10-2014

The Historic Inability of the Haitian Education System to Create Human Development and its Consequences

Patrick Michael Rea
Graduate Center, City University of New York

How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!
Follow this and additional works at: https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_etds
Part of the Education Policy Commons, Latin American Languages and Societies Commons, and the Latin American Studies Commons

Recommended Citation
https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_etds/463

This Thesis is brought to you by CUNY Academic Works. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Dissertations, Theses, and Capstone Projects by an authorized administrator of CUNY Academic Works. For more information, please contact deposit@gc.cuny.edu.
The Historic Inability Of The Haitian Education System To Create Human Development And Its Consequences

By

Patrick M. Rea

A thesis submitted to the Graduate Faculty in Liberal Studies in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Masters of Arts, The City University of New York

2014
This manuscript has been read and accepted for the Graduate Faculty in Liberal Studies in satisfaction of the thesis requirement for the degree of Masters of Arts

Laird Bergad, PhD.  
9-15-14  
Laird Bergad, PhD.  
Date  
Thesis Advisor

Matthew Gold, PhD.  
9-15-14  
Matthew Gold, PhD.  
Date  
Executive Officer

The City University of New York
Abstract

The Historic Inability Of The Haitian Education System To Create Human Development And Its Consequences

By

Patrick M. Rea

Advisor: Professor Laird Bergad, PhD.

This study aims to evaluate the role that a lack of literacy and education has played in Haiti’s historic and presently low level of human development. The pedagogical philosophies of two educationists, Paolo Friere and Maurice Dartigue, are used throughout the study as lenses from which to read and interpret the history of Haitian education –its many failed attempts, and recurrent challenges- in creating a literate and educated population. The author concludes that mass literacy is prerequisite if the Haitian people are to achieve self-realization and actualization, which essentially equates to what the United Nations Development Program calls “Human Development”. Only after human development is achieved for the vast majority of Haitian people, will Haitians achieve a stable democracy, viable economy and self-determination.
Foreword

My personal experience with Haiti began in 1998, when a close friend of mine, Terry, described to me a trip she had made to that country to do volunteer work. Her story would have a profound effect on my future interest and activity there. Terry, a Puerto Rican American, described to me an extraordinarily desperate scene, where the poverty had been so much greater in comparison to Bolivia where she had lived as a volunteer, that she was profoundly affected.

Her experience there would inspire me to become involved in the planning and realization of a medical mission trip to Port au Prince in 1998. I assisted by recruiting doctors and nurses, as well as procuring supplies for the surgeries that the medical team provided. It was during this first month-long visit to Haiti with the medical team that I initially become acquainted with the Haitian people: their history, culture; language, food, beliefs, personalities, as well as the extreme challenges that the vast majority of Haitians face on a daily basis to survive.

Although Haiti was very poor in 1998, and is still very poor today, I have loved all of my visits there (the last one being this year; 2014), and continue to learn about and from the country’s people and culture. Although I acknowledge that we must not subscribe to too many of the popular beliefs about Haiti, which have often been based on long-held misconceptions, I do believe that by seeing things as they are, that Americans can help Haitians achieve political and economic independence by offering whatever resources and kindness that they wish to accept.
For nearly a century now, the US and international community has been asking itself: How do we help (or change) Haiti? Academics have often contributed by stimulating theoretical conversations about the problems that countries like Haiti face, and how we should view or think about them. Others have and continue to improve the circumstances of Haitians through tangible means, such as providing basic necessities like food, water, shelter, medical treatment and education to the poor. Then, there are those like the writer whose goals lie somewhere in between the theoretical and pragmatic, or between Paolo Freire and Maurice Dartigue, as will be discussed. This might best describe my work as applied research, which in this study of Haiti will explore universal literacy and education’s potential to empower the rural populations of Haiti by promoting their self-realization and human development, and thus expanding their live choices.
Table of Contents

Intro: Why this study is important; Contribution to literature; Methodology and scope...........1
Part One: The purpose of education; Defining Human Development and Human Capital........14

Part Two: Examining the historic socio-cultural and economic climate in Haiti, and its impact on Haiti’s educational system and human development...............................26


Part Four: Innovation and human capital in Latin America and The Caribbean, and Haiti .......................................................................................................................40

Part Five: Efforts for Haitian education reform and results from mid-20th century to present, and the effects of national literary movements on socio-political development in Haiti, Dominican Republic and Cuba........................................43

Conclusion: Thoughts on the UN Human Development Index, literacy and Haiti’s future prospects for human development ........................................................................59
Appendix: Country statistics and indicators: Haiti, Dominican Republic and Cuba......61
-Statistic Sources: Freedom House, CIA World Factbook and UNICEF.62
-Summary analysis..................................................................................................66
Bibliography............................................................................................................68
A study of the historic inability by the Haitian education system to create human development and its consequences

Human development can be simply defined as a process of enlarging choices.

–UNDP definition of “human development”¹

Intro
Why this study is important

Shortly after the catastrophic 2010 earthquake, an article published in the Wall Street Journal began with the title, “To Help Haiti, End Foreign Aid”. It proceeded to predict that, “just about every conceivable aid scheme beyond immediate humanitarian relief will lead to more poverty, more corruption and less institutional capacity”. In November, 2011 in a GAO Report to the US Congressional Committees entitled “Haiti Reconstruction: Factors Contributing to Delays in USAID Infrastructure Construction”, the background profile on Haiti read that “Haiti is the poorest country in the Western Hemisphere, with more than 75 percent of the population living on less than $2 per day and unemployment rates estimated at 60 to 70 percent”.

In January of 2012, another WSJ article titled, “Two Years After the Quake, Haiti Remains in Distress”, claimed that “two years after an earthquake killed an untold number of Haitians, half a million people still live in squalid tent cities and rubble remains where it fell in this ruined city”². In the same year, US Department of State's website described Haiti as having one of the highest rates of infant mortality and illiteracy in the western hemisphere, one of the lowest national GDP's (a significant portion of the country's revenue owing to foreign aid and

¹ United Nations Development Program, “Definition of Human Development” in Arab development report
² “Ingred Arnesen: Two Years After Quake, Haiti Remains in Distress”, WSJ online
remittances from the US, France and Canada\(^3\), one of the highest rates of unemployment (perhaps as high as 80 percent), one of the highest incidents of AIDS, and finally, having an environmental and ecological “disaster” due to deforestation and soil exhaustion.

Until recently, much of Haiti’s capital still remained in rubble after the Jan, 2010 earthquake, as for example in the summer of 2012, when on a trip to Haiti the writer observed that the damage to the presidential palace was unchanged. Finally, although a recent Huffington Post article commemorating four years since the earthquake optimistically claimed that Haiti’s progress was “not always visible to the naked eye”\(^4\), the writer, having just returned from Haiti three months after the article, found Port au Prince to look pretty much as it did on his first trip to the country, more than 15 years prior, which one might view as progress, or regression.

Haiti’s long history of political instability, corruption, and foreign intervention has resulted in multi-generational illiteracy, political and economic underdevelopment and poverty for most of the country’s population of nine million. In 2011, “nearly 80% of public services and 70% of health services in rural areas (were) provided by non-governmental organizations”\(^5\).

Considering Haiti’s proximity to and dependency on the US and Canada, and the recent massive response effort by the international community to the 2010 earthquake that took over 230,000 lives and left hundreds of thousands of displaced people with billions of dollars in damage, its logical to make the assumption that North America and the international community have a significant investment in the promotion of human development in Haiti. This is not only because Haiti’s notorious dependency on North America and international community has earned it the name “Republic of NGO’s”, but also because everything that the people of the

---

\(^3\) Tatiana Wah, “Haiti’s development…”; Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”

\(^4\) Huffington Post, “Four years later…”

\(^5\) Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds in the rubble…”
United States so fervently cherish, and that they proudly claim their nation to embody -freedom, prosperity, health and protection- have been virtually absent in Haiti’s history.

Today, many argue that past European and American intervention in Haiti such as the war indemnity to France and US occupation and promotion of Haitian military\(^6\), has played an important role in much of the country’s current misfortune, but what the writer believes to have been the most significant culprit to Haiti’s past and current problems is the lack of access to education and illiteracy.

Contribution to current literature

In the 1980’s, the development narratives of scholars such as Bernard Salome that “only an improvement in the stock of human capital by means of education and training adapted to the reality of Haiti can help to solve the dilemma of ‘ill-development’”\(^7\), and those in the 90’s by Marc Prou that “education, socioeconomic development, and democratization are inextricably linked”\(^8\), shared a similar neo-liberal\(^9\) notion of national progress, where GDP was often taken to be the most reliable indicator of a society’s overall economic, political and social well-being.

When trying to understand the problems that poor and developing countries such as Haiti face, and judging which types of assistance might best help alleviate these countries’ hardships, many writers today in the fields of socio-economic development look through one of two theoretical lenses: that of a Marxist, where the problem of post-colonial dependency implies the

---

\(^6\) F. Pierre-Louis, “Earthquakes…”
\(^7\) Salomé, OECD papers.
\(^8\) Prou, “Haiti renewed…” Rothenberg, editor.
\(^9\) Hefferan, “Twinning faith…” pg. 46
need for separation of the rural poor from global capitalist influence, and that of a neo-liberal lens\textsuperscript{10}, where economic development is viewed as the goal of a nation or society.

The writer concurs with the philosophies of Marxist theorists such as R. Peet that human rather than economic development is the most representative indicator of life quality or progress for a people in a country such as Haiti, but is specifically interested in the contributions that literacy, and then education make to human development, and whether or not the UN’s Human Development Index (HDI) assigns them appropriate emphasis.

Some recent critical theories of western literacy such as those put forth by Street and Kleiman (see Part 3) have posited that western schooled literacy (reading and writing) has often been used by the more powerful colonial and post-colonial countries such as the U.S. as a means to dominate knowledge and exert socio-cultural and economic control over weaker and dependent ones such as Haiti. Although Kleiman’s research provides examples demonstrating that non-schooled forms of literacy such as oral instruction or narratives do serve essential functions for learning and knowledge transfer in traditional societies, the writer uses the educational theories of two foundational educationists, Paolo Freire and Maurice Dartigue, to evaluate the importance of book-literacy in the creation and promotion of human development for the rural poor in Haiti.

Central to the immensely influential Brazilian educator and social activist Paolo Freire’s (1921-1997) concept of a “Pedagogy of the Oppressed” were rural schools and adult literacy centers. Freire suggested that by cultivating a reality-specific conscientização, or critical consciousness centered around the rural peasantry’s “thematic universe”\textsuperscript{11}, that they could then

\textsuperscript{10} Hefferan, pg. 46
\textsuperscript{11} Freire, “Pedagogy…” pg. 96
identify their own problems and solutions, and therefore be empowered to define and create their own political and economic realities.

Like many before him, the extraordinarily talented and patriotic Haitian educationist Maurice Dartigue (1903-1983) saw literacy as a struggle against mass ignorance that kept most rural Haitians from achieving a technologically-advanced and economically secure modern life, as well as being governed by accountable, civically-responsible leaders.

This study uses Freire’s social-activist, pedagogical theories of dialogical and problem-posing literacy to achieve conscientização, and Dartigue’s more economically-pragmatic approaches to rural education and vocational training, as lenses from which to evaluate the potential for Haiti’s educational system to produce human development through high-level, universal literacy. The writer puts Freire’s pedagogy against oppression into philosophical conversation with Maurice Dartigue’s efforts to achieve economic development and progress among rural Haitians. Although Freire and Dartigue held different political and economic philosophies, the writer hypothesizes that combining the two as a hybrid approach can perhaps offer new insight into solutions to this problem of human and societal underdevelopment in Haiti.

In contrast to neo-liberal economic theory which places an inflated significance on the value of GNP as an indicator of a society’s development, progress and its members’ quality of life choices, or Marxist ideology that suggests the developing world’s rural poor will experience greater freedom if living in the absence of any global-capitalist influence, this study attempts to determine whether and how human development can be achieved in Haiti through education and
literacy, and if this will allow them to define and achieve the political and economic future that they will.

Methodology and study’s scope

In researching and writing this study, the writer has taken a multi-disciplinary approach that largely reflects his liberal-studies graduate course work to accomplish three tasks: First, to examine prevailing philosophies and theories regarding the value and role of literacy and education in the creation of human development. Second, to determine, by examining Haitian history and cross-country comparisons with the Dominican Republic and Cuba’s education and literary histories, why Haiti’s education system has apparently failed to produce human development for the Haitian people. Third, to construct a hypothesis for a literacy-focused education policy that could be implemented to produce needed human development, economic independence and political stability for Haiti.

This study of Haiti’s education and development is viewed in the context of its socio-cultural and economic history. Although this subject will likely be most interesting to Haitian and North American educators and policy-makers, the intended audience is any person, lay or academic, that desires to know more about the cultural and political history of the Haitian people, how that history has influenced the level and quality of education in Haiti, and ultimately, help the reader better understand the role that human development (or lack of) has played in creating the present socio-economic and political reality of the Haitian people.

The sources used in this investigation are mostly secondary source academic books and papers and news articles in the fields of Haitian history, development, economics, education and literacy theory. The writer has also used primary resource documents such as the biography of
Haitian educator Maurice Dartigue (written by Dartigue’s spouse, Ester), as well as referenced his own personal experiences in Haiti, and social network that includes Haitian teachers and friends, and business associates in Haiti for first-hand accounts regarding education and life in Haiti.

The presidency of Francois Duvalier from 1957-1971 was chosen as the starting point from which to review modern Haiti’s education system, as perhaps no other period of leadership in the country’s recent history did more to generate a brain-drain that depleted Haiti of many of its most skilled and educated professionals, and thus contributing to Haiti’s current lack of human development\(^\text{12}\). The writer also provides a survey of Haiti’s past and current political, economic and social problems, as well as those successful efforts that should be viewed as exemplars for the future promotion of human development in Haiti.

Furthermore, the goal of this study will not be to determine what type of vocational training, or higher education that the youth in Haiti should pursue to maximize income or their purchasing power…this has already been addressed for many decades by economic theorists such as Salomé and Prou as well as organizations such as RAND\(^\text{13}\) and the World Bank\(^\text{14}\). Rather, the questions that this study asks and aims to answer are whether or not literacy and education are valuable for Haiti, and if so, how they can be promoted and utilized by the Haitian government through its education system to create human development.

