

BRONX COMMUNITY COLLEGE

of the City University of New York

Committee on Academic Standing

Minutes of March 11, 2020 (Language Hall, 001)

Present: Rasheen Allen (Bio), Laurel Cummins (World Lang), Cynthia S. Espinal (CD, non-voting), Teresa Fisher (CommAS), Anthony Gatto (A&M), Janet Heller (HPER), Paul Jaijairam (Bus), Noah Jampol (Eng), Mehdi Lejmi (Math), Octavio Melendez (Adv, OAA), Stephen Powers (Edu), Wladyslaw Rocznik (Hist), James Watson (Library)

Present Alternates: Edward Lehner (Edu), Anita Rivers (Reg) -- seated, Marjaline Vizcarrondo (Soc Sc) -- seated

Guests: Alexander Ott (OAA)

Absent/Excused: Ama Afful (Student), Nicholas Anuku (Chem), Gregory Cobb (Soc Sc), Eugene Mananga (Eng Phy Tech), Vivien Rodriguez (Nurs), Shirley Skelt (Appeals Agent, non-voting), Karen Thomas (Registrar)

SGA appointed but class conflict: Sarkouyaya Fadiga (SGA), Odalisa Santos (Student)

1. **Call to Order:** 2:12 P.M., meeting called to order by S. Powers.
2. **Approval of the February 26, 2020, Minutes:** The February 26th meeting minutes were approved unanimously as amended by the 12 members present who were at that meeting (*M. Vizcarrondo had stepped out.*).
3. **Student Appeals:** There were no appeals to report.
4. **College Now Grades:** Members brought back questions and comments from their departments of the proposal (see agenda). Discussion ensued. Some departments are in support, others are not, and some still need to discuss. Vote tabled until March 25, 2020 meeting.
5. **Minimum GPA for online courses** – Members brought back questions and comments from their departments (see agenda and handout). Many departments were opposed to the proposal. Vote tabled until March 25, 2020 meeting. Amendments to the proposal were offered including:
 - A. Utilize a questionnaire or online module to determine online readiness.
 - B. Only remove the GPA requirement for hybrid courses, Leave it in place for fully online courses.
 - C. Utilize a minimum GPA or proficiency (looking at the data collected to establish college proficiency, which A. Ott noted does measure student readiness, which is a key component to online success).
 - i. Would a proficiency index hurt non-traditional or returning students whose prior performance was poor, but age/maturity has resolved that?
 - D. Limit online classes to only one class in their first semester for freshman (CUNYFirst most likely will not be able to determine that).
 - E. Keep the GPA limit, but allow transfer students and freshmen to sign up for online courses.
 - F. Have ENG 111 be a pre-requisite for taking an online/hybrid course.

Questions and comments included:

- A. More data including on attrition rates in online/hybrid courses at schools without a GPA requirement. A. Ott noted he would look into gathering such data. R. Allen

asked how many incoming students actually want to take an online course. What is the experience of the online class versus the face to face class?

- B. Age maturity and EI (emotional intelligence) were highlighted as indicators of online course success. K. Rodriguez suggested it is beneficial for students to start out with a semester with face to face classes before moving into online courses. Many members mentioned students not being prepared for the demands of an online class as a concern.
 - C. A. Rivers noted she can only approve e-permit course requests if the student has a 2.0 GPA (most who want online courses go to Professional Studies, which is all online and that school looks at the student's record before approving the permit). For students coming to BCC to take an online course, most are coming from Hunter, Lehman, and CSI.
 - D. The Business department is checking with their accrediting agencies to make sure eliminating the minimum GPA would not be an issue for accreditation.
 - E. In addition to student preparedness, faculty must also be prepared to teach online.
 - F. We also need to look at the bigger picture of how the college will incorporate more online courses, if the trend continues to grow.
6. **New Business:** None.
7. **Adjournment:** 3:19 P.M.
- The next meeting is scheduled for March 25, 2020, from 2-4 p.m. in Language Hall basement (meetings are held on the 2nd and 4th Wednesday of the month). Subsequent meetings in the spring semester are April 22 and May 13.

