

BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE

of the City University of New York

Committee on Academic Standing

Minutes of February 26, 2020 (Language Hall, 001)

Present: Ama Afful (Student), Rasheen Allen (Bio), Laurel Cummins (World Lang), Teresa Fisher (CommAS), Anthony Gatto (A&M), Janet Heller (HPER), Paul Jaijairam (Bus), Noah Jampol (Eng), Mehdi Lejmi (Math), Eugene Mananga (Eng Phy Tech), Octavio Melendez (Adv, OAA), Stephen Powers (Edu), Vivien Rodriguez (Nurs), Shirley Skelt (Appeals Agent, non-voting), James Watson (Library)

Present Alternates: Edward Lehner (Edu), Leidy Pichardo (CD, non-voting), Anita Rivers (Reg), Marjaline Vizcarrondo (Soc Sc) -- seated

Guests: Alexander Ott (OAA), Susana Rivera (College Now)

Absent/Excused: Nicholas Anuku (Chem), Gregory Cobb (Soc Sc), Cynthia S. Espinal (CD, non-voting), Wladyslaw Roczniak (Hist), Karen Thomas (Registrar)

1. **Call to Order:** 2:05 P.M., meeting called to order by S. Powers.
2. **Approval of the December 11, 2019, Minutes:** The December 11th meeting minutes were approved unanimously as amended by the 12 members present from that meeting.
3. **Student Appeals:** S. Skelt presented report from the 1/14/2020 and 1/22/2020 RISE student appeal events (see handout). There were 340 students whose academic appeals were reviewed with 319 granted. She also passed around the sign up sheet for sub-committee appeal dates. Members who participated in the January RISE appeals are exempt from the spring sub-committee appeals. Questions were asked and answered regarding trends in appeal denials and other nuances of the appeal process. Members were asked to consider participating in the summer RISE appeal events.
4. **Semester Credit Limit Proposal:** S. Powers reported the proposal had been approved by the Senate following the second presentation of it to that body.
5. **College Now Grades:** S. Powers and S. Rivera explained how high school students in College Now (CN) can earn BCC credits, but if these students earn a C- or lower grade or have a WU, they can enter college on academic probation and if they don't earn a high enough GPA in their first semester (1.5 or 1.75, depending on how many college credits attempted during College Now), they can be dismissed after that first semester for not achieving Satisfactory Academic Progress. Additionally, students can be refused financial aid before they start BCC if, for example, they took a course via College Now and received a WU which means they have attempted credits but have no GPA as students must have a GPA if they have attempted credits in order to receive financial aid. To address this issue, Academic Affairs is exploring whether the situation can be addressed by utilizing the College Now grading schema. If so, then it must be determined if the CUNYFirst menu can be modified for the College Now courses so that only A+, A, A-, B+, B, B-, C+, C, WU, W (student initiated) and INC are available for the CN instructors. Students who fail the course would receive an NC (no credit). In the case of the WU, BCC Advisors would see the WU grades at enrollment and freshmen advisement and have the students complete an administrative (WU) appeal, change to a W, on the basis that it was a College Now enrollment and the withdrawal policy may not be clear to a high school student. The proposed model is already in use at Queensboro and LaGuardia. This situation effected 51

students this past semester. S. Rivera noted that high school counselors and teachers are aware of this issue and, if they see their student has received a C- or lower grade in a College Now class, they will suggest students shouldn't attend BCC. It was further explained that while these are CN students (not college students) these are college grades, so it is not clear if we should codify this, and if we do codify, it is unclear if we can modify the CUNY Grading Policy in the drop down menu – whereas if not codified, it is not a policy, it is a practice. A. Ott suggested the change should be codified. Questions were asked and discussed. R. Allen asked if College Now students could simply get a Pass or Fail grade, but the answer was it would hurt students who earn, for example, an A as they won't get credit for that grade. S. Powers and P. Jaijairam wondered if the Freshmen Year Forgiveness Policy would apply – the determination is that it would not in this situation as the students are not matriculated at BCC during their time in College Now. Members will bring this to their departments to discuss.