Haiti and its education system in historical and contemporary literature

Haiti’s early 19\(^{th}\)-century “national” writers were men who, much like the American revolutionary thinkers before and after their war of independence, were concerned with

---

12 Polyné, “The idea...” pg. 139
13 RAND Corp., “Restructuring...”
14 World Bank, “Factors impacting...”
defending their new nation’s sovereignty, and also discussing how their country should function politically, socially and economically. Gordon Lewis says that for the new Latin American and Caribbean nations, “…economic backwardness, political immaturity, the almost total absence of general popular education, and (a) large reading public” created a climate of political, economic and artistic thinking that was highly dependent on European style\textsuperscript{15}. Lewis says that for Haiti, this meant “living in a cultural desert…obliged to write for the metropolitan audience…in French”\textsuperscript{16}.

In Haiti, where historically only privileged, literate and educated men wrote about their country’s revolution, political and economic aspirations, and national identity, the result was a body of writing reflecting the liberal sentiments of a “Rousseauistic petty-bourgeois”\textsuperscript{17} whose socio-political ideologies amounted to the belief that their government was essentially a “neutral force to be used by the ‘enlightened’ and ‘educated’ class in the interests of all”\textsuperscript{18}.

In North America, many of the prevailing 19\textsuperscript{th}-century beliefs that guided and continue to guide popular thinking about what Haiti is and who the Haitian people are (ex: African, poor, politically unstable, uneducated, superstitious and violent have been rooted in real historical experiences related to Haiti’s unique cultural and linguistic isolation, its violent slave rebellion and subsequent post-revolution alienation throughout the 19\textsuperscript{th}-century by France, the U.S. and other sugar and slave-dependent economies. At the same time, many of these historic stereotypes of Haiti are misinformed\textsuperscript{19}.

\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{15}] Lewis, “Main currents…” pg. 304
\item[\textsuperscript{16}] Lewis, pg. 304
\item[\textsuperscript{17}] Seeking to identify with the French upper-class
\item[\textsuperscript{18}] Lewis, pg. 262
\item[\textsuperscript{19}] Hefferson, “Twinning faith…” pg. 185
\end{itemize}
In 2012, an announcement for a CUNY Graduate School seminar titled “Telling Histories” sponsored by the Department of Humanities, and featuring Haiti Historian Laurent Dubois read: “While Haiti’s complex and cursed past was often used by journalists to explain its recent and tragic upheaval, these historical retellings frequently did more to malign and undermine the promising cultural and political forces the country was founded on than to illuminate them”. It proceeded to ask, “How might historians and other academics responsibly and effectively contribute to a global public discourse?”

The approach of an academic historian such as Dubois to the framing of Haiti’s history and present struggles is to reexamine old assumptions and beliefs with the hope of stimulating new discourse about what happened in the past, and what it means for the future. At the same time, even if American and European scholarship and media has often contributed to erroneous representations of Haiti as a backward, voodoo-practicing, culturally African and economically-subsistent society, it’s still important to acknowledge that Haiti has historically been politically undemocratic, linguistically and culturally isolated, and at least in rural Haiti, a society heavily influenced by the former slaves’ west-African culture. In many ways, rural Haiti today still resembles a 19th-century peasant society of former African slaves preserved in the modern Caribbean.

In acknowledgement of Dubois’ hypothesis, there is a long tradition by North American and European scholars and news media of addressing Haiti from the context of a political, economic and cultural “problem”. Although the Haitian slaves and their leaders had followed in the footsteps of both the American and French revolutions in throwing off their subjugation to European monarchies, the early Haitian state was met with a cool reception by the United States.

---

20 Title of 2012 Dubois seminar at CUNY GC
21 Dubois, “Aftershocks…” pg. 157, church report from 1861
and England, both of which at the time were heavily invested in the cotton, sugar and coffee
economies, and the US itself being a nation with slavery (achieving abolition 60 years after
Haiti).

As suggested above by Dubois, the paradigm of violence has been particularly prevalent
in the American narratives of Haiti, when accounts of Haiti’s slave insurrection and later
independence in 1804 were written about by north American observers such as Thomas
Jefferson\textsuperscript{22} through the lens of a violent slave uprising, where thousands of (white) men, woman
and children had been killed, and the world’s most productive sugar colony reduced to ashes.

But discussions about Haiti were not always negative. Commentaries on Haiti’s military
leaders such as Toussaint L’Ouverture (1743-1803), their rebellion and new nation were
common among contemporary European intellectuals. According to Susan Buck-Morss, “events
in Saint-Dominque were central to the contemporary attempts to make sense out of the reality of
the French Revolution and its aftermath”\textsuperscript{23} and contends that G.W.F. Hegel’s (1770-1831)
dialectic of lordship and bondage\textsuperscript{23} which re-characterized man’s struggle for liberty as slaves
vs. masters was inspired by the events in Haiti. Furthermore, contemporary writers of the Haitian
revolution such as Archenholz, founder of the German publication Minerva that was read
regularly by Hegel, found reason to praise L’Ouverture for his “character, leadership, and
humanity in superlatives”\textsuperscript{24}.

During and after its struggle for independence, several European writers also described
with enthusiasm the attempts by King Henry Christophe to establish institutions for the
education of the children whose fathers had served in the revolution. One early witness of this

\textsuperscript{22}Spears and Barotte, editors. “The Haitian Creole…” pg. 29
\textsuperscript{24}Buck-Morss, “Hegel, Haiti…”, pg. 43
effort to create an educated class in Haiti was an Englishman who observed King Christophe’s Lancastrian-style school in Cap-Francois. In comparing a familiar Lancastrian school in England to the one he saw in Haiti, the visitor admitted that he “could not perceive its superiority, in point of general discipline to that consisting of the Haytian youth at Cape-Francois”\(^{25}\).

Unfortunately, Haiti’s early need to remain in a battle-ready state\(^{26}\) dissuaded leaders such as Jean-Pierre Boyer (1776-1850) from contributing the necessary resources to set Haitian education on firm footing. Boyer is also credited with having fatally committed Haiti to the war reparation of 150 million francs to France for recognizing its independence (approximately 20 billion US today). While it was later reduced to 50 million, modern historians often cite this early immense financial liability as having set Haiti on a path of economic ruin and future dependency on foreign loans and assistance throughout the later 19\(^{th}\) and 20\(^{th}\) centuries. It has also been hypothesized that this period of great financial burden between 1804 and 1915 was the most significant in terms of impacting Haiti’s future inability to develop a national educational plan and system.\(^{27}\)

Like other post-colonial societies in Latin America, economics has not been the only facet of dependency that Haiti has historically faced. As R. Peet says, “the Third World is made dependent on the First World for knowledge…about itself”. This includes “the export of raw data from the Third World to the First, where its surplus is realized as theories and then exported back to the Third World as pearls of wisdom”\(^{28}\). Furthermore, the fact that much of Haiti’s history has been one of a largely illiterate society has arguably played a significant role in Haiti

---

\(^{25}\) Clement, “The history of education…”

\(^{26}\) For Haiti’s first thirty years as a nation, it struggled for official recognition from France and the U.S., during which time it also strived to remain ready to repel any attempt by France to reacquire its former colony. (see Clement)

\(^{27}\) F. Pierre-Louis, “Earthquakes…”

\(^{28}\) Peet and Hartwick, “Theories of development…”, pg. 213
being defined historically and culturally by others. Clement claimed that “until 1915, a great number of Haitian political leaders, including many of the monarchs and presidents, could barely read and write”, and that “besides illiterate chiefs of state, most political regimes did not provide leadership and continuity because the continual struggle for power fed turmoil and civil strife” 29.

In the late 1950’s, when a well-educated ethnologist, and presumed benevolent Francois Duvalier became president, the world eagerly awaited a promising “new era” or “new Haiti”, which has been a historical theme in Haitian political propaganda30. Although Duvalier and other Haitian-nationalist scholars attempted to create a “counter narrative to European cultural hegemony…”31, ironically, by the end of his presidency Duvalier had become perhaps the most tyrannical and economically scandalous leader in Haiti’s history.

Finally, insight from T. Hefferan’s research on “twinning” between a Catholic parish in Haiti, and one in Michigan can perhaps provide us a window from which to look into ourselves as Americans and examine our own cultural preconceptions. She concludes that from the vantage point of the American community in her study and their “positions of relative power and privilege” in relationship to their Haitian parish twin and its parishioners, where they essentially “establish the parameters of twinning and development”, that the Haitians’ poverty is ultimately the framework from which their American twin community views them:

“Whether they are esteemed for their focus on family, greater spirituality, and lack of materialism…or chastised for their illiteracy, laziness, evasiveness, or dishonesty, Haitians are

29 Clement, “History of…”
30 The writer thinks he read these themes in Rotberg’s “Haiti Renewed”, but they have certainly been used by leaders such as Aristide, and recycled by others such as President Clinton.
31 Polyné, “The idea…”, pg. 215
understood in terms of their poverty…in terms of what it gives them, what it denies them, and why it exists”32.

The question of whether or not Haitians are truly “poor”, is a fascinating, and legitimate one, but in respect to illiteracy in Haiti, it is not just a framework from which to view Haitians (as pointed out by Hefferan)…but also a grave fact and reality.

Hefferan’s and Peet’s thoughts prompt important reflection: Does mass illiteracy serve to perpetuate a predatory state, and thus keep Haitians from demanding that their government address their needs? Are rural Haiti's traditions of economic subsistence33 contributing to the country’s progressive depletion of resources, and subsequent dependence on the international community for life's basic necessities such as food, water and medicine? And finally, is the Creole language isolating Haitians from their English and Spanish-speaking neighbors, and limiting Haiti’s educational resources and knowledge-sharing power?

These questions are open for debate, and will be explored. Nevertheless, nearly everyone knowledgeable about Haiti agrees, as both doctors Paul Farmer and Laurent Dubois have consistently pointed out, that Haiti’s weak and corrupt political system and institutions, and especially its education system, have done more than anything to stifle human development that has been critical for the betterment of the lives of Haitian people.

32 Hefferan, “Twinning faith…”, pg. 185
33 See Kakou cooperatives in Lundahl’s “Politics or markets?”
PART ONE: The purpose of education; Defining Human Development and Human Capital

According to article 32.2 of the current Haitian constitution (1987), “The first responsibility of the state...is the education of the masses, which is the only way the country can be developed”. 34

There is little purpose in addressing the question of whether or not humans need food, water and shelter, or medical care when sick. Nor is it necessary to question the importance of familiar love, bonds of friendship, or the basic norms of acceptable behavior in human societies that are culturally universal. Furthermore, the fact that nearly every human tribe, society or nation in history has subscribed some kind of supernatural belief system, testifies to the fact that humans also have innate and universal spiritual needs.

We’re going to take for granted those individual needs at the bottom of Maslow’s hierarchy (the physiological, social and emotional) 35, and address those needs and desires of the Haitian people at the top of the pyramid that are more closely associated with self-realization and actualization (or human development). What we must ask is: What are those innate human needs and desires that Haitians (like all other people in our world) have, and have their country’s leaders and education policies effectively addressed those needs and desires?

According to Paolo Freire, the need for a people to achieve conscientização or a critical consciousness is imperative for their lives as politically and economically-free individuals:

34 Hebblethwaite, “French and underdevelopment…”
35 “Maslow’s hierarchy…”, http://www.simplypsychology.org/maslow.html
“The important thing, from the point of view of libertarian education, is for the people to come to feel like masters of their thinking by discussing the thinking and views of the world explicitly or implicitly manifest in their own suggestions and those of their comrades”. 36

For approximately the last 150 years, much of the world’s population has shifted from rural to urban living, with different opinions regarding why this urbanization has occurred; whether it is a natural and necessary progression for mankind, or rather due to the exogenous pressures of global western-capitalism. For example, Ester Dartigue suggested that the rural Haitian peasant’s ‘exodus to the cities’ originated with the disastrous effects that the SHADA program (initiative of Roosevelt’s Good-Neighbor policy37) had on the peasant’s land in the Morne des Commissaires region38, while F Pierre-Louis cites the international NGO’s influence on Duvalier’s encouragement of the Haitian peasant to relocate to Port au Prince and seek jobs in the assembly sector39.

In the countries such as Argentina and the U.S., the transition from manual to mechanized cultivation of crops such as wheat and corn have turned millions of acres of soil-rich land into these nations’ breadbaskets. The increased out-put of food staples by modern farmers has undoubtedly coincided with urbanization of the world’s population over the course of the 20th century. Furthermore (although more so in Europe), the diminishing size of family farms as the consequence of property being passed down from one generation to the next, has also served to promote the consolidation of family farming into the larger, more technological and profit-driven industrial farming.

36 Freire, “Pedagogy…”, pg. 124
37 E. Dartigue, “An outstanding Haitian…”, pg. 71
38 E. Dartigue, pg. 88
39 F. Pierre-Louis, “Earthquakes…”, pg. 196
Yet in Haiti, these same evolutionary forces that define rural life (yet without a proportional increase in technological development) have been identified by many scholars of development economics as the primary reason for the increasing impoverishment of the Haitian peasant over the last century. From a Malthusian perspective\textsuperscript{40}, the number of people to feed in Haiti continues to grow, but the amount of land from which to produce food is diminishing in both quantity and quality. Furthermore, as was frequently pointed out by Maurice Dartigue, in addition to continued low agro-technology, contributing to rural Haiti’s diminishing quality and quantity of land is the fact that methods to control erosion historically have been rarely applied\textsuperscript{41}.

Furthermore, global urbanization trend of the late 19\textsuperscript{th} and 20\textsuperscript{th} centuries has deeper roots than simply the decreasing availability of land for farming\textsuperscript{42}. As Marxist interpretations suggest (and which are fairly empirical in the most highly-industrialized, capitalistic countries such as the U.S. or Japan), in addition to the transfer of employment opportunities from rural to urban locations, the increasingly industrialized nature of production has also resulted in a growing desire (or dependence) for the products and adjoining lifestyle that the modern industrial (urban) world promises to provide (Say’s law; “supply creates its own demand”\textsuperscript{43}). Karl Marx (1818-1883) called this growing desire by the general population for the mass produced goods of the capitalist industrial world “commodity fetishism”\textsuperscript{44}, which is the center of the Marxist economic critique of western and especially American capitalism, as well as the neo-liberal, human capital concept of development.

