

City University of New York (CUNY)

## CUNY Academic Works

---

Publications and Research

New York City College of Technology

---

2018

### **Cryptic diversity in the Mexican highlands: Thousands of UCE loci help illuminate phylogenetic relationships, species limits and divergence times of montane rattlesnakes (Viperidae: Crotalus )**

Christopher Blair  
*CUNY New York City College of Technology*

Robert W. Bryson Jr  
*University of Washington*

Charles W. Linkem  
*University of Washington*

David Lazcano  
*Universidad Autónoma de Nuevo León*

John Klicka  
*University of Washington*

*See next page for additional authors*

### [How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!](#)

More information about this work at: [https://academicworks.cuny.edu/ny\\_pubs/605](https://academicworks.cuny.edu/ny_pubs/605)

Discover additional works at: <https://academicworks.cuny.edu>

---

This work is made publicly available by the City University of New York (CUNY).  
Contact: [AcademicWorks@cuny.edu](mailto:AcademicWorks@cuny.edu)

---

**Authors**

Christopher Blair, Robert W. Bryson Jr, Charles W. Linkem, David Lazcano, John Klicka, and John E. McCormack

1 **RH: Phylogenomics of montane rattlesnakes**

2

3 **Cryptic diversity in the Mexican highlands: thousands of UCE loci help illuminate**  
4 **phylogenetic relationships, species limits and divergence times of montane rattlesnakes**  
5 **(Viperidae: *Crotalus*)**

6

7 Christopher Blair<sup>1,2</sup>, Robert W. Bryson, Jr.<sup>3,4</sup>, Charles W. Linkem<sup>3</sup>, David Lazcano<sup>5</sup>, John Klicka<sup>3</sup>,  
8 and John E. McCormack<sup>4</sup>

9

10 <sup>1</sup>Department of Biological Sciences, New York City College of Technology, The City University  
11 of New York, 300 Jay Street, Brooklyn, NY, 11201, USA.

12 <sup>2</sup>Biology PhD Program, CUNY Graduate Center, 365 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue, New York, NY 10016.

13 <sup>3</sup>Department of Biology and Burke Museum of Natural History and Culture, University of  
14 Washington, 4331 Memorial Way Northeast, Seattle, WA, 98195, USA.

15 <sup>4</sup>Moore Laboratory of Zoology, Occidental College, Los Angeles, CA, 90041, USA.

16 <sup>5</sup>Laboratorio de Herpetología, Facultad de Ciencias Biológicas, Universidad Autónoma de  
17 Nuevo León, San Nicolás de los Garza, Nuevo León, México

18

19 Correspondence: [cblair@citytech.cuny.edu](mailto:cblair@citytech.cuny.edu); 718-260-5342 (ph)

20

21

22

23 *Key Words: Bayesian, coalescence, genomics, rattlesnakes, speciation, systematics*

24 **Abstract**

25

26 With the continued adoption of genome-scale data in evolutionary biology comes the challenge  
27 of adequately harnessing the information to make accurate phylogenetic inferences.  
28 Coalescent-based methods of species tree inference have become common, and concatenation  
29 has been shown in simulation to perform well, particularly when levels of incomplete lineage  
30 sorting are low. However, simulation conditions are often overly simplistic, leaving empiricists  
31 with uncertainty regarding analytical tools. We use a large ultraconserved element (UCE) data  
32 set (>3000 loci) from rattlesnakes of the *Crotalus triseriatus* group to delimit lineages and  
33 estimate species trees using concatenation and several coalescent-based methods.  
34 Unpartitioned and partitioned maximum-likelihood and Bayesian analysis of the concatenated  
35 matrix yield a topology identical to coalescent analysis of a subset of the data in BPP. ASTRAL  
36 analysis on a subset of the more variable loci also result in a tree consistent with concatenation  
37 and BPP, whereas the SVDQUARTETS phylogeny differs at additional nodes. The size of the  
38 concatenated matrix has a strong effect on species-tree inference using SVDQUARTETS,  
39 warranting additional investigation on optimal data characteristics for this method. Species-  
40 delimitation analyses suggest up to 16 unique lineages may be present within the *C. triseriatus*  
41 group, with divergences occurring during the Neogene and Quaternary. Network analyses  
42 suggest hybridization within the group is relatively rare. Altogether, our results reaffirm the  
43 Mexican highlands as a biodiversity hotspot and suggest that coalescent-based species-tree  
44 inference on data subsets can provide a strongly supported species tree consistent with  
45 concatenation of all loci with a large amount of missing data.

46

47

48

49

## 50 **Introduction**

51  
52 Phylogenetics and phylogeography continue to experience a progressive transformation with  
53 the evolving power of next-generation DNA sequencing (NGS) technologies and sophisticated  
54 new analytical models (Edwards 2009; Liu et al. 2009; McCormack et al. 2013; McCormack and  
55 Faircloth 2013; Edwards et al. 2016). Although phylogenetic studies have been conducted with  
56 whole genomes (Jarvis et al. 2014), reduced-representation approaches like restriction enzyme-  
57 based methods (e.g., RADseq, ddRADseq, GBS) and DNA sequence capture have emerged as  
58 particularly flexible methods for interrogating large eukaryotic genomes for hundreds to  
59 thousands of orthologous loci suitable for phylogenetics (Baird et al. 2008; Elshire et al. 2011;  
60 Faircloth et al. 2012; Lemmon et al. 2012; Peterson et al. 2012). The large number of loci  
61 provided by these methods can help resolve difficult nodes in species trees, particularly those  
62 involved in rapid evolutionary radiations (Wagner et al. 2013; Giarla and Esselstyn 2015;  
63 Leaché et al. 2015, 2016; Meiklejohn et al. 2016). A specific class of molecular marker used  
64 with sequence capture, ultraconserved elements (UCEs; Bejerano et al. 2004; Faircloth et al.  
65 2012), has helped resolve longstanding evolutionary questions across taxonomic groups at  
66 multiple spatial and temporal scales (Crawford et al. 2012; McCormack et al. 2012; Faircloth et  
67 al. 2013; McCormack et al. 2013; Smith et al. 2013; Leaché et al. 2016; Streicher et al. 2016). In  
68 UCEs, the conserved core regions facilitate the collection of orthologous loci among diverse  
69 organisms, whereas the flanking regions provide the sequence variability necessary for  
70 phylogenetics (Faircloth et al. 2012).

71         A major challenge of working with UCE and other types of large data sets is deciding on  
72 the best approaches to analyze these large, often heterogeneous data sets. Although traditional  
73 concatenation is relatively straightforward and computationally feasible, it can be statistically  
74 inconsistent in the presence of incomplete lineage sorting (Kubatko and Degnan 2007; Roch  
75 and Steel 2014; Chou et al. 2015; Mirarab et al. 2016). Meanwhile, fully probabilistic

76 multispecies coalescent methods such as STARBEAST2 (Ogilvie et al. 2017) are attractive as  
77 they model stochastic lineage sorting and simultaneously estimate gene trees, the species tree,  
78 divergence times, and substitution rates. However, likelihood-based multispecies coalescent  
79 methods are not easily scalable to large NGS data sets. To address this, gene-tree  
80 reconciliation methods estimate species trees relatively quickly and directly from gene trees,  
81 instead of sequence data (Liu et al. 2009; Liu et al. 2010; Vachaspati and Warnow 2015; Zhang  
82 et al. 2017). However, poorly resolved gene trees can have a large impact on the species tree  
83 (Xi et al. 2015; Meiklejohn et al. 2016; Xu and Yang 2016). A relatively new coalescent method,  
84 SVDQUARTETS, bypasses the estimation of gene trees and uses singular value decomposition  
85 scores to estimate relationships among quartets prior to assembling quartets into a full species  
86 tree containing all taxa (Chifman and Kubatko 2014; Chifman and Kubatko 2015). The method  
87 appears statistically consistent under the multispecies coalescent, is scalable to NGS data sets,  
88 and performs well under simulations (Chou et al. 2015), but it has not been well tested with  
89 empirical data sets.

90 Rattlesnakes (*Crotalus* and *Sistrurus*) represent a radiation of around 45 pitvipers  
91 distributed throughout the New World from Canada to Argentina (Gloyd 1940; Klauber 1956;  
92 Campbell and Lamar 2004; Blair and Sánchez-Ramírez 2016). There continues to be broad  
93 interest in elucidating the evolutionary history of these enigmatic snakes due, in part, to their  
94 medicinal importance and contributions to yearly envenomations (Campbell and Lamar 2004).  
95 Despite extensive effort over many decades, however, relationships among key groups remain  
96 unresolved. Early studies using morphology and protein data conflict with those using mtDNA  
97 sequences, which in turn often conflict with phylogenies generated from nuclear genes (Gloyd  
98 1940; Klauber 1956; Brattstrom 1964; Foote and MacMahon 1977; Murphy et al. 2002; Bryson  
99 et al. 2011; Reyes-Velasco et al. 2013; Blair and Sánchez-Ramírez 2016). Part of the  
100 discrepancy seems to result from the fact that many molecular studies rely solely on mtDNA  
101 (Parkinson 1999; Murphy et al. 2002; Parkinson et al. 2002; Castoe and Parkinson 2006;

102 Bryson et al. 2011), which often conflict with phylogenies from other sources of data (Leaché  
103 and McGuire 2006; Grummer et al. 2014). An additional difficulty in resolving the rattlesnake  
104 tree is that many groups rapidly diversified during the late Miocene during periods of global  
105 climate change (Zachos et al. 2001) and mountain formation in Mexico (Bryson et al. 2011;  
106 Bryson et al. 2014; Blair and Sánchez-Ramírez 2016). Rapid radiations increase the likelihood  
107 of gene-tree species-tree conflicts, particularly in species with large effective population sizes  
108 (Maddison 1997). Thus, genome-level data sets coupled with multispecies coalescent methods  
109 are often needed to provide both additional informative variation and the necessary analytical  
110 tools to resolve difficult nodes.

111 Rattlesnakes of the *Crotalus triseriatus* species group inhabit mountainous regions in  
112 Mexico and the southwestern US (Campbell and Lamar 2004). Previous mtDNA work on the  
113 group indicates multiple instances of paraphyly and the presence of cryptic species (Bryson et  
114 al. 2011). A subsequent study based on multilocus and morphological data described two new  
115 species and elevated one subspecies to species status (Bryson et al. 2014). Nine species are  
116 now recognized in the group, although phylogenetic relationships among species remain  
117 uncertain, and it is likely that additional species-level diversity awaits discovery. Previous  
118 mtDNA evidence suggests that the *C. triseriatus* group rapidly diversified during formation of the  
119 Trans-Mexican Volcanic Belt (Bryson et al. 2011), and UCE data and multispecies coalescent  
120 models may provide additional insight to better resolve the divergence history of the clade.

