Musicking and Literacy Connections in the Third Space: Leveraging the Strengths of a Latinx Immigrant Community

Angelica Ortega
The Graduate Center, City University of New York

Recommended Citation
https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_etds/2587

This Dissertation is brought to you by CUNY Academic Works. It has been accepted for inclusion in All Dissertations, Theses, and Capstone Projects by an authorized administrator of CUNY Academic Works. For more information, please contact deposit@gc.cuny.edu.
Musicking and Literacy Connections in the Third Space:
Leveraging the strengths of a Latinx immigrant community

by

Angelica Ortega

This manuscript has been read and accepted for the Graduate Faculty in Urban Education in satisfaction of the dissertation requirement for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

Date  Ofelia García
             Chair of Examining Committee

Date  Wendy Luttrel
             Executive Officer

Supervisory Committee:

Ofelia García
Nicholas Michelli
Terrie Epstein

THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
Abstract

The music-making classroom is a space where students enact their multi-literacies. This space is especially important for Latinx bilingual students who are often labeled as struggling in school. In the music-making classroom, students reinvent their identities as integral members of a learning community, are accepted as leaders by their peers and are seen as literate in their music making practices. This habitus of success can have a durable, generative and transposable impact on the identity formation for the bilingual student that goes beyond the music classroom. This occurs because the music-making classroom acts as a third space both cognitively and physically, where students can translanguage, implementing all their ways of knowing to make meaning.

This study examines the question, *How does the music-making classroom as a third space facilitate literacy acts and literacy identities for bilingual children?* Field observations of students enrolled at the Corona Youth Music Program, an El Sistema inspired afterschool orchestral program, provide a thick description of student literacies as well as the various ways in which the music classroom is both a physical and cognitive third space. Student writing and interviews will reveal metatalk and meta-thinking around music practices, the social and academic function of music in their lives, and the role that music plays in connecting to school and home literacies. Teaching artist interviews point to the culturally responsive practices that facilitate critical and creative literacy acts in the classroom. Interviews with parents uncover the ways in which music is a fund of knowledge of families’ cultural practices.
Keywords: Bilingual studies, Translanguaging, Third Space theory, Lantinx, Immigrant studies, New Literacy Studies, Culturally Responsive Pedagogy, Musicking, Ethnomusicology, El Sistema.
Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my advisor and chair, Dr. Ofelia Garcia. The courses that I have taken with you throughout the years at the Graduate Center have shaped the way that I think about bilingualism, literacy and critical discourse research. Thank you for your incredible support throughout this process and making yourself available to meet beyond your office and office hours. I would also like to thank my other committee member Dr. Nicholas Michelli, whose Educators Policy course got me thinking about the inequities that exist in the arts and why as educators we teach in a democracy. Thank you for inviting me to the writing sessions that you offer to your advisees. Thank you to my other committee member Dr. Terrie Epstein. Your student facilitated Urban Literacies course provided us the space to learn from each other's practices and grow as educators. Last, I would like to thank the late Dr. Jean Anyon, who believed in me and accepted me into the Urban Education program at the Graduate Center.

I am very grateful to my Graduate Center classmates and friends who stood by me throughout this entire journey. A very special thanks to my writing buddies—Dr. Stacey Campo, Dr. Sharon Hardy, Dr. Audra Watson, and Dr. Lisa Auslander. I hope that our research journeys continue to cross paths.

A special thanks to Dr. Lori Custodero at Teachers College whose Children’s Musical Development course contributed greatly to the theoretical framework of this dissertation.

Thank you to Dr. Anthony Picciano, the Executive Officer of the Urban Education department for nominating me for the Harrison's Scholarship award and to the Advanced Research Collaborative for granting me a research Praxis Fellowship.
I owe a great deal to the music mentors in my life. To my first music teacher, Andrew Bobi who showed me how the music classroom could serve as a transformative space, even if was in a Junior High School in Jamaica, Queens during the 1990s. To my high school private-lessons teacher at the Juilliard School Larry Guy, whose dedication meant weekly phone calls at a predetermined time to ensure that I was practicing my clarinet and refining my craft. A special thanks to Jean Kopperud and Renee Rosen who saw lessons as a place for musical and emotional self-reflection and growth.

Professionally, I would like to thank my former principal Rosemary Cipriani-Sklar who saw my passion for music education and offered me a position teaching music. To my current principal Heather Benson who believes in access to the arts and has helped the music program at our school to grow. Last to my music colleague Jerry Drake who has been an incredible mentor and shows me that you don’t retire from your passion.

I have a remarkable and loving family that I owe a lot of gratitude. To my husband and best friend, Chintan Panchal, who has supported me throughout the entire doctoral journey. To my amazing hermanita, Diana Ortega, who inspires me with her creativity and incredible musicianship. To my tia Mari, a super-educator, whose devotion to her students as a teacher, principal, and professor in Colombia made me want to follow in her footsteps early on. To my tio Ulysess, my number one music supporter. Thank you for taking me to my lessons and for buying me my first professional clarinet. And of course thank you to my loving parents, Beatriz and Oscar Ortega. Your hard work and sacrifice have often meant putting your wellbeing and happiness before their own.

Last, I would like to thank the Corona Youth Music Project community. Thank
you to the remarkable students and their families were so forthcoming in sharing their
time and their stories. Your stories and music practices breathed life into this
dissertation, and I am forever grateful. Last, to the teaching artists and the CYMP music
director, Alvaro Ruedas for granting me access a program that I believe is truly
transformative for the students and the community.
**Table of Contents**

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii

Dedication ....................................................................................................................................... iv

Acknowledgments ......................................................................................................................... vi

Table of Contents .......................................................................................................................... viii

List of Figures, Texts, and Tables ................................................................................................. xiv

Chapter 1: Introduction

- Personal Vignette ...................................................................................................................... 1
- Statement of the problem ........................................................................................................... 2
- My Interest and Experience in the Topic .................................................................................... 6
- Goals ........................................................................................................................................... 10
- Research Questions .................................................................................................................... 11
- Structure and Style of Dissertation .......................................................................................... 13

Chapter 2: Review of the Literature and Conceptual Framework

- Literature Review ..................................................................................................................... 16
- State of the Arts: Policy Context ............................................................................................... 16
- Music as Language and Literacy Practice ................................................................................ 23
- Theoretical Framework ............................................................................................................ 30
- Literacy Identities: Music as Social Capital ............................................................................. 33
- The Music Classroom as Thirdspace/ Third Space .................................................................. 35
- Musicking as Translanguaging ................................................................................................. 37
- Musicking as Higher Order Thinking Skills ............................................................................. 39
Music Intelligence as Special ......................................................... 40
Musicking as Emancipatory.............................................................. 41
Conclusion.................................................................................. 43

Chapter 3: Research Design

Corona Youth Music Program Site and Participants.............................. 45
Method of Data Collection ................................................................ 56
Data Analysis ................................................................................ 61
Research Reflexivity as Validity........................................................ 65
Positionality of the Researcher .......................................................... 66
Limitations .................................................................................... 68

Chapter 4: Moments of Literacy Enactment

Introduction................................................................................... 70
Rehearsing: Conga del Fuego with Corona Youth Orchestra.................... 71
Collaborating and planning: Reading across clefs and student-led lesson planning ... 79
Composing with Corona Children’s Orchestra Strings Sectional .............. 90
Performing: No Frontier Children’s Orchestra...................................... 94
Conclusion.................................................................................... 97

Chapter 5: School Literacies as Creative Practice: Enacting Literacy Acts in the Musical Third Space

Introduction................................................................................... 101
Section 1. Connections between music and literacy strategies.................. 102
Audiation as Envisionment .............................................................. 102
Metacognitive Strategies................................................................ 113
Sustaining Flow as Motivation ................................................................. 121

Section 2. Musicking-Literacy Connections: Student Reflections ............... 127
Music and Math Connections ....................................................................... 127
Music and Writing Connections ................................................................. 129
Conclusion .................................................................................................. 131

Chapter 6: Musicking as Translanguaging in the Classroom and Beyond
Musicking as Creative Translanguaging .................................................. 133
Transmusicking .......................................................................................... 138
Transmusicking Beyond the Music Classroom .......................................... 144
Conclusion .................................................................................................. 146

Chapter 7: Constructing Literacy Identities Through Musicking
Introduction ............................................................................................... 148
Performing Emotions .................................................................................. 149
Developing a Habitus of Success ............................................................... 153
Building Valuable Musical Identities on Social Media .............................. 163
Strengthening Family Cultural Identity ..................................................... 164
Students as Agents of Social Change .......................................................... 165
Mentoring as Transformative Practice ....................................................... 170
Conclusion .................................................................................................. 174

Chapter 8: Music, Social and School Literacies: The Role of the Teaching Artist
Perceptions of Music-School Literacy Connections .................................... 176
Effective Teaching Practices ........................................................................ 182
Conclusion .................................................................................................. 187
Chapter 9: Music as Family Funds of Knowledge

Community Vignette ........................................................................................................... 190
Section 1. Family Portraits .................................................................................................. 191
Section 2. Role of Music in the Family ................................................................................. 196
  Music as Home Literacy .................................................................................................... 197
  Perceptions on Children Participation in CYMP ............................................................ 211
  Perceptions of Music-School Connection ....................................................................... 222
Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 228

Chapter 10: Findings, Recommendations and Next Steps

Dissertation Recap .................................................................................................................. 230
Section 1. Findings ............................................................................................................ 231
  Finding 1 .......................................................................................................................... 232
  Finding 2 .......................................................................................................................... 234
  Finding 3 .......................................................................................................................... 239
  Finding 4 .......................................................................................................................... 242
  Finding 5 .......................................................................................................................... 242
  Finding 6 .......................................................................................................................... 243
Section 2. Recommendations .............................................................................................. 244
  Recommendation 1 .......................................................................................................... 244
  Recommendation 2 .......................................................................................................... 245
  Recommendation 3 .......................................................................................................... 246
  Recommendation 4 .......................................................................................................... 247
  Recommendation 5 .......................................................................................................... 248
List of Figures, Texts and Tables

Figure Number

4.1 Te Deum Score
4.2 Treble and Alto Clef
4.3 Transcription of Students’ Spontaneous Compositions
6.1 Binder Divider
6.2 Sheet Music Legend
6.3 Word Cloud Map
6.4 Student Transcription of A Thousand Years, Christina Perry
6.5 En Tu Dia en Tono LA [On Your Day in A]
6.6 Student Music Notation
7.1 Tenets of Critical Literacy

List of Texts

5.1 New World Symphony Response, Grade 3
5.2 New World Symphony Response, Grade 4
5.3 New World Symphony Response, Grade 3
5.4 Jinrikisha Response, Grade 4
7.1 Musical City Noise Excerpt
7.2 Musical Me Excerpt
7.3 Confidence, Education and Friendship [Full Text]
7.4 Excerpt from Musical City Noise
7.5 From a Musical Family [Full Text]
Tables


3.2 Student Case Study Participants

3.3 Parent Case Study Participants

8.1 Conception of Self and Others

8.2 Social Relations

8.3 Conception of Knowledge
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

David attends a Title I school situated in Northern Queens. The school, like all schools in the area, is overcrowded with close to 1,800 students and an average classroom size of 30 students. David is a Latinx bilingual student whose parents emigrated from Honduras. He was born here. He does not show much engagement in school and even after the personal ramifications of failing the ELA in the third grade, continues to experience school as "a reluctant reader." In September, David’s English reading assessment placed him at a level K (1st-grade level).