\textsuperscript{40} Foley, “Adam’s Fallacy”, pg. 58
\textsuperscript{41} M. Dartigue, “Rural education…”, pg. 31
\textsuperscript{42} This phenomenon has played out in varying degrees between developed-industrialized nations and traditional-rural countries such as the U.S. and Haiti, where scarcity of land for traditional farming has certainly played a larger role in urbanization in Haiti than in the U.S.
\textsuperscript{43} “Say’s Law of markets”, http://www.investopedia.com/terms/s/says-law.asp
\textsuperscript{44} Foley, “Adam’s Fallacy”, pg. 110
This form of Says Law which describes the shift in production and consumption patterns from those of rural, to those of urban and technologically-centered needs, has defined the transition in lifestyle for most of the world from the end of the 19th century to the present, and is the same shift in which Haiti currently struggles to transition from its traditional rural forms of knowledge and education, to those of the modern, urban, industrial and capitalist world.

Ironically, scholars such as Mats Lundahl have described the chronic shortage of educational institutions, resources and thus educated people in Haiti as a kind of “Say’s law in reverse”, where “the lack of education stands out not only as a supply problem, but as one of insufficient demand that is linked to insufficient supply through decreasing returns to human capital formation”\(^45\).

Globalized education: The human development and human capital dilemma

Modern scholars of education history and theory such as Bowles and Gintis have pointed out that this debate regarding the inherent purpose or value of public education, and how it should be conducted dates to the beginnings of the 19th century with foundational theorists such as Horace Mann (1796-1859) and John Dewey (1859-1952)\(^46\). In the industrialized western nations of the mid to late 19th century such as the United States and Canada, discussions about the purpose of public education centered around leading citizen's desires to provide vocational training to promote a skilled labor force, maintain social control and reduce delinquency, and, the inculcation of Christian morals\(^47\).

Mann began, and Dewey continued a nearly centuries-long discussion regarding the role of education in changing or improving the economic position of students. Dewey claimed “it is

\(^45\) Rotberg, editor., “Haiti Renewed”, pg. 66
\(^46\) Bowles and Gintis, “Schooling in Capitalist…”, pgs. 212
\(^47\) Tyack, “The one best…”, pg. 84
the office of the school environment...to see to it that each individual gets an opportunity to escape from the limitations of the social group in which he was born, and to come into living contact with a broader environment"\textsuperscript{48}. Horace Mann, while secretary of the Massachusetts State Board of Education, espoused his belief that both capitalism and education could work hand in hand to produce a freer, more equal society, claiming that “capitalists and his agents...do not promote a dunce to a station where he will destroy raw materials or slacken industry because of his name, birth or family connections”\textsuperscript{49}, therefore ensuring an equal opportunity to rise socially and economically to anyone with proper education, training and moral character.

Similarly, in the 1930s and 40s, Haiti’s innovative and patriotic educationist, Maurice Dartigue, also saw education of the rural masses as essential for the realization of their civic roles, and intelligent planning for their nation’s socio-economic development. In reference to both the civil and educational institutions that were left in the hands of the Haitian authorities upon the exit of US occupation (1915-1934), Dartigue said:

“Now it is up to us to protect these services and from political intervention, favoritism and anti-administrative and anti-governmental measures...the masses must be educated so that they can watch over to see that the services are run properly. If the masses are educated they will no longer accept seeing the roads they use deteriorate through lack of upkeep. They will no longer accept that hospitals and clinics cease to function, nor accept untrained doctors or nurses, nor illiterate teachers. They will see the difference between good and bad schools and will not tolerate the latter anymore. They no longer will permit their representatives to vote laws contrary to their interests...”\textsuperscript{50}

\textsuperscript{48} Bowles and Gintis, pg. 142  
\textsuperscript{49} Bowles and Gintis, “Schooling...”, pg. 23  
\textsuperscript{50} E. Dartigue, “An outstanding Haitian...”, pg. 17
These thoughts concerning the value and purpose of education in a society should cause us to reflect on the role that education (or lack of) has played in Haiti’s history and socio-economic development. Considering Haiti’s history and current reality, what should most rightfully be the end purpose of public education for Haiti? Should it be, as Plato might have suggested, to construct social classes that will each carry out specific functions for the promotion of a higher public virtue? Or, as Dewey, Mann or Dartigue might have suggested, to enfranchise the poor to achieve higher socio-economic status, while promoting moral character and civic responsibility?

These are perhaps the most profound and critical questions that one can ask regarding education in Haiti, or in any society.

Definitions or interpretations of what development means vary by context. For example, the United Nations Development Program has created a Human Development Index (HDI), which, in addition to taking account of basic measures such as nourishment, health and security, measures the degree of life choices promoting individual self-realization and actualization that a particular society can provide its people. In 2008, out of a scale from 1.0 to 0.1, many European countries and the U.S. scored 0.9 (considered high), while Haiti was one of the 31 countries that scored below 0.5, which is considered low human development.

Education and development can be viewed as a “chicken or the egg” dilemma. We might ask, did our early ancestors, going back thousands of years, first begin to develop their surroundings, and then later decide to educate themselves, or did the reverse happen? Or, was it necessary that the two happened simultaneously? Any discussion regarding education must include a discussion about its end goal, or how it should lead to development, either individual or

---

51 See ‘warrior guardians’ and ‘philosopher kings’ in Plato’s “Republic”
52 Peet and Hartwick, “Theories of development…”, pg. 8
social. On the other hand, since our concepts of human development seem to depend on pre-
conceptions of what a developed person or society should be or look like, it seems logical that it
requires a certain degree of socio-cultural development before determining what kind of
knowledge and skills are necessary to achieve a desired development goal.\(^5\)

In the same way, a discussion about Haiti’s future prospects for economic and political
viability must be based upon the Haitian people’s requisite wisdom or knowledge of what kind of
education will produce their desired development outcome in Haiti’s population. If Haiti is to
go from where it is now…largely illiterate, poor, politically and economically unstable, and
being greatly dependent upon foreign assistance…to where it (ought) to go, or, as Freire would
suggest, how the Haitian people think it ought to be, the common rural Haitian must have the
requisite knowledge and wisdom to envision an alternative future for themselves and their
country.

Theorists such as R. Peet remind us that central to the poststructuralist and anti-
Eurocentric critique of development theory is the very term “development” itself, and whether its
western conception is automatically to be taken as something good, or desirable for all people.\(^4\)
In this study, the writer equates human development (the people in a society as a whole) with
self-realization or actualization (individual persons).

The definitively western enlightenment concept of development of human societies\(^5\) is
one of a cultural, technological, and spiritual development through multiple evolutionary
stages.\(^6\) Just as humans have supposedly evolved from lower species via survival of the fittest,
this notion of development posits that humans societies have also evolved from primitive (low-

---

5 Bory-Adams, “Educational policies…”, pg. 45
4 Peet and Hartwick, “Theories of development…”, pg. 212
5 Hefferan, “Twinning faith…”, pg. 168
6 Peet and Hartwick, “Theories…”, pg. 126; Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”, pg. 537; Hefferson, pgs. 168 and 174
technology and political organization, non-literate and polytheistic) to advanced (technologically innovating, politically complex, literate and monotheistic). As the concept of development can certainly be a subjective one, reflecting the differences in values, beliefs and resources between human beings and their societies around the world, for this reason, the western, evolutionary conception of development is now often criticized as Euro-centric, and therefore inappropriate as an analytical framework from which to judge non-western societies or cultures.

Nevertheless, it is important to keep in mind that there are many examples of development and innovation such as oral and written literacy, farming and herding, painting and poetry and religious worship that reflect universal cultural knowledge and values among nearly all humans and their communities. For example, nearly all human societies, whether large or small, technologically simple or complex, have made at least some innovations to improve their hunting and farming, and their historical recording-keeping, and have recognized the advantages of political organization and community cooperation for survival and protection.

The 20th century human capital theory of development which was first espoused by educational theorists such as Schultz, Denison and Becker, was widely influential in the educational development and assistance policies towards Latin America and Haiti of both UNESCO57 as well as the U.S.’s Reagan administration in the 70’s and 80’s58. In the post-WWII era, political-scientists concerned with global education and economic development such as Garrett and Bory-Adams pointed out that in the aftermath of WWII, much of the interest on the part of the developed countries such as the U.S., England and France to foster “development” in the 3rd-world stemmed from a desire for global economic and political stability, as well as

57 United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
58 Bory-Adams, “Educational policies…”, pg. 162
concerns over the growing influence (or threat) of Soviet Communism as well as Marxist socio-economic movements such as those in Cuba or China59.

As economic hardship and “red scare” were essentially at the roots of the second world war and following Cold War conflict, developed and democratically “free” donor countries such as the U.S. and England have traditionally espoused a policy of aid to countries such as Haiti and the rest of Latin America based on their ideological premises of the superiority of a free-enterprise economy, democratically-elected governments and broad civil liberties (as valued in their own countries)60. Essential to the plans of 1st-world countries for the development of 3rd-world countries has been the promotion and replication of these donor countries’ education systems in the recipient countries.

Since the 1960’s and 70’s, these politically and economically western assistance policies for developing regions such as Latin America and the Caribbean have been challenged by world-systems and education theorists such as Bowles and Gintis as perpetuating the economic dependence and subservience of developing nations (such as Haiti) to the developed nations such as the U.S. Furthermore, Marxist philosophers of rural education such as Paolo Freire have argued that the typical western educational model has only served to reinforce capitalistic economic systems that suppress individuals’ and communities’ self-realization and actualization, and therefore “oppress” those peoples who exist on the fringes of modern society and its material wealth: the rural peasantry.

Freire and Dartigue: Rural literacy and education from the approaches of social justice and economic pragmatism

59 Bory-Adams, “Educational policies…”, pg. 162; Garrett, “Education and…”, pg. 80
60 Garrett, “Education and development”, pg. 80; UNESCO, LA AFP
“The starting point for organizing the program content of education or political action must be the present, existential, concrete situation, reflecting the aspiration of the people. Utilizing certain basic contradictions, we must pose this existential, concrete, present situation to the people as a problem which challenges them and requires a response—not just at the intellectual level, but at the level of action”.  

-P. Freire

“What kind of education can adequately meet the needs of the Haitian peasantry?...Reading is certainly an important tool of knowledge and a sound education implies literacy. But under the present conditions, economic proficiency is more important…If the Haitian government had the money available to undertake a restricted program of mass education, and had to make the choice between literacy and economic proficiency, it would be wiser to develop craft work, such as making of baskets that could be sold in the United States, than to attempt to wipe out illiteracy immediately”

-M. Dartigue

The education philosophy and methodology of early 20th century Brazilian educationalist and social activist Paolo Freire has perhaps had more impact on contemporary ideas about critical education for the rural poor in Latin America than any other. Freire’s canonical work, “Pedagogy of the Oppressed”, is a manifesto on both the oppressive, as well as liberating potential behind western schooled literacy, learning and technology, as well as a quintessential example of self-directed and critical human development theory.

Freire proposed that when the minds of students serve only as reciprocals of a dominant culture’s knowledge (which Freire referred to as the banking form of instruction) and elitist socio-economic agenda, their education then only serves as a means for their control and subjugation. On the other hand, when literacy and learning assumes a dialogical nature with vocabulary revolving around the rural student’s own cultural realities, it then promotes the student’s awareness of self, environment, and socio-economic reality, and thus serves to

---

61 Freire, “Pedagogy…”, pg. 95
62 Dartigue, “Rural Education…”, pg. 35
empower them to improve their conditions, and assert their political will. Freire called this awakening of the student’s internal and external awareness their critical consciousness.

Maurice Dartigue’s upbringing in Les Cayes, Haiti would have been considered privileged for that time and place. His father was a lawyer, and his family had the means to provide him a superior, higher education. He studied for his graduate education in the US, receiving his MA in education at Columbia University, where he also met his Hungarian wife, Ester.

After his studies, Dartigue and his wife returned to Haiti where he served honorably as the Director of Rural Education (1931-41), the Minister of Public Instruction (1941-1945) and finally the Minister of Agriculture and Labor (under the SHADA^{63} program). Although the political and economic upheaval from the SHADA program required that Dartigue and his family leave Haiti, he then took a position with the UNESCO (1956-60), where he was responsible for the designing and implementing of education programs in several African countries^{64}.

Dartigue’s philosophies of education and development for the rural and urban Haitian people were perhaps closely aligned with those of the early and mid-19th century educationalists such as Egerton Ryerson (1802-1882) and Horace Mann (1796-1859), as well as today’s neo-liberal development ideologies. Rural development for Dartigue meant the acquisition of modern technological methods of production and farming. Progress meant the elimination of ignorance through literacy, economic savviness, and intelligent civic participation and planning.

---

^{63} Societe Haitiano-Americaine de Developpement Agricole

^{64} “Dartigue”, http://dartigue.com/
Disregarding for the moment the different economic and political objectives of each of
the two education-philosophers, for this writer, the essential similarity between Freire and
Dartigue lies in their understandings of how educated individuals are the foundation of a society
with human development. Although theorists such as Benedict Anderson\textsuperscript{65} have posited the
greater influence of the elite state as opposed to the community in the creation of national
cultural identities such as language and customs, for Freire and Dartigue, it is clearly in those
societies where lack of education and ignorance characterize the commoner, such as the Haitian
peasant, that they are most subjected to the socio-cultural bias and economic designs of the
privileged and educated class, such as the French-speaking elite of Port au Prince.

If a Marxist such as Freire proposed an education system for the rural masses that would
inculcate a critical consciousness in the people of their socio-economic and political oppression
in order to empowered them to take control of their reality and future, Maurice Dartigue’s rural
education philosophy perhaps more closely resembled the status quo in that rather than calling on
the rural masses to use education and literacy as a means to overturn socio-economic power
structures, Dartigue directed his efforts in Haiti at condemning “negligence and mediocrity”
among the teachers of rural schools\textsuperscript{66}, and devising a national education system that would
“struggle against ignorance” and “launch the country on the road to development and
progress”\textsuperscript{67}.