6. New Business:

A. Minimum GPA for online courses – S. Powers and A. Ott presented the proposal regarding minimum GPA requirements for online courses. Currently, for a student to take an online course, they must have a 2.0. This prevents all incoming freshmen, transfer students, student with College Now attempted (not earned) remedial students, etc. from taking an online course, thus reducing course enrollment. This policy was put into practice back when remedial coursework counted in registration. A survey of college courses and remedial courses demonstrated that the best predictor of success in online courses was not remedial placements, but rather GPA. With the changes in remediation, should we continue to enroll as we did when remediation exists? Please note BCC is the only community college that has a minimum GPA requirement. Questions were asked and concerns raised. More data was requested. A. Ott will ask for members to have access to the Blackboard online learning module. A. Rivers noted that 60% of the e-permit classes this semester at BCC were online courses. She also noted that fewer online students receive a WN. Members should bring this to their departments to discuss.

7. Adjournment: 3:44 P.M.

The next meeting is scheduled for March 11, 2020, from 2-4 p.m. in Language Hall basement (meetings are held on the 2nd and 4th Wednesday of the month). Subsequent meetings in the spring semester are March 25, April 22, and May 13.

Respectfully Submitted,



Teresa A. Fisher, Recording Secretary

Handouts: agenda, appeals report, hybrid/online courses and GPA handout

COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC STANDING

February 26, 2020 - 2:00 – 4:00

Language Hall (001) “Faculty Lounge”

AGENDA

1. **Approval of Minutes from 12/11/19** Teresa Fisher
2. **Introductions (if there are new members)** Stephen Powers
3. **Student Appeals** Shirley Skelt
 - a. RISE 1/14/20
 - b. RISE 1/22/20
4. **Semester Credit Limit** Stephen Powers

Presented for a second time at College Senate
Approved. Thank you!

5. **College Now Grades (if you read this and your hair hurts....)**

A Simple topic: in College Now (CN) students in high school take college courses. They can earn BCC college credits while in high school. If they get A+, A, A-, or B+, B, B-, or C+, C all is well and good. However, if they earn an F, or WU, or D-, D, D+ or C-, this is a problem. As with the D+ (1.3) they are coming to college on probation, and if they do not have a 1.5 or a 1.75 dependent on credits attempted, they could be dismissed after their first semester. This also has an impact on Satisfactory Academic Progress (for Financial Aid eligibility).

We could just not include the attempt in the GPA, but that is unfair to those who achieve good grades. We cannot include the C and up and disregard the C- and down.

After some discussion, we have arrived at a position that we need to address this with the submission of grades, and not after the submission of grades.

So we are exploring whether CUNY FIRST menu can be modified for CN courses so that only A+, A, A-, B+, B, B-, C+, C, WU, W (student initiated) and INC are available for the CN instructors.

BCC Advisors would see the WU grades at enrollment and freshmen advisement and have the students complete an administrative (WU) appeal, change to a W, on the basis that it was a College Now enrollment and withdrawal policy may not be clear to a high school student.

This effects 51 students for the current BCC enrollment

These are CN students, not college students, but these are college grades, so we do not know if we can codify this, and if we must codify, not sure if we can modify the CUNY Grading Policy in the drop down menu – whereas if not codified, it is not a policy it is a practice.

6. **New Business**

- A. Discussion for Departments – at the moment, for a student to take an online course, they must have a 2.0. This prevents all incoming freshmen, transfer students, student with College Now attempted (not earned) remedial students, etc. from taking an online course, thus reducing course enrollment. This was put into practice back when remedial coursework was in place and counted in registration. A survey of college courses and remedial courses demonstrated that the best predictor of success in online courses was not remedial placements, but rather GPA. I believe this may have been from

2010 or so. With the changes in remediation, should we continue as we enroll as we did when remediation exists?

Spring 2020 Dates:

- March 11
- March 25
- April 8 (Spring Recess, no meeting)
- April 22
- May 13

Preliminary Appeals
 Stats- CAS Report
 Spring 2020

	# Head Count	# Students CAME	% CAME	# of Aca Appeals reviewed	% Academic Appeals reviewed	# Appeals Granted Academic	% Appeals Granted Academic
Rise January 14th 2020	314	94	29.94%	55	58.51%	54	98.18%
Rise January 22 - January 26	220	301	136.82%	285	94.68%	265	92.98%
Total	314	395	125.80%	340	86.08%	319	93.82%

- Between January 22 and January 26-301 students submitted Academic Appeals
- Out of 301 students who submitted or had the intention to submit an Academic Appeals, only 285 appeals were submitted.
- Out of the 285 reviewed appeals- 16 were denied during RISE and 5 were tabled.