David often stops by the auditorium hoping to listen to the senior violins practice. There are 15 violins available for the incoming Junior violins, and David takes the musical aptitude test, hoping to get in. Although he scores 28 out of 30 questions correctly, his teacher and the Assistant Principal both recommend that he not participate in the program. He is a holdover and needs the extra remediation. I select 15 third graders, but not David.

However, David is determined to get into the program and convinces his grandmother to buy him a violin, with the caveat that he will do all his homework. His grandma pays $120 for the violin and David walks into school the following day eager for his first violin lesson. I add him to my junior violin roster.

David excels in the music domain. He is a reflective learner, setting goals for what and how he will practice; when he meets these goals, he sets new goals. He takes on a leadership position in the classroom, often leading the ensemble and coaching the Junior violins. At home, he looks for new music to practice online. He uses his favorite
piece, "Rolling Along," as a model to compose his variation. He entitles his piece, "Pizzacato Jam." David describes his composition below:

The piece is slow and soft at first and then fast and loud. It expresses how I feel when I play the violin. First, I have to pay attention to what I am doing and concentrate. Then I am just having fun! I want to play this song for my mom on Christmas because I know she will feel proud of me.

David is now in the fourth grade. It is December, and the students are putting on a Winter concert for the school. David volunteers to lead the violin ensemble on "Feliz Navidad." When the audience recognizes the familiar melody, they begin to sing along. David is beaming.

What he is learning in violin class seems to transfer into the classroom. I suspect the teachers too see David in a new light. He is more than a holdover, a reluctant reader whose ELA and Math performance assessment placed him in the lowest third of the city. David is now seen as a “talented child.” The school knows it and more importantly, so does he. When David walked by the auditorium and saw his peers playing the violin, he imagined another possibility- one in which he was successful. Now he knows he is¹.

Statement of Problem

Language and literacy are often conflated in public schools. What shapes literacy instruction in schools are hegemonic language policies, as evidenced by the emphasis on instruction geared towards high stakes testing. These exams measure the proficiency in the English language of schools, not of literacy. While linguistic and even visual codes

¹ The vignette presented above is a fictional narrative based on my experience teaching music in the classroom. The student is representative of students that I have worked with over the last five years as a music teacher in an elementary public school.
are used to promote learning, auditory codes beyond speech are less explored within schools (Gromko, 2002). This narrow definition of literacy, which emphasizes standardized tests, results in the privileging of the English language and printed text.

The problem with this narrow mode of instruction is that it marginalizes many students in urban schools whose home language is different from the English of schools. It denies students the right to use their **Funds of Knowledge**, which results in a fracturing of students’ literacies from the rich literate traditions of their home language to the transactional and disconnected literacies of the classroom (Gonzales, Moll & Amanti, 1995). Failing to incorporate a multimodal approach to literacy into the school ecology, is a monolingual monoglossic approach argue García & Li Wei (2014), which disallows people to experience school as their bilingual-multilingual selves, unable to use all their resources to make meaning.

Since literacy is a socially constructed practice, students are often recognized as literate only if they perform grade level work in English Language Arts. This is a major problem for Latinx bilingual students in NYC public schools who are often labeled “struggling readers,” and therefore not accepted as literate. That is, while they are literate in other domains, (ex. home life, social life) and other meaning-making systems and languages, they are not considered school literate and are excluded from the perception of what it means to be a "good student.” Latinx bilinguales are consequently at risk of developing a fixed school identity of failure because they are so often framed as "struggling" in school. Creating school communities of practice where students feel successful in generating literacy practices is important. The music classroom offers a field of possibility. Rather than just embodying an identity of struggling readers, I argue
that children who play instruments in schools are also labeled as “talented.” Playing a musical instrument is a symbolic capital that gives students a body hexis that aligns to what schools value. Bourdieu (1997) writes,

Body hexis speaks directly to the motor function, in the form of a pattern of postures that is both individual and systematic, because it is linked to a whole system of techniques involving the body and tools, and charged with a host of social meanings and values. (in Block, 2014, p. 58)

The practice of playing an instrument can reposition the individual in the classroom field and can prevent the individual from developing a habitus of failure. In the music classroom, students can re-invent their identities as integral members of the school community. They can be accepted as leaders by their peers, and seen as literate in the music making practices. This habitus of success, I argue, can have a durable, generative and transposable impact on the identity formation for the bilingual student that goes beyond the music classroom.

More important to the focus of the study, music gives students a multi-modal set of tools that are valued in the context of the school because the arts develop school literacies, and are part of a cognitive education framework that fosters higher order thinking and problem solving. The arts require higher-level cognitive strategies that can be transferred to other domains. These are often referred to as 21st Century skills and include, “problem solving, critical and creative thinking, dealing with ambiguity and

---

2 I refute the use the word “talented” since it implies a biological musical disposition, and I believe that music is a social interaction. Still, the word talent is a positive attribute that is used to describe a student who is often described using deficit language.
complexity, integration of multiple skill sets, and the ability to perform cross-disciplinary work” (President’s Committee on the Arts and the Humanities, 2011).

However aesthetic arts, of which music is included, continue to play a marginal role in the education of urban poor children, especially Latinx and Black children, as schools favor remediation over enrichment as a means to closing the achievement gap. For instance, while New York State has set specific Arts instruction requirements for K-12 (number of mandatory hours spent in arts instruction, certification criteria for teachers of the Arts, dedicated arts spaces), many low income inner-city schools, which disproportionately serve bilingual populations, continue to be out of compliance. There is a problem of access to Arts education for low income students in the United States.

As a result of this inequity, music programs all across the nation exist in a third space, both real and imagined. The music classroom, as evidenced by the literature on the lack of access to dedicated music spaces, certified music teachers, and advanced music education, is a physical thirdspace in the NYC schools that low income, bilingual students attend. This is a significant disadvantage for students, for they cannot use music as a cognitive third space to engage in the art literacies that help in the development of school literacies.

There is little qualitative research exploring the direct ways in which participating in an instrumental music program can facilitate school literacies, specifically for bilingual elementary school students in low income neighborhoods. The need to provide evidence of the specific benefits of arts based instruction in school literacies is especially relevant today as there are threats to cut federal funding for the arts.
My Interests and Experiences in the Topic

This dissertation is an intersection of my identities as a first-generation bilingual, Latinx musician and teacher who has a social justice lens for education. I was once an emergent bilingual student who found music to be fundamental in my identity development. I attended public school in Jamaica, Queens and started my public schooling in a bilingual education classroom. My mother felt very strongly that I learn literacy from a place of strength, and although I was born in the United States, Spanish is my first language. My mother and father, recent immigrants from Colombia, taught me how to read and write in Spanish, so I entered Kindergarten with strong literacy skills, but little English language skills.

I thrived in the bilingual education classroom, especially in my second-grade class. Mr. Morales taught as if our entire elementary school education depended on what we learned that year— and looking back, he was right. I remember tackling long multiplication, long division, and Roman Numeral, math concepts that wouldn’t be re-introduced until the fifth grade. I remember reading in book clubs in Spanish and English, which was replaced by basal reading in the subsequent years. I remember reading and rereading my favorite picture book Tiki-tiki Tembo with my two best friends and performing in the school auditorium. I remember how proud I was to be able to pronounce such a long and complex name, His name was tiki-tiki tembo, noza rembo, bara bara bush, pip peripembo.

Despite the rigorous pace of the classroom, as soon as I stepped outside I was made aware that being in a bilingual classroom carried with it negative connotations. In the third grade, I transitioned into a monolingual class, forfeiting the power to use my
native language in the context of my education. Although I was placed in an honors class, I always felt that a certain degree of enrichment was lost. My own experiences as a bilingual student early on in my schooling pointed to the hidden transcripts behind schooling- that of native language as remediation, a discrediting of native language in literacy development, and a silencing of identity.

There was no music program in my elementary school. There was a piano in the school auditorium that was used to play a chord, to call our attention. The first time that I had access to a musical instruction was in Junior high school. I had a wonderful band teacher, who like Mr. Morales understood that every day we were in the class could never be repeated. My music instruction was daily, it was rigorous, and it was meaningful. Music soon became an extension of my voice. We were performing by the end of the year and by the second year, we were playing a second instrument and performing with other ensembles around the city. Music determined where I went to high school, were I participated in marching band, orchestras, and the Juilliard schools on Saturdays. It also helped me in my college admissions.

When it was time to go to college, I did my bachelors in political economics at Barnard College, yet music always beckoned me. Some of my favorite courses were in music– my music theory classes, the intro to Jazz class, my weekly clarinet lessons with and performing with the Columbia Wind Ensemble.