\textsuperscript{65} See Anderson’s “Imagined Communities”
\textsuperscript{66} E. Dartigue, “An outstanding Haitian…”, pg. 34
\textsuperscript{67} M. Dartigue, “An economic program for Haiti”
**PART TWO:** Examining the historic socio-cultural and economic climate in Haiti, and its impact on Haiti’s educational system and human development.

Historic challenges to Haiti’s education system

As explained earlier by historian Clement, although the history of education in Haiti can be defined as having noble, early attempts by leaders such as King Christophe and Alexander Pétion (1770-1818) to establish public education, in the decades that followed independence, political and financial instability, and even more significantly, the Port au Prince elite’s general neglect of rural education, has resulted in what is today an obvious failure to produce anything close to universal literacy, or quality mass education in Haiti.

From its earliest years as a French colony, through its independence, and continuing today, Haitian society has been divided by class, culture and color. Although this is not a unique feature of a colonial or post-colonial Caribbean society, Haiti is a unique case in that contrary to almost any other country in Latin America, the former slaves in Haiti retained control of much of the cultivable land, and have survived since emancipation through subsistence farming on small individual and familial holdings. The prevailing historical narrative explains that the origin of Haiti’s modern socio-economic stratification is found in its history of landholding:

With the eviction of white Europeans from the former San Dominic colony by the revolutionaries, Haiti’s population was then reduced to the formerly landed and French-speaking *mulatto affranchise*\(^\text{68}\), the military class, and the largely Creole-speaking former slaves. Upon release from slavery, the former slaves resisted efforts on the part of the revolutionary leadership

---

\(^{68}\) Mintz, “Can Haiti change?”
such as H. Christophe to revive the plantation economy, and instead took small rural land holdings for subsistence farming, which then created what some have called the only authentic post-Columbian “peasant” society in the Americas. As a consequence, since the formerly landed mulatto families could not regain control of plantation agriculture or labor, they therefore monopolized the political process and tax system, as well as other industries such as the import and export sector and its revenues\(^6\).

---

Although there is a long tradition of shared nationalistic sentiment among Haitians of all classes (which has been universally aroused in response to national threats such as the first American occupation; 1915-1934)\(^7\), the socio-economic and political consequence of this established order has been a culture divided by skin color, language, cultural traditions, religious practices, level of education and ultimately, wealth. The analogy of a predatory state\(^7\) has been popularly used to describe the historic relationship between the elite-run, military-supported, and Port au Prince-centered national government where the office of the presidency has most often been viewed as a source of wealth and power acquisition, and a means of placing family and friends in supportive positions to provide protection…and a largely illiterate and poor peasantry, or moun aneyo\(^7\) that has been little more concerned than with the subsistence farming passed on by their west-African ancestors.

Perhaps it is not correct to say that all of the historic misfortunes of Haiti’s poor have been due to their neglect by the elite Port au Prince individuals or families (ex: Maurice Dartigue), it is true to say that this, combined with unending political strife and power struggles

---

\(^6\) Mintz, “Can Haiti change?”
\(^7\) Polyne, “The idea…”, pg. 215
\(^7\) Lundahl, “Politics or markets?”, pg. 255
\(^7\) Polyne, “The idea…”, pg. 95
resulting in the historical lack of constitutional authority and institutional heritage, and coupled with poor, mismanaged or even non-existent national education plans, have in 200 years produced the poorest, most unhealthy, most illiterate, and most economically-dependent nation in the Americas today.

Considering these facts, the reason for Haiti being so bad off today, upon entering the second decade of the 21st century, is probably not because the majority of people in Haiti after its independence were former slaves, but as Rotburg says, because of the lack of a “founding and persevering ‘social contract’” in Haiti between those that had and have education, power and resources, and those that do not. Instead of education producing human development for all Haitians, and closing the vast socio-economic gap between the haves and have-nots, the lack of rural resources and education has simply caused it to widen.

French and Creole languages and teaching in Haitian society and education

Recent studies by neuropsychologists have suggested that the first few years of a child’s life are foundational for that child’s cognitive development of phonemic awareness. As explained by M. Posner and M. Rothbart, “this adaption involves sharpening of the boundaries around their native language phonemes, but also the loss of the ability to discriminate phonemes in other languages”.

In other words, our brains are pre-conditioned in our earliest years to begin to recognize the phonics of our native mother tongue, and discriminate between those, and sounds we hear in other languages. The implications for this are significant when a child begins to read, as their mind has already been pre-conditioned to de-code the sounds that make up the words of their

---

73 Rotberg, “Haiti past…”
74 Posner and Rothbard, “Educating the human brain”, pg. 166
spoken native language. Furthermore, the ability to phonetically decode written words is recognized by educators as an essential tool for development of early reading\textsuperscript{75}.

These discoveries about the development of phonemic awareness in children’s brains, and its later implication for reading and writing, reveal much about the historic failure of the Haitian educational system to produce literacy. Until very recently, one of the many and most significant supposed obstacles to the achievement of universal literacy in Haiti has been the primary use of French instruction, accompanied by French language textbooks in Haiti’s classrooms. Most contemporary education and linguistic scholars such as Arthur Spears now subscribe to the commonsensical idea that since the vast majority of Haitian people including public teachers speak Creole as their first and only language of fluency, while only a small percentage of the population has more than basic conversational and writing knowledge of French, that the use of French language education has historically been, and continues to be detrimental to the promotion of literacy and therefore education in Haiti.

Educationist Benjamin Hebblethwaite points out that international data on the “use of a second language in school correlates with high illiteracy and poverty”\textsuperscript{76}, and provides a concise critique of the traditional Haitian school curriculum:

“The curriculum, which is based upon an early twentieth century French model, lacks relevancy because teachers provide one-way classical exposition to passive student ‘vessels’ who are expected to memorize French instead of mastering content”\textsuperscript{77}.

Although in the early 1940’s, Haiti’s national director of Rural Education, Maurice Dartigue, acknowledged that the use of the Creole language in Haitian children’s’ initial three

\begin{footnotesize}
\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{75} “The role of decoding in learning to read”, http://www.scholastic.com/dodea/Module_2/resources/dodea_m2_pa_roledecod.pdf
\item \textsuperscript{76} Hebblethwaite, “French and underdevelopment…”
\item \textsuperscript{77} Hebblethwaite
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
grades (before they would switch to French instruction) was “building up a pride in, and a sympathetic appreciation for local culture”\(^{78}\), Dartigue’s primary interest in rural literacy was perhaps mostly to address their “lack of knowledge of modern methods of agriculture”\(^ {79}\). Even today, efforts to provide Creole-language instruction are burdened by the historic dearth of Creole language material, which would have been an even greater obstacle for Creole instruction in the 1940’s.

Complicating the problem of a historic preference by the mulatto and upper-class Haitian society for speaking French, and for French instruction at all levels of Haitian education, has been that until very recently, this prejudice against Creole instruction was also shared by many poor, rural Haitian\(^ {80}\). Although Hebblethwaite claims that this attitude is changing among the rural and middle-class parents, it is still prevalent among the wealthier Port au Prince classes, whose belief in creole “exceptionalism” (that creole is essentially a primitive, inadequate language for reading, writing and thus learning), and “expression of class self-interest”\(^ {81}\) continues to make them resistant to Creole language instruction.

In addition to the historic prejudice by the French-speaking elite against Creole instruction for its perceived linguistic “inferiority”, Bernard and other scholars have noted similarly negative attitudes among both social classes in Haiti (rural poor and wealthy urban) for the teaching profession. Although not altogether dissimilar from attitudes in wealthier, developed countries such as the U.S., Bernard says that many of the most talented and qualified individuals in Haitian society are discouraged from pursing teaching due to its being traditional perceived as

\(^{78}\) M. Dartigue, “Rural life…”
\(^{79}\) M. Dartigue, “Rural life…”
\(^{80}\) Hebblethwaite says that Creole is more accepted by the rural poor, but others have suggested that since French has long been perceived as a fundamental “goal” of education and means of upward social mobility, a resistant for creole-language instruction has not been uncommon among rural Haitians
\(^{81}\) Hebblethwaite, “French and underdevelopment…”, pg. 262
a lower, rather than higher-status occupation. Although a “Teacher Status Act” was adapted by the Haitian government in 1984 that aimed to legitimize the teaching profession in Haiti through better training, salaries and job security for public-sector teachers, Bory-Adams says that this government initiative largely failed due to a lack of educational resources, especially Creole-language material, and career incentives on the part of the teachers.

The consequences of this traditional social stigma in Haitian society against teaching, furthered by the fact that the Haitian government has historically been either unable, or unwilling to dignify and legitimize the teaching profession through high-level training and appropriate compensation for teachers, have been a disastrous record of education goals and achievements, and failure to create human development in Haiti.

Lastly, although scholars can show that Haitian Creole has a rich oral tradition of folklore and myths, and some degree of national literary tradition (although limited in volume and availability of material), one might legitimately ask whether Creole is an adequately developed language for education in philosophy, or micro-biology? Although scholars such as Hebblethwaite and Spears say that “Creole is indeed a language”, not simply “corrupt French”, and is grammatically separate “just as French is separate [although related to] Latin and other Romance languages”, can it be used to teach advanced economics, or electrical engineering?

The question is fascinating when we draw a parallel between Creole, having an official orthography only since 1982, with the modern languages of Asia, such as Japanese. Although countries such as Japan and Korea are today considered by Americans and other westerners to be countries with high educational emphasis in the modern sciences and engineering, Asian cultures

---

82 Bory-Adams, “Educational policies…”, pg. 147; Bernard, “Higher education in Haiti”, pg. 62
83 Bory-Adams, pg. 147
84 Spears and Barotte, “The Haitian Creole language…”, pg. 2
like Japan were essentially isolated from (and behind?) the western scientific disciplines until nearly the 20th century. Consequently, their languages lacked some significant conceptual-vocabulary for dealing with western scientific methodology and data. To solve this problem in Japan, linguistic reforms under the Meiji restoration (1868) introduced western scripts into the Japanese language and writing system, thus enabling it to adapt western scientific disciplines and concepts to address problems in fields such as mechanical engineering, calculus, economics and the social sciences85.

If a language such as Japanese, which belongs to a completely different linguistic family than the Indo-European language of English, Spanish or French, can be made compatible with the European scientific disciplines, it should be little problem for Haitian (French) Creole to do so, even if it is necessary to invent and incorporate new vocabulary. For example, the writer searched briefly on the internet, and pulled up a “Mathematics Glossary - English/Haitian Creole - Elementary, Middle School and High School Level” from Amazon.com86.

Girl’s education in Haiti

In his summary of the history of education in Haiti, Clement begins his section on primary schools for girls by saying…

“It is difficult to find an account of primary schools for girls because their instruction was not considered important (and that) this is one of the results of a male-oriented society which had originated in the colonial period. In fact, during the period from 1804-1915, little was done to educate Haitian woman”87.

85 Hebblethwaite, “French and underdevelopment…”, see Japanese “selective Westernization”
86 Additionally, a sample listing of multi-discipline Haiti Creole-Language books can be found in Hebblethwaite’s article found in the bibliography
87 Clement, “History of education…”
Almost 100 years later in 2009, the US state department cited that in Haiti, “only 65% of school-aged children are enrolled in primary school, and of these, less than 35% will actually complete their primary education”. Shortly after the 2010 earthquake, USIP also released a special report in which they cited similar statistics pointing to the generally low total enrollment rates, and high drop-out and repetition rates for Haiti’s primary and secondary education students. Furthermore, the report cited generally low instruction quality for both private and public schools, as well the lack of basic educational resources available such as text books.

Contributing to a low educational opportunity for girls is the diverse role that woman hold in rural Haitian society. The analogy of wearing many hats applies appropriately to many woman in rural Haiti, as in addition to their commonly accepted familial role of rearing children, they are also often needed to provide additional income through either formal or informal industry. As many Haitian husbands and fathers themselves often earn a subsistence wage through the informal sector, and many also travel to the Dominican Republic where there are relatively greater prospects for higher-paying and steadier work, rural Haitian women are often placed in a position with their children and/or extended family as a primary earner who also rears her children and serves as head of her household.

Although in general, both rural and urban Haitian parents place a high value on both their female and male children’s education, when limited resources require that choices be made between which children to educate, and which to keep at home to assist with domestic tasks, the males are often chosen to attend school, while teenage girls are withheld or retrieved for the

---

88 Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”
89 USIP “Special Report”
90 Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”, pg. 538
household duties such as assisting their mothers in selling goods in the market, working on the family’s plot, or taking care of younger siblings\textsuperscript{93}. These, with the high fertility rate among Haitian woman (highest in the Caribbean) are the most significant factors affecting girl’s enrollment in Haitian schools. Conversely, H. Metz shows girls as 48\% of total primary and secondary enrollment in Haiti in 1995\textsuperscript{94}.

When we consider the indispensable role that mothers in developing as well developed countries often play in the process of their children’s early learning\textsuperscript{95}, we can begin to see how a cycle of illiteracy defines the pattern of lack of education and literacy in rural Haiti. Primary education for most rural Haitian children is poor to begin, with many privately-owned and operated rural schools being run by minimally or poorly educated owner-teachers\textsuperscript{96} (as the teachers are often drawn from a pool of poorly-educated former students), and having little or no accountability to the Haitian government, their schools lack a common curricular content and educational objectives. When males and females (do) attend school, and do complete their studies through the primary and secondary levels (which is most often not the case), in the end, they have a sub-standard education anyway.

Studies of developing countries around the world that have looked at the relationship between the average number of years of girls’ education and the level of economic development in a country have confirmed that the longer girls remain in school, and the more education they achieve, the lower the total national fertility rate will be, and higher their contribution to both household and per capita income will be\textsuperscript{97}.

\textsuperscript{93} Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”, pg. 539
\textsuperscript{94} Metz, “Dominican Republic…”, pg. 352
\textsuperscript{95} Lincove, “Growth, Girls’…”
\textsuperscript{96} Conversation with Pro. Francois Pierre-Louis, Fall, 2013
\textsuperscript{97} Krueger and Lindahl, “Education for…”
In summary, Haitian girls, often demonstrating high academic potential, are more typically withdrawn from school before their male siblings for the purpose of tending to their familiar duties as older female siblings, and thus remaining marginally literate or illiterate. We must then ask: when a great percentage of the young girls in a society do not receive even the most fundamental instruction to achieve competency in reading and writing, or basic math, can they in turn develop to become woman, mothers and even teachers (a female-dominated occupation in Haiti) that are capable of passing these essential skills on to their children or students? This is the dilemma that has historically plagued the efforts to provide quality primary and secondary education and even basic literacy for youth of Haiti, and what we continue to observe today.