Respectfully Submitted,



Teresa A. Fisher, Recording Secretary

Handouts: agenda, updated handout regarding online minimum GPA requirement

COMMITTEE ON ACADEMIC STANDING

March 11, 2020 - 2:00 – 4:00

Language Hall (001) “Faculty Lounge”

AGENDA

1. **Approval of Minutes from 2/26/20** Teresa Fisher
2. **Student Appeals** Shirley Skelt
 - a. RISE 3/4/20

3. **College Now Grades**

A Simple topic: in College Now (CN) students in high school take college courses. They can earn BCC college credits while in high school. If they get A+, A, A-, or B+, B, B-, or C+, C all is well and good. However, if they earn an F, or WU, or D-, D, D+ or C-, this is a problem. As with the D+ (1.3) they are coming to college on probation, and if they do not have a 1.5 or a 1.75 dependent on credits attempted, they could be dismissed after their first semester. This also has an impact on Satisfactory Academic Progress (for Financial Aid eligibility).

We could just not include the attempt in the GPA, but that is unfair to those who achieve good grades. We cannot include the C and up and disregard the C- and down.

After some discussion, we have arrived at a position that we need to address this with the submission of grades, and not after the submission of grades.

So we are exploring whether CUNY FIRST menu can be modified for CN courses so that only A+, A, A-, B+, B, B-, C+, C, WU, W (student initiated) and INC are available for the CN instructors.

BCC Advisors would see the WU grades at enrollment and freshmen advisement and have the students complete an administrative (WU) appeal, change to a W, on the basis that it was a College Now enrollment and withdrawal policy may not be clear to a high school student.

This effects 51 students for the current BCC enrollment

A. **2.0 For Online Classes**

Discussion for Departments – at the moment, for a student to take an online course, they must have a 2.0. This prevents all incoming freshmen, transfer students, student with College Now attempted (not earned) remedial students, etc. from taking an online course, thus reducing course enrollment.

This was put into practice back when remedial coursework was in place and counted in registration.

A survey of college courses and remedial courses demonstrated that the best predictor of success in online courses was not remedial placements, but rather GPA. I believe this may have been from 2010 or so. With the changes in remediation, should we continue as we enroll as we did when remediation exists?

Spring 2020 Dates:

- March 25
- April 8 (Spring Recess, no meeting)
- April 22
- May 13

**Context Relating to Topic of Reconsidering the 2.0 minimum GPA for Hybrid/Online
3/4/20**

I. Current policy:

8.2.7 Distance Learning Courses

- a. *Students registering in online (hybrid, blended, or asynchronous) courses must have a minimum GPA of 2.0.*

II. Issues relating to current policy:

1. Current policy prevents all incoming students from taking either online or hybrid. It also limits second semester enrollment in hybrid/online because students typically register in the second semester while still not having completed the first semester.
2. Current policy is out of step with most CUNY community colleges, which have no GPA restrictions. Hostos, KCC, and Queensborough strongly recommend an online module to prepare students for taking an online course (some instructors may mandate). BMCC mandates an online module (note that they have two fully online programs). LaGuardia does have a GPA requirement similar to BCC's current policy.¹
3. Current policy limits ability to develop/offer fully or largely online/hybrid programs.

III. Student Success data relating to current policy:

Analysis of student success data in online/hybrid course indicates that students are generally slightly more academically successful in online/hybrid than they are in traditional courses. See Table 1 below.