121 The first objective of our study is to use a large UCE data set to estimate phylogenetic  
122 relationships and species limits within the *C. triseriatus* group. Our second goal is to estimate  
123 divergence times and compare results to previous rattlesnake studies based on fewer loci  
124 (Bryson et al. 2011; Blair and Sánchez-Ramírez 2016). Finally, we compare traditional  
125 concatenation and coalescent methods, including the newer SVDQUARTETS, using a large  
126 empirical data set. We hope that these comparisons facilitate additional discussion on best  
127 practices for extracting meaningful phylogenetic information from genomic data sets.

128

## 129 **Materials and Methods**

130

### 131 *Sampling and library preparation*

132 We sampled 54 rattlesnakes of the *C. triseriatus* group from throughout the Mexican highlands  
133 (Fig. 1; Supplementary Table S1). We included multiple exemplars of all currently described  
134 taxa to assess both species limits and phylogenetic relationships. Taxa in the group include *C.*  
135 *aquilus*, *C. armstrongi*, *C. campbelli*, *C. lepidus* (*C. l. lepidus*, *C. l. klauberi*, and *C. l.*  
136 *maculosus*), *C. morulus*, *C. pusillus*, *C. ravus* (*C. r. ravus*, *C. r. brunneus*, and *C. r. exiguus*), *C.*  
137 *tlaloci*, and *C. triseriatus* (Bryson et al. 2011; Bryson et al. 2014). We included *Agkistrodon*  
138 *piscivorus* as an outgroup taxon to root tree topologies (Alencar et al. 2016). Handling of  
139 animals followed animal use protocols approved by the University of Nevada at Las Vegas  
140 Animal Care Committee (R701-1105-203) and the University of Washington Institutional Animal  
141 Care and Use Committee (4209-01).

142 Genomic DNA was extracted from tissue samples using the Qiagen DNeasy Blood &  
143 Tissue Kit (Qiagen Inc., Valencia, CA, USA). Aliquots of extracts were shipped to RAPID  
144 Genomics (Gainesville, FL, USA) for UCE library preparation and sequencing following Bryson et  
145 al. (2017). Briefly, 5,472 custom-designed probes (MYbaits; MYcroarray, Inc., Ann Arbor, MI,  
146 USA) were used to enrich 5,060 UCE loci using protocols specified in Faircloth et al. (2012).  
147 Libraries were sequenced on an Illumina HiSeq 3000 (100 paired-end) at the University of  
148 Florida ICBR Facility. Data quality filtering and assembly were performed using the PHYLUCE  
149 pipeline (Faircloth 2016) following Bryson et al. (2017). A locus was retained in the final  
150 assembly if it was represented by >75% of taxa. Alignments were deposited in Dryad  
151 (doi:10.5061/dryad.4467407).

152

### 153 *Concatenated phylogenetic analysis*



154 All phylogenetic analyses were performed using the high-performance computer cluster at the  
155 Center for Theoretical Physics at New York City College of Technology (CUNY). We performed  
156 both maximum likelihood (ML) and Bayesian phylogenetic analyses on the concatenated (75%  
157 complete) matrix. Unpartitioned ML analyses were performed using RAXML v. 8.2.10  
158 (Stamatakis 2014) under a GTRGAMMA substitution model. We used the `-f a` option to calculate  
159 bootstrap support values and infer the ML tree in a single analysis. Nodal support was assessed  
160 through 100 rapid bootstrap replicates. All trees were rooted using *A. piscivorus*.

161 Unpartitioned Bayesian analyses were performed using EXABAYES v. 1.5 (Aberer et al.  
162 2014). EXABAYES is a MCMC package specifically geared towards Bayesian inference of large  
163 phylogenomic data sets, providing multiple analytical solutions for high-level parallelism. All  
164 analyses utilized a general time reversible model with gamma distributed rate heterogeneity  
165 (GTRGAMMA). To make sure that chains were not getting stuck in local optima, we  
166 implemented two independent runs (`-R 2`) with Metropolis-Coupling (three heated and one cold  
167 chain per run [`-C 4`]) in parallel to better sample parameter space. Sampling proposal weights  
168 included the following: `likeSpr = 4`, `parsimonySPR = 8`, `stNNI = 4`, `eSPR = 4`, `blDistGamma = 7`,  
169 `branchMulti = 2`. All analyses were implemented on 64 cores for at least 1 million generations  
170 (sampling every 500) using default priors for all parameters. Mixing and stationarity were  
171 monitored using TRACER v. 1.6.0 (Rambaut and Drummond 2007) with a target effective sample  
172 size (ESS) value of 200 for all parameters. The average standard deviation of split frequencies  
173 (ASDSF) was also used as a measure of convergence using the default threshold value of 5%.  
174 Extended majority rule (MRE) consensus trees were generated through the *consense* script.  
175 The default burn-in of 25% was used for all post-run analysis. Unrooted topologies were rooted  
176 using *A. piscivorus*.

177 The optimal partitioning strategy for all partitioned analyses was determined using  
178 PARTITIONFINDER v. 2.1.1 (Lanfear et al. 2017). Because of the large size of the data set, we  
179 used the relaxed hierarchical clustering algorithm to assign sites to different partitions (Lanfear

180 et al. 2014). This clustering algorithm has been shown to be nearly as accurate as the greedy  
181 algorithm implemented in PARTITIONFINDER, but allows for the scaling of up to thousands of loci.  
182 Although the strict hierarchical clustering algorithm can further improve computational  
183 performance, the relatively high error rates preclude its utility in large phylogenomic data sets  
184 (Lanfear et al. 2014). We limited substitution models to GTR+G as this is the standard model  
185 implemented for nucleotide data in RAXML and currently the only nucleotide model in  
186 EXABAYES. Initial data blocks were assigned by locus from the output provided by the PHYLUCE  
187 pipeline. Default weights (i.e., 1,0,0,0) were used to calculate similarity among partitions  
188 (subsets), which were based solely on differences in substitution rate among sets. We specified  
189 an *rcluster-max* of 1000 and *rcluster-percent* of 10. AICc was used for all partitioning scheme  
190 selection and the *--raxml* option was executed for analysis (Stamatakis 2014). We used the ML  
191 tree from the unpartitioned RAXML analysis as the starting tree for PARTITIONFINDER. The  
192 optimal partitioning scheme was then utilized in partitioned RAXML and EXABAYES analyses  
193 using the same parameter settings as the unpartitioned analyses.

194

#### 195 *Coalescent-based species delimitation and species-tree analysis*

196 We first used SVDQUARTETS (Chifman and Kubatko 2014; Chifman and Kubatko 2015) in  
197 PAUP\* v. 4.0a152 (Swofford 2001) for coalescent-based phylogenomic analysis. SVDQUARTETS  
198 uses site pattern frequencies in SNP or multilocus sequence data to infer singular value  
199 decomposition (SVD) scores among alternative unrooted quartet trees (lower score better). A  
200 tree amalgamation step is subsequently used to assemble a full tree containing all taxa. We first  
201 ran an analysis utilizing every sequence as a terminal (i.e., no species assignments) to estimate  
202 a lineage tree statistically consistent with the multispecies coalescent. We exhaustively sampled  
203 all 341,055 quartets. Following the calculation of SVD scores for alternative quartets, *Quartet*  
204 *FM* (QFM; Reaz et al. 2014) was used in PAUP\* to assemble the full tree. Support for nodes

205 was assessed using nonparametric bootstrapping with 100 replicates. Trees were rooted with *A.*  
206 *piscivorus*.

207 We used BPP v. 3.3a (Yang and Rannala 2010) for joint species delimitation and  
208 species-tree inference (i.e., unguided species delimitation; Yang and Rannala 2014). BPP  
209 utilizes the multispecies coalescent model in a fully probabilistic (Bayesian) framework for  
210 parameter estimation, explicitly accounting for gene tree/species tree discordance due to  
211 incomplete lineage sorting. Due to the relatively high computational burden of Bayesian  
212 methods like BPP, we performed inference on reduced data sets consisting of a subset of 100 of  
213 the most variable loci. Geneious v. 9.1.7 (Kearse et al. 2012) was used to select loci based on  
214 the percentage of variable sites. Assignment of individuals to putative species followed previous  
215 studies (Bryson et al. 2011; Bryson et al. 2014) and the results of the concatenated  
216 phylogenetic analyses. Two samples, Ct143ClkJAL and Ct2CaqAGS, were placed in strongly  
217 supported yet conflicting relationships in concatenated and coalescent analyses (see below) in  
218 a pattern suggestive of historical introgression. Both were subsequently excluded from the  
219 analysis to meet methodological assumptions of the method (i.e. no hybridization among  
220 species; Yang and Rannala 2010, 2014), leaving a total of 17 groupings and 53 individuals.  
221 *Crotalus lepidus* was divided into six populations consistent with geography and our  
222 phylogenetic analyses: *C. l. lepidus*, *C. l. maculosus*, *C. l. klauberi-3* Northwest (samples from  
223 the northeastern Sierra Madre Occidental and adjacent sky islands), *C. l. klauberi-4* Northeast  
224 (samples from the dry slopes of the northeastern Sierra Madre Occidental and adjacent  
225 uplands), *C. l. klauberi-2* Durango (samples from the Sierra Madre Occidental of Durango), and  
226 *C. l. klauberi-1* South (samples from the Sierra Madre Occidental south of the Rio Mezquital  
227 drainage). We specified gamma priors of  $G(2,1000)$  for both population sizes ( $\theta$ s) and the  
228 divergence time of the root ( $\tau_0$ ). The *locusrate* parameter was used to account for rate variation  
229 among loci using  $D(\alpha) = 10$ . Uniform rooted trees was used as the species model prior.  
230 Following a burn-in of 10,000 generations, chains were sampled every 5 generations for a total

231 of 20,000 samples. Multiple analyses were run using different species delimitations algorithms  
232 (Algorithms 0 and 1) to check for indications of convergence. We also tested the influence of the  
233 prior on  $\theta$ s and  $\tau_0$  as previous research suggests that these priors may influence species  
234 delimitation results (Leaché and Fujita 2010; Blair et al. 2015; Yang 2015). We specifically  
235 compared results between  $G(2,1000)$  and  $G(2,100)$ . We also performed additional species-  
236 delimitation analyses using 500 of the more variable loci to compare to the analyses using 100  
237 loci. Parameter settings were similar to the 100 loci analyses, but in this case we used a burn-in  
238 of 20,000 and a sample frequency of 10. In total, 16 different species-delimitation analyses were  
239 performed.