Submitted Academic Appeals by category

Dismissed	92
Administrative	188
Statute	1
Freshman Forgiveness	38
Total Academic Appeals	319

Tabled	5
Denied	16
Total	21

**Context Relating to Topic of Reconsidering the 2.0 minimum GPA for Hybrid/Online
2/25/20**

I. Current policy:

8.2.7 Distance Learning Courses

- a. *Students registering in online (hybrid, blended, or asynchronous) courses must have a minimum GPA of 2.0.*

II. Issues relating to current policy:

1. Current policy prevents all incoming students from taking either online or hybrid. It also limits second semester enrollment in hybrid/online because students typically register in the second semester while still not having completed the first semester.
2. Current policy is out of step with other CUNY community colleges, which have no GPA restrictions. (Hostos strongly recommends an online module to prepare students for taking an online course.)
3. Current policy limits ability to develop/offer fully or largely online/hybrid programs.

III. Student Success data relating to current policy:

Analysis of student success data in online/hybrid course indicates that students are generally slightly more academically successful in online/hybrid than they are in traditional courses. See Table 1 below.

**Table 1:
Spring 2017 to Fall 2019 -- Summary Data**

	Pass Rate	Withdrawal Rate	Average Grade
Traditional	71.8%	16.6%	2.38
Fully Online	72.1%	17.4%	2.53
Hybrid	75.5%	16.4%	2.57
Total*	71.9%	16.6%	2.39

**Weighted Average*

Source: BCC Institutional Research. See full tables for additional information

However, these data are not definitive. It seems likely that two factors, at least, are effecting this comparison:

1. The composition of on-line/hybrid courses is different from the full population of traditional courses against which the comparison is being made. Some of the traditional courses that do not have an online/hybrid version may have lower student success metrics, on average. For example, traditional courses may include courses with

2. Students in on-line/hybrid are academically stronger, on average, than those in traditional courses, both because they are self-selecting to take on-line/hybrid and because of the 2.0 minimum cum GPA requirement.

Point #2 is borne out by further analysis of the data. See Table 2 below.

**Table 2:
Average Credits Earned and GPA of Students Enrolled in Traditional, Online,
Hybrid Spring 2018 to Fall 2019**

Category	N	Total Earned Credits	Avg. Cum. GPA
Other	131429	19.1	2.6
Fully Online	4118	33.7	2.83
Hybrid	4403	30.4	2.81

It seems likely, then, that an elimination of the GPA requirement would result in academically weaker students taking online/hybrid. This, in turn, is likely to result in poorer academic performance in hybrid/online courses.

That said, a considerable number of students may benefit from the flexibility and opportunity afforded by hybrid/online. Additionally, steps can be taken, such as Hostos has done, to prepare students for online courses by encouraging completion of an online module before students take a hybrid/online course.

Appendix A

Table 1: Pass Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1				Passing		Total
				Passing	Not Passing	
Other	Semester	Sp17	N	25236	9899	35135
			%	71.8%	28.2%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	25938	10737	36675	
		%	70.7%	29.3%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	25309	9677	34986	
		%	72.3%	27.7%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	24274	9900	34174	
		%	71.0%	29.0%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	23599	8590	32189	
		%	73.3%	26.7%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	22101	8767	30868	
		%	71.6%	28.4%	100.0%	
	Total	N	146457	57570	204027	
		%	71.8%	28.2%	100.0%	
Fully Online	Semester	Sp17	N	412	157	569
			%	72.4%	27.6%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	391	165	556	
		%	70.3%	29.7%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	558	198	756	
		%	73.8%	26.2%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	823	289	1112	
		%	74.0%	26.0%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	807	317	1124	
		%	71.8%	28.2%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	880	373	1253	
		%	70.2%	29.8%	100.0%	
	Total	N	3871	1499	5370	
		%	72.1%	27.9%	100.0%	
Hybrid	Semester	Sp17	N	617	177	794
			%	77.7%	22.3%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	647	211	858	
		%	75.4%	24.6%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	749	211	960	
		%	78.0%	22.0%	100.0%	

