and ambiguities are certainly found in art music as well as vernacular music; thus, if the "tin chopra" ("three strokes") of Trinidadian tassa does not describe any particular features in the meter it denotes, for its part the classical sitar (from *sehtār*) certainly has more strings than the three suggested by its name.

33. Appa Pendse, Vinayak Vishwanath (1916-?). Pendse also created and popularized a collective dance called *barchi*. I am grateful to informants such as Subhash Deshpande (secretary of the Jnana Prabodhini School founded by Pendse) for information on him. For further portrayal of ḍhol-tāsha drumming, see also my documentary video *Drumming for Ganesh: Music at Pune's Ganpati Festival* (2014), posted on YouTube and Vimeo.

34. My sources on rāgini include Kadyan (n.d.) and Sharma (2001). I am grateful to Kadyan for sharing his manuscript with me. Many clips of Haryanvi rāgini competitions can be seen on YouTube.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

References

Adorno, Theodor. 1976. *Introduction to the Sociology of Music*, translated by E.B. Aston. New York: Continuum Publishing (originally published as *Einleitung in die Musiksoziologie*, 1962).

Agarwal, Ram Narayan. 1976. *Saangit: Ek Loknatya Parampara*. Delhi: Rajpal & Sons.

Allen, Matthew. 1998. "'Tales Tunes Tell: Deepening the Dialogue Between the 'Classical' and 'Non-classical' in the Music of India." *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 30:22–52.

Banerjee, Usha Rani. 1986. "Braj ke Rasiyon ke Adhyayan" [The Forms of Braj Rasiya]. Ph.D. dissertation, Banaras Hindu University.

Bakhle, Janaki. 2005. *Two Men and Music: Nationalism and the Making of an Indian Classical Tradition*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Beck, Guy. 2011. *Vaishnava Temple Music in Vrindaban: The Radhavallabha Songbook*. Kirksville, Missouri: Blazing Sapphire Press.

Bharucha, Rustam. 2003. *Rajasthan: An Oral History: Conversations with Komal Kothari*. New Delhi: Penguin.

Bhatkhande, V.N. 1951–57. *Hindustani Sangit Paddhati.* Vols. I-IV. Hathras: Sangeet Karyalaya.

Bhatt, Bhagvatiprasad Premshankar. 1983. *Pushti Sangit Prakash*. New Delhi: Sangeet Natak Akademi.

Blackburn, Stuart, and A.K. Ramanujan, eds. 1986. *Another Harmony: New Essays on the Folklore of India*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Bohlman, Philip. 1988. *The Study of Folk Music in the Modern World*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Brahmanand, Swami. 1915. *Shri Brahmanand Bhajan Mala*. Delhi: Garg & Co.

Busch, Alison. 2011. *Poetry of Kings: The Classical Hindi Literature of Mughal India*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Butler Schofield, Katherine. 2010. "Reviving the golden age again: 'Classicization,' Hindustani music,' and the Mughals." *Ethnomusicology* 54(3):484–517.

Faqirullah. 1996. *Tarjumai-Manakutuhala & Risala-i-Ragadarpana*, edited and annotated by Shahab Sarmadee. Delhi: Indira Gandhi Centre for the Arts.

Fazl Allami, Abul. 1927. *The A-in-I Akbari*, translated by Colonel H.S Jarrett. Delhi: Low Price Publications (2001 reprint; original completed 1584).

Frietag, Sandra. 1987. "Introduction," in *Culture and Power in Banaras: Community, Performance, and Environment, 1800–1900*, edited by Sandra Frietag, 25–33. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Gaston, Anne-Marie. 1997. *Krishna's Musicians: Musicians and Music-making in the Temples of Nathdvara, Rajasthan*. Delhi: Manohar.

Gogoi, Hiranmayee Das. N.d."Dhrūpadi Elements of Borgeet." On website of Society for Srimanta Sankaradeva, at: http://sankaradeva.com/blogs/29

Hansen, Kathryn. 1992. *Grounds for Play: The Nauṭanki Theatre of North India*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Ho, Meilu. 2013. "Connecting histories: Liturgical Songs as Classical Compositions in Hindustani music." *Ethnomusicology* 57(2):207–35.

Imam, Hakim Mohammad Karm. 1959. "Melody Through the Centuries: Being a Chapter from Ma'danul Moosiqui written in 1856 by Hakim Mohammad Karm Imam, a Courtier of Wajid Ali Shah of Lucknow." Translated by Govind Vidyarthi. *Sangeet Natak Akademi Bulletin* 11–12:13–26, 33.

Jairazbhoy, N.A. 1980. "Embryo of a Classical Music Tradition in Western Rajasthan." In *The Communication of Ideas*, edited by J.S. Yadava and V. Gautam, 99–109. 10th ICAES Series, no. 2. New Delhi: Concept Publishing Company.

Kadyan, Deepak. N.p. "Popular Music and Cassette Industry in Haryana 1980–2005." Manuscript.