240 We also used BPP for species-tree inference (Analysis 01) under the multispecies  
241 coalescent model using the 500 loci data set. Individuals were partitioned into 17 'species'  
242 following the results of the species-delimitation analyses (see Results). Three independent  
243 MCMC runs were implemented with a burn-in of 10,000, a sample frequency of 5, and 20,000  
244 total samples. We specified gamma priors of  $G(2,1000)$  for both population sizes ( $\theta$ s) and the  
245 divergence time of the root ( $\tau_0$ ). The species model prior assumed uniform rooted trees.

246 Based on the species delimitation results obtained from BPP, we performed a  
247 coalescent-based species-tree analysis on the full concatenated matrix of 3,384 UCE loci in  
248 SVDQUARTETS. Individuals ( $n=53$ ) were assigned to 17 species, and Ct143CikJAL and  
249 Ct2CaqAGS were excluded, matching our BPP species-tree analyses. We performed a species  
250 tree search using all quartets (195,833) and used QFM to assemble the species tree. Node  
251 support was assessed using 100 nonparametric bootstrap replicates. We also performed  
252 additional species tree analyses in SVDQUARTETS using concatenated subsets of the total data  
253 (50 UCE loci, 100 UCE loci, 1000 UCE loci, 2000 UCE loci) to assess levels of congruence. All  
254 quartets were evaluated for each subset and 100 nonparametric bootstrap replicates were used  
255 to calculate support values.

256 Finally, we used the gene-tree reconciliation method ASTRAL-III v. 5.5.6 (Mirarab et al.  
257 2014; Mirarab and Warnow 2015; Zhang et al. 2017) to infer a species tree that is statistically  
258 consistent with the multispecies coalescent. ASTRAL takes as input a set of unrooted gene  
259 trees and finds the species tree containing the maximum number of induced quartets that are  
260 consistent with the gene trees. Several studies have indicated that ASTRAL is one of the more  
261 accurate gene tree reconciliation methods currently available (e.g., Mirarab et al. 2014; Chou et  
262 al. 2015). However, caution is often warranted as poor resolution gene trees can substantially  
263 influence the accuracy of the inferred species tree (Mirarab et al. 2014; Xi et al. 2015). We  
264 began by manually inspecting the 500 loci used in BPP. We used GENEIOUS to remove  
265 individuals with all missing data (?s), the two putative hybrid samples, individuals with highly  
266 fragmented data (Hosner et al. 2016), and loci without the outgroup sequence. We also  
267 removed loci with extremely low levels of variability that were unlikely to yield useful gene trees.  
268 RAxML was used with the *raxml\_wrapper.pl* script ([https://sco.h-](https://sco.h-its.org/exelixis/web/software/raxml/index.html)  
269 [its.org/exelixis/web/software/raxml/index.html](https://sco.h-its.org/exelixis/web/software/raxml/index.html)) to process the 351 alignments (-f d search under  
270 GTRGAMMA). Initial runs were used to prune identical sequences from each alignment and  
271 subsequent runs searched for ML trees using unique haplotypes. All 351 ML gene trees were  
272 used in ASTRAL, and we created a file to assign individuals to species. Support for  
273 relationships in the ASTRAL species tree was quantified using local posterior probabilities  
274 (Sayyari and Mirarab 2016). We did not include ML bootstrap trees in analyses (i.e., multilocus  
275 bootstrapping) as recent research suggests that local posterior probabilities may be more a  
276 more accurate measure of support (Sayyari and Mirarab 2016). The unrooted ASTRAL species  
277 tree was subsequently rooted with *A. piscivorus*.

278

### 279 *Divergence time estimation*

280 Because of the large size of the data set, we estimated divergence times on the fixed BPP  
281 species tree topology using MCMCTree within PAML v. 4.9e (Yang and Rannala 2006; Rannala

282 and Yang 2007; Yang 2007). MCMCTree is particularly suitable for Bayesian estimation of  
283 divergence times under alternative clock models in large, next-generation data sets where joint  
284 estimation of tree topology and divergence times is computationally problematic (Reis and Yang  
285 2011). Divergence times were estimated using a pruned alignment containing a single sample  
286 per lineage. PAUP\* v. 4.0a161 (Swofford 2001) was used to test for a strict molecular clock  
287 using likelihood ratio tests, AICc, and BIC under a HKY+I+G substitution model. As the results  
288 strongly rejected the molecular clock (see Results), we used the approximate likelihood method  
289 and independent rates clock model in MCMCTree (Reis and Yang 2011). Analyses used a  
290 HKY+G4 substitution model, default priors for kappa ( $G[6,2]$ ) and alpha ( $G[1,1]$ ),  $G(2,2000)$  for  
291 substitution rate, and  $G(1,10)$  for sigma. A single alignment partition of the full 3,384 loci was  
292 used to minimize the number of parameters and ensure adequate mixing and convergence.  
293 Sampling included a burn-in of 1 million generations followed by 10,000 posterior samples  
294 drawn every 5,000 generations. We calibrated the root node using information from a recent  
295 fossil-calibrated rattlesnake phylogeny (Blair and Sánchez-Ramírez 2016). Specifically, soft  
296 bounds between 20-12 Ma were placed on the MRCA of *Crotalus* and *Agkistrodon*.  
297 Convergence was assessed by running all analyses twice and monitoring effective sample sizes  
298 (ESS) in Tracer v. 1.6 (Rambaut and Drummond 2007). We also tested the impact of the sigma  
299 prior on divergence times by re-running analyses using a  $G(1,100)$  prior. Finally, MCMCTree  
300 was run without data (i.e., sampling the prior only; usedata = 0) to quantify the information  
301 content in the sequence data and make sure that the choice of priors for divergence times was  
302 reasonable.

303

#### 304 *Network estimation*

305 Because strictly bifurcating trees may not adequately depict evolutionary history, we used the  
306 pseudolikelihood method SNaQ (Solís-Lemus and Ané 2016) in the PhyloNetworks package  
307 (Solís-Lemus et al. 2017) to estimate a phylogenomic network. SNaQ is a recently-developed

308 algorithm that can explicitly account for both incomplete lineage sorting and introgression/gene  
309 flow. Previous studies have suggested that a large number of loci may be needed to accurately  
310 detect hybridization events (Solís-Lemus and Ané 2016), so we used all 3,384 loci and all 55  
311 individuals, each of which was assigned to species following our species-tree analyses. We  
312 began by running RAxML on each of the 3,384 alignments (ML + bootstrap search). We then  
313 used the best trees to determine concordance factors at the level of individuals. This data frame  
314 was then modified to create a concordance factor table at the level of species that was used as  
315 input for SNaQ. A more comprehensive discussion of running SNaQ using multiple alleles per  
316 species can be found in the online documentation of SNaQ/PhyloNetworks. We tested hmax  
317 values of 0–4 and selected the best value by plotting hmax versus loglik. Ten independent runs  
318 were implemented for each value of hmax. For hmax=0 we used the ASTRAL tree as the  
319 starting topology. For all remaining hmax values we used the best network estimated from  
320 previous hmax values as the starting topology.

321

## 322 **Results**

323

### 324 *Data set characteristics*

325 We sequenced 3,384 UCE loci (after quality filtering) for 54 specimens of montane rattlesnakes  
326 in the *C. triseriatus* species group and the outgroup. Out of a total of 2,057,530 characters,  
327 1,978,984 were constant, 40,907 were variable and parsimony-uninformative, and 37,639 were  
328 variable and parsimony-informative. The proportion of gaps and undetermined characters in the  
329 concatenated data matrix was 18.4%, and pairwise identity was 99.4% with 94.7% of sites  
330 identical (including the *Agkistrodon* outgroup), illustrating the high degree of conservatism in  
331 UCE loci. Also typical of UCE data, the data showed an AT-bias, with a %GC-value of 38.1.

332

### 333 *Concatenated analysis*

334 Unpartitioned ML analyses of the concatenated matrix under a GTRGAMMA substitution model  
335 yielded a topology with strong support for most nodes (Fig. 2). The majority of presently defined  
336 species and subspecies were monophyletic, with the exception of *C. aquilus* and *C. lepidus*  
337 *klauberi*, the latter of which was placed throughout a large clade in the phylogeny with strong  
338 bootstrap support. The two samples of *C. lepidus lepidus* were deeply nested within a clade of  
339 *C. lepidus klauberi*. The majority of nodes towards the base of the tree received high bootstrap  
340 support, with the newly described *C. tlaloci* placed sister to *C. pusillus*, and *C. campbelli* sister  
341 to *C. armstrongi*. *Crotalus ravus* was strongly supported as sister to the remaining sampled  
342 rattlesnakes. *Crotalus morulus* was also fully resolved and placed sister to a clade containing *C.*  
343 *lepidus maculosus*, *C. lepidus klauberi*, and *C. lepidus lepidus*. One sample of *C. aquilus*  
344 (Ct2CaqAGS) was placed within a clade of *C. l. klauberi*.

345 All unpartitioned EXABAYES analyses indicated adequate convergence (ESS values  
346 >200, ASDSF <0.05). In fact, both runs converged to the identical posterior distribution (ASDSF  
347 = 0) after 20,000 generations. However, chains were run for a full 1 million generations to  
348 adequately sample all parameters. The topology of the EXABAYES MRE tree was identical to the  
349 ML tree with all nodes fully resolved (posterior probability = 1.0).

350 The *rcluster* algorithm in PARTITIONFINDER clustered the concatenated alignment into  
351 2,005 subsets consisting of 20,156 parameters (lnL = -3,796,380.79; AICc = 7,633,472.41). This  
352 partitioning scheme was then used to perform partitioned ML and Bayesian analyses in RAXML  
353 and EXABAYES, respectively, assigning independent GTRGAMMA models to each partition. The  
354 ML tree from the partitioned analysis was identical to the unpartitioned ML and Bayesian trees,  
355 with high bootstrap support for the majority of nodes. Similar to the unpartitioned analysis, the  
356 partitioned EXABAYES runs attained excellent convergence relatively rapidly (ASDSF = 0).  
357 However, ESS values for two parameters (LnPr and TL) were low due to large fluctuations in  
358 values throughout the runs. All other parameters had excellent ESS values (>200). This  
359 indicated potential issues with the estimation of branch lengths on large partitioned EXABAYES



360 analyses. Nevertheless, we created a MRE consensus tree from the two partitioned EXABAYES  
361 runs and the topology was identical to the unpartitioned ExaBayes analysis and the partitioned  
362 and unpartitioned RAXML analyses. However, branch length estimates were off by an order of  
363 magnitude.