PART THREE: The literacy Myth?: Is literacy essential for human development?

The “Literacy Myth”: The debate over assumed vs. the demonstrated value of literacy

“Literacy has been identified as the basic technology responsible for the major achievements of society from classical Greece to the contemporary U.S. Conversely, the relative lack of techno-economic development in Third World countries today has been blamed on low literacy or lack of it”.98

“Once you learn to read, you will be forever free.” –Frederick Douglass

Are the above statements true? The role of literacy is a central issue for Haiti, not only because Haiti has the highest level of illiteracy in the Americas (and is linguistically isolated), but because there is an on-going debate regarding the universal value of western literacy in the creation of both human development and human capital in developing countries.

98 Akinnaso, “The consequences…”
One facet of the literacy debate centers around the question of whether literacy is really as universally beneficial to the development of one’s cognitive abilities, and life enrichment (enlarging one’s choices) as traditionally supposed, or whether the notion of a universal benefit of literacy functions more for socio-cultural hegemony, where western schooled literacy of developed, Euro-centric countries such as the U.S. filters non-literate, traditional cultures’ forms of knowledge before they are considered legitimate.

Scholars of cultural history, linguistics, anthropology and psychology have sought to determine the authentic role of literacy in regards to its empowerment of the individual, as well as its contribution to, and advancement of society. Probably for most of us, the benefits of literacy, and the empowerment and enrichment (both socio-economically and purely philosophical) that the written word bestows on the lives of those that can read and write seem too commonsensical to even question. Nevertheless, it is exactly these types of beliefs (those presumed to be universally true) that often motivate academics to question and re-examine their legitimacy.

The issue has been addressed from several angles, most of which can be placed into one of three categories: That of socio-economic outcomes, where scholars have attempted to determine whether or not literacy improves peoples’ life choices, standards of living or civic freedom; cognitive-psychology, which seeks to determine how literacy affects cognitive processes and abilities, and thus a person’s ability to adapt, survive or compete in an increasingly technological, and information-driven world; and socio-linguistics, where traditional or oral forms of literacy, and those of academic or schooled literacy are examined to learn how non-literate and literate people function in and alter their respective societies.
In the late 1970’s, Harvey Graff wrote a controversial book called “The Literacy Myth”, an historical analysis and critique of the mid-19th century campaigns “against ignorance” by upper-Canadian and American educationalists such as E. Ryerson and H. Mann whose stated goals were the preparation of productive workers, and elimination of delinquency through the eradication of child and adult illiteracy in cities. Furthermore, juvenile and adult schools were to guide their new readers’ preferences towards material that promoted Christian morality and civic responsibility\(^9\).

Graff’s paradigm-shifting work challenged the traditional assumptions regarding the motives behind the educationalists and their campaigns, as well as the socio-economic implications of both literacy and illiteracy in the 19th-century city populations\(^1\). In short, Graff’s research concluded that “the possession or lack of literacy had not the determining consequences that school promoters’ rhetoric and middle-class moral proselytizing declaimed so frequently”.\(^2\) Graff discovered that despite the claims of educationists at the time that literacy created more disciplined, employable and productive workers, improvement of socio-economic position for the working populations in cities such as Hamilton (London) and Kingston (Ontario) correlated more closely with ethnicity (Anglo-Saxon) and religious affiliation (Protestant), than with literacy.

As we will read, similar claims as Graff’s are made today that espouse an over-emphasis on book-literacy and western schooling in developing countries, and therefore argue for more “culturally-relevant” instructional methods and subject content.

Literacy and cognition

\(^9\) Graff, “The literacy…”, pg. 297
\(^1\) Hamilton (London) and Kingston (Ontario)
\(^2\) Graff, “The literacy…”, pg. 52
Goody’s “Domestication of the Savage Mind” proposed that literacy has separated the people of complex societies from those of traditional, non-literate ones not only by enabling them to “engage in deeper scrutiny of permanent forms of (oral) discourse”, but that literacy has actually expanded inherent cognitive processes and mental abilities in literate peoples. In opposition to the historical and anthropological schools of cultural relativism that hypothesized a difference between mystical (traditional) societies and scientific (Western) ones as being either “unaware” or “aware” of alternative explanations to nature’s questions, Goody’s solution was to search for an “inherent closure” in the traditional (non-literate) mind to alternative explanations, as opposed to the openness that was inherent to the literate one\textsuperscript{102}.

More recently, anthropologists such as Akinnaso have pointed to new scientific research showing that rather than adding additional cognitive processes to a person’s brain, literacy may bring about “changes in the deployment of preexisting cognitive capabilities and the ability to maximize the use of limited resources more effectively”\textsuperscript{103}. Linguistic scholars such as Angela Kleiman have also challenged the dichotomous, “folk-taxonomy” that has often defined individuals and societies as either literate, or non-literate, or even logical vs. pre-logical thinkers-actors\textsuperscript{104}.

Basing her research on Street’s critical theory of an “autonomous model of literacy” that refers to a philosophy of learning where literacy serves as an end in itself (rather than a means to an end), Kleiman equates the differences between “literate orality” and academic literacy (logical oral vs. textual knowledge) with notions of “popular versus academic cultural forms”\textsuperscript{105}. She uses several examples of literate and non-literate classroom interactions between teachers and

\textsuperscript{102} Goody, “Domestication...”, pg. 42
\textsuperscript{103} Akinnaso, “The consequences...”
\textsuperscript{104} Goody, “Domestication...”, pg. 2
\textsuperscript{105} Oliveire and Valsiner, “Literacy in Human...”, pg. 210
rural (non-literate) students to demonstrate that non-literate groups can and do utilize the same logical cognitive processes that have most often been attributed exclusively to schooled, or textual literacy\textsuperscript{106}, as well as exercise creative coping mechanisms when they are unable to read or write\textsuperscript{107}.

Finally, in the mid 1980’s, educationist Roger Garrett referred to the “omni-capable”, or overly grandiose or idealistic belief that solving all of the development (and all other) problems in the world simply came down to educating people, or spreading literacy…

“the process of arriving at a more realistic and, thus, more modest assessment of how much difference education in and of itself can make in bringing about significant changes in the social, economic, and political fabric of developing as well as advanced societies now seems to have run its course”\textsuperscript{108}.

Despite Garrett’s (healthy) skepticism about the inflated perception of education to solve development problems, the writer feels that historic evidence compels us to consider whether an education that enriches one’s life by enlarging one’s choices (as measured by the HDI), might arguably best be obtained through book literacy. Although this specific question will be more extensively addressed in the study’s conclusion, an immediate, practical example may elucidate this hypothesis:

If a person wants to grow sugar cane or coffee, or build simple family homes, they may be able to learn to do so with some practical understanding of plant life, basic craftsmanship and math, which, like many other traditional skills, may be learned through on-the-job training or

\textsuperscript{106} Oliveire and Valsiner, see corn cake receipe, pg. 198
\textsuperscript{107} Oliveire and Valsiner, see civic service public exam, pg. 207
\textsuperscript{108} Garrett, “Education and…”, pg. 149
apprenticeship. On the other hand, if a person (or community) wishes to develop a method to study plant growth, pathology and soil erosion, or develop stronger and more uniform materials and building methods for constructing family homes or community centers, it is hard to imagine that this could be taught and learned more effectively than by utilizing textual, written knowledge. But, the influence that literacy and education have on technological development is only part of the greater socio-economic and political narrative that defines a country such as Haiti.

PART FOUR: Innovation and human capital in Latin America and the Caribbean, and Haiti

“Latin America and the Caribbean has a historic deficit of engineers, dating at least to the early 20th-century” -Latin American Entrepreneurs/World Bank

The writer recently witnessed a fascinating and yet common phenomenon in Latin American and Caribbean at a construction site north of Port au Prince, where he had the privilege of meeting several foreign (non-Haitian) engineers and construction foremen who along with other lower-level managers were imported from abroad for the purpose of constructing a new cargo port for the Port au Prince import-export community. The future site lies just north of PAP, is being financed by a well-known, wealthy member of Port au Prince’s business community, and being built by the international-development firm GB group109.

It’s not a coincidence that in countries such as Haiti or Bolivia (where the writer has first-hand experience), that when a visitor has the opportunity to see the organized exploitation of many of these nations’ national resources such as natural gas, petroleum, precious metals, or even tourism or the execution of civil engineering projects such as building bridges, ports and highways, that those who are designing, engineering and building are often not local architects,

engineers and skilled workers, but foreigners, working for foreign firms, that often ultimately repatriate their earnings to their own nations.

A very recent and revealing study by the World Bank called “Latin American Entrepreneurs: Many firms but little innovation” (2014) set out to provide an explanation for the paradox that although there is no shortage of small-scale entrepreneurship throughout Latin America and the Caribbean (Haiti being perhaps a quintessential example), Latin American and Caribbean entrepreneurs and firms on the whole are smaller, employing fewer people (including older, established firms), producing fewer new products with less international market penetration, and holding fewer patents, than firms in more developed and higher-earning countries such as the US, Canada or England\textsuperscript{110}.

According to the World Bank, rather than producing new products, the typical Latin American and Caribbean firm’s \textit{modus operandi} in regards to product development and marketing is to follow the lead of those countries already on the “innovation frontier”\textsuperscript{111} (such as the U.S.) by adapting their products, and perhaps modifying them to meet local market needs. Although the answer is not absolutely conclusive, researchers at the World Bank have hypothesized that one of the determining factors likely includes the historic emphasis in Latin American education on the humanities, rather than the sciences, which produces fewer highly-trained scientists and engineers, less investment in research and development by Latin American and Caribbean firms, and thus fewer market innovations and new products to sell both domestically, and on the world market. In turn, Latin American and Caribbean firms have less global market penetration, less growth, and therefore employ fewer people, which lead more people to embark on self-employment ventures.

\textsuperscript{110} Lederman, Messina, Pienknagura, and Rigolini, World Bank: “Latin American firms…”

\textsuperscript{111} Lederman, Messina, Pienknagura, and Rigolini
Perhaps it is appropriate at this time to ponder the inseparable links that exist in highly developed and industrialized countries such as the U.S. between institutions of higher education, private industry and their national or state governments. In the U.S., the institutions of higher education consistently produce the girth of creative as well as technological human capital that fuels the private industry, which in turn reinvests its profits back into its nation’s education system either through direct incentives to generate skilled workers (fellowships), or indirectly through the taxes that they pay.

It’s also interesting to consider that although investment in higher education may assume to produce a more immediate return on investment to private industry, that even the most economically developed, and technologically sophisticated countries in the world such as the U.S. are apparently beginning to experience the repercussions of top-heavy educational investment, where degree inflation is far too common among young college graduates. At the same time, primary and secondary public-school education appears to be suffering from low student science and math scores, for which the system responds with decreasing focus on artistic and humanistic education, both of which have also been esteemed by celebrated educationists such as Mortimer Adler as being essential for complete, well-rounded human development.¹¹²

Finally, in light of the example above of the GB Group’s building a new port in Haiti, Freire claimed that…

“…science and technology at the service of the former (oppressors) are used to reduce the oppressed to the status of “things”; at the service of the latter (revolutionary humanitarian), they are used to promote humanization”.¹¹³

¹¹² Adler, “An Education Manifesto…”
¹¹³ Freire, “Pedagogy…”, pg. 133
Freire recognized that in its essence, technological innovation is a politically, economically and morally ambiguous human activity. Educated, innovative and creative-thinking individuals will likely be essential to any society’s technological progress and cultural advancement, regardless of profit or political motive. But, as long as Haiti and other poor Latin American and Caribbean countries suffer from a dearth of quality primary schools and educators, resulting in low-literacy populations and low human development, foreigners, rather than Haitians, will likely have prior opportunity to design and build Haiti’s infrastructure, and have a greater influence in Haiti’s future.

Part five: Efforts for Haitian education reform and results from mid-20\textsuperscript{th} century to present, and the effects of national literary movements on socio-political development in Haiti, Dominican Republic and Cuba

Regressing for a moment to the reference made at the beginning of this study to the prevalent paradigms of violence in the literature about Haiti, there is perhaps an interesting correlation that this writer and others identify between a lack of literacy and education (which many such as Freire and Dartigue and Alder say are necessary for the creation and support of democratic institutions), and the tendency to use violence or extra-legal means to bring about political and economic change. The correlation between Haiti’s great historic dearth of literacy and foundational education, and its long history of violent socio-political conflicts, resulting in extra-constitutional transfers of power is salient. As Rotberg tells us, “Haiti came to govern itself in the absence of any heritage of representative democracy or any experience of consensus”, and that from 1843 to 1915, “there were 22 presidents, most of whom came to power by force of arms and coups d’etat”\textsuperscript{114}.

\textsuperscript{114} Rotberg, “Haiti’s past…”
Assuming there to be a minimal level of economic prosperity (material wealth) as both a prerequisite and result of a healthy and developed individual and society, social scientists have drawn a correlation between the creation and stability of social institutions or “social infrastructure”\textsuperscript{115} such as the rule of law, property rights, courts of justice (and police), with higher average levels of income in a country. In short, what their research has found is that when geography (natural resources), integration (participation in world markets) and social institutions are each evaluated to determine their weight of influence on a country or society’s average level of wealth, it appears that social institutions essentially “trump” the other two in terms of their importance\textsuperscript{116}.

Reflecting on our earlier conundrum of the chicken or the egg…whether education comes before or after development...we can deduce from this research by the social infrastructure school of development, that there is a direct relationship between a nation’s level of wealth, and the depth of the roots of its social and civic institutions. In other words, if a society is not firmed grounded in a democratic (or other) type of socio-political tradition that establishes and preserves a rule of law defining rules and norms for social, political and activities and interactions, the result will likely be a low-level of socio-political stability, with economic stagnation or regression, precisely as we have seen in Haiti\textsuperscript{117}.