After college, I went to teach in an elementary school located in a community very much like the one where I grew– a low income, immigrant community with a high percent of English Language Learners. I firmly believed that being an excellent literacy teacher was fundamental to being the best teacher I could be for my students. I enrolled
at Teachers College where I graduated with a Masters as a Literacy Specialist. There I learned to teach with a critical literacy lens, tapping into the literacies of the “struggling reader” and repositioning them as integral participants of the classroom. As a classroom teacher, my favorite subject to teach was writing. I loved writing process—the conversations, the visual representations through sketching, the clumsy drafts that would eventually lead to a published piece. While not all my students got to that point though, falling somewhere on that continuum, I loved to teach writing as a creative process for finding you writers voice. In many ways, I realize now that I have that same approach to how I learn music and how I teach music to my students.

When I started my doctoral studies, I knew that I wanted to look at the literacy practices of the immigrant community. I was captivated by a community that is culturally rich and yet silenced in so many ways by the policies that deny students and their families the many literacies that they have. At first, I thought my doctoral studies would be in policy.

However, towards the end of the first year of my doctoral studies, I was approached by my school principal and asked to teach music. I embraced the task full on, going back to school to strengthen my music craft, as I pursued my doctoral program and obtaining my music certification. This new position provided me with a new lens of my student, the parents and the community. Suddenly I noticed my students walking with their backpacks and instruments. Sometimes they carry their instruments, sometimes it is their parents, or sometimes it is a willing younger sibling, a willing bearer and hopefully future band member in our school. Before the students go to class, they drop their instruments in the classroom, letting me know if a string needs to be re-tuned or if a pad
on a clarinet is loose. During their lunch break, they will often come to my room hoping to get extra rehearsal time. Similarly, instead of unwinding after a long day of classes, they rush to the stage and start practicing in the school auditorium which until recently, doubled as a noisy bus room for close to 200 students. When they perform collectively, they produce a sound that surpasses that of $200 weathered instruments. I know that it is not the teacher, nor the instrument, but the love they have for playing that allows them to breathe life into their instruments. When it is concert time, most of my students have memorized their repertoire. These experiences have informed my understanding of music as a literacy and of the music classroom as a powerful social domain.

I am very fortunate because I work in a school that is very supportive of the arts. All the same, music exists in this third space where all the actors involved— the students, the parents, and the teachers fight to claim space, time, and capital for students to play their instruments. Componding this are the daily demands of the classroom mean that I must prove that music is as valuable a literacy as those learned in the homeroom. Last, when student leave my classroom many of them attend middle school that do not offer an instrumental program.

Transitioning from a classroom teacher to a music educator, I believe that keeping the arts alive in schools is more than an issue of access, especially for bilingual immigrant students. It is an issue of social justice and one that brings me to this dissertation. In this dissertation I have three primary goals, which I detail in the following section.
Goals

First, the goal of this study is to redefine the practices occurring in music programs as translanguaging/transliteracy acts. Li Wei (2011) views translanguaging as, generating trans-systems of semiosis, and creating trans-spaces where new language practices, meaning-making multimodal practices, subjectivities and social structures are dynamically generated in response to the complex interactions of the 21st century. (in García and Li Wei, 2014, p.43)

In these trans-spaces, the authors note, bilingual students integrate social spaces where they engage in “meaningful participation in the act of learning enabled by translanguaging… [and] create for themselves identities that are also academic, and thus invest in learning” (p. 79-80). At a theoretical level, I argue that this occurs because the music classroom fosters a translanguaging ecology. Translanguaging naturally occurs in the music classroom by de-emphasizing the English language as the main form of communication. This results in destabilizing the language hierarchies that privilege hegemonic and solitary ways of languaging, while promoting the school literacies that students need to be successful in the classroom.

Secondly, the study seeks to identify the translanguaging practices occurring in the music programs. Students in the music classroom translanguage, by engaging in transdisciplinary practices, which bring their musical, social, and school literacies into their musicking. They do this by employing diverse multimodal practices (i.e. audio, gestural, written, kinesthetic) to make meaning. In doing so, I argue that bilingual students in the music classroom approach their literacies as a creative process, ”that is the property of the agents’ way of acting in interactions, rather than belonging to the language
system itself” (García & Li Wei, 2014, p.25). To support this argument, I will look at the practices that students engage in the music classroom as literacy acts that promote the school literacies needed to be successful in school.

Lastly, by adding music to the conversation around language and literacy, I want to contribute to the work around the importance of fostering a multilingual/multiliteracy ecology in our schools and recognizing it in the family. I argue that the music classroom as a social domain is an intersection where students’ multiliteracies are enacted. In conceptualizing music as a literacy and integral to identity, I want to show how the music classroom allows for the critical literacy practices sought out in 21st Century learning. Specifically, the music classroom can foster the literacies needed for critical thinking, communication, collaboration and creativity.

It is important to state that while I believe in arts for art’s sake, making connections between music and its value in schools, particularly school achievement as defined by 21st Century Learning Skills, is necessary if music programs are to secure a place in schools. By making connections to 21st Century learning skills, as defined by the Common Core, it will be possible to demonstrate the rigor and relevance of arts education for bilingual students using the current educational design practices.

**Research Questions**

The main research question is,

| How does engaging in a music program as a third space facilitate literacy acts and literacy identities for bilingual children? |


To answer this question, I use a series of different methods of data. I use field observations, which provide a thick description of student literacies as well as ways in which the music classroom is both a physical and cognitive third space. These low inference observations allow identification of teaching practices by teaching artists that facilitate the connection between music and school literacies for bilingual students. I also use student interviews and writing to look at the meta-talk and meta-thinking around music practices and how they connect to school literacies (Ex. voice, synthesis, envisionment).

The first set of sub-questions are focused on the students, their perceptions of literacy and their identity as literary beings:

- What are the perceptions of bilingual students about the relationship between music literacy and school literacy?
- How do they impact on the students' identity as a literate being?

Interview questions for students were used to create themes around the home-school practices that shape students' lives and that shape their literacy identities. Questions that elicited meta-talk and meta-thinking around music practices shed light on the social and academic function of music in their lives as well as the role that music plays in connecting to school and home literacies.

The second set of sub-questions are focused on the teaching artist’s perceptions of literacy, and the instructional practices that facilitate the connection between school and music literacies:
What are the perceptions of the teaching artist of bilingual students about the relationship between music instruction and school literacy?

What practices allow for students to make connections between music and school literacy?

Whereas the original intent was to interview the classroom teacher, interviewing the teaching artist provided valuable insight into the pedagogical practices that facilitate the connection between music and school literacies.

The last set of sub-questions are focused on parents and their perceptions of literacy, as well as their perceptions about the relationship between music and literacy for their children:

What are the perceptions of parents about the relationship between music engagement and school literacies?

How does participation in music impact their perception of their child as a literate being?

To address these questions, I interviewed parents about the musicking practices that occur at home as well as the role of music in the home. Interviews also helped to develop a framework for how to look at music as a translanguaging practice, integrating all the different spaces—home, social and school.

**Structure and Style of Dissertation**

In Chapter 2, I provide a literature review of the state of arts in the United States, to make the case that music education matters, especially for students of color and
bilingual students. This is followed by the theoretical framework for this dissertation which borrows from modules in New Literacy Studies, sociolinguistic theories around bilingualism/multilingualism and critical theory, and ethnomusicology. This literature provides me with a lens for interpreting student practices and interactions, as "school literacies."

Chapter three discusses my research design. This includes the research site, method of data collection, method of data analysis, positionality of the researcher, and limitations of the study.

Chapters four through nine are the analysis of the findings. Chapter 4 is structured as a narrative and details my observations at the Corona Youth Music Program (CYMP), an afterschool music program serving K-12 students, who almost entirely come from Latinx immigrant families. Using moment analysis (Li Wei, 2011b), I construct four vignettes, each identifying a transformative literacy moment for the bilingual students in this study.

I use thematic analysis in chapters five through nine to construct multi-voiced stanzas from interviews with students, parents and a teaching artist. I present the data in stanza form because as a study that looks at music as a literacy, poetry allows me to capture the musicality of the voice of the participants. That is, in presenting the voices of the students, parents and teaching artist, I want to capture the rhythm, the flow in their narrative around musicking practices. The stanzas are presented with Roman Numerals which correspond to different student voices. Where no Roman Numeral is presented, the voice is from a single student. Included in these chapters are also music artifacts and writing responses collected from students in the case study. Writing excerpts are
interwoven into the narratives and provide another modality for analysis.

Chapters five through seven present the voices of students. Chapter 5 looks at the school literacies occurring in the music classroom first as identified by the researcher, then as perceived by the students. Chapter 6 names the practices that occur in the music domains as translinguaging practices and looks at how these spaces give students the freedom to enact their literacies critically and creatively. Chapter 7 looks at how students construct literacy identities through their musicking in the music classroom and across other social domains.

Chapters 8 and 9 shift the focus from students to teacher and families. Chapter 8 describes the role of the teaching artist in helping students make connections between music and school literacies. The teaching artist’s voice is an important part of the narrative I am creating on the practices of music education that facilitate literacy acts and literacy identities for bilingual students. I conclude the chapter by looking at how the teaching artist applies culturally responsive pedagogy in her teaching.

Chapter 9 provides a portrait of the musicking practices of nine families in this primarily Mexican community. Music above all is a fund of knowledge. Families play a key role in helping their children enact this fund of knowledge. Their perceptions on the role of music in literacy identity are also discussed.

Chapter 10 summarizes the findings of the study. I also provide my recommendations and next steps for the field. Last, I use bold face throughout the dissertation to call attention to terms that are key to the study. These terms are further described in the Glossary as Appendix I.
Chapter 2
REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Literature Review

State of the Arts: Policy Context

In the urban schools, the situation for arts education is not a positive one. Although urban schools are often the recipient of large arts grants, these programs survive as long as the funding holds out and then disappear. What urban schools lack in terms of the arts, is continuity. (Delorenzo, 2012, p. 118)

Aesthetic arts foster school literacies. They also provide higher ordered 21st century skills which address "problem solving, critical and creative thinking, dealing with ambiguity and complexity, integration of multiple skill sets, and the ability to perform cross-disciplinary work" (President's Committee of the Arts and Humanities, 2011).