364

#### 365 *Coalescent-based species delimitation and species-tree analysis*

366 The bootstrap consensus tree from the lineage-based (without *a priori* species assignments)  
367 SVDQUARTETS analysis conflicted with the inferred topology from the RAXML and EXABAYES  
368 analyses, although support for conflicting relationships was mixed (Supplementary Fig. S1). In  
369 the SVDQUARTETS tree, following the divergence of *C. ravus*, a *C. armstrongi/C. campbelli* clade  
370 was strongly supported as sister to all remaining rattlesnakes. Similar to the concatenation (i.e.  
371 non-coalescent) analyses, *C. tlaloci* was strongly supported as sister to *C. pusillus*.  
372 Relationships within the *C. aquilus*, *C. lepidus*, and *C. morulus* clade were ambiguous and  
373 contradictory to relationships inferred from the concatenated RAXML and EXABAYES analyses.  
374 However, many nodes in this clade suffered from low bootstrap support. One sample of *C. l.*  
375 *klauberi* (Ct143ClkJAL) was placed within a clade of *C. aquilus*.

376 We performed multiple coalescent-based species-delimitation analyses in BPP to help  
377 determine if the genetic lineages inferred in our phylogenetic analyses may represent distinct  
378 species or reproductively isolated populations. Alternative runs, priors, and search algorithms  
379 gave consistent results, indicating that chains were run for a sufficient length of time. There was  
380 overwhelming support for a species-delimitation model where each of the 17 lineages (including  
381 the outgroup) represent distinct populations or species (Fig. 3; Supplementary Table S2).  
382 Posterior probability values for each 'species' was 1.0 for the majority of taxa in the tree in both  
383 the 100 and 500 loci data sets. Only four taxa received less than full support in our analyses: *C.*  
384 *lepidus klauberi-2* (Durango), *C. lepidus klauberi-3* (Northwest), *C. lepidus klauberi-4*  
385 (Northeast), and *C. lepidus lepidus*. However, posterior probability values remained high,

386 particularly for analyses based on 500 loci (Fig. 3). Based on these results, we treated these  
387 taxa as distinct lineages for downstream species tree analysis.

388 We used the species-delimitation model with the highest posterior probability for  
389 additional coalescent-based species tree analyses. The three independent BPP runs were  
390 largely consistent with one another, suggesting strong signal in the data and that chains were  
391 run for an acceptable duration. The only topological difference among runs occurred in the clade  
392 containing *C. lepidus klauberi-3* (Northwest), *C. lepidus klauberi-4* (Northeast), and *C. lepidus*  
393 *lepidus*. Two of the three runs placed *C. lepidus lepidus* as sister to *C. lepidus klauberi-4*  
394 (Northeast), whereas the third run placed *C. lepidus klauberi-3* (Northwest) sister to *C. lepidus*  
395 *klauberi-4* (Northeast). The tree topology of the former two runs was identical to the  
396 concatenated ML and Bayesian trees (Figs. 2,4A).

397 We also used the species delimitation results from BPP for subsequent species tree  
398 analysis in SVDQUARTETS. The resulting species tree differed from the RAxML and ExaBayes  
399 trees, the BPP species tree, and the SVDQUARTETS lineage tree, particularly with regard to  
400 deeper relationships (Fig. 4B). For example, BPP and the concatenated ML and Bayesian  
401 analyses placed *C. campbelli* and *C. armstrongi* as sister to a clade containing *C. tlaloci* and *C.*  
402 *pusillus*. In contrast, the coalescent-based species tree analysis in SVDQUARTETS placed *C.*  
403 *campbelli* and *C. armstrongi* as sister to all remaining rattlesnakes except *C. ravus*. In addition,  
404 the concatenated analyses and BPP placed *C. aquilus* sister to one of the *C. lepidus klauberi*  
405 lineages (Figs. 2,4A), whereas SVDQUARTETS placed *C. aquilus* as sister to a clade consisting  
406 of *C. morulus*, *C. lepidus maculosus*, *C. lepidus lepidus*, and the three remaining *C. lepidus*  
407 *klauberi* lineages (Fig. 4B). Bootstrap support was high for the majority of nodes in the  
408 SVDQUARTETS species tree (>70), except for the node uniting *C. campbelli* and *C. armstrongi*  
409 (63) and the node representing the MRCA of the majority of the species group (59).

410 The species tree inferred from ASTRAL analysis of 351 gene trees was largely  
411 consistent with the trees inferred from concatenated ML and Bayesian analyses and coalescent

412 analyses in BPP (Fig. 4C). The majority of differences involved nodes with low support values.  
413 *Crotalus campbelli* and *C. armstrongi* were placed sister to a clade containing *C. tlaloci* and *C.*  
414 *pusillus*, albeit with low local posterior probability. In the ASTRAL tree *C. lepidus klauberi*-1  
415 (South) was more closely related to *C. morulus* and other *C. lepidus* lineages versus *C. aquilus*,  
416 which differed from relationships inferred using the other species tree methods utilized.

417 We explored how the size of the concatenated data matrix might influence species tree  
418 inference in SVDQUARTETS by inferring trees based on 50, 100, 1000, and 2000 UCE loci.  
419 Discordant results were obtained from each analysis, although most incongruence was  
420 restricted to poorly supported nodes (Fig. 5). No tree was identical to the tree inferred through  
421 the analysis of the full 3,384 loci. The 100 loci analysis had the highest number of nodes with  
422 bootstrap values <70. Thus, there appears to be additional nuances of the data other than size  
423 that influence node support.

424

#### 425 *Divergence time estimation*

426 A strict clock model was strongly rejected using a likelihood ratio test (difference = 184.8485;  $p$   
427 < 0.001), AICc (difference = 339.6962) and BIC (difference = 151.6418). Adequate convergence  
428 was obtained in multiple runs of MCMCTree (Fig. 6), with all ESS values >200. Virtually  
429 identical results were obtained using smaller gamma priors for sigma ( $G[1,100]$ ), and thus we  
430 present the results using  $G(1,10)$  only. The MRCA of the *C. triseriatus* group dated back to  
431 around 10 Ma. Divergence within the three subspecies of *C. ravus* occurred in the Pliocene  
432 around 4–5 Ma. The newly described *C. tlaloci* diverged from its sister taxon, *C. pusillus*, close  
433 to 5 Ma. *Crotalus campbelli* diverged from *C. armstrongi* about 5.5 Ma. Independent lineages  
434 within *C. lepidus klauberi* originated within the past 5 million years. The estimated mean rate of  
435 substitution ( $\mu$ ) was 3.57E-4 subs/site/My (95% HPD = 2.496E-4–4.696E-4). We also ran  
436 MCMCTree without data (i.e., sampling from the prior only) to determine the information content  
437 in the sequence data and make sure that the priors on divergence times were adequate. All

438 divergence time priors were reasonable, yet different from posterior estimates that included the  
439 sequences (Supplementary Table S3). Thus, we concluded that the data were efficient to  
440 estimate divergence times and that our root calibration scheme was adequate.

441

#### 442 *Network analysis*

443 There was a sharp increase in pseudolikelihood score from  $h_{\max}=0$  to  $h_{\max}=1$  (-766.252 vs. -  
444 541.526) followed by a more gradual improvement with additional reticulations (Supplementary  
445 Fig. S2). Thus, a single hybridization event best represented the data. The SNaQ major tree  
446 was virtually identical to the topologies from ASTRAL, BPP, and concatenation (Fig. 7).  
447 Topological differences were predominantly restricted to the clade consisting of *C. lepidus*  
448 *lepidus* and the different populations of *C. lepidus klauberi*. The single inferred reticulation event  
449 involved the mrca of the *C. lepidus* + *C. morulus* clade contributing genes ( $\gamma = 0.194$ ) to *C.*  
450 *armstrongi*.

451

## 452 **Discussion**

453

#### 454 *Phylogenomic analysis*

455 One of our main objectives was to examine levels of discordance in commonly used  
456 phylogenomic packages on a large empirical data set. With the realization that gene-tree  
457 topologies do not always agree with the species tree due to multiple processes including  
458 incomplete lineage sorting (Maddison 1997; Degnan and Rosenberg 2006; Degnan and  
459 Rosenberg 2009; Edwards 2009), substantial effort has been placed on the development of  
460 sophisticated algorithms to explicitly account for gene-tree discordance when estimating species  
461 trees (e.g., Liu et al. 2009, 2010; Heled and Drummond 2010; Mirarab et al. 2014; Vachaspati  
462 and Warnow 2015). The species tree methods we select for comparison include concatenation,  
463 a fully probabilistic coalescent method (BPP), a gene-tree reconciliation method (ASTRAL III),

464 and a site-specific technique based on algebraic statistics (SVDQUARTETS). These methods are  
465 selected based on both our data set characteristics and the relative performance of methods in  
466 simulation and empirical studies (Yang and Rannala 2010; Chifman and Kubatko 2014; Mirarab  
467 et al. 2014; Chou et al. 2015; Mirarab and Warnow 2015; Yang 2015). Both our concatenated  
468 ML and Bayesian analyses provide a well-supported phylogenomic hypothesis for rattlesnakes  
469 in the *C. triseriatus* group. Interestingly, the topology inferred from concatenation (Fig. 2) is  
470 identical to the topology inferred by fully probabilistic coalescent analyses in BPP (Fig. 4A). Due  
471 to the computational burden of methods like BPP, we restrict our analysis to 500 UCE loci. Our  
472 results coupled with those of previous studies suggest that BPP is likely to be an accurate  
473 estimator of species trees even with subsets of the total data (Caviedes-Solis et al. 2015; Shi  
474 and Yang 2018). We are a bit surprised that BPP is not used more often for species tree  
475 inference, although it is widely used for the purposes of species delimitation (e.g., Leaché and  
476 Fujita 2010; Blair et al. 2015). We encourage empiricists to explore the method with additional  
477 phylogenomic data sets.

478         There are now myriad gene-tree reconciliation techniques available to estimate species  
479 trees (Liu et al. 2009; Liu et al. 2010; Mirarab et al. 2014; Mirarab and Warnow 2015; Zhang et  
480 al. 2017). These two-step procedures first use individual alignments to estimate gene trees,  
481 which are subsequently used as input data for species tree inference. We examined ASTRAL  
482 as simulation studies have shown it to be one of the more accurate techniques (Mirarab et al.  
483 2014; Chou et al. 2015). It is also one of the few methods that can handle multiple individuals  
484 per species. To try to minimize potential errors in species tree inference, we followed the  
485 recommendations of recent studies (e.g., Xi et al. 2015; Hosner et al. 2016; Meiklejohn et al.  
486 2016) and limited our ASTRAL analysis to 351 of the more variable UCE loci with little  
487 fragmentary data and use RAxML for gene tree reconstruction. The resulting species tree was  
488 highly congruent to the species trees inferred using concatenation and BPP. One difference that  
489 was strongly supported is the placement of *C. aquilus* and *C. lepidus klauberi*-1 (South), which

490 were inferred as sister taxa in concatenation and BPP. Conversely, in the ASTRAL tree, *C.*  
491 *lepidus klauberi-1* (South) was sister to a clade consisting of *C. morulus* and the remaining *C.*  
492 *lepidus* taxa. Other differences in the ASTRAL tree involved lineages within *C. lepidus klauberi*,  
493 but these relationships were weakly supported. Thus, although our ASTRAL results were  
494 consistent with other methods examined, additional studies are needed to help determine how  
495 large phylogenomic data sets should be pruned and subsampled prior to species tree inference.