**Table 1:
Spring 2017 to Fall 2019 -- Summary Data**

	Pass Rate	Withdrawal Rate	Average Grade
Traditional	71.8%	16.6%	2.38
Fully Online	72.1%	17.4%	2.53
Hybrid	75.5%	16.4%	2.57
Total*	71.9%	16.6%	2.39

**Weighted Average*

Source: BCC Institutional Research. See full tables for additional information

¹ Revised based on new information not found in CUNY First. See LaGuardia policy at <https://www.laguardia.edu/Online/requirements/>

However, these data are not definitive. It seems likely that two factors, at least, are effecting this comparison:

1. The composition of on-line/hybrid courses is different from the full population of traditional courses against which the comparison is being made. Some of the traditional courses that do not have an online/hybrid version may have lower student success metrics, on average. For example, traditional courses may include courses with
2. Students in on-line/hybrid are academically stronger, on average, than those in traditional courses, both because they are self-selecting to take on-line/hybrid and because of the 2.0 minimum cum GPA requirement.

Point #2 is borne out by further analysis of the data. See Table 2 below.

**Table 2:
Average Credits Earned and GPA of Students Enrolled in Traditional, Online,
Hybrid Spring 2018 to Fall 2019**

Category	N	Total Earned Credits	Avg. Cum. GPA
Other	131429	19.1	2.6
Fully Online	4118	33.7	2.83
Hybrid	4403	30.4	2.81

It seems likely, then, that an elimination of the GPA requirement would result in academically weaker students taking online/hybrid. This, in turn, is likely to result in poorer academic performance in hybrid/online courses.

That said, a considerable number of students may benefit from the flexibility and opportunity afforded by hybrid/online. Additionally, steps can be taken, such as Hostos, KCC, and Queensborough have done, to prepare students for online courses by encouraging completion of an online module before students take a hybrid/online course.

Appendix A

Table 1: Pass Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1				Passing		Total
				Passing	Not Passing	
Other	Semester	Sp17	N	25236	9899	35135
			%	71.8%	28.2%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	25938	10737	36675	
		%	70.7%	29.3%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	25309	9677	34986	
		%	72.3%	27.7%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	24274	9900	34174	
		%	71.0%	29.0%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	23599	8590	32189	
		%	73.3%	26.7%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	22101	8767	30868	
		%	71.6%	28.4%	100.0%	
	Total	N	146457	57570	204027	
		%	71.8%	28.2%	100.0%	
Fully Online	Semester	Sp17	N	412	157	569
			%	72.4%	27.6%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	391	165	556	
		%	70.3%	29.7%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	558	198	756	
		%	73.8%	26.2%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	823	289	1112	
		%	74.0%	26.0%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	807	317	1124	
		%	71.8%	28.2%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	880	373	1253	
		%	70.2%	29.8%	100.0%	
	Total	N	3871	1499	5370	
		%	72.1%	27.9%	100.0%	
Hybrid	Semester	Sp17	N	617	177	794
			%	77.7%	22.3%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	647	211	858	
		%	75.4%	24.6%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	749	211	960	
		%	78.0%	22.0%	100.0%	

Table 1: Pass Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1			Passing		Total		
			Passing	Not Passing			
	Fa18	N	855	292	1147		
		%	74.5%	25.5%	100.0%		
	Sp19	N	879	310	1189		
		%	73.9%	26.1%	100.0%		
	Fa19	N	862	296	1158		
		%	74.4%	25.6%	100.0%		
	Total	N	4609	1497	6106		
		%	75.5%	24.5%	100.0%		
	Total	Semester	Sp17	N	26265	10233	36498
				%	72.0%	28.0%	100.0%
Fa17		N	26976	11113	38089		
		%	70.8%	29.2%	100.0%		
Sp18		N	26616	10086	36702		
		%	72.5%	27.5%	100.0%		
Fa18		N	25952	10481	36433		
		%	71.2%	28.8%	100.0%		
Sp19		N	25285	9217	34502		
		%	73.3%	26.7%	100.0%		
Fa19		N	23843	9436	33279		
		%	71.6%	28.4%	100.0%		
Total		N	154937	60566	215503		
		%	71.9%	28.1%	100.0%		