Despite the known benefits, the arts are not accessible to all. Aesthetic arts continue to play a marginal role in the education of urban poor children, especially low income black and brown communities. Results from the 2008 National Assessment of Educational Progress in the Arts (NAEP) reveal that minority students and low SES students have less access to the arts, receive less instruction from a full-time or part-time arts specialist, are less likely to take field trips, and have less visiting artists in their schools. Rabkin and Hedberg (2008) used the National Endowment for the Art’s Survey of Public Participation and found that for the first time since 1982, arts participation has declined. However, there was an uneven decline resulting in a 49% decline for African American students and 40% decline for Latinx children in childhood arts since 1982. By contrast, there was a 5% decline in arts education for White children
between 1982 and 2008. The authors find that “These statistics support the conclusion that almost the *entire* decline in childhood arts education between the 1982 and 2008 SPPAs was absorbed by African American and Hispanic children” (p. 47).

A look at New York City public schools reveals a compelling story. The 2014 *New York City Annual School in Arts Report* found a 47% decrease in spending to hire arts and cultural organizations to service students, and an even sharper decline from $10.7 million in SY ‘06-’07 to $1.7 million in SY ‘13-’14, representing an 84% decline (pg. 3). The number of music certified teachers was also found to be on a decline, from 907 music teachers (K-12) in 2009-2010 to 898 in 2013-2014. As a result, many schools in New York City were out of compliance with New York State Law, which sets arts instruction requirements for all public schools and at each grade level.

There is also a widening gap in access to the arts amongst school districts tied to the low-performing schools, where low income minority students attend. A report prepared by Israel (2009) for the Center for Arts Education (CAE) found that schools in the bottom third for graduation rates (less than 50% graduation rate) offered the least access to arts education—40% less certified arts teachers per student, 40% less dedicated arts spaces, and 25% fewer arts and culture partnerships, than the top third schools in graduation rates. The 2014 *New York City State of the Arts* by the office of the New York City Comptroller Scott Stringer, reported that only 38% of all elementary schools had at least one full-time certified arts teacher (music, visual, theater, dance, or film). Approximately 42% of the schools that lacked a full time or part time certified teacher were located in Central Brooklyn and the South Bronx low income neighborhoods. Perhaps this is why results from studies like the 2008 NAEP, find that students from
lower SES, and Latinx and African American students scored significantly lower than their counterparts in the arts. Average response scores in music and visual arts were both 22-32 points lower for African American and Latinx students (p. 2). The lack of music programs in public schools is first and foremost an issue of access in low income inner-city schools, not an issue of disinvestment in aesthetic arts.

The *State of the Arts* report was the catalyst for financial investment in arts education funding for New York City public schools. In response to this scathing report, New York City took aggressive measures to address the inequities facing New York City public schools. In 2015, Mayor Bill di Blasio promised an additional $96 million towards arts funding over the next four years. Its impact is reflected in an increase in the number of certified arts teachers, dedicated arts spaces, and professional development.

While there have been improvements in closing the gap in New York City, there is still a lot of work to be done. Results from the *2016-2017 Annual Arts in School Reports*, where 90% (n=593) of all elementary schools participated, had the following four findings for K-6 students which raise some concerns:

1. Schools reported 41-50 hours of instructional time in Grades 1-3 and 31-40 hours in Grades four and five by any service provider.

   It is unknown from the report what counts as “instructional time” in music education, and if any of these hours include instrumental education. Also, since there is no requirement for who provides instruction at the elementary school level, it is unknown what percentage (if any) of those hours were facilitated by an arts educator. The hours reported may include the classroom teacher, a non-licensed arts teacher, a certified music teacher or a cultural arts organization.
2. 83% of all schools reported offering music instruction by "school based staff" in Grades 1-5, while in Grades 6-8 only 69% of students receive music instruction by "school based staff" only.

School based staff may include classroom teachers or cluster teachers who may not have music certification and certified music teachers. This is an area of concern since only 54% of all non-arts teachers reported attending arts-based professional development for that school year. The quality of music instruction is not known.

3. 64% of all schools reported having a certified teacher at the elementary school level. 43% of all schools have at least one full time teacher and 17% have at least one part time teacher.

While this number has gone up significantly since Stringer's report, this number does not guarantee that instrumental programs are being offered in school. It also does not ensure that students are receiving music consistently throughout the year. Many schools offer arts programs in cycles, creating a piece-meal approach to the arts that lacks rigor and continuity. This is more likely to occur in larger elementary schools were having one certified is not enough to service all the students in school.

4. Only 50% of schools offer a multi-grade or music pullout program in K-5.

This figure is probably most indicative of schools that offer an instrumental music program. The report does not indicate which schools offer these pull-out programs or where schools are located. It is unclear whether this focus on the arts has resulted in an increase in instrumental programs at the elementary and middle school levels.

Despite strides to improve access to the arts in NYC for all its students, the additional funding for arts ends in the 2018-2019 school year. This is especially
troubling, considering the current federal administration is threatening to eliminate the National Endowment for the Arts Funding. Established in 1965, the NEA provides equitable access for low income individuals. A 2017 report by Comptroller Scott Stringer, finds that The NEA today represents just 0.0037 percent of Federal spending, and targets organizations that serve communities in need with 40% of grants awarded to programs in high poverty communities and 36% of grants going to organizations that reach underserved populations. Inequity in the arts persists for low income and communities of color.

**Why this inequity exists.**

There is a misconception that the need for low income and Black and Latinx children to do well on standardized exams trumps the need for creativity and imagination. The *Turn-Around Initiative Report* released by the President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities (2013) found that even after all the short and long term positive influences that the arts have on students, schools in low income communities are the first to cut their arts programs, replacing them with programs that prepare students for state tests. Suárez-Orozco et al. (2008) point to the importance of mentoring and after-school organizations for immigrant youth. Sadly, they find that only 9% of students in their study participated in afterschool programs or enrichment classes. Furthermore, whereas Chinese immigrant students were enrolled in after-school tutoring or college preparation activities, Latinx students were involved in "keep them out of trouble and off the streets" types of organizations. "Not surprisingly," the authors note, "the more scholastic activities seemed linked to more positive academic outcomes than were behavior based programs" (p. 85).
This lack of access is suggestive of school as reproductive agents of class structure (Anyon, 1981). Students in affluent communities continue to receive music instruction, a cultural and symbolic capital, while students in low income communities do not, perpetuating the system of social reproduction that Anyon (1981) cautions. This is particularly distressing since a study by McPherson et al. (2015) finds that the greatest number of participants who express a desire to learn a musical instrument come from upper primary school students in lower (SES) areas, the focus group of this study.

**Why the arts matter.**

The lack of access for low SES, minority students is especially troubling considering the evidence of short and long-term positive influences on school performance. A study by Heath (1998) shows that students in low income neighborhoods involved in arts education for at least nine hours a week were three times more likely to have high attendance and four times more likely to experience high academic achievement. In another study by Catteral & Waldorf (1999), 19 Chicago elementary schools piloting the CAPE3 Arts integration model consistently demonstrated higher average scores on the district's reading and mathematics assessment over a six-year period when compared to all the elementary schools in its district. Barry (2010) found that schools in Montgomery County, Maryland that provided arts professional development over three years to teachers in failing schools posted significant reductions in the achievement gap between low SES minority students and the rest of the student

---

3 The Chicago Arts Partnership provides arts integration to students in Chicago public schools by partnering one teaching artist with one classroom teacher.
population. Schools with a higher percentage of minority and low SES students reduced their reading gap by 14% and math by 26% over three years.

In an age where College readiness is necessary, the arts have again demonstrated their importance in preparing students for higher education. The College Board (2005) found that on average students from low income families, who received arts instruction throughout all four years of high school, scored 58 points higher in verbal and 38 points higher in math on the SATs, than students with six months or less in arts instruction. The 1988 National Educational Longitudinal Survey, which looked at 25,000 students between eighth and twelfth grade found that low socioeconomic students who attended high arts schools and participated in instrumental programs performed better in school, especially in mathematics, reported being less bored, and had higher rates of graduating on time than low socio-economic students attending low arts schools. Furthermore, the effects of arts instruction increased over time (Catterall et al., 1999). A follow-up study by Catterall (2009) which followed 12,000 of the students in the original study until they were 26 years old, found that low income students who attended arts-rich vs. arts-poor schools experienced higher "success" after high school. Students in arts rich schools experienced higher levels of college attendance, college grades, and civic participation. These studies reveal the impact the arts have on student achievement, especially for low SES and minority students.

Aesthetic education, of which music is part, includes a cognitive education framework that fosters critical thinking and problem solving. Aesthetic art requires higher-level cognitive strategies that can be transferred to other domains. These are often referred to 21st Century skills and include, “problem solving, critical and creative
thinking, dealing with ambiguity and complexity, integration of multiple skill sets, and the ability to perform cross-disciplinary work” (President’s Committee on the Arts and the Humanities, 2011). The reasoning behind the effectiveness of aesthetic education in promoting higher level cognitive thinking is explained by Hanley & Noblit (2009) who note that,

as artists [and musicians] students are the central meaning makers... students can create and recreate experience to express meaning. Thus student voice, which is often ignored particularly for disfavored ethnic and racial groups, is empowered. Engagement in the arts may provide a means of redirecting the anger, anxiety and alienation reported by numerous students of color and students who live with the challenges of poverty. (p. 9)

Therefore, for urban students especially, the arts should open doors rather than become, “sites for exclusion and alienation” (Delorenzo, 2012, p. 124). In a school climate where the arts fight for a permanent presence in public schools, it is vital to demonstrate how music is a critical literacy for students in the 21st century. In the following section I focus on the relationship between music and language and its significance on literacy development in the childhood years.