496 Although these gene-tree reconciliation methods are relatively quick, there are  
497 numerous additional considerations that researchers must be aware of when using these  
498 methods. For example, gene tree error has been shown to negatively influence the resulting  
499 species trees (Mirarab et al. 2014, 2016; Roch and Warnow 2015; Xi et al. 2015). Unfortunately,  
500 gene tree error/uncertainty is often ubiquitous when working with loci with relatively few  
501 informative characters such as UCEs. Second, missing data can also negatively impact gene  
502 tree reconciliation techniques, most likely to a greater degree than concatenation and site-based  
503 methods (Burleigh et al. 2015; Hosner et al. 2016). Missing data can come as either an entire  
504 sequence missing for some species in an alignment or species having partial (fragmented)  
505 sequences that reduce information content. Other studies have also shown a measurable  
506 impact of the method used to reconstruct gene trees (Xi et al. 2015; Meiklejohn et al. 2016).  
507 Recently, Streicher et al. (2016) used a large UCE data set from iguanian lizards to quantify the  
508 effects of taxon and locus sampling on species tree inference. Their results based on  
509 concatenation and coalescent analyses ( $NJ_{st}$ ) suggest that including a large proportion of  
510 missing data (including loci with up to 50% missing taxa) may be beneficial in phylogenomic  
511 studies. However, results and conclusions were based off branch support values in the  
512 unknown iguanian tree and differences were obtained between phylogenomic methods. In  
513 another recent study, Hosner et al. (2016) found that missing data (particularly  
514 partial/fragmented sequences) were a bigger issue for gene tree reconciliation approaches  
515 versus concatenation and quartet-based methods like SVDQUARTETS. Their results also

516 corroborated other recent studies (e.g., Meiklejohn et al. 2016) and suggest that gene tree  
517 reconciliation methods be restricted to a subset of the most variable loci to improve the quality  
518 of gene trees. In sum, there is still a great deal of uncertainty with how taxa and loci should be  
519 sampled in phylogenomics, particularly when using gene tree reconciliation approaches.

520         Because of the potential issues with gene tree reconciliation methods highlighted above,  
521 there has been substantial interest in species tree methods that work directly from the sequence  
522 data and are scalable to large phylogenomic data sets. One popular method that has emerged  
523 is the SVDQUARTETS algorithm currently implemented in PAUP\*. The method is statistically  
524 consistent under the multispecies coalescent model, can work with both SNP data and  
525 concatenated UCE loci, is relatively quick, and can apparently work well with large quantities of  
526 missing data (Chifman and Kubatko 2014; Chou et al. 2015; Leaché et al. 2015; Leaché et al.  
527 2016). These attributes make the methods particularly appealing to analyze large phylogenomic  
528 data sets generated through both sequence capture and RADseq related approaches. The  
529 technique has been shown to perform well in simulation (Chou et al. 2015), but there is still little  
530 data available illustrating how SVDQUARTETS performs on empirical phylogenomic data (Leaché  
531 et al. 2015; Hosner et al. 2016; Leaché et al. 2016). We performed multiple SVDQUARTETS  
532 analyses on different data sets to quantify discordant topological patterns. The lineage-based  
533 analysis (using individuals as terminals) differed from the concatenated ML and Bayesian  
534 analyses although bootstrap support values were relatively low. In the SVDQUARTETS lineage  
535 tree, *C. morulus* was not monophyletic and *C. campbelli* was nested with *C. armstrongi*. The  
536 SVDQUARTETS species tree based on all 3,384 loci also differed from species trees inferred from  
537 other methods. Of particular note is the early divergence of (*C. campbelli* + *C. armstrongi*) in the  
538 SVDQUARTETS tree, whereas other species tree analyses and concatenation placed these taxa  
539 as sister to (*C. pusillus* + *C. tlaloci*). However, bootstrap support for this placement was weak  
540 (59%), and it is likely that *C. campbelli* and *C. armstrongi* form a clade with *C. pusillus* and *C.*  
541 *tlaloci*.

542 To further probe how results from SVDQUARTETS may change based on data set size  
543 and characteristics, we performed additional species tree analyses on concatenated alignments  
544 consisting of 50, 100, 1000, and 2000 UCE loci. Different topologies were recovered for each  
545 analysis, although bootstrap support at conflicting nodes was relatively weak. With only 50 UCE  
546 loci, the *C. ravus* clade was placed sister to *C. campbelli* and *C. armstrongi* with a bootstrap  
547 value of 65%. This result disappeared in all analyses with more data. Our results also  
548 suggested an unclear relationship between data set size and bootstrap support values,  
549 indicating that there are additional nuances besides number of loci that contribute to strongly  
550 supported species trees. In general, our results are consistent with other recent studies that  
551 found lower node support values for SVDQUARTETS trees versus trees inferred through  
552 concatenation (Leaché and Linkem 2015; Leaché et al. 2015, 2016; Hosner et al. 2016). In  
553 addition, our results are similar to a recent study that examined phylogenomic relationships  
554 among gibbons using real and simulated data and found that species trees inferred by BPP and  
555 ASTRAL were much more consistent than those inferred by SVDQUARTETS (Shi and Yang  
556 2018). Although additional simulation and empirical studies are needed to examine  
557 characteristics of the SVDQUARTETS method in greater detail, it appears that relatively large data  
558 sets are needed to reach a topology and support values consistent with other methods of  
559 species tree inference, and that full likelihood-based approaches that adequately model rate  
560 heterogeneity and coalescent stochasticity may be preferable.

561 Strictly bifurcating trees may not adequately depict evolutionary history when gene flow  
562 and hybridization are prevalent (Yu and Nakhleh 2015; Solís-Lemus and Ané 2016; Wen et al.  
563 2018). Using SNaQ, we found hybridization within the sampled taxa of the *C. triseriatus* group to  
564 be relatively rare. Results provided strong support for a model consisting of a single reticulation  
565 event from the mrca of *C. lepidus* + *C. morulus* into *C. armstrongi*. The major tree inferred by  
566 SNaQ was virtually identical to the ASTRAL tree and very similar to the trees inferred by BPP  
567 and concatenation. Interestingly, SNaQ detected no introgression between *C. aquilus* and *C.*



568 *lepidus klauberi*-1 (South) even though this was suggested in our other phylogenetic analyses. It  
569 is possible that introgression between these two taxa was limited to two individuals in our study  
570 (Ct143CikJAL and Ct2CaqAGS), and the inclusion of larger number of samples from each  
571 species masked the signal of hybridization. Additional sampling of both species from near where  
572 their ranges meet should further elucidate the propensity for introgression in these snakes.

573 Interest in phylogenomic networks continues to increase as more evidence accumulates  
574 suggesting that both incomplete lineage sorting and reticulation/hybridization may be a common  
575 component of the evolutionary history of several groups (Solís-Lemus and Ané 2016; Solís-  
576 Lemus et al. 2017; Wen et al. 2018). Unfortunately, many of these explicit network methods are  
577 computationally demanding (Than et al. 2008), necessitating the use of some type of  
578 approximation. New pseudolikelihood methods such as SNaQ and similar techniques in the  
579 PhyloNet package (Yu and Nakhleh 2015; Wen et al. 2018) show promise for analyzing large  
580 phylogenomic data sets. Combining tree-based and network-based phylogenomic methods,  
581 each with their own strengths and weaknesses, will likely provide the most robust conclusions  
582 regarding evolutionary history. Further, although our inferred divergence times are broadly  
583 concordant with previous studies (e.g., Bryson et al. 2011; Blair and Sánchez-Ramírez 2016),  
584 more research is needed to determine how reticulated histories influence inferred divergence  
585 times.

586

#### 587 *Systematics and biogeography of the C. triseriatus group*

588 The Mexican highlands are a known biodiversity hotspot (Mittermeier et al. 2017), and multiple  
589 phylogeographic studies have documented cryptic diversity distributed throughout high-  
590 elevation biomes within Mexico's major mountain systems (e.g., León-Paniagua et al. 2007;  
591 McCormack et al. 2008; Navarro-Sigüenza et al. 2008; Puebla-Olivares et al. 2008; Bryson et  
592 al. 2012). Based on our analyses, it is clear that *C. ravus* is divergent from the remainder of the  
593 group. The three currently recognized subspecies of *C. ravus* are allopatric (Campbell and

594 Lamar 2004), morphologically differentiated (Campbell and Armstrong 1979), form distinct  
595 lineages (Bryson et al. 2011), and are supported as distinct species by our species-delimitation  
596 models using phylogenomic data. Based on these combined lines of evidence, we recommend  
597 that the three subspecies be elevated to full species status: *C. ravus*, *C. brunneus*, and *C.*  
598 *exiguus*.

599         Nearly all species trees place *C. tlaloci* sister to *C. pusillus* and *C. campbelli* sister to *C.*  
600 *armstrongi*. These relationships are consistent with geography, with *C. pusillus* inhabiting the  
601 western regions of the Trans-Mexican Volcanic Belt and adjacent Sierra de Coalcomán, and *C.*  
602 *tlaloci* found along the central part of the Trans-Mexican Volcanic Belt. *Crotalus campbelli* is  
603 distributed along the western margin of the Trans-Mexican Volcanic Belt, and is separated by  
604 low-elevation valleys from *C. armstrongi* inhabiting regions of the Trans-Mexican Volcanic Belt  
605 to the east (Bryson et al. 2014). None of these species are known to occur sympatrically,  
606 although *C. pusillus* and *C. armstrongi* are both found on Cerro Tancítaro in western  
607 Michoacán.