Table 2: Withdrawal Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1				Withdraw		Total
				Withdraw	Did not withdraw	
Other	Semester	Sp17	N	5739	29396	35135
			%	16.3%	83.7%	100.0%
		Fa17	N	6410	30265	36675
			%	17.5%	82.5%	100.0%
		Sp18	N	5788	29198	34986
			%	16.5%	83.5%	100.0%
		Fa18	N	5890	28284	34174
			%	17.2%	82.8%	100.0%
		Sp19	N	5096	27093	32189
			%	15.8%	84.2%	100.0%
		Fa19	N	4966	25902	30868
			%	16.1%	83.9%	100.0%
	Total		N	33889	170138	204027
			%	16.6%	83.4%	100.0%
Fully Online	Semester	Sp17	N	96	473	569
			%	16.9%	83.1%	100.0%
		Fa17	N	108	448	556
			%	19.4%	80.6%	100.0%
		Sp18	N	102	654	756
			%	13.5%	86.5%	100.0%
		Fa18	N	191	921	1112
			%	17.2%	82.8%	100.0%
		Sp19	N	204	920	1124
			%	18.1%	81.9%	100.0%
		Fa19	N	236	1017	1253
			%	18.8%	81.2%	100.0%
	Total		N	937	4433	5370
			%	17.4%	82.6%	100.0%
Hybrid	Semester	Sp17	N	134	660	794
			%	16.9%	83.1%	100.0%
		Fa17	N	168	690	858
			%	19.6%	80.4%	100.0%

Table 2: Withdrawal Rates by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

online_cat1			Withdrew		Total	
			Withdrew	Did not withdraw		
	Sp18	N	135	825	960	
		%	14.1%	85.9%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	196	951	1147	
		%	17.1%	82.9%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	190	999	1189	
		%	16.0%	84.0%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	178	980	1158	
		%	15.4%	84.6%	100.0%	
	Total	N	1001	5105	6106	
		%	16.4%	83.6%	100.0%	
Total	Semester	Sp17	N	5969	30529	36498
			%	16.4%	83.6%	100.0%
	Fa17	N	6686	31403	38089	
		%	17.6%	82.4%	100.0%	
	Sp18	N	6025	30677	36702	
		%	16.4%	83.6%	100.0%	
	Fa18	N	6277	30156	36433	
		%	17.2%	82.8%	100.0%	
	Sp19	N	5490	29012	34502	
		%	15.9%	84.1%	100.0%	
	Fa19	N	5380	27899	33279	
		%	16.2%	83.8%	100.0%	
	Total	N	35827	179676	215503	
		%	16.6%	83.4%	100.0%	

Table 3: Average Grade by Online Course Category, Sp17 to Fa19

Quality_Points_2				
online_cat1	Semester	Mean	N	Std. Deviation
Other	Sp17	2.36	30896	1.44
	Fa17	2.34	32141	1.45
	Sp18	2.41	30712	1.43
	Fa18	2.39	29719	1.45
	Sp19	2.44	28708	1.44
	Fa19	2.36	27476	1.45
	Total	2.38	179652	1.44
Fully Online	Sp17	2.39	494	1.39
	Fa17	2.53	470	1.41
	Sp18	2.58	648	1.35
	Fa18	2.65	947	1.36
	Sp19	2.55	960	1.41
	Fa19	2.46	1091	1.48
	Total	2.53	4610	1.41
Hybrid	Sp17	2.53	695	1.20
	Fa17	2.63	725	1.24
	Sp18	2.66	836	1.26
	Fa18	2.62	988	1.33
	Sp19	2.52	1035	1.37
	Fa19	2.50	1028	1.38
	Total	2.57	5307	1.31
Total	Sp17	2.37	32085	1.44
	Fa17	2.34	33336	1.45
	Sp18	2.42	32196	1.43
	Fa18	2.41	31654	1.44
	Sp19	2.45	30703	1.44
	Fa19	2.37	29595	1.45
	Total	2.39	189569	1.44