We can perhaps reapply Lundahl’s previous analogy of Say’s law in reverse describing the dynamics of supply and demand for education in Haiti, to explain the low level of social-infrastructure in Haiti by substituting the concept of education with politics: The lack of social infrastructure stands out not only as a supply problem (lack of social contract with the elite), but

\textsuperscript{115} Dani Rodrik, Arvind Subramanian and Francesco Trebbi, “Institutions rule…”
\textsuperscript{116} Dani Rodrik, Arvind Subramanian and Francesco Trebbi
\textsuperscript{117} According to UNICEF, Haiti’s GDP per capita annual growth for 1990-2012 was -.9%
as one of insufficient demand (mass political ignorance) that is linked to insufficient supply through the low level of return on investment (in mass literacy and education). Mass illiteracy and lack of education in Haiti’s population has made for a low level of rural (and urban) civic participation in the national democratic process, and therefore a low return on attempts to organize (legitimate) political action, which in turn creates little incentive on the part of the privileged, Port au Prince officials to value and seek out the support of the poor, illiterate, rural masses in the nation’s political process.

As a logical result, Haitian political candidates cannot easily educate their potential (or current) constituents regarding their policies or plans, nor can their constituents likely make informed decisions about who to choose as their leaders, nor can elections be confidently organized, executed and validated because they lack the legitimacy that comes from an established “social contract” between the government and the people. Furthermore, the Haitian people are unable to demand that their national government acknowledge and fulfill its basic constitutional obligations to its citizens (such as the eradication of illiteracy and universal primary and secondary education), because most Haitians are illiterate, and lack of knowledge of their basic constitutional rights, and how to exercise them.

One might argue that Aristide was successfully elected by the popular will of the Haitian people. Although he was, because the majority of his rural and urban contingencies were illiterate people, and due to their socio-economic group’s historically low level of political organization and participation (Haiti’s relatively high number of political parties indicates a low level of political and ideological organization and consensus…in contrast to the U.S.’s two-party
system), they were unable to defend his constitutional legitimacy when he was deposed by their opposition (many of whom belonged to the more educated and literate socio-economic groups), and ultimately resorted to violence in their attempt to do so (For more, see Farmer’s, “The Uses of Haiti”).

Another way of seeing the problem of illiteracy in Haiti, and its connection to the Haitian people’s lack of political agency, is by viewing a parallel between Haiti’s linguistic isolation, illiteracy and underdevelopment, and the absence of a fully-formed “national consciousness” or voice. Although the first literary document in Haitian Creole dates back to the late 1790’s, and despite efforts on the part of Haitian writers such as Price-Mars in the 1930’s and Duvalier in the 50’s to initiate a Haitian ethnological movement that would promote Haitian cultural discovery and awareness via the Creole language, Creole has only had an official orthography since 1982.

From a Freirian perspective of mass literacy and socio-political agency, this long absence of a national literary tradition and subsequent lack of national voice can be viewed as having been a significant culprit to the long-time “focalized view of problems” by the people in Haitian society, “rather than seeing them as dimensions of a totality”, which Freire contends leads to the alienation of a people, where the “the more alienated the people are, the easier it is (for the oppressors) to divide them and keep them divided”.

Haitian policies, reforms and results from Dartigue to Duvalier to current

---

118 Number of major political parties and lobbying groups (CIA World Factbook)
119 Spears and Berotte, “Haitian Creole Language…”, pg.154
120 Polyné, “The idea…”, Duvalier’s voodoo tourism as part of Haitian ethnological movement
121 Freire, “Pedagogy…”, pg. 141
Although linguists and educationists today such as A. Spears and B. Hebblethwaite address the current problems of educating the Haitian youth by debating the exceptionalism\textsuperscript{122} and uniformitarianism\textsuperscript{123} arguments for and against Creole language instruction, or the pedagogical implications and outcomes of single vs. dual-language instruction for Haitian students, for Maurice Dartigue, who was Haiti’s Director of Rural Education in the 1930’s, the language of the Haitian student’s instruction was perhaps the least of his concerns. Maurice’s wife Ester (also an educationist) later recalled the negligent state in which she and her husband found the rural Haitian schools as late as the mid 1930’s, when Dartigue was serving as Director of Rural Education (DRE):

“…very few rural schools were in good condition. Some were used by the directors or teachers as their homes while the children were taught outdoors under a tree or an arbor. In a few schools the teachers had not come for months, the children being taught, if one can use the word, by an almost illiterate substitute…There were supposed to be inspectors to control the schools, but often they did not know where the schools were or if they had ever existed. These “inspectors” drew their salaries, such as they were, and let it go at that”\textsuperscript{124}

For more than 10 years as DRE, Dartigue (with the help of Ester) attempted to establish methodology, uniformity and accountability in the Haitian education bureaucracy and its schools by creating rural training centers for teachers, designing curriculum for farm schools and competency exams for teaching candidates. He promoted the use of Creole in children’s early instruction as a stepping-stone to French\textsuperscript{125}, but further argued for Haitian students’ competency

\textsuperscript{122} Habblethwaite: “French and…”, Concept of Francophilic elite that Haitian Creole is an inferior language to European lexifiers
\textsuperscript{123} Habblethwaite. Concept that all languages are fundamentally equivalent or uniform across species
\textsuperscript{124} E. Dartigue, “An outstanding…”, pg. 8
\textsuperscript{125} E. Dartigue…pg. 55
in both English and Spanish\textsuperscript{126}, as he saw the economic interaction with the United States as imperative to Haiti’s future development.

As discussed earlier, Dartigue was a realist who believed that mass ignorance (illiteracy and/or backwardness) was the primary reason for the increasing impoverishment of Haitian peasants (already recognized as a significant problem in the 1930s!), not only because they failed to use modern farming techniques and methods of erosion control, but because they also failed to effectively demand responsibility and accountability from their government and leaders.

Perhaps a true antithesis to the benevolent and patriotic efforts of Maurice Dartigue were those of François “Papa doc” Duvalier (1907-1971), who is perhaps the most vilified figure of the last 100 years (or even all) of Haitian history. Papa doc is credited by many historians today with having played a direct and significant role in lowering the level of human development and capital in the Haitian population to its modern, depressed levels during his five-teen years in power. This was done by ostracizing the already sparse number of educated intellectuals that were in Haiti, and provoking them to flee to France, the U.S. and Canada\textsuperscript{127}.

History has portrayed Papa Doc as a man who was concerned with two things only: his personal and unchallenged authority as “president” of Haiti, and his personal financial enrichment, both of which (apparently) he obtained and retained through imprisonment, torture or elimination of opposition by his personal \textit{tonton macoute} security force. Although the majority of presumed reliable sources that the writer has examined generally confirm this, ironically, it was under the presidency of François’ hand-picked predecessor and son, Jean-

\textsuperscript{126} E. Dartigue…pg. 52  
\textsuperscript{127} Bernard, “Higher Education…”, pg. 53
Claude (1951- ), or “baby doc” that the significant Bernard (education) Reform (la reforme\textsuperscript{128}) of 1978 was created.

The Bernard Reform, or “La Reforme Educative” was inspired by the UNESCO Addis Ababa education conference of 1961 that set a precedence for developing countries to establish education policies with goals of “universal primary education and the use of vernacular languages in teaching”\textsuperscript{129}, and attempted to modernize Haiti’s primary and secondary education systems by making Creole the language of instruction for the first four grades of primary school, separating the curriculum into both academic and technical tracks and also “attempted to align the school structure with labor market demands”\textsuperscript{130}.

As president, Jean-Claude succeeded at generating a large influx of international development aid from countries such as the US by creating tax-exempt (free) manufacturing zones for foreign companies (such as Rawlings baseballs) to establish off-shore assembly in Haiti. Although much of this foreign aid apparently was allocated to education reform, Haiti’s traditional socio-economic and political malignancies (lack of resources, organization, accountability, cultural unity\textsuperscript{131} and political accountability) once again resulted in a largely ineffective and unrealized reform\textsuperscript{132}, with Jean-Claude ultimately being forced from power by a popular coup in 1986.

Recalling Freire’s analogy of the banking form of education vs. the dialogical, where the student serves only as a “vessel” to be filled by the knowledge or agenda of the teacher who is in reality a steward of an oppressive system, its often been similarly expressed by critics of Haiti’s

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{128} Bory-Adams, “Educational policies…”, pg. 100
\textsuperscript{129} Spears and Berotte, “Haitian Creole Language..”, pg. 178
\textsuperscript{130} USIOP, “Special Report”
\textsuperscript{131} Spears and Berotte, “Haitian Creole Language…”, pg. 250
\textsuperscript{132} USIOP
\end{flushright}
traditional public schooling that the use of French instruction and a Euro-centric, classics-emphasis curriculum has essentially treated the Haitian student in much the same way, with Haitian education for the last 100 years serving to reinforce perceptions by both the upward-aspiring urban and rural populations that speaking French equates to higher social status and intelligence, and even that the very goal of education itself is to “learn French”\textsuperscript{133}.

The first official break by the Haitian education system from the traditional French-classics curriculum and its methodology of teaching students as “passive learners” was in 1997 with the “National Plan of Education and Training” (NPET). Under the NPET plan (primarily funded by the IADB\textsuperscript{134}), Fundamental Application Schools and Pedagogical Application Centers (EFACAP’s) were established in rural and urban communities throughout Haiti for the purpose of creating “student-centered”, reality-specific (practical) learning environments, to promote “citizenship education” and serve as “centers for continuous training of teachers”\textsuperscript{135}.

Although several sources including USIP’s\textsuperscript{136} special report following the earthquake and reports from the WISE Haiti initiative) suggest that NPET and its EFACAP learning centers have made a significant step towards designing and implementing a model for improved teacher training and student learning in Haiti, the USAID website currently cites surveys (15 years after NPET’s initiation) indicating that “approximately 35 percent of Haitian youth are unable to read and that the average Haitian child spends less than four years in school”\textsuperscript{137}.

In August, 2012, with funding of $12.9 mil US until Dec, 2014, USAID began a partnership with Haiti’s Ministry of Education (MENFP) on a project to raise childhood literacy

\textsuperscript{133} “Country studies...”, http://countrystudies.us/haiti/32.htm
\textsuperscript{134} Inter-American Development Bank
\textsuperscript{135} USIOP, “Special report...”
\textsuperscript{136} United States Institute of Peace
in Cap Haitian, St. Marc and Port au Prince called “Tout Timound Ap Li” (All Children Reading) or TOTAL. Its goal has been to develop and implement an “innovative reading curriculum” in both French and Creole that meets international standards. Although the current project aims to reach real literacy goals (rather than serving as just a proof of concept), the project is still described by USAID as “developing and testing an instructional model to improve reading skills of children”\textsuperscript{138}.

Today, the majority of primary and secondary schools in Haiti are either private (for profit), or supported by non-for-profit NGO’s. Per USAID: “more than 80 percent of primary schools are privately managed by nongovernmental organizations, churches, communities, and for-profit operators, with minimal government oversight”. Furthermore, it’s estimated that lower-income families in Haiti spend as much as 40 percent of their income on their children’s private school education\textsuperscript{139}, which, considering most of the sources the writer has viewed, is typically low-quality. (These realities of rural education in Haiti were also recently confirmed to the writer by a CUNY professor of political science, who is Haitian-American\textsuperscript{140}).

210 years after Haiti’s independence, and nearly 200 years after Henri Christophe’s establishment of Haiti’s first schools, nearly half the population of Haiti is still effectively illiterate in both French and Creole, not to mention an inability to communicate in English or Spanish. Although USAID is striving with the Haitian government to reduce the level of illiteracy by creating bilingual and reality-specific curriculum, there still remains a great amount of work to be done in translating and transcribing both Haitian national literature (writers, myths, folklore and history) and also essential foreign-language texts in the sciences, mathematics and

\textsuperscript{138} USAID, “All Children Reading”
\textsuperscript{139} US State Dept. factsheet, http://www.state.gov/s/hsc/factsheets/2014/220012.htm
\textsuperscript{140} Conversation with professor Francois Pierre-Louis, PhD
economics before any significant change in the quality of Haitian education, or decrease in mass literacy can be seen\textsuperscript{141}.

Even once a significant number of primary and secondary school teachers have been adequately trained in Haiti, and have adequate Creole-language material to teach Haitian students a well-rounded, diverse liberal education, unless they will also master either English or Spanish (as Dartigue supported), they will still be linguistically isolated\textsuperscript{142} from the rest of the largely English and Spanish-speaking Caribbean and the two much larger American continents. Although some have contested the supposed disadvantages of Haitian Creole’s “linguistic isolation” by citing examples of small, ethno-linguistically unique countries such as Iceland that have high literacy rates and standards of living, it should be remembered that there is also a strong emphasis throughout Europe on English-language proficiency\textsuperscript{143}.

In short, for Haiti to expand literacy and education to its whole population, it will need to train thousands of motivated individuals to become highly literate and able language instructors not only in Creole, but also in English or Spanish. Simultaneously, multitudes of bilingually-fluent translators will be needed for many years to translate centuries of canonical global knowledge across dozens of academic fields and artistic disciplines into the Haitian students’ native Creole language\textsuperscript{144}.

The task is especially daunting for the politically disorganized and extremely poor country of Haiti, but with the help of the international community, the Haitian diaspora and the Haitian nationals themselves, it is not impossible\textsuperscript{145}. On the other hand, in the opinion of this

\textsuperscript{141} Habblethwaite, “French and…”, see “major gaps”
\textsuperscript{142} Not sharing a common language with any other nation in the Americas, or the world
\textsuperscript{143} See statistics for English language proficiency in Iceland
\textsuperscript{144} Buchmann and Hannum, “Education and…”, basic material inputs for developing countries, pg. 86
\textsuperscript{145} Habblethwaite provides a sample curriculum for secondary and tertiary education in the Creole language
writer, if it is not done, there can be little hope that Haiti will have the intellectual capital to take control of, alter and stir its own destiny.

Cross-country comparisons of literary-nationalism in Haiti, D.R. and Cuba

The Caribbean island-nations of Haiti, Dominican Republic and Cuba all lie in close geographical proximity, have similar colonial histories as plantation-based sugar economies, similar population demographics, and all have recent (and current) histories of dictatorial rule (Duvalier, Trujillo and Castro), yet a spectrum of different educational, economic and institutional outcomes.