608         *Crotalus triseriatus* is the sister species to the large clade containing *C. aquilus*, *C.*  
609 *morulus*, and *C. lepidus*. *Crotalus aquilus* and southern *C. l. klauberi* (*C. l. klauberi*-1 South) are  
610 strongly supported as sister taxa in several of our analyses. Previous results based on mtDNA  
611 suggested *C. aquilus* formed a closer relationship with *C. morulus*, and placed southern *C. l.*  
612 *klauberi* as sister to the remaining *C. lepidus* (Bryson et al. 2011). Our species-delimitation  
613 analyses indicate *C. lepidus* contains as many as six distinct lineages, all consistent with  
614 geography. These same lineages were inferred with mtDNA (Bryson et al. 2011). Although our  
615 sampling spanned the geographic distribution of most subspecies, we lack samples from critical  
616 regions where subspecies converge (Campbell and Lamar 2004). We therefore hold off on  
617 formal taxonomic changes to *C. lepidus* until further range-wide sampling combined with a  
618 detailed examination of morphology can be made. Additional sampling and integrative  
619 approaches to species delimitation will also help alleviate concerns of overestimating the

620 number of true species when using BPP and other multispecies coalescent programs  
621 (Sukumaran and Knowles 2017).

622 Our results based on UCE data and results based on mtDNA (Bryson et al. 2011)  
623 present evidence for limited hybridization of *C. aquilus* with southern *C. lepidus* and *C. morulus*  
624 across the northern region of the Central Mexican Plateau from San Luis Potosí to Jalisco. The  
625 patchy islands of suitable rocky habitat above 2000 m across this region, similar to ‘sky islands’  
626 in northern Mexico and Arizona (McCormack et al. 2009), suggest populations in this area likely  
627 harbor genetic signatures of a former Pleistocene hybrid zone. Current gene flow at a low rate  
628 may also be possible in those few areas with contiguous suitable habitat. Divergence time  
629 estimates here and elsewhere (Bryson et al. 2011) indicate *C. aquilus*, southern *C. l. klauberi*,  
630 and *C. morulus* likely diverged from each other prior to onset of the Pleistocene 2.6 Ma. After  
631 these divergences, montane woodlands covered much of the Central Mexican Plateau (Van  
632 Devender, 1990; McDonald, 1993; Metcalfe, 2006; Gugger et al. 2011), and as a result, the  
633 distributions of these taxa probably extensively overlapped during most of the Pleistocene.  
634 However, within the core distributions of *C. aquilus* and *C. morulus*, no evidence of introgression  
635 has been uncovered and each species maintains phenotypic cohesion, suggesting these two  
636 species have maintained their distinctiveness throughout the past several million years. It is  
637 clear, however, that southern *C. l. klauberi* has a closer relationship to *C. aquilus* than to other  
638 *C. lepidus*, at least based on genomic and potentially phenotypic data. While mtDNA clearly  
639 supports the distinctiveness of southern *C. l. klauberi*, consistent with our species-delimitation  
640 models, it unites this lineage with other *C. lepidus* (Bryson et al. 2011). This finding suggests  
641 that a history of introgression between southern *C. l. klauberi* and *C. aquilus* has been  
642 maintained in the nuclear genome, but not the mitochondrial genome. Finer-scale population-  
643 level sampling across the northern Central Mexican Plateau is needed to fully characterize  
644 potential hybrid-zone dynamics within the species group and help determine if southern *C. l.*  
645 *klauberi* deserves recognition as a distinct species.

646

647

648 **Acknowledgements**

649 We thank the following curators, institutions, and individuals for providing tissue samples: R.W.  
650 Murphy and A. Lathrop (Royal Ontario Museum), O. Flores-Villela and A. Nieto-Montes  
651 (Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México), J.A. Campbell, C. Franklin, and E.N. Smith  
652 (University of Texas at Arlington), J. Alvarado-Díaz (Universidad Michoacana de San Nicolás de  
653 Hidalgo, Michoacán), A. Kardon (San Antonio Zoo), U.O. García-Vázquez, J. Lemos-Espinal,  
654 L. Canseco-Marquez, G. Swinford, E. Mociño-Deloya, K. Setser, and G. Quintero-Díaz. Funding  
655 was provided in part by NSF (DEB-1257785 and DEB-1258205). Collecting was conducted  
656 under permits granted by SEMARNAT to RWB, the late F. Mendoza-Quijano, and UNAM. For  
657 additional support and advice, we thank members of the McCormack and Klicka Labs, J. Jones,  
658 C. Grunwald, and the many volunteers that helped with field work. The authors are grateful to  
659 the Center for Theoretical Physics of New York City College of Technology (CUNY) for  
660 providing computational resources. Finally, we thank A. Stamatakis and A. Aberer for  
661 assistance with EXABAYES and C. Ané for assistance with SNaQ.

662

663 **References**

- 664 Aberer AJ, Kobert K, Stamatakis A. 2014. ExaBayes: massively parallel Bayesian tree inference  
665 for the whole-genome era. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 31:2553–2556.
- 666 Alencar LRV, Quental TB, Graziotin FG, Alfaro ML, Martins M, Venzon M, Zaher H. 2016.  
667 Diversification in vipers: phylogenetic relationships, time of divergence and shifts in  
668 speciation rates. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 105:50–62.
- 669 Baird NA, Etter PD, Atwood TS, Currey MC, Shiver AL, Lewis ZA, Selker EU, Cresko WA,  
670 Johnson EA. 2008. Rapid SNP discovery and genetic mapping using sequenced RAD  
671 markers. *PLoS One* 3:e3376.
- 672 Bejerano G, Pheasant M, Makunin I, Stephen S, Kent WJ, Mattick JS, Haussler D. 2004.  
673 Ultraconserved elements in the human genome. *Science* 304:1321–1325.

- 674 Blair C, Mendez de la Cruz FR, Law C, Murphy RW. 2015. Molecular phylogenetics and species  
675 delimitation of leaf-toed geckos (Phyllodactylidae: *Phyllodactylus*) throughout the  
676 Mexican tropical dry forest. *Mol Phylogenet Evol* 84:254–265.
- 677 Blair C, Sánchez-Ramírez S. 2016. Diversity-dependent cladogenesis throughout western  
678 Mexico: evolutionary biogeography of rattlesnakes (Viperidae: Crotalinae: *Crotalus* and  
679 *Sistrurus*). *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 97:145–154.
- 680 Brattstrom BH. 1964. Evolution of the pit vipers. Smith II.
- 681 Bryson RW, García-Vázquez UO, Riddle BR. 2012. Diversification in the Mexican horned lizard  
682 *Phrynosoma orbiculare* across a dynamic landscape. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 62:87–96.
- 683 Bryson RW, Linkem CW, Dorcas ME, Lathrop A, Jones JM, Alvarado-Díaz J, Grünwald CI,  
684 Murphy RW. 2014. Multilocus species delimitation in the *Crotalus triseriatus* species  
685 group (Serpentes: Viperidae: Crotalinae), with the description of two new species.  
686 *Zootaxa* 3826:475–496.
- 687 Bryson RW, Linkem CW, Pavón-Vázquez CJ, Nieto-Montes de Oca A, Klicka J, McCormack JE.  
688 2017. A phylogenomic perspective on the biogeography of skinks in the *Plestiodon*  
689 *brevirostris* group inferred from target enrichment of ultraconserved elements. *J.*  
690 *Biogeogr.* 44:2033–2044.
- 691 Bryson RW, Murphy RW, Lathrop A, Lazcano-Villareal D. 2011. Evolutionary drivers of  
692 phylogeographical diversity in the highlands of Mexico: a case study of the *Crotalus*  
693 *triseriatus* species group of montane rattlesnakes. *J. Biogeogr.* 38:697–710.
- 694 Burleigh JG, Kimball RT, Braun EL. 2015. Building the avian tree of life using a large-scale,  
695 sparse supermatrix. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 84:53–63.
- 696 Campbell JA, Armstrong BL. 1979. Geographic variation in the Mexican Pygmy Rattlesnake,  
697 *Sistrurus ravus*, with the description of a new subspecies. *Herpetologica* 35:304–317.
- 698 Campbell JA, Lamar WW. 2004. The venomous reptiles of the western hemisphere. Comstock  
699 Pub. Associates Ithaca.
- 700 Castoe TA, Parkinson CL. 2006. Bayesian mixed models and the phylogeny of pitvipers  
701 (Viperidae: Serpentes). *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 39:91–110.
- 702 Caviedes-Solis IW, Bouzid NM, Banbury BL, Leaché AD. 2015. Uprooting phylogenetic  
703 uncertainty in coalescent species delimitation: a meta-analysis of empirical studies. *Curr.*  
704 *Zool.* 61:866–873.
- 705 Chifman J, Kubatko L. 2014. Quartet inference from SNP data under the coalescent model.  
706 *Bioinformatics* 30:3317–3324.
- 707 Chifman J, Kubatko L. 2015. Identifiability of the unrooted species tree topology under the  
708 coalescent model with time-reversible substitution processes, site-specific rate variation,  
709 and invariable sites. *J. Theor. Biol.* 374:35–47.

- 710 Chou J, Gupta A, Yaduvanshi S, Davidson R, Nute M, Mirarab S, Warnow T. 2015. A  
711 comparative study of SVDquartets and other coalescent-based species tree estimation  
712 methods. *BMC Genomics* 16:S2.
- 713 Crawford NG, Faircloth BC, McCormack JE, Brumfield RT, Winker K, Glenn TC. 2012. More  
714 than 1000 ultraconserved elements provide evidence that turtles are the sister group of  
715 archosaurs. *Biol. Lett.* 8:783–786.
- 716 Degnan JH, Rosenberg NA. 2006. Discordance of species trees with their most likely gene  
717 trees. *PLoS Genet.* 2:e68.
- 718 Degnan JH, Rosenberg NA. 2009. Gene tree discordance, phylogenetic inference and the  
719 multispecies coalescent. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* 24:332–340.
- 720 Edwards SV. 2009. Is a new and general theory of molecular systematics emerging? *Evol. Int.*  
721 *J. Org. Evol.* 63:1–19.
- 722 Edwards SV, Xi Z, Janke A, Faircloth BC, McCormack JE, Glenn TC, Zhong B, Wu S, Lemmon  
723 EM, Lemmon AR, et al. 2016. Implementing and testing the multispecies coalescent  
724 model: a valuable paradigm for phylogenomics. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 94:447–462.
- 725 Elshire RJ, Glaubitz JC, Sun Q, Poland JA, Kawamoto K, Buckler ES, Mitchell SE. 2011. A  
726 robust, simple genotyping-by-sequencing (GBS) approach for high diversity species.  
727 *PLoS One* 6:e19379.
- 728 Faircloth BC. 2016. PHYLUCE is a software package for the analysis of conserved genomic  
729 loci. *Bioinforma. Oxf. Engl.* 32:786–788.
- 730 Faircloth BC, McCormack JE, Crawford NG, Harvey MG, Brumfield RT, Glenn TC. 2012.  
731 Ultraconserved elements anchor thousands of genetic markers spanning multiple  
732 evolutionary timescales. *Syst. Biol.* 61:717–726.
- 733 Faircloth BC, Sorenson L, Santini F, Alfaro ME. 2013. A phylogenomic perspective on the  
734 radiation of ray-finned fishes based upon targeted sequencing of ultraconserved  
735 elements (UCEs). *PLoS One* 8:e65923.
- 736 Foote R, MacMahon JA. 1977. Electrophoretic studies of rattlesnake (*Crotalus* & *Sistrurus*)  
737 venom: taxonomic implications. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol. Part B Comp. Biochem.*  
738 57:235–241.
- 739 Giarla TC, Esselstyn JA. 2015. The challenges of resolving a rapid, recent radiation: empirical  
740 and simulated phylogenomics of Philippine shrews. *Syst. Biol.* 64:727–740.
- 741 Gloyd HK. 1940. The rattlesnakes, genera *Sistrurus* and *Crotalus*.: a study in zoogeography and  
742 evolution. Chicago Available from: <https://catalog.hathitrust.org/Record/001501205>.
- 743 Grummer JA, Bryson RW, Reeder TW. 2014. Species delimitation using Bayes factors:  
744 simulations and application to the *Sceloporus scalaris* species group (Squamata:  
745 Phrynosomatidae). *Syst. Biol.* 63:119–133.