**Music as Language and Literacy Practice**

**Review of studies around music and language.**

Playing an instrument specifically has a demonstrated positive effect on language acquisition and reading comprehension. Music training improves the brain’s early encoding of linguistic sound (Patel & Iverson, 2007), including pitch patterns (Magne, Schon & Besson, 2006) phonemic awareness (Lamb & Gregory, 1993), the ability to
interpret prosody (Thompson, Schellenberg, & Husain, 2004), and decode print (Anvari, Trainor, Woodside, & Levy, 2002).

Verbal learning and vocabulary development have also been tied to playing an instrument (Piro & Ortiz, 2009; Ho, Cheung and Chan, 2003). Chan et al. (1998) found that learning to play an instrument enhances the ability to remember 17% more verbal information, which the authors attributed to an enhancement of the left cranial temporal regions.

Studies that look at the role of music in facilitating language skills find that music contributes to the development of reading comprehension (Gardiner, Fox, Knowles and Jeffrey, 1996; Butzlaff, 2000). Nicholson (1972), Movsesian (1985), and Long (2007) propose that music as an intervention for struggling readers, such as clapping and chanting rhythms in time to simple notation, significantly improves standardized reading comprehension scores. Corrigall and Trainor (2011) conducted a study which looked at six to nine-year-olds who had musical training from .1 to 6.2 years. Controlling for age and socio-economic status, they looked at number of hours spent reading per week, results from an IQ test, and the Word Identification and Passage Comprehension subtests of the Woodcock Reading Mastery Test. They found that length of musical training was robustly associated with reading comprehension.

Several studies specifically show how music helps language learners acquire additional language skills. Researchers have found that music helped additional language learners acquire vocabulary (Legg, 2009; Li & Brand, 2009; Moyeda, Gomez, & Flores, 2006; Salcedo, 2010). A study by Slevc & Miyake (2006) found connections between musical ability (i.e., music analysis) and the ability to perceive and produce subtle
phonetic contrasts in an additional language. Fisher (2001) conducted a 2-year study involving 160 low SES kindergarten students in a bilingual program. He found that students in classrooms that used music when teaching English scored significantly higher on standardized tests of oral language, decoding of written material, and reading comprehension than those who were not exposed to music in their curriculum. While 25% of the 80 students in the classrooms that offered music instruction could read at grade level, only one could read at grade level in the non-music classroom. In a similar study, Ray (1997) spent two weeks observing 14 Pre-K through to second grade bilingual student classrooms and found that 93% of students receiving daily music instruction for 30 minutes moved up one or more levels on the ELA, while only 23% of those not receiving daily music instruction had the same growth. A study by Kennedy and Scott (2005) which provided music therapy to 34 middle school ESL students for a 3-month music period found that students increased their English comprehension and scored higher on oral language and reading comprehension tests, than students who did not receive music therapy.

Research also suggest that duration of music instruction impacts the role of music instruction in language and literacy development. A study by Forgeard et al. (2008) found that duration of training significantly predicted transfer on measures of vocabulary and non-verbal reasoning ability in children ages 7-10 who received three years of instrumental music training in addition to general music in school, versus students receiving only general music classes. Rauscher and Hinton (2011) looked at students K-5 who participated in 30 minutes of keyboard instruction once a week. They found benefits for a quantitative and spatial-temporal task only after three years of instructions. A study
by Kraus et al. (2014) looked at changes in the neurophysiology related to the auditory processing of 44 Spanish–English bilingual students 6 to 9 years of age from underserved neighborhoods in Los Angeles, participating in an instrumental music program for one or two years. Students participated in the Harmony Project (Los Angeles, CA), receiving one hour of instruction, two times a week in instrumental and ensemble training. Researchers then measured students' identification of constructive speech syllables during passive listening, after active music training had stopped. Results indicate that students had a stronger neurophysiological distinction of stop consonants, a neural mechanism linked to reading and language skills and that the added training received by students who had instruction for two years resulted in greater enhancement in neurophysiological function. The literature below offers an explanation for the complementary relationship between music and language.

**Music and language: a universal constant.**

Like language, music is a universal constant, an inherent human predisposition. Our thinking and practices around music happen well before schooling, when we are still in the womb. By six months, an infant's ear has developed the structural maturity inside the womb to process sounds in their brains (Keil and Campbell, 2010). In the womb, "the mother's heart beat [becomes the], source of all life and energy," and "instills in the growing human organism, a deep sense of tempo and pulse" (ibid.). Sounds at or above 80db sound pressure level are audible, so that the unborn child can hear the mother's singing and loud music being played in the outside world (Sloboda, 2004, p. 3). Campbell (2010) writes, "the development of musical language and musical understanding is already well on its way by the time of birth" (p. 6).
While music and language use sound as the primary medium, what makes something a language is what the human brain can do with language and music, which is to map these sounds into internal structures. In language there are three basic internal structures: phonology, syntax, and semantics. There have been many attempts to compare language and music structures using phonology, syntax and semantics.

Our brain processes seemingly infinite variety of sounds into finite categories, or phonemes. As in phonology, in music individuals do not perceive every sound change but assimilate sound into broader categories, which we refer to as pitch (Sloboda, 1990, p. 4). Syntax, is our brain’s ability to create grammar, or a set of rules that generates sequences that are acceptable to a specific language. Music, like language, follows a cultural grammar, which allows people to make sense of music. Research shows that individuals can recall music that follows a cultural grammar, such as the European structure of diatonic tonality4, than music that is culturally unfamiliar. (Sloboda, 1985, Zenatti, 1969; Deutsch, 1980). Furthermore, individuals do not generally remember information word for word, but reconstruct something similar to the original information heard, in their own words, as part of their meaning-making process. Similarly, studies in music show that individuals use grammatically possible substitutions when asked to recall music they just listened to (Sloboda and Parker, 1985; Oura and Hatano, 1988). For Sloboda (2004), "this kind of finding suggests that people generally store something more abstract than the actual words or notes" (p. 107).

---

4 Western music from the middle ages to the late 19th century was based on the diatonic scale, made up of five whole steps and two half steps. Pop and rock music, for instance, follow diatonic tonality.
**Music and literacy as comprehension.**

As with language, it is not enough to recognize sounds (phonology) or a sequence as grammatical (syntax), one needs to understand it (semantics). Just as individuals possess certain skills that they use to develop comprehension around a text\(^5\), so too do they possess skills they use in engaging in a musical composition.

Music as auditory text evokes a visual representation and evokes a mood or emotion. It is not enough to have fluency in musical syntax; musicians need to understand the composition to play expressively. As part of her conceptualization of the creative thinking process in music, Greenhoe (1972) argued that individuals rehearse sounds in the imagination, practicing free imagery in sound, and thinking in sound images (p. 181). Sloboda (2009) argues musicians require the skill of **audiation**\(^6\), a cognitive process, which allows the individual to mentally hear and comprehend music, to play expressively. Webster (1987) notes that while subconscious imagery, a subset of audiation, has not been formally investigated, "it clearly plays a role in problem solving over time, a task that is common in composition and analysis. It may play a role in performance as well" (p. 164).

Similar claims can be said about the importance of envisioning in reading comprehension. That is, fluency and prosody do not necessarily reveal reading comprehension. One way to tap into and develop student’s reading comprehension is their ability to envision, or make a mental image as they read to ensure comprehension.

---

\(^5\) Text is conceptualized multi-modally and not only include the printed word but also includes the visual and auditory semiosis as well.

\(^6\) Terms are presented in bold throughout the dissertation and defined within the text. A comprehensive list of terms also appears as Appendix I.
Envisioning goes beyond making a movie in your mind and includes the picturing of ideas and abstract concepts. Angelillo (2007) writes, “A fluent reader sees the text in his mind’s eye, regardless of the topic, genre, or text structure” (p. 2).

Furthermore, through audiation students also seem to make self to text connections. Custodero (2012) writes, “Sinking into music becomes a sensory experience” (p. 371). When students of music “sink into music” they are embodying their music. Embodiment refers to an individual’s ability to use voice and expression as a way of interpreting a text. Embodiment is a powerful literacy practice, since it demands the student to make connections to what they hear in order to locate themselves in the text. For instance, a fourth-grade student writes in her journal as she reflects on her musicking: “Have you ever seen that movie Ratatouille? You know, the part where Remy bites the strawberry from the lady’s house, and sparkles come to his mind? That’s how I feel when I sing a song in chorus or in violin class.” The student’s audiation skills lead her to make connections to other mediums and to other domains. Just as students make personal connections to characters or the events they read about, which drive their reading comprehension, they also make personal connections to texts, which drives their audiation.

Music is a multi-modal, multi-sensory, and ultimately multi-lingual approach to literacy, as students elicit the visual, the auditory, the kinesthetic to make meaning of the musical text. In the following section, I provide the theoretical framework- my understanding of the music classroom as third space, where students translanguage to make social and school literacies
**Theoretical Framework**

From the time children begin to speak, gesture, and draw, they are acquiring literacy across multiple symbol systems. Generally, however, when school personnel and funding agencies refer to literacy, they are referring to the reading of print and the speaking and writing of verbal language. (Gromko, 2002, pg. 334)

In constructing my theoretical framework for music as a literacy, I intend to borrow from modules in New Literacy Studies, sociolinguistic theories around bilingualism/multilingualism, and critical theory. My intention is to use these theories to interpret student practices and interactions, as “school literacies” in the music classroom.

First, I take a multimodal semiotic approach to define “literacy acts.”

**Multimodality** includes five semiotic systems: linguistic, visual, auditory, gestural, and spatial (Antsey & Bull, 2006). Kress and van Leeuwen (2001) look at multimodal social semiotics, considering not only the signs in all modes, but also the sign makers and the social environments in which the signs are made. They argue that the modes used to make meaning, “do not occur in isolation but always with others in ensembles” (García & Li Wei, 2014, p.28). Under this definition music is a *literacy*, a part of the auditory system, which students use to “language” in their social environments. Music is a powerful source of meaning making. According to Custodero (2012b), music is the way that very young children primarily make sense of the world. When they make their own music, “they do for reasons that meet developmental needs for expression, belonging, comfort and complexity—they sing to know.” (Web log post).