In a 2009 comparative grown analysis of the GDP’s of Haiti and the Dominican Republic, economic historians Jaramillo and Sancak suggest that before the mid-20th century, “the literature does not provide evidence of significant differences between Spanish colonial rule in the Dominican Republic, and French colonial rule in Haiti” as having played a significant role in determining the two nation’s current socio-economic differences. They cite that between 1804-1915, while Haiti “had 33 heads of state, with an average time in power of 3.4 years”, that between 1844-1916, the Dominican Republic moreover “had 61 heads of state, with an average time in power of only 1.2 years”, and credit most of the differences in the two country’s 2009 GDPs to a divergence that took place after 1960, when the Trujillo regime promoted “agriculture, industry, and public works”, as opposed to the Duvalier regime’s “rent-seeking behavior”\footnote{Jaramillo and Sancak, “Why has the grass…”, pg. 330}.

In the writer’s opinion, Jaramillo and Sancak’s assessment of the differences and similarities of colonial Haiti and the Dominican Republic, and the degree to which their colonial histories have impacted the modern nations’ current levels of socio-economic, and human
development, are somewhat over-simplified. Although France and Spain’s Caribbean colonies
did have many similarities (Catholic religion, economic subservience under mercantilism, slave-
supported cash-crop economies), there were quite considerable differences in their laws that
defined slavery, the slaves’ rights, and the relationships between slaves and their masters.
Furthermore, there were considerable differences in the intensity of their sugar cultivation, and
ratio of slaves to freemen or masters\textsuperscript{147}.

At the end of the 18\textsuperscript{th} century, Haiti was the most important producer of sugar in the
Americas (or even the world), while Cuba was ascending, and Santo Domingo was yet in its
sugar “infancy”. For this fact, Haiti had also imported the most slaves from Africa up to that
time\textsuperscript{148}, followed by Cuba. As sugar become more important to the economies of Spanish Cuba
and Santo Domingo, and as a consequence, more slaves were brought into those colonies, the
relatively greater agency and legal privileges given to those slaves under Spanish law starkly
contrasted with the rights of slaves in French San Dominique.

For slaves in Cuba and Santo Domingo, traditional Spanish legal code, or “Las Sietes
Partidas”\textsuperscript{149}, guaranteed some degree of social mobility and even often favored their
emancipation, leading one to logically hypothesize that there was a great need and incentive on
the parts of the Spanish colonials and officials (and especially the slaves themselves) for slaves
to learn and speak formal, Castilian Spanish. The fervent evangelical efforts on the part of the
Spanish Catholic church undoubtedly also contributed to Spanish-language homogeneity, slave-
literacy and even “private lives” in Spanish colonial societies\textsuperscript{150}.

\textsuperscript{147} Bergad, “The comparative histories…”, pg. 55
\textsuperscript{148} Bergad, “The comparative histories…”, pg. 55
\textsuperscript{149} “Las Sietes Partidas” http://www.cedt.org/alfonso.htm
\textsuperscript{150} Bergad, 54; Bennett, “Colonial blackness”, (thesis in introduction)
In contrast to Spanish law, the guidelines for masters’ treatment and relationship to slaves in the 1685 French “Code Noir” were less concerned with slave rights or emancipation. Even when later ameliorations to the code promoting some rights for slaves were made, its laws were selectively enforced:

“From 1784 to 1785, new royal ordinances from France make it possible for slaves to legally denounce abuses of a master, overseer, or plantation manager. Few slaves take advantage of these new rules, however, and the ones who do find that in reality the same system is still in place”\textsuperscript{151}.

Habblethwaite also says about colonial Haiti, “slaves were valued for their labor, skills and craftsmanship but access to literacy through the \textit{syllabaire} “the spelling book”, was forbidden\textsuperscript{152}.

By the time the Dominican Republic and Cuba had both permanently separated from Spain at the end of the 20\textsuperscript{th}-century, a linguistic, cultural and literary unity in their populations had been fully-formed. According to G. Lewis, anticolonial sentiment and “intimate contact existing between the island centers and the leading mainland centers of the Latin republics” enabled Cuban and Dominican authors such as Martí and de Jesús Galván to play foundational roles in the creation of their nation’s new cultural and political identities. These political and cultural revolutions fueled “movements seeking the discovery, or the rediscovery, of the regional cultural patrimony”\textsuperscript{153}, in which European, indigenous and later African cultural identities would be recognized and embraced.

Haiti on the other hand, having expelled the white, French-European colonists by the beginning of the 19\textsuperscript{th} century, and never achieving the degree of social-mobility in the slave

\textsuperscript{151} “History of Haiti”, http://library.brown.edu/haitihistory/2frt.html
\textsuperscript{152} Habblethwaite, “French and…”
\textsuperscript{153} Lewis, “Main currents…”, pg. 304
population under French-colonialism as had existed in the former Spanish colonies, remained at the time of its independence 200 years ago, a linguistically and culturally fragmented land. Practically all slaves spoke Creole (a hybrid of African Gbe languages and 17th century French), some of the mulatto affranchise spoke French, and many of the slave population were likely still speaking their unique native African languages (as sugar-intensive colonies like Haiti were frequently importing new slaves from Africa).

We are already familiar with Haiti’s historic struggle and failure to create a literate and educated general population due primarily to inept national governance and negligent rural education policy that has resulted in a dearth of quality primary and secondary schools and educators, a dearth of a (truly) national literary body and ultimately the absence of a unifying socio-political Haitian consciousness. Conversely, both the D.R. and Cuba have strong national literary traditions and heroes, with Cuba (the most literate of the three countries) being extraordinarily prolific. Furthermore, literacy and national literary movements have played a predominate role in both the Dominican Republic’s and Cuba’s socio-political formation and institutions.

According to Lewis, the nationalistic movements of the Hispanic Antilles differed from those of the English, French and Dutch by “intellectual activity, especially in Cuba and Santo Domingo, (which) was electrified by political revolution and anticolonial insurrection”. In the Dominican Republic, national literary movements starting from the end of the 19th century played a significant role in the development and formation of a Dominican national consciousness and unity. As Helen Metz explains, although the predominate early themes of

154 Spears and Berotte, “The Haitian…”, intro
155 Bergad, “The comparative histories…”, pg. 54
156 Lewis, “Main currents…”, pg. 304
indigenismo and hispanidad\textsuperscript{157} aimed to minimize the roots and influence of Africa in Dominican culture (especially under Trujillo), a more socially pluralistic criolla, or mixed-blood (African, Spanish and Taino) identification prevailed after the dictator’s death, becoming a unifying sentiment of national writers, and further fueling a strong resistance in the later 20\textsuperscript{th} century to a perceived Americanization of Dominican culture\textsuperscript{158}.

Although Cuba’s 50-years of socialistic and dictatorial-type governance under Fidel Castro (1926- ) has contributed to its low Freedom-House index (which perhaps has capitalist economic preconceptions), somewhat paradoxically, its population scores very high on levels of human development. Cuba’s literary legacy and its role in the formation of Cuban socio-political identity have been extraordinary. For example, Cuba’s perhaps most celebrated national political hero and revolutionary, Jose Martí, is also its most important national literary figure, whose works of essays and poetry representing the ideal embodiment of love and sacrifice for country was as important to Castro’s socialist political revolution of the late 1950’s, as it was during Martí’s own era of struggle against Spanish colonial control and United States intervention.

Although Castro’s long regime has depended to a large degree on the restriction of democracy, educational indoctrination and the control of Cuban media (for which Castro has long been criticized by western powers as a dictator), since the 1960’s, the socialist leader has made the spread of literacy and promotion of the literary arts a fundamental mission of the Cuban socialist revolution\textsuperscript{159}.

\textsuperscript{157} Emphasis on and celebration of both native and Spanish racial and cultural origins, rather than African.

\textsuperscript{158} Metz, “Dominican Republic…”, pg. 94-96

\textsuperscript{159} Fidel Castro speech “Palabras a los intelectuales”
Ironically, although levels of rural and urban literacy among the general population in Cuba when Jose Marti’s writings first spread their patriotic sentiments were likely very low\textsuperscript{160}, for Castro’s revolution, the spread of literary-nationalism for the indoctrination of the revolucionario has been an indispensable tool for the success of Castro’s socio-political and economic agenda, the high degree of patriotic sentiments and cultural cohesion among the Cuban people today, as well as a potent instrument of socio-political and economic criticism of the Castro regime by the exiled intellectuals\textsuperscript{161}.

Today, Cuba scores high among other much larger and economically integrated Latin American countries on important indicators such as general literacy rates, number of college science and engineering degrees as well as the HDI:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Literacy rate (all)\textsuperscript{162}</th>
<th>Total first S&amp;E degrees (24-year-old pop.) (1999)\textsuperscript{163}</th>
<th>Total number surveyed</th>
<th>HDI ranking (out of 187 countries)\textsuperscript{164}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>98.6 (%)</td>
<td>10,531</td>
<td>246,963</td>
<td>4.26 (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Argentina</td>
<td>97.9</td>
<td>16,106</td>
<td>567,400</td>
<td>2.83 (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>99.8</td>
<td>7,339</td>
<td>201,800</td>
<td>3.63 (%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{160} Cuban author Reinaldo Arenas discusses the low levels of education surrounding his own rural upbringing in Holguín, Cuba in the years preceding the Castro revolution.
\textsuperscript{161} Such as Renaldo Arenas
\textsuperscript{162} CIA World Factbook
\textsuperscript{163} Ratio of first university degrees and science and engineering degrees to 24-year-old population in selected locations, by region: 1999 or most recent year.
http://www.nsf.gov/statistics/seind02/c2/c2s4.htm#c2s4l1
\textsuperscript{164} Wikipedia.org
Conclusion: Thoughts on the HDI, literacy and Haiti’s future prospects for human development

Although the UN’s Human Development Index has broadened the scope from which to view global humanity…its metaphysical as well as material needs and aspirations, perhaps no other human or social achievement indicator, either in the past or present, has shown to correlate more directly with the empowerment of the individual by making them aware of both their local and global reality, and therefore broadening their life choices, than textual, “western” literacy. Although literacy and education is an essential component of the HDI, by virtue of being a part of a larger whole, it necessarily takes a subservient role to a greater ideology and goal, which, as Freire might say, may or may not ultimately reflect the unique aspirations of specific communities.

For Freire, creating and imposing a universal HDI may be either impossible, or even oppressive, as only self-realization of needs and aspirations through dialogical and reflective education can produce human development. Therefore, in Freire’s hypothesis, culturally-relevant literacy and dialogue must precede any national political or economic agenda.

Although Dartigue’s human capital-laden ideas such as devoting the Haitian peasants to economic savviness rather than first irradiating illiteracy reflected his immediate preoccupation with creating a positive national cash-flow that would enable the Haitian
government to focus on internal infrastructure and production of basic commodities before addressing the higher-Maslowian aspirations of its citizens, he was keenly aware of the Haitian peoples’ ultimate need to become educated individuals for both economic growth, and civic participation.

Finally, for the writer, this evaluation of the historical challenge of human development in Haiti, as defined either by the UN, or viewed through the philosophies of Freire or Dartigue, suggests that Haiti’s current human under-development is due primarily to Haiti’s widely understood socio-economic and political instability and/or increasing impoverishment of rural Haitians, all of which are to a great degree the result of mass lack of education, especially manifest in its mass illiteracy.

Putting aside any discussion about the equality of the culturally-diverse forms of literacy (textual or oral), the writer finds nothing Euro-centric about his belief that reading and writing (whether in 16th-century Japanese, or Haiti-Creole), for all the reasons thus-far mentioned, improves, enriches and empowers human development. Just as ancient Near-Eastern peoples long-ago spread their cultural invention west for the better of the Egyptian and Persian, and then the western Greek and Roman cultures, so literacy must spread to, take root in, and establish a permanent place in the socio-cognitive imagination of the Haitian people, that will forever define and guide their self-realization, actualization and finally…human development.

The stakes are such, that unless Haiti not only eradicates its illiteracy, but also produces a population of very literate people (such as Cuba), it will remain a “free”, “democratic” nation in name only, and will likely continue to remain economically dependent on the resources of foreign nations, and their political and economic agendas.
Appendix: Statistical indicators relevant to literacy and education for Haiti, Dominican Republic and Cuba

The writer now presents statistics that many of the examined sources on development literature have cited as having either a direct or indirect relationship to literacy (being either a cause or effect). Determining the precise relationship that literacy has with any particular indicator is part of a broader discussion, but beyond our immediate scope. Our purpose is to see how the average levels of general literacy in Cuba, D.R. and Haiti correlate (conversely or inversely) with stated goals of the UN Literacy Decade which are “eradicating poverty, reducing child mortality, curbing population growth, achieving gender equality and ensuring sustainable development, peace and democracy”\textsuperscript{165}.

We assume that population statistics for literacy indicate those people that are at least functionally literate\textsuperscript{166}. In other words, they can read newspapers or a basic novel, do general math, use a dictionary or read a voting ballot.

Data was accessed March, 2014 and selected from the UNICEF general country statistics, the CIA World Factbook and the USAID websites. Some data for Haiti is missing due to its lack of internal accountability or available data. For Cuba, some data is inapplicable, while other data may be either withheld or suspect of inaccuracy (according to CIA). Each UNICEF category is followed by references selected by the writer that elaborate on the relationship of the statistics to literacy and education.