- 746 Gugger PF, González-Rodríguez A, Rodríguez-Correa H, Sugita S, Cavender-Bares J (2011)  
747 Southward Pleistocene migration of Douglas-fir into Mexico: phylogeography, ecological  
748 niche modeling, and conservation of 'rear edge' populations. *New Phytol.* 189:1185–  
749 1199.
- 750 Heled J, Drummond AJ. 2010. Bayesian inference of species trees from multilocus data. *Mol.*  
751 *Biol. Evol.* 27:570–580.
- 752 Hosner PA, Faircloth BC, Glenn TC, Braun EL, Kimball RT. 2016. Avoiding missing data biases  
753 in phylogenomic inference: an empirical study in the landfowl (Aves: Galliformes). *Mol.*  
754 *Biol. Evol.* 33:1110–1125.
- 755 Jarvis ED, Mirarab S, Aberer AJ, Li B, Houde P, Li C, Ho SYW, Faircloth BC, Nabholz B,  
756 Howard JT, et al. 2014. Whole-genome analyses resolve early branches in the tree of  
757 life of modern birds. *Science* 346:1320–1331.
- 758 Kearse M, Moir R, Wilson A, Stones-Havas S, Cheung M, Sturrock S, Buxton S, Cooper A,  
759 Markowitz S, Duran C, et al. 2012. Geneious Basic: an integrated and extendable  
760 desktop software platform for the organization and analysis of sequence data.  
761 *Bioinformatics* 28:1647–1649.
- 762 Klauber LM. 1956. Rattlesnakes. Univ of California Press
- 763 Kubatko LS, Degnan JH. 2007. Inconsistency of phylogenetic estimates from concatenated data  
764 under coalescence. *Syst Biol* 56:17–24.
- 765 Lanfear R, Calcott B, Kainer D, Mayer C, Stamatakis A. 2014. Selecting optimal partitioning  
766 schemes for phylogenomic datasets. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 14:82.
- 767 Lanfear R, Frandsen PB, Wright AM, Senfeld T, Calcott B. 2017. PartitionFinder 2: new  
768 methods for selecting partitioned models of evolution for molecular and morphological  
769 phylogenetic analyses. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 34:772–773.
- 770 Leaché AD, Banbury BL, Linkem CW, de Oca AN-M. 2016. Phylogenomics of a rapid radiation:  
771 is chromosomal evolution linked to increased diversification in North American spiny  
772 lizards (Genus *Sceloporus*)? *BMC Evol. Biol.* 16:63.
- 773 Leaché AD, Chavez AS, Jones LN, Grummer JA, Gottscho AD, Linkem CW. 2015.  
774 Phylogenomics of phrynosomatid lizards: conflicting signals from sequence capture  
775 versus restriction site associated DNA sequencing. *Genome Biol. Evol.* 7:706–719.
- 776 Leaché AD, Fujita MK. 2010. Bayesian species delimitation in West African forest geckos  
777 (*Hemidactylus fasciatus*). *Proc. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* 277:3071–3077.
- 778 Leaché AD, Linkem CW. 2015. Phylogenomics of horned lizards (Genus: *Phrynosoma*) using  
779 targeted sequence capture data. *Copeia* 103:586–594.
- 780 Leaché AD, McGuire JA. 2006. Phylogenetic relationships of horned lizards (*Phrynosoma*)  
781 based on nuclear and mitochondrial data: evidence for a misleading mitochondrial gene  
782 tree. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 39:628–644.

- 783 Lemmon AR, Emme SA, Lemmon EM. 2012. Anchored hybrid enrichment for massively high-  
784 throughput phylogenomics. *Syst. Biol.* 61:727–744.
- 785 León-Paniagua L, Navarro-Sigüenza AG, Hernández-Baños BE, Morales JC. 2007.  
786 Diversification of the arboreal mice of the genus *Habromys* (Rodentia: Cricetidae:  
787 Neotominae) in the Mesoamerican highlands. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 42:653–664.
- 788 Liu L, Yu L, Edwards SV. 2010. A maximum pseudo-likelihood approach for estimating species  
789 trees under the coalescent model. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 10:302.
- 790 Liu L, Yu L, Kubatko L, Pearl DK, Edwards SV. 2009. Coalescent methods for estimating  
791 phylogenetic trees. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 53:320–328.
- 792 Maddison WP. 1997. Gene trees in species trees. *Syst. Biol.* 46:523–536.
- 793 McCormack JE, Faircloth BC. 2013. Next-generation phylogenetics takes root. *Mol. Ecol.*  
794 22:19–21.
- 795 McCormack JE, Faircloth BC, Crawford NG, Gowaty PA, Brumfield RT, Glenn TC. 2012.  
796 Ultraconserved elements are novel phylogenomic markers that resolve placental  
797 mammal phylogeny when combined with species-tree analysis. *Genome Res.* 22:746–  
798 754.
- 799 McCormack JE, Harvey MG, Faircloth BC, Crawford NG, Glenn TC, Brumfield RT. 2013. A  
800 phylogeny of birds based on over 1,500 loci collected by target enrichment and high-  
801 throughput sequencing. *PLoS One* 8:e54848.
- 802 McCormack JE, Hird SM, Zellmer AJ, Carstens BC, Brumfield RT. 2013. Applications of next-  
803 generation sequencing to phylogeography and phylogenetics. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.*  
804 66:526–538.
- 805 McCormack JE, Peterson AT, Bonaccorso E, Smith TB. 2008. Speciation in the highlands of  
806 Mexico: genetic and phenotypic divergence in the Mexican jay (*Aphelocoma*  
807 *ultramarina*). *Mol. Ecol.* 17:2505–2521.
- 808 McCormack JE, Huang H, Knowles LL. 2009. Sky islands. *Encyclopedia of Islands* (ed.  
809 Gillespie R.G., Clague D.) pp. 839–843. University of California Press, Berkeley, CA.
- 810 McDonald JA. 1993. Phytogeography and history of the alpine–subalpine flora of northeastern  
811 Mexico. *Biological diversity in Mexico: origins and distribution* (ed. by T.P.  
812 Ramamoorthy, R. Bye, A. Lot and J. Fa.), pp. 681–703. Oxford University Press, New  
813 York.
- 814 Meiklejohn KA, Faircloth BC, Glenn TC, Kimball RT, Braun EL. 2016. Analysis of a rapid  
815 evolutionary radiation using ultraconserved elements: evidence for a bias in some  
816 multispecies coalescent methods. *Syst. Biol.* 65:612–627.
- 817 Metcalfe SE. 2006. Late Quaternary environments of the northern deserts and central  
818 Transvolcanic Belt of Mexico. *Ann. Mo. Bot. Gard.* 93:258–273.



- 819 Mirarab S, Bayzid MS, Warnow T. 2016. Evaluating summary methods for multilocus species  
820 tree estimation in the presence of incomplete lineage sorting. *Syst. Biol.* 65:366–380.
- 821 Mirarab S, Reaz R, Bayzid MS, Zimmermann T, Swenson MS, Warnow T. 2014. ASTRAL:  
822 genome-scale coalescent-based species tree estimation. *Bioinforma. Oxf. Engl.* 30:i541-  
823 548.
- 824 Mirarab S, Warnow T. 2015. ASTRAL-II: coalescent-based species tree estimation with many  
825 hundreds of taxa and thousands of genes. *Bioinforma. Oxf. Engl.* 31:i44-52.
- 826 Mittermeier RA, Gil PG, Hoffman M, Pilgrim J, Brooks TM, Mittermeier CG, Lamoreux J, Da  
827 Fonseca G a. B. 2017. Hotspots Revisited: Earth’s Biologically Richest and Most  
828 Endangered Terrestrial Ecoregions. Available from:  
829 <https://wedocs.unep.org/handle/20.500.11822/15160>
- 830 Murphy RW, Fu J, Lathrop A, Feltham JV, Kovac V. 2002. Phylogeny of the rattlesnakes  
831 (*Crotalus* and *Sistrurus*) inferred from sequences of five mitochondrial DNA genes. *Biol.*  
832 *Vipers*:69–92.
- 833 Navarro-Sigüenza AG, Townsend Peterson A, Nyari A, García-Deras GM, García-Moreno J.  
834 2008. Phylogeography of the Buarremon brush-finch complex (*Aves*, *Emberizidae*) in  
835 Mesoamerica. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 47:21–35.
- 836 Ogilvie HA, Bouckaert RR, Drummond AJ. 2017. StarBEAST2 brings faster species tree  
837 inference and accurate estimates of substitution rates. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 34:2101–2114.
- 838 Parkinson CL. 1999. Molecular systematics and biogeographical history of pitvipers as  
839 determined by mitochondrial ribosomal DNA sequences. *Copeia*:576–586.
- 840 Parkinson CL, Campbell JA, Chippindale PT, Schuett G. 2002. Multigene phylogenetic analysis  
841 of pitvipers, with comments on their biogeography. *Biol. Vipers* 9:3–110.
- 842 Peterson BK, Weber JN, Kay EH, Fisher HS, Hoekstra HE. 2012. Double digest RADseq: an  
843 inexpensive method for de novo SNP discovery and genotyping in model and non-model  
844 species. *PLoS One* 7:e37135.
- 845 Puebla-Olivares F, Bonaccorso E, De Los Monteros AE, Omland KE, Llorente-Bousquets JE,  
846 Peterson AT, Navarro-Sigüenza AG. 2008. Speciation in the Emerald Toucanet  
847 (*Aulacorhynchus prasinus*) Complex. *The Auk* 125:39–50.
- 848 Rambaut A, Drummond A. 2007. Tracer v1. 4.
- 849 Rannala B, Yang Z. 2007. Inferring speciation times under an episodic molecular clock. *Syst.*  
850 *Biol.* 56:453–466.
- 851 Reaz R, Bayzid MS, Rahman MS. 2014. Accurate phylogenetic tree reconstruction from  
852 quartets: a heuristic approach. *PLOS ONE* 9:e104008.
- 853 Reis M dos, Yang Z. 2011. Approximate likelihood calculation on a phylogeny for Bayesian  
854 estimation of divergence times. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 28:2161–2172.