Therefore, a multimodal approach to teaching literacy needs to be considered when thinking about how students learn best, especially for the bilingual student. García
& Li Wei (2014) argue that the language and semiotic practices of bilingual children must be put into the service of meaning making, which emerge through their social interactions. As noted by Gromko (2002), while the linguistic and even visual code is used, auditory codes are less explored beyond speech within schools. Instead, what is valued in the schools are the literacy practices rich in print, including reading aloud to children, questioning and feedback (Dudley-Marling & Lucas, 2009). Failing to incorporate a multimodal approach to literacy into the school ecology is a monolingual approach argue García & Li Wei (2014), which disallows people to experience school in their bilingual/multilingual selves. This approach does not acknowledge “the underlying issues of economic and power relations between dominant and minoritized populations” (Gonzales, 2005, p. 35) and leads to cultural reproduction in literacy development.

Secondly, I take a socio-cultural approach to literacy. Literacy building is a socially constructed practice. According to Gee, “Reading and writing in any domain… are not just ways of decoding print… they are caught up with different social practices” (2014, p. 14). Music too is a socially constructed practice. In observing the music practices, Blacking (1967) realized that the Venda children were not acculturated or socialized into the adult music but rather had their own communities where they developed their own musical expression, their own “children’s music culture.” As children grow up and enter adulthood, the allegiance to musical communities intensifies, as music becomes a primary action of self-expression.

Perhaps, Smalls (1997) puts it best when he describes music as a human action. He theorizes music, not as a noun but as a verb, an action that all people do, which he terms as “musicking.” He states that musicking.
is an encounter between human beings in which meanings are being generated. As with all human encounters it takes place in a physical and a social space, and that social space also has to be taken into account as well when we ask what meanings are being generated in a performance. (p.3)

When considering the music practices of students in the classroom it is important to consider not only the performer and the performance, but also the actions and interactions all the individual in the social space. As Smalls states,

These sets of relationships stand in turn for relationships in the larger world outside the performance space, relationships between person and person, between individual and society, humanity and the natural world and even the supernatural world, as they are imagined to be by those taking part. (ibid)

Musicking has several parallels with the concept of languaging. Languaging too is a verb, not a noun, grounded in in human interactions instead of established ideas. Mignolo (2000) writes, “Language is not an object, something that human beings have, but an ongoing process that only exists in language… Language is the home of languaging” (Mignolo, 2000, p. 253). As a practice, not a fixed structure, “languaging in language allows us to describe ourselves interacting as well as to describe the description of our interactions” (p. 254). Similarly, looking at all the interactions in the music classroom as musicking allows one to look beyond the immediate task, to students meaning making using their translanguaging tools.

Third, using critical literacy, I define literacy as needing to be transformational and emancipatory. Freire (1987) states, “a person is literate to the extent that he or she is able to use language for social and political reconstruction” (p 159). The idea of
individuals not only as text users, but also as text analysts and text producers (Freebody & Luke, 1990) is a very powerful concept as it taps into students’ critical thinking and agency, lending itself to transformation and emancipation. Music as a literacy is transformative.

**Literacy Identities: Music as Social Capital**

Gee (2007) states that literacy is tied to identity, in an active negotiation of a range of Discourses and literacy practices across cultures and social contexts. As such, people are only literate in a semiotic domain if others recognize that they are producing meaning in the domain (Gee, 2007). The problem is that Latinx bilinguals in NYC public schools are often labeled struggling readers and therefore not accepted as literate in the academic semiotic domains. While they are literate in other domains, (ex. Home life, social life), they are too often not considered literate in the academic domain.

Bourdieu (1991) argues that students experience failure as “habitus,” limiting the range of what they can conceive as possible. **Habitus** is described as a set of dispositions, which through a gradual process of inculcation, gets molded into the body and becomes second nature (ibid., p. 12). The inculcation process is most significant to an individual’s habitus during the childhood years, when the individual develops a set of dispositions. The dispositions acquired are structured because they reflect the social conditions in which they were acquired and become engrained in the individual as body hexis. This quality makes the dispositions durable, generative and transposable since habitus is, “embodied, turned into a permanent disposition, a durable way of standing, speaking, walking and thereby of feeling and thinking” (Bourdieu, 1990, p. 69-60).

Experiencing failure and marginality in the classroom can have a durable effect on the
student’s schooling, while generating traits or disposition, which further marginalizes the student in the classroom. Important to note is that since individuals are not passive but active agents within the field, fields are constant sites of struggle. For the students who do not possess school literacies, this struggle can be embodied as “acting out” or “reluctance.”

Latinx bilinguals are consequently at risk of developing a fixed academic identity of failure because they are so often framed as “struggling.” Creating communities of practice where students are successful is of essence in generating other practices that will transpose to the academic classroom. Once such field I argue, of successful practice, is the music classroom. Rather than just acquiring an identity of struggling reader, I argue that children who play instruments are perceived as “talented.”

Playing a musical instrument is a symbolic capital that gives students a body hexis that aligns to what schools value. On **body hexis**, Bourdieu writes,

> Body hexis speaks directly to the motor function, in the form of a pattern of postures that is both individual and systematic, because linked to a whole system of techniques involving the body and tools, and charged with a host of social meanings and values. (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 87 in Block, p. 58 2014)

Roger Session, a 20th century American composer, stressed the close ties that exist between music and bodily or gestural language. I argue that these communicative skills are both needed in the music ensemble and in the school classroom. By providing students with a set of gestural tools that are also valued in school, the music classroom can help reinvent student identity in the context of the school.
As students develop identities as integral members in the music classroom, accepted as leaders by their peers, and very literate in the music making practices, they are developing a habitus of success. This habitus of success can have a durable, generative and transposable impact on the identity formation of the bilingual student.

**The Music Classroom as Thirdspace**

To define the music classroom, I employ Soja’s (1996) theory of “Thirdspace” where students draw from each of their languages to construct identity and knowledge. This is evidenced by the literature around lack of access of dedicated music spaces, certified music teachers and a continuum in music education in schools across New York City, where low income, Latinx bilingual children attend. However, I want to also argue that for many students, music is a cognitive third space, where students engage critically to make meaning, and rich literacy practices take place.

According to Soja (1996), **thirdspace** (one word) is, “an-Other way of understanding and acting to change the spatiality of human life, a distinct mode of critical special awareness that is appropriate to a new scope and significance being brought about in the rebalanced trialectics of spatiality-historicality-sociality”, which “gives rise to something different, something new and unrecognizable, a new area of negotiation of meaning and representation” (p. 61). While sociality and historicity are often discussed, spatiality is often marginalized, a critique of binary reductionism originally made by Lefebvre. As a result, Lefebvre repositions or restructures spatiality as the strategic agent, where issues of race, class and gender can be addressed. One must think trialectically (spatially, historically, and socially) to understand thirdspace.

Built into the theory of thirdspace is agency. The dialectical nature of trialectics
allows for a bidirectional relationship between socio-spatiality and spatial-temporality. Soja critiques other previous theorists, like Marx, whose unidirectional, structuring-structure approach denies the individual agency. Instead of looking at marginality not just as oppressive, he looks at the social space, which is socially produced, as a space of possibility for the marginalized. In this way, Soja aligns himself with Michel Foucault, as the subaltern space is a place of both oppression and resistance. Soja cites bell hooks and Cornell West, as black intellectuals working from the margins and engaging in a "cognitive remapping" (p. 99) of social spaces. He states,

as black intellectuals, hooks and West have been multiply marginalized, made peripheral to the mainstreams of American political, intellectual and everyday life; but they have also consciously chosen to envelop and develop this marginality, as hooks puts it, as a space or radical openness, a context from which to build communities of resistance and renewal that cross the boundaries and double-cross the binaries of race, gender, class, and all oppressively Othering categories. (p. 84)

The thirdspace avoids binaries and is a way to be both central and marginal, where individuals can imagine and ultimately create other spaces. Most importantly, “it is a spatiality where radical subjectivities can multiply, connect, and combine in the polycentric communities of identity and resistance” (p. 99). I want to argue that the music classroom is a third space where students practice their music, school, and social literacies to produce new meanings.

Gutierrez (2008) interprets the third space (two words) as learning ecology, both spatially and cognitively, where students use a variety of tools to foster their socio-critical
literacy and cognitive development. She acknowledges vertical forms of learning, which I take as the cognitive development of the individual, and the horizontal development, which considers the individual’s practices across different communities. Third space bridge home and school knowledge, allowing individuals to move back and forth between these different domains uninterrupted. Third space is not a tool for scaffolding, but a “transformative space where the potential for an expanded form of learning and the development of new knowledge are heightened” (p. 153). A key addition to third space theory is Gutierrez’s use of Vygotsky’s Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD). In this ZPD space, students reorganize their grammar, from past and present to future functions, which enables what Gutierrez refers to as “social dreaming” (p. 157). Relying heavily on auxiliary modal verbs such as could, should, may and will point in student writing to future oriented practices and dreaming of future possibilities. Music allows for a cognitive third space where students can engage in social dream and imagine different possibilities.

**Musicking as Translanguaging**

Translanguaging transgresses and destabilizes language hierarchies, and at the same time expands and extends practices that are typically valued in school and in the everyday worlds of communities and home (García & Li Wei, 2014). In this section I make the case that the music classroom fosters a translanguaging ecology. By fostering translanguaging, the classroom destabilizes the language hierarchies that privileges hegemonic ways of languaging, while promoting the school literacies students need to be successful in the classroom.

Translanguaging is a break from the traditional concepts of bilingualism, a form
of colonial monolingualism. Monolingualism in the context of schooling is subtractive. The concept of Translanguaging aligns itself with Mignolo’s concept of “bilanguaging,” which is additive. Mignolo (2000) centers languages in the individual, preferring the term bilanguaging, not bilingualism. Bilanguaging allows languages to “maintain their purity but at the same time their asymmetry” (p. 231). He adds that bilanguaging reflects a political concern and “addresses the asymmetry of languages and denounces the coloniality of power and knowledge” (p. 231). The act of languaging is an unfettered, emancipatory, political way of being, which breaks away from the hierarchy of languages established by Western imperialism.