\textsuperscript{166} UN Developmental Program, “Functional literacy”, http://www.undp.org/content/support/en/home/test_area/ourwork/povertyreduction/successstories/functional_literacy_the_language_of_empowerment/
Statistic sources:

Direct, inverse or indeterminate relationship between statistic and literacy ranking among three countries; Haiti (lowest) to Cuba (highest)

Basic indicators of individual and social well-being: HRI, Freedom House, HDI and GINI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Haiti</th>
<th>D.R.</th>
<th>Cuba</th>
<th>Notes/Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Human Rights Index</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>(lower number equals greater legal respect for international standards on universal human rights)(^{167})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom House rating</td>
<td>Press partly free</td>
<td>Press party free</td>
<td>Press/internet NOT free</td>
<td>(^{168})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human Development Index (UNDP)</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>.7</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>(^{169})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GINI Index (World Bank)</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>47.2 (out of 100)</td>
<td>N.A.</td>
<td>‘0’ being perfect income equality(^{170})</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CIA World Factbook (updated 2013-14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Haiti</th>
<th>D.R.</th>
<th>Cuba</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total population</td>
<td>Approx. 10,000,000 (2014)</td>
<td>Approx. 10,300,000 (2014)</td>
<td>Approx. 11,000,000 (2014)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP per capita ($)</td>
<td>1,200 (2011)</td>
<td>9,500 (2011)</td>
<td>10,200 (2010)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP per sector (%)</td>
<td>Agro: 24.1, Ind: 19.9, Srvs: 56</td>
<td>Agro: 6, Ind: 29.1, Srvs: 64.0</td>
<td>Agro: 3.8, Ind: 22.3, Srvs: 73.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor force per sector (%)</td>
<td>Agro: 38.1, Ind: 11.5, Srvs: 50.4</td>
<td>Agro: 14.6, Ind: 22.3, Srvs: 63.1</td>
<td>Agro: 19.7, Ind: 17.1, Srvs: 63.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment (%)</td>
<td>40.6 (2010)</td>
<td>14.3 (2012)</td>
<td>8 (2012 CIA estimate) –official: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages (official)</td>
<td>(2) Creole, French</td>
<td>(1) Spanish</td>
<td>(1) Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physicians per 1000 people</td>
<td>.25</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


\(^{170}\) World Bank, “Measuring inequality”;

UNICEF: Basic country indicators (2011-2012)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total adult literacy</th>
<th>GNI per cap ($US)</th>
<th>Life expectancy (years)</th>
<th>Annual # of under-5 deaths (1000’s)</th>
<th>Primary school net enrollment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>48.7%</td>
<td>760</td>
<td>62.7</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>90.1</td>
<td>5470</td>
<td>73.2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>92.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>99.8</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>79.1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>98.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Maternal education for mothers in developing countries has shown to have a greater impact on reducing infant mortality than household income level.*

Education:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Youth (15-24 years) literacy rate/male</th>
<th>Youth (15-24 years) literacy rate/female</th>
<th>Primary school survival rate to last grade</th>
<th>Secondary school net attendance ratio (male)</th>
<th>Secondary school net attendance ratio (female)</th>
<th>Internet users (number per 100 in population)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>74.4%</td>
<td>70.5%</td>
<td>85.1 (survey)</td>
<td>21.6%</td>
<td>21.9%</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>96.1</td>
<td>98.1</td>
<td>78 (survey)</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>64.9</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>95 (admin)</td>
<td>86.5</td>
<td>86.7</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Studies suggest that governments of developing countries with lower levels of HD allocate funds more effectively by first investing in primary and secondary education, then higher education.*

Nutrition:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low birth weight</th>
<th>Early initiation of breastfeeding</th>
<th>Stunting (moderate and sever)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>46.7%</td>
<td>21.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>68.7</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>76.7</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Evidence supports a connection between childhood malnutrition and/or stunted growth and lower future school performance.*

---

172 Fuchs, Pamuk and Lutz “Education or Wealth?...”; Krueger and Lindahl, “Education for growth...”


174 Fuller, “What school factors...”
Health:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Use of improved drinking water sources (urban)</th>
<th>Use of improved drinking water sources (rural)</th>
<th>Use of improved sanitation facilities (urban)</th>
<th>Use of improved sanitation facilities (rural)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>77.5%</td>
<td>48.5%</td>
<td>33.7%</td>
<td>17.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>80.6</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>74.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>96.2</td>
<td>86.4</td>
<td>93.7</td>
<td>87.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 'More than 3.4 million people die each year from water, sanitation, and hygiene-related causes. Nearly all deaths, 99 percent, occur in the developing world’. 3 Forty percent of the people in Haiti lack access to clean water and only one in five have access to a sanitary toilet’. 175

* McMahon cites an inverse relationship between secondary and higher education and level of water pollution in developing countries. 176

HIV/AIDS:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Adult HIV prevalence</th>
<th>Woman living with HIV (1000’s)</th>
<th>Children living with HIV (1000’s)</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (15-24 years) males</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (15-24 years) females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27.6%</td>
<td>34.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>22</td>
<td></td>
<td>33.7</td>
<td>40.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
<td>53.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Although the prevalence of HIV in Haiti has decreased in the last decade, in 2010, woman still had higher incidence of HIV than men, due to woman’s ‘historically low status and their inability to negotiate safe sex and consistent condom use…’ 177

Woman:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Contraceptive prevalence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>34.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>72.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>74.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*‘From 2000-2007, ‘comprehensive and correct knowledge’ of HIV/AIDS was credited for an increase in condom use from 19-29%’. 178

---

175 www.water.org, Haiti
176 McMahon, “Education and Development”, pg. 135
177 Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”
178 Padgett and Warnecke, “Diamonds…”
Child protection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Child labor (male)</th>
<th>Child labor (female)</th>
<th>Child marriage (by 18)</th>
<th>Violent discipline (total)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>24.3%</td>
<td>17.5%</td>
<td>86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>40.8</td>
<td>67.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>40.4</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A UNIP special report cites ‘poverty, lack of jobs, and lack of education’ as all contributing to ‘the breakdown of societal norms’, where ’50 percent of young woman in the violent shantytowns of Haiti have been raped or sexually assaulted’, one-third of those reporting such crimes being under age thirteen.\(^{179}\)

Demographic indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>1.6%</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*At 3.5 births per woman in 2008, Haiti had the highest fertility rate in the region. (j.) Studies of developing nations in Africa suggests that there is an inverse relationship between woman’s’ levels of education, and national fertility rate.\(^{180}\)

Economic indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>GDP per capita annual growth (1970-1990)</th>
<th>GDP per capita annual growth (1990-2012)</th>
<th>Population below international poverty line (1.25US/day)</th>
<th>Public funds allocated to education (% of GDP)</th>
<th>Share of household income (richest 20%)</th>
<th>Share of household income (poorest 40%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-0.9%</td>
<td>61.7</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.2%</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Higher levels of spending on public education measured by both total public expenditures, and percentage of GDP correlate with higher levels of academic achievement in developing countries.\(^{181}\)

The Rate of Progress

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
<td>5.4%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-0.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.1%</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{179}\) USIOP, “Special Report”  
\(^{180}\) McMahon  
\(^{181}\) Mehrotra, “Education for all…”
Adolescents (15-24 years)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Births by age 18</th>
<th>Adolescent birth rate</th>
<th>Lower secondary school enrollment ratio</th>
<th>Upper secondary school enrollment ratio</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (males)</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (females)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>12.9%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>31.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>85.5%</td>
<td>71.4%</td>
<td>32.6</td>
<td>39.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>96.3</td>
<td>84.3</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>53.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disparities by residence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Skilled attendant at birth (urban)</th>
<th>Skilled attendant at birth (rural)</th>
<th>Primary school net attendance ratio (urban)</th>
<th>Primary school net attendance ratio (rural)</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (urban females 15-24 years)</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (rural females 15-24 years)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>59.4%</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
<td>85.9%</td>
<td>72.8%</td>
<td>41.1%</td>
<td>28.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>96.7</td>
<td>95.4</td>
<td>94.6</td>
<td>42.4</td>
<td>36.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>48.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Disparities by household wealth

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Primary school net attendance ratio (richest 20%)</th>
<th>Primary school net attendance ratio (poorest 20%)</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (richest females 15-24 years)</th>
<th>Comprehensive knowledge of HIV (poorest females 15-24 years)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Haiti</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>65.5%</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.R.</td>
<td>98.2</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>46.4%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Summary analysis:

These statistical indicators for Haiti, Dominican Republic and Cuba suggest some important direct and indirect correlations with levels of literacy. To begin, the more of a country’s GDP that is allocated to education, the higher is the country’s average rate of literacy. With higher levels of adult literacy and more years of schooling for both men and woman, there are lower national fertility rates, better care and health for infants and children, and longer average lifespans. Furthermore, the population is typically more urbanized, and with a greater
portion of its population working in industries and services, and generating a higher GNI per capita.

Although Cuba has limited popular democratic participation, free speech and media, it is an excellent example of how education policies that promote literacy and emphasize a national literary culture can promote political stability and cultural cohesion. Cuba also has a higher proportion of doctors to total population than the D.R. (and Haiti), and a relatively high number of first S&E degrees when compared with other, larger LAC countries. The D.R. spends less of its GDP on education than Cuba, but nevertheless has achieved high adult literacy, is currently a model of LAC socio-political stability, and one of the more promising economic prospects in its region and has a higher Freedom House rating than both Cuba and Haiti.

Finally, Haiti has the lowest rate of literacy among the three total national populations (and in LAC), essentially scores lower (and often very low) on nearly all of the important HDI indicators such as education, infant mortality and average lifespan, as well as other important human capital indicators such as employment, income disparity and percentage of population below the international poverty line. Finally, Haiti is the most aid-dependent nation in the Americas, has the greatest number of major political or lobbying groups (probably reflecting the lowest level of socio-political cohesion among the three countries), and continues to be both politically and economically dysfunctional.

Thanks Terry!

With love…Pat
BIBLIOGRAPHY
Sources Cited

Academic Papers

“Why Has the Grass Been Greener on One Side of Hispaniola? A Comparative Growth Analysis of the Dominican Republic and Haiti”
Laura Jaramillo and Cemile Sancak, IMF Staff Papers, Vol. 56, No. 2 (2009), pp. 323-349

“History of Education in Haiti: 1804-1915”
Job B. Clement, Revista de Historia de América, No. 88 (Jul. - Dec., 1979), pp. 33-74

“Education and Stratification in Developing Countries: A Review of Theories and Research”

“Diamonds in the Rubble: The Women of Haiti Institutions, Gender Equity and Human Development in Haiti”

“Economic Growth and Investment in Education: How Allocation Matters”

“Can Haiti Change?”

“Haiti's Past Mortgages Its Future”

“Growth, Girls' Education, and Female Labor: A Longitudinal Analysis”
Jane Arnold Lincove, The Journal of Developing Areas, Vol. 41, No. 2 (Spring, 2008), pp. 45-68

“Education or wealth: which matters more for reducing child mortality in developing countries?” Regina Fuchs, Elsie Pamuk and Wolfgang Lutz, Vienna Yearbook of popular research, Vol. 8, Education and demography (2010), pp. 175-199

“What School Factors Raise Achievement in the Third World?”

“Institutions Rule: The Primacy of Institutions over Geography and Integration in Economic Development”
Dani Rodrik, Arvind Subramanian and Francesco Trebbi
Journal of Economic Growth, Vol. 9, No. 2 (Jun., 2004), pp. 131-165

“The Consequences of Literacy in Pragmatic and Theoretical Perspectives”
“French and underdevelopment, Haitian Creole and development: Educational language policy problems and solutions in Haiti”


“Rural life and education in Haiti”

Maurice Dartigue. Washington, DC. 1941

“Earthquakes, Nongovernmental Organizations, and Governance in Haiti”


**Reports**


“An economic program for Haiti: a special report.”

Jean-Joseph Maurice Dartigue, Publisher: [Washington, D.C.?] : Institute of Inter-American Affairs, Food Supply Division, [1946]


**Theses**


**Books**


David B. Tyack, *The One Best System*. 


Gordon Lewis, *Main Currents in Caribbean Thought.*


**Websites**


http://www.scholastic.com/dodea/Module_2/resources/dodea_m2_pa_roledecod.pdf

“UN’s first Girl’s summit”, accessed Spring, 2014.

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2niUmUyuvcs


http://www.state.gov/p/wha/ci/ha/


http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/domrepublic_statistics.html


http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SI.POV.GINI


http://chnm.gmu.edu/revolution/d/335/


http://www.cedt.org/alfonso.htm

“Huffington Post. Four years later: Haiti’s progress not always visible to the naked eye”, accessed Spring, 2014.

http://www.huffingtonpost.com/caitlin-klevorick/4-years-later-haitis-prog_b_4592848.html


http://www.scu.edu/ethics/publications/submitted/dillon/education_plato_republic.html


http://ciberamerica.blogspot.com/2012/01/two-years-after-quake-haiti-remains-in.html


http://centerforthehumanities.org/

**Interviews or conversations**

Fall, 2013: Discussion with Haitian-American professor of Political Science, Francois Pierre-Louis (Queens College) regarding private and public primary education in Haiti.

**Sources Consulted**

**Academic Papers**

“Rural Grassroots Organisations in Haiti: A Case of Wasted Potential”

“Education for Growth: Why and For Whom?”


“Curricular Content, Educational Expansion, and Economic Growth”

“What School Factors Raise Achievement in the Third World?”

Aaron Benavot, Yun-Kyung Cha, David Kamens, John W. Meyer and Suk-Ying Wong

“Haitian Creole language and bilingual education in the United States: Problem, right, or resource?”

“Culture, Place, and School: Improving Primary Education in Rural Ecuador”

“Education for All: Policy Lessons from High-Achieving Countries”

http://online.wsj.com/news/articles/SB10001424052748704541004575010860014031260

“Literacy, Social Movements, and Class Consciousness: Paths from Freire and the São Paulo Experience”

“Income and Land Distribution in Haiti: Some Remarks on Available Statistics”

“On the Impact of Foreign Aid in Education on Growth: How Relevant Is the Heterogeneity of Aid Flows and the Heterogeneity of Aid Recipients?”

“Human Development: Means and Ends”

“Shaping Human Development: Which Way Next?”

“Harnessing Women's Work: Restructuring Agricultural and Industrial Labor Forces in the Dominican Republic”

**Reports**

“Factors Impacting Youth Development In Haiti”

**Theses**

“Education and empowerment: establishment of a vocational training program in Nativity Village, Haiti”

**Books**


Mark Schuller, *Killing with kindness: Haiti, international aid, and NGOs*.


Dr. Paul Farmer, *The uses of Haiti*


Renaldo Arenas, *Antes Que Anochezca*. 

Websites

   bigstory.ap.org/article/haitian-schools-expand-use-creole-language

   Haitianproject.org

   www.clintonbushhaitifund.org/

   http://www.miamiherald.com

   http://dartigue.com

“G. W. F. Hegel's "Lordship and Bondage: A Summary”

Interviews or conversations

Conversation with Haitian-Americans Joseph Dagist and Herby Valce, May 12th, 2012 at CUNY Graduate Center