- 855 Reyes-Velasco J, Meik JM, Smith EN, Castoe TA. 2013. Phylogenetic relationships of the  
856 enigmatic longtailed rattlesnakes (*Crotalus ericsmithi*, *C. lannomi*, and *C. stejnegeri*).  
857 Mol. Phylogenet. Evol. 69:524–534.
- 858 Roch S, Steel M. 2014. Likelihood-based tree reconstruction on a concatenation of aligned  
859 sequence data sets can be statistically inconsistent. Theor. Popul. Biol. 100C:56–62.
- 860 Roch S, Warnow T. 2015. On the robustness to gene tree estimation error (or lack thereof) of  
861 coalescent-based species tree methods. Syst. Biol. 64:663–676.
- 862 Sayyari E, Mirarab S. 2016. Fast coalescent-based computation of local branch support from  
863 quartet frequencies. Mol. Biol. Evol. 33:1654–1668.
- 864 Shi C-M, Yang Z. 2018. Coalescent-based analyses of genomic sequence data provide a robust  
865 resolution of phylogenetic relationships among major groups of gibbons. Mol. Biol. Evol.  
866 35:159–179.
- 867 Smith BT, Harvey MG, Faircloth BC, Glenn TC, Brumfield RT. 2013. Target capture and  
868 massively parallel sequencing of ultraconserved elements for comparative studies at  
869 shallow evolutionary time scales. Syst. Biol. 63:83–95.
- 870 Solís-Lemus C, Ané C. 2016. Inferring phylogenetic networks with maximum pseudolikelihood  
871 under incomplete lineage sorting. PLOS Genet. 12:e1005896.
- 872 Solís-Lemus C, Bastide P, Ané C. 2017. PhyloNetworks: a package for phylogenetic networks.  
873 Mol. Biol. Evol. 34:3292–3298.
- 874 Stamatakis A. 2014. RAxML version 8: a tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of  
875 large phylogenies. Bioinformatics 30:1312–1313.
- 876 Streicher JW, Schulte JA, Wiens JJ. 2016. How should genes and taxa be sampled for  
877 phylogenomic analyses with missing data? An empirical study in iguanian lizards. Syst.  
878 Biol. 65:128–145.
- 879 Sukumaran J, Knowles LL. 2017. Multispecies coalescent delimits structure, not species. Proc.  
880 Natl. Acad. Sci. 114:1607–1612.
- 881 Swofford DL. 2001. PAUP\*: Phylogenetic Analysis Using Parsimony (and other methods)  
882 4.0.b5.
- 883 Than C, Ruths D, Nakhleh L. 2008. PhyloNet: a software package for analyzing and  
884 reconstructing reticulate evolutionary relationships. BMC Bioinformatics 9:322.
- 885 Vachaspati P, Warnow T. 2015. ASTRID: Accurate Species TRees from Internode Distances.  
886 BMC Genomics 16:S3.
- 887 Van Devender TR. 1990. Late Quaternary vegetation and climate of the Chihuahuan Desert,  
888 United States and Mexico. University of Arizona Press Tucson, AZ.
- 889 Wagner CE, Keller I, Wittwer S, Selz OM, Mwaiko S, Greuter L, Sivasundar A, Seehausen O.  
890 2013. Genome-wide RAD sequence data provide unprecedented resolution of species

- 891 boundaries and relationships in the Lake Victoria cichlid adaptive radiation. *Mol. Ecol.*  
892 22:787–798.
- 893 Wen D, Yu Y, Zhu J, Nakhleh L, Posada D. 2018. Inferring phylogenetic networks using  
894 PhyloNet. *Syst. Biol.* 67:735–740.
- 895 Xi Z, Liu L, Davis CC. 2015. Genes with minimal phylogenetic information are problematic for  
896 coalescent analyses when gene tree estimation is biased. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 92:63–  
897 71.
- 898 Xu B, Yang Z. 2016. Challenges in species tree estimation under the multispecies coalescent  
899 model. *Genetics* 204:1353–1368.
- 900 Yang Z. 2007. PAML 4: phylogenetic analysis by maximum likelihood. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 24:1586–  
901 1591.
- 902 Yang Z. 2015. The BPP program for species tree estimation and species delimitation. *Curr.*  
903 *Zool.* 61:854–865.
- 904 Yang Z, Rannala B. 2006. Bayesian estimation of species divergence times under a molecular  
905 clock using multiple fossil calibrations with soft bounds. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 23:212–226.
- 906 Yang Z, Rannala B. 2010. Bayesian species delimitation using multilocus sequence data. *Proc.*  
907 *Natl. Acad. Sci.* 107:9264–9269.
- 908 Yang Z, Rannala B. 2014. Unguided species delimitation using DNA sequence data from  
909 multiple loci. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* 31:3125–3135.
- 910 Yu Y, Nakhleh L. 2015. A maximum pseudo-likelihood approach for phylogenetic networks.  
911 *BMC Genomics* 16:S10.
- 912 Zachos J, Pagani M, Sloan L, Thomas E, Billups K. 2001. Trends, rhythms, and aberrations in  
913 global climate 65 Ma to present. *Science* 292:686–693.
- 914 Zhang C, Sayyari E, Mirarab S. 2017. ASTRAL-III: increased scalability and impacts of  
915 contracting low support branches. In: *Comparative Genomics. Lecture Notes in*  
916 *Computer Science.* Springer, Cham. p. 53–75. Available from:  
917 [https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-67979-2\\_4](https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-67979-2_4)

918  
919 **Data Accessibility**

920 Alignment and tree files are available from the Dryad Digital Repository  
921 (doi:10.5061/dryad.4467407).  
922

923 **Author Contributions**

924  
925 C.B., R.W.B., J.K. and J.E.M. developed the conceptual framework for the project; R.W.B. and  
926 D.L. performed fieldwork and contributed samples; R.W.B. generated the data; C.B., R.W.B.

927 and C.W.L. analysed the data; C.B. and R.W.B. led the writing, and all authors contributed to  
928 and approved the final manuscript.  
929

930

931 **Figures and Figure Legends**

932

933 **Fig. 1.** Map of all taxa used in this study. Species are color-coded based on previous taxonomy  
934 (Bryson et al. 2011, 2014); distributions adapted from Campbell and Lamar (2004). Two  
935 samples indicated with stars were identified as probable hybrids in our study.

936

937 **Fig. 2.** Phylogenomic relationships of montane rattlesnakes of the *Crotalus triseriatus* group  
938 based on unpartitioned concatenated maximum likelihood (ML) analysis of 3384 UCE loci  
939 (2,057,530 bp) under a GTRGAMMA model of substitution. Values adjacent to nodes represent  
940 rapid bootstrap values from a joint bootstrap + ML search in RAXML (-f a option). Blue boxes  
941 indicate geographical lineages within *C. lepidus klauberi*; gray box indicates putative  
942 hybridization/introgression between *C. aquilus* and *C. lepidus klauberi*. MRE consensus tree  
943 from unpartitioned EXABAYES analyses was identical, with full posterior probability values (1.0)  
944 for all nodes.

945

946 **Fig. 3.** Bayesian posterior probability values for different species within the *Crotalus triseriatus*  
947 species group. Values represent averages over eight different BPP analyses using different  
948 search algorithms, priors, and independent MCMC runs. Orange bars represent averages  
949 based on 100 loci and blue bars represent averages based on 500 loci.

950

951

952

953 **Fig. 4.** Coalescent-based species trees of rattlesnakes of the *Crotalus triseriatus* group based  
954 on alternative search algorithms. Individuals (53) were assigned to 17 species based on results  
955 from prior coalescent-based species delimitation analyses. (A) Majority-rule consensus tree  
956 from BPP analysis of 500 of the more variable loci. Values at nodes represent posterior  
957 probability values. (B) Species tree inferred from SVDQUARTETS analysis. Tree is the  
958 SVDQUARTETS tree inferred using the concatenated matrix of 2,057,530 bp. Values indicate  
959 nonparametric bootstrap support from 100 replicates. 'X' indicates nodes that were not  
960 recovered in the bootstrap consensus tree. (C) Species tree inferred from ASTRAL analysis of  
961 351 gene trees inferred under a GTRGAMMA model in RAXML. Values at nodes represent local  
962 posterior probability values.

963 **Fig. 5.** Species trees inferred by SVDQUARTETS based on different subsets of the total data set.  
964 Loci were selected randomly and concatenated for each analysis. Individual – species  
965 assignments followed analyses on the full data and were based off results from BPP. Trees  
966 shown are the SVDQUARTETS trees with bootstrap support values mapped on branches (100  
967 replicates). Numbers in bold indicate bootstrap values below 70%. ‘X’ indicates nodes that were  
968 not recovered in the bootstrap consensus tree.

969

970

971

972 **Fig. 6.** Divergence times of rattlesnakes of the *Crotalus triseriatus* group based on 2,057,530  
973 bp. Parameter inference was based on approximate likelihood calculations in MCMCTree using  
974 the BPP species tree as a fixed topology and one individual per lineage. Horizontal bars  
975 represent 95% HPD confidence intervals for divergence times. Inset plot shows estimated mean  
976 divergence times from two independent MCMCTree runs. High levels of concordance between  
977 runs indicates that chains were run for a sufficient length of time and convergence was reached.  
978  
979  
980  
981  
982



983 **Fig. 7.** Phylogenomic network for rattlesnakes of the *Crotalus triseriatus* group based on SNaQ  
984 analyses of 3,384 loci. Individuals (55) were assigned to species (tips) based on other  
985 phylogenetic and species delimitation analyses. Concordance factors were calculated based on  
986 gene trees estimated in RAxML. Figure shows the network inferred with a single hybridization  
987 event ( $h_{max}=1$ ). Y = proportion of introgressed genes.

988

989

990