To define the social practices taking place in the music classroom (third spaces), I use the theory of translanguaging, defined by García (2009), as “multiple discursive practices in which bilinguals engage in order to make sense of their bilingual worlds” (p.45). I also adopt García & Li Wei’s definition of tranlanguaging as, "generating trans-systems of semiosis, and creating trans-spaces where new language practices, meaning-making multimodal practices, subjectivities and social structures are dynamically generated in response to the complex interactions of the 21st century” (2014, p. 43). In these trans-spaces, the authors note, bilingual students integrate social spaces where they engage in “meaningful participation in the act of learning enabled by translanguaging… [and] create for themselves identities that are also academic, and thus invest in learning” (p. 79-80).

Translanguaging uses Dynamic Systems Theory (García, 2009, 2014b), which demands active, not passive learners, and is both a transformative pedagogical practice and a creative practice on the part of the user. Li Wei (2011a) sees translanguaging as
creative use of language strategies. He also considers translanguaging to be "the foundation of criticality - the ability to use evidence appropriately, systematically, and insightfully to inform considered views of cultural, social and linguistic phenomena, to question and problematize received wisdom, and to express views adequately through reasoned responses to situations" (p. 374). Translanguaging challenges the hegemonic language practices of our school system, which does little to recognize the critical literacies of the bilingual students.

I argue that students in the music classroom translanguage, by engaging in transdisciplinary practices, which bring their musical, social, and school literacies into their musicking. They do this by translanguaging across diverse multimodal practices (i.e. audio, gestural, written, kinesthetic). In doing so bilingual students in the music classroom approach their literacies as a creative process, “that is the property of the agents’ way of acting in interactions, rather than belonging to the language system itself” (ibid. p.25).

Musicking as a Higher Order Thinking Skills

In defining school literacies that I will be indentifying in the musical thirdspace, I turn to critical theory. 21st Century skills and Common Core Standards require students to develop critical thinking skills. When students engage in musicking practices, they attend to, reflect on, critique and manipulate texts at a meta-level (Gee, 2007). As noted in the literature section above, research shows that music facilitates thinking about process.

Music facilitates higher order thinking because it is a challenging activity in which students feel capable and successful in their learning. Sergent (1993) finds that
multiple brain regions are activated during musical performance. Custodero (2012) uses Csikszentmihalyi's idea of flow, to argue that music provides optimal flow because in engaging in this highly enjoyable practice, they are challenged and feel capable. Csikszntnmihalyi (2009) found that engagement in tasks which requires one's best efforts generate flow. To sustain flow, one's skills must improve to meet the challenge, and in turn the activity must also improve. This state of flow results in a self-perpetuating situation where skills and challenges must match and must be high. It is this flow that activates creativity, which is essentially how individuals learn. Important to note is that the "activities that generate these behaviors are characterized by an absence of adult intervention; when present, it is invited rather than asserted" (Custodero, 2005, p. 194).

There are three challenge-seeking behaviors necessary for optimal flow.

a. Self-assignment. Self-initiation is indicative of self-control, a descriptor of flow according to Csikszentmihalyi (1997) and "the corresponding perception of self-as-agent" (ibid., p. 194). This can be seen in a classroom where there is space between planned activities for students to initiate their own musical experience so that children can enact meaningful music activity.

b. Self-correction. Children are able to adjust to accommodate new understanding as long as they are given time to rehearse and given immediate feedback.

c. Deliberate Gesture. Physical response “of directed energy (which) reflects the concentrated intensity usually associated with flow experience.”

Music Intelligence as Special

In a talk given at the Ithaca Conference in 1996, Edward Gardner developed an argument for music intelligence as special, considering the idea that “music may be a
privileged organizer of cognitive processes, especially among young people” (p. 31).

Music is a way that young people organize experience. Gardner cites Plato and Confucius, as ancient philosophers who believed that music played a significant organizing role in society. He hypothesized that music can change over time, first being more an organizer of more computation actions and then being more an organizer of emotional life as we get older (p. 32).

Gardner also considers his bias as a music enthusiast and young musician, which reveal his languaging around music. He says he hears music all the time in his head. He says it shapes his thinking,

My literary work reflects the sort of organization that I observed in compositions I studied and played (i.e. the development of themes, the effect that something introduced at one point has much later, the posing of what I call questions and answers in a musical way, the way symbols can capture not just reference bust aspects of moods and the form of moods). (p. 32)

Gardner makes various literacy connections in thinking about his musicking.

**Musicking as Emancipatory**

Perhaps the most noted example of a music program serving as a social initiative to transform the lives of low income youth is the National System of Youth and Children’s Orchestra of Venezuela or *El Sistema*. Founded in Caracas, Venezuela in 1975, *El Sistema* is a government sponsored public-school education policy that believes in access for all children and the pursuit of musical excellence at all levels of student participation. Its conceptual framework is “to systematize music education and to promote the collective practice of music through symphony orchestras and choruses in
order to help children and young people achieve their full potential and acquire values
that favor their growth and have a positive impact on their lives in society” (Tunstall,
2010, p. 45).

Currently there are approximately 400,000 participants out of the country’s population of 29 million. Most of its participants are underprivileged children. For Dr. Abreu, founder of EL Sistema, music is an instrument for social change. Students are required to develop a sense of civic engagement and social responsibility by embracing the rigors of disciplined personal practice, the interpersonal dynamics of playing in an instrumental ensemble, and the responsibility to build a dynamic learning community. This model serves as an example for how government funded music programs based on open access and excellence can foster individual and social transformation of youth.

Important to note is that every nucleo differentiates its instruction and musical tasks according to every child’s technical progress, because of this policy of inclusion. Their insistence on collective performance across all ages and levels of expertise, requires a differentiate method of instruction that fosters “the social and personal learning skills necessary to sustain every child’s self-esteem as a learner and a citizen in the musical community” (p. 81).

Distinctive features identified by Manjo (2012) that may impact school performance include:

● Non-selective, non-elitist, inclusive criteria for admission.

● Continuity and intensity in training which music programs in schools often lack.

● Playing in a community setting, which fosters community, leadership and
respect. Dr. Abreu strongly believed that the best teachers are the youth. If you know A, then you can teach A so that everyone is seen as teacher/producer.

- The pursuit of artistic quality. Goal setting and high expectation are critical to good musicianship.
- Inclusion. Playing together can overcome language barriers and other disadvantages.

In an interview with Gustavo Dudamel, conductor of the Los Angeles Symphony and El Sistema alumnus, he states “the orchestra, you know it’s a community. It’s a little world, where you can create harmony. And of course when you have this, connection with an artistic sensibility… anything is possible. Everything is possible” (Tunstill, 23). Similarly, Maxine Greene famously said, “You can’t become what you can’t imagine” (Web post). The music classroom that engages in community building serves as a space for radical possibilities for students.

**Conclusion**

In *Social Class and the Hidden Curriculum of Work*, Anyon (1982), finds that there is a hidden curriculum in schoolwork, where students receive different instruction based on social class. The first part of this chapter included literature that point to the inequities in the provision of arts education based on race and economics. This is especially alarming since, as Anyon writes, "skillful application of symbolic capital may yield social and cultural power, and perhaps physical power" (p. 89). I argue that "skillful application" of learning to play an instrument facilitates translanguaging and can lead to a shift in the way that children perceive themselves and are perceived in schools, from an outsider to an insider. Instrumental music instruction for students in urban
schools, especially bilingual students, could serve as a transformative social domain. In many ways, El Sistema programs, such as the research site of this study, exist in cognitive and physical spaces, providing students with social capital and allowing them to translanguage to bring together all their literacies.
Chapter 3

RESEARCH DESIGN

Corona Youth Music Program: Site and Participants

I conducted my research at the Corona Youth Music Program (CYMP) from February 2017 to June 2017. CYMP follows the El Sistema model. As I said in the section labeled *El: Sistema: Musicking as emancipatory* in Chapter 2, El Sistema is a tuition-free music program serving as a social initiative to transform the lives of low income youth. Founded in Caracas, Venezuela in 1975, its mission is “to systematize music education and to promote the collective practice of music through symphony orchestras and choruses in order to help children and young people achieve their full potential and acquire values that favor their growth and have a positive impact on their lives in society” (p. 45). El Sistema has branched out and now has satellite programs globally, including the CYMP.

CYMP is a tuition-free after-school music program, and was founded by an El Sistema fellow in 2010. As stated on their website, the program’s mission is, “to promote social inclusion in New York City by empowering youth and children in Corona, Queens to excel through participation in music ensembles” (www.nucleocorona.org). Its core values include building community, joy, access and strive amongst its students. CYMP currently offers a Pre-Orchestra Program, a Children’s Orchestra, a Youth Orchestra, and a Children’s Choir. These groups meet after-school, during Winter and Spring break, as well as during the summer break. Students are loaned orchestral instrument which they keep so long as they are participants of the program. CYMP provides access to classical instruction, bringing in professional teaching artists and conductors to give master classes.
to its students. It employs a mentor model, where older and more experience students facilitate sectionals\(^7\) and sit side by side with the younger students. Students put on several performances across the year in school, in the community and in the greater New York City area. In this way it upholds El Sistema’s mission to provide performance excellence. According to the director of CYMP, there are close to 200 students participating in the program. Approximately 60% of the participants are female and 40% are male.

**Pre-orchestra program.**

Students typically begin in the pre-orchestra program, an orchestra initiation program for students ages four to six which include,

- Percussion ensemble to learn basic rhythm
- Choir to teach basic music theory and ear training.
- Recorder Ensemble
- Paper orchestra. Students and their parents co-construct life-sized string instruments out of cardboard. They learn the physiology of instruments like the violin and the cello, while also learning key musicianship skills to prepare them for ensemble playing.