Table 1: Pass Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1			Passing		Total		
			Passing	Not Passing			
	Fa18	N	855	292	1147		
		%	74.5%	25.5%	100.0%		
	Sp19	N	879	310	1189		
		%	73.9%	26.1%	100.0%		
	Fa19	N	862	296	1158		
		%	74.4%	25.6%	100.0%		
	Total	N	4609	1497	6106		
		%	75.5%	24.5%	100.0%		
	Total	Semester	Sp17	N	26265	10233	36498
				%	72.0%	28.0%	100.0%
Fa17		N	26976	11113	38089		
		%	70.8%	29.2%	100.0%		
Sp18		N	26616	10086	36702		
		%	72.5%	27.5%	100.0%		
Fa18		N	25952	10481	36433		
		%	71.2%	28.8%	100.0%		
Sp19		N	25285	9217	34502		
		%	73.3%	26.7%	100.0%		
Fa19		N	23843	9436	33279		
		%	71.6%	28.4%	100.0%		
Total		N	154937	60566	215503		
		%	71.9%	28.1%	100.0%		

Table 2: Withdrawal Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1				Withdrew		Total
				Withdrew	Did not withdraw	
Other	Semester	Sp17	N	5739	29396	35135
			%	16.3%	83.7%	100.0%
		Fa17	N	6410	30265	36675
			%	17.5%	82.5%	100.0%
		Sp18	N	5788	29198	34986
			%	16.5%	83.5%	100.0%
		Fa18	N	5890	28284	34174
			%	17.2%	82.8%	100.0%
		Sp19	N	5096	27093	32189
			%	15.8%	84.2%	100.0%
		Fa19	N	4966	25902	30868
			%	16.1%	83.9%	100.0%
	Total		N	33889	170138	204027
			%	16.6%	83.4%	100.0%
Fully Online	Semester	Sp17	N	96	473	569
			%	16.9%	83.1%	100.0%
		Fa17	N	108	448	556
			%	19.4%	80.6%	100.0%
		Sp18	N	102	654	756
			%	13.5%	86.5%	100.0%
		Fa18	N	191	921	1112
			%	17.2%	82.8%	100.0%
		Sp19	N	204	920	1124
			%	18.1%	81.9%	100.0%
		Fa19	N	236	1017	1253
			%	18.8%	81.2%	100.0%
	Total		N	937	4433	5370
			%	17.4%	82.6%	100.0%
Hybrid	Semester	Sp17	N	134	660	794
			%	16.9%	83.1%	100.0%
		Fa17	N	168	690	858
			%	19.6%	80.4%	100.0%

Table 2: Withdrawal Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1			Withdrew		Total	
			Withdrew	Did not withdraw		
	Sp18	N	135	825	960	
		%	14.1%	85.9%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	196	951	1147	
		%	17.1%	82.9%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	190	999	1189	
		%	16.0%	84.0%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	178	980	1158	
		%	15.4%	84.6%	100.0%	
	Total	N	1001	5105	6106	
		%	16.4%	83.6%	100.0%	
Total	Semester	Sp17	N	5969	30529	36498
		%	16.4%	83.6%	100.0%	
	Fa17	N	6686	31403	38089	
		%	17.6%	82.4%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	6025	30677	36702	
		%	16.4%	83.6%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	6277	30156	36433	
		%	17.2%	82.8%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	5490	29012	34502	
		%	15.9%	84.1%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	5380	27899	33279	
		%	16.2%	83.8%	100.0%	
	Total	N	35827	179676	215503	
		%	16.6%	83.4%	100.0%	

Table 3: Average Grade by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

Quality_Points_2

online_cat1	Semester	Mean	N	Std. Deviation
Other	Sp17	2.36	30896	1.44
	Fa17	2.34	32141	1.45
	Sp18	2.41	30712	1.43
	Fa18	2.39	29719	1.45
	Sp19	2.44	28708	1.44
	Fa19	2.36	27476	1.45
	Total	2.38	179652	1.44
Fully Online	Sp17	2.39	494	1.39
	Fa17	2.53	470	1.41
	Sp18	2.58	648	1.35
	Fa18	2.65	947	1.36
	Sp19	2.55	960	1.41
	Fa19	2.46	1091	1.48
	Total	2.53	4610	1.41
Hybrid	Sp17	2.53	695	1.20
	Fa17	2.63	725	1.24
	Sp18	2.66	836	1.26
	Fa18	2.62	988	1.33
	Sp19	2.52	1035	1.37
	Fa19	2.50	1028	1.38
	Total	2.57	5307	1.31
Total	Sp17	2.37	32085	1.44
	Fa17	2.34	33336	1.45
	Sp18	2.42	32196	1.43
	Fa18	2.41	31654	1.44
	Sp19	2.45	30703	1.44
	Fa19	2.37	29595	1.45
	Total	2.39	189569	1.44