Kalra, Virender. Forthcoming. *Sacred and Secular Musics: A Postcolonial Approach*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

Mansukhani, G.S. 1982. *Indian Classical Music and Sikh Kirtan*. Delhi: Oxford.
Manuel, Peter. 1981."The Evolution of Todi Raags in Indian Music," *Journal of the Indian Musicological Society* (Bombay) 12(3&4):14–30.
———. 1988–89. "A Historical Survey of the Urdu Gazal-Song in India." *Asian Music* 20(1):93–113.
———. 1989. *Thumri in Historical and Stylistic Perspectives*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
———. 1994. "Syncretism and Adaptation in Rasiya, a Braj Folksong Genre." *Journal of Vaisnava Studies* 3(1):33–59.
———. 2000a. "The Construction of a Diasporic Tradition: Indo-Caribbean 'Local Classical Music.'" *Ethnomusicology* 44(1):97–119.
———. 2000b. *East Indian Music in the West Indies: Tan-Singing, Chutney, and the Making of Indo-Caribbean Culture.* Philadelphia: Temple University Press.
———. 2009. "Transnational Chowtal: Bhojpuri Folksong from North India to the Caribbean, Fiji, and Beyond." *Asian Music* 40 (2):1–32.
———. 2010. "Thumri, Ghazal, and Modernity in Hindustani Music Culture." In *Hindustani Music: Thirteenth to Twentieth Centuries*, edited by Joep Bor, Francoise Delvoye, Jane Harvey, and Emme te Nijenhuis, 239–52. Delhi: Manohar.
———. 2014. *Drumming for Ganesh: Music at Pune's Ganpati Festival.* Video documentary.
———. 2015. *Tales, Tunes, and Tassa Drums: Retention and Invention in Indo-Caribbean Music*. Champaign, IL: University of Illinois Press.
———. n.p. "Hathrasi Rasiya: An Intermediate Song Genre of North India." Under review.
Neuman, Daniel, and Shubha Chaudhuri, Komal Kothari. 2006. *Bards, Ballads, and Boundaries. An Ethnographic Atlas of Music Traditions in West Rajasthan.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press (and Seagull Books).
Pandarika Vitthala. 1998. *Nartananirnaya*, Vol. III, edited and translated by R. Sathyanarayana. New Delhi: Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts.
Patrakar, Devkinanda "Vikal." 1983. "Hathras ki Rasiya Parampara," in *Braj Rasm*, edited by Bedil Hathrasi, 27–30. Hathras: Braj Kala Kendra.
———. 1988. "Lok Gāyaki kā Pramukh Kendra Hāthras aur Rasiya Paramparā," in *Natharām Sharmā Gaur Shatābdī Samaroh*. Hathras: Sharma Gaur Book Depot, 85–87.
Powers, Harold. 1980. "Classical Music, Cultural Roots, and Colonial Rule: An Indic Musicologist looks at the Muslim World." *Asian Music* 12(1):5–39.
———. 1981. "India." In *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, edited by Stanley Sadie, Vol. IX, 69–166. London: MacMillan.
Prasad, Onkar. 1987. *Folk Music and Folk Dances of Banaras.* Calcutta: Anthropological Survey of India.
Qureshi, Regula. 1981. "Music and Culture in the Sindh," in *Sind Through the Centuries: Proceedings of an International Seminar*, edited by Hamida Khuhro, 235–43. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
Rao, Vidya. 1996. "Thumri and Thumri Singers: Changes in Style and Life-style." In *Cultural Reorientation in Modern India*, edited by Indu Banga Jaidev, 278–315. Simla: Indian Institute of Advanced Study.
Sarmadee, Shahab. 1996. "Introduction," to *Tarjuma-i-Mānakutuhala & Risāla-i-Ragadarpana, by Faqqirullah*, edited by Shahab Sarmadee. New Delhi: India Gandhi Centre for the Arts, pp. xxiii-lxv.
———. 2003. *Nur-Ratnākar: A Bio-bibiographical Survey and Techno-historical Study, of All Available Important Writings in Arabic, Persian, Sanskrit and Other Allied Languages on the Subject of Song, Dance and Drama,* edited by Prem Lata Sharma and Francoise 'Nalini' Delvoye, New Delhi: Sangeet Research Academy.
Sharma, Chander Krishan. 2001. *Kavi Surya Lakhmi Chand.* Chandigarh: Haryana Publication Bureau.
Soneji, Davesh. 2012. *Unfinished Gestures: Devadasis, Memory, and Modernity in South India.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.

Subramaniam, Lakshmi. 2006. *From the Tanjore Court to the Madras Music Academy: A Social History of Music in South India*. New York: Oxford University Press.
Thielemann, Selina. 1998. *Sounds of the Sacred: Religious Music in India*. Delhi: S.P. Nagia.
———. 1998. *Rasalila: A Music Study of Religious Drama in Vraja*. New Delhi: APH Publishing.
———. 2001. *Musical Traditions of Vaishnava Temples in Vraja*. 2 volumes. New Delhi: Sagar Printers & Publishers.
Thompson, Gordon. 1995. "What's in a ḍhāl? Evidence of Raga-like Approaches in a Gujarati Music Tradition." *Ethnomusicology* 39(3):417–33.
Verma, Vijay. 1987. *The Living Music of Rajasthan*. Delhi: Census of India.
Weidman, Amanda. 2006. *Singing The Classical, Voicing The Modern*. Raleigh-Durham: Duke University Press.
Wolf, Richard. 2000. "Embodiment and Ambivalence: Emotion in South Asian Muharram Drumming." *Yearbook for Traditional Music*: 81–115.
———. 2014. *The Voice in the Drum: Music, Language and Emotion in Islamicate South and West Asia.* Champaign-Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

From Ethnomusicology, Vol 59, No. 1, 2015. Copyright 2015 by the Society of Ethnomusicology.
Complimentary copy--not for distribution without permission.