**Orchestra program.**

Once students advance to playing an instrument, they can play one of the following instruments:

---

\(^7\) Instead of private lessons, students are coached in small groups by sections once a week. The sections consist of: Violin, Viola, Percussion, Trumpet, Trombone, French Horn, Flute and Clarinet.
• Strings: Violin, Viola, Cello, Bass

• Woodwind: Flute, Clarinet, Oboe, Bassoon

• Brass: Trumpet, Trombone, French Horn

• Percussion Instruments

Students advance through the following orchestras, which meet one to two times a week for one hour's rehearsal as they develop their musicianship.

• No Frontier Children’s Orchestra (NFCO)- The beginning level orchestra.

• Corona Children’s Orchestra (CCO)- Full orchestra composed of students ages 7-12. There are approximately 35 students in this orchestra.

• Corona Youth Orchestra (CYO)- Full orchestra made up of students ages 9-15. There are approximately 45 students in the CYO.

To support skill development and musicianship, CYMP also offers the following sessions:

• Sectionals. Instead of offering private lessons, sectionals serve as group lessons. They are offered once a week and are taught at each orchestral level. At the time of the study, CYMP was offering flute, clarinet, trombone, trumpet, violin, viola and percussion sectionals.

• Mentoring sessions. These sessions are offered to some of the advanced students in CYO to one day take over the orchestra. Student age range from 12-15. At the time of the study, there were 10-12 students who attended these sessions.
Site of CYMP

CYMP is housed at P.S.19Q, the Jeanet P. Merino school, a community school with a strong dual language program. With close to 2,000, 60% who are English Language Learners, this is one of the most overcrowded schools in New York City. Since 1994, the school has used six trailers to house nearly 500 Kindergarten and First grade students. A five-story addition, expected to be completed by the 2018-2019 school year hopes to alleviate the overcrowding also experienced by other nearby schools.

Neighborhood

A 2013 report by the New York City Department of Planning, the most recent of its kind, found that Corona has the fourth largest foreign-born population after Washington Heights, Bensonhurst and Elmhurst. Corona saw a 7.4% increase in foreign-born residents between the 2000 and 2010 census. It has the largest Latinx immigration population, with 23.1% from Mexican, 21.1% from Ecuadorian, and 17% from the Dominican Republic (p.56). 64.2% (103,210) residents reported being born in the community. All of the participants in the program at the time that observations took place where immigrants or children of one or both immigrant parents.

Participants

The study was composed of general observations, followed by specific case studies. I first describe the participants in the observations, and then focus on those who participated in the case study.

Participants in observations.

I observed students and teaching artists at CYMP for a total of 20 sessions between February 2017 and June 2017. These sessions included the No Frontiers
Children Orchestra, the Corona Children’s Orchestra and Corona Youth Orchestra rehearsals, sectionals, mentoring sessions, and performances. A detailed observation schedule can be found in Appendix A. Each session lasted approximately one hour, although I often began my observations fifteen to twenty minutes before the start of each session to capture moments where musicking was occurring in an informal setting.

**Students.**

There were approximately 20 students in NFCO, 35 students in CCO and 45 students in CYO at the time of the study. However, while CYMP orchestras are comprised of students in elementary, middle and high school, this study looks at the literacy practices and identities of students in Grades 3-6.

Further, while the site of CYMP is at PS19Q, participants attended as many as 15 different public elementary, middle, and high schools. All participants in the study attend **Title I schools**, meaning that they have a high percentage of students that come from low income homes. Table 1 provides other relevant demographics for the study for four elementary schools and one local middle school attended by CYMP students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School A  (K-5)</th>
<th>School B  (K-5)</th>
<th>School C  (K-5)</th>
<th>School D  (K-5)</th>
<th>School E  (6-8) Public</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Enrollment</strong></td>
<td><strong>Enrollment</strong></td>
<td><strong>Enrollment</strong></td>
<td><strong>Enrollment</strong></td>
<td><strong>Enrollment</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1,600</td>
<td>1,950</td>
<td>1,704</td>
<td>991</td>
<td>2,219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethnicity</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ethnicity</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ethnicity</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ethnicity</strong></td>
<td><strong>Ethnicity</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic 91%</td>
<td>Hispanic 92%</td>
<td>Hispanic 93%</td>
<td>Hispanic 94%</td>
<td>Hispanic 89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian 8%</td>
<td>Asian 7%</td>
<td>Asian 5%</td>
<td>Asian 3%</td>
<td>Asian 6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black 0%</td>
<td>Black 1%</td>
<td>Black 2%</td>
<td>Black 1%</td>
<td>Black 3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White 1%</td>
<td>White 0%</td>
<td>White 1%</td>
<td>White 1%</td>
<td>White 2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ELL</strong> 47%</td>
<td><strong>ELL</strong> 60%</td>
<td><strong>ELL</strong> 52%</td>
<td><strong>ELL</strong> 40%</td>
<td><strong>ELL</strong> 33%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Dual Language</strong></td>
<td><strong>Dual Language</strong></td>
<td><strong>Dual Language</strong></td>
<td><strong>Dual Language</strong></td>
<td><strong>Dual Language</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

49
As seen in Table 1, over 89% of all schools are Latinx. Public School D has the highest population with 94% of all students who are Latinx. Also, English Language Learners (ELLs) compose more than the city average which is 14%, in all five schools. Elementary school C has the highest number of ELLs at 60%, while middle school E has the least number of ELLs with 33% of the population. All five schools offer a dual language and transitional education programs.

While there is no data available on the offering of instrumental programs in these schools, according to the *School in Arts Report*, two of the five schools have dedicated music rooms. Two of the four elementary schools have “Pull-Out” programs, meaning that these schools most likely have either an instrumental or choir program at school. Middle school F does not offer the mandated music sequence, meaning that students are not offered music for all three years. There is no music continuum. All six schools have at least one full time certified music school teacher, whereas school C and E have two full time music certified teachers. However, all schools have a very high student music
teacher ratio. School D has the lowest student music teacher ratio (991:2) while School B has the highest music teacher ratio at (1,948:1). This points to an issue of access for schools in overpopulated, low income neighborhoods.

The number of students who met the state standards in ELA and Math is lower than the city average of 40% in ELA and 42% in Math at the elementary school level. School B had the most number of students perform at or above grade level with 29% whereas school C had the lowest performance scores with 18%. In Math, School D had 36% of its students meet or exceed the standards on the Math state exam, while School D had 24% of the student meet or exceed the state standards. Last, whereas 44% of all middle school students met or exceeded the standards on the ELA test, only 28% met the standards at middle school E. School E also performed below the city level of 33% with 22% of all students meeting or exceeding the Math state standards on the exam.

**Teaching Artists.**

The teaching artists are all conservatory-trained musicians with a background in teaching children. All teaching artists reported having worked with or currently working for other arts partnerships. All teaching artists are also active members of the music community, working as paid musicians around the city. Four of the six teaching artists observed were Latinx. Four were female and two were male.

**Participants in the case study.**

I also conducted a case study of eight families who attended CYMP. The case study included interviews with the eight families—twelve children, nine parents and an interview with the teaching artist. I also collected writing excerpts from seven of the twelve students in the case study.
Children.

The table below provides demographic data for the twelve students who participated in the case study. This includes the school attended, the grade level, the instrument the student plays, the number of years enrolled at CYMP, bilingual proficiency of students, the country of birth and classroom setting, as reported by the parents.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Instrument</th>
<th>Years in CYMP</th>
<th>Sibling in CYMP</th>
<th>Bilingual</th>
<th>Country of Birth</th>
<th>Instruction</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Joaquin</td>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads, Writes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natalia</td>
<td>6th</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads, Writes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sara</td>
<td>4th</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Comprehends</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alejandro</td>
<td>6th</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Comprehends</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jocelyn</td>
<td>5th</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roberto</td>
<td>6th</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raquel</td>
<td>5th</td>
<td>Trumpet</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads, Writes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Dual Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jose</td>
<td>3rd</td>
<td>Viola</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>No*</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads, Writes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Dual Language ICT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennifer</td>
<td>4th</td>
<td>French Horn</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Speaks, Reads</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laura</td>
<td>7th</td>
<td>French Horn</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Speaks</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diego</td>
<td>4th</td>
<td>Percussion</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Speaks, reads, writes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra</td>
<td>5th</td>
<td>Violin</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Speaks, reads, writes</td>
<td>U.S.</td>
<td>Monolingual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.2 Student Case Study Participants

As listed in Table 2, there were two third graders, three 4th graders, three fifth graders, three sixth graders and one seventh grader who participated in the case study.
Eight of the twelve participants had siblings participating in CYMP. All students were born in the United States and were children of immigrant parents. Spanish was the language spoken at home for all the students, as reported by the student and the parents. Ten of the twelve students could fluently speak Spanish, while at least six could read and write in Spanish.

*Parents.*

The table below provides demographic data for the eight families that participated in the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parent A (Mother)</th>
<th>Children in CYMP</th>
<th>City &amp; Country of Birth</th>
<th>City &amp; Borough of residence</th>
<th>Language Spoken at Home</th>
<th>Additional Native Language</th>
<th>Parent Artistic Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parent B (Mother)</td>
<td>Sara &amp; Alejandra</td>
<td>Puebla, Mexico</td>
<td>Staten Island</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Photography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent C (Mother, Father)</td>
<td>Jocelyn and Roberto</td>
<td>Puebla, Mexico</td>
<td>Corona</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Professional Bassist (Father)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent D (Father)</td>
<td>Raquel</td>
<td>Puebla, Mexico</td>
<td>Corona^9</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Nahuatl</td>
<td>Amateur Percussionist</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

^8 The father in this study makes additional income by performing with his banda at events and renting out his studio.

^9 Parent D was a resident of the study at time of interview. A follow-up phone called revealed that the family moved to another undisclosed location.
While 40% of all CYMP participants are Mexican, seven out of the eight families who volunteered for the study where Mexican, with one family being from Guayaquil, Ecuador. Four of the families emigrated from Puebla, one from Oaxaca and two from Guerrero. These are neighboring states in central Mexico. All the families spoke Spanish at home, while two families also spoke Nahuatl and one family spoke Mixteca. Two of parents were active music makers, although as I will detail in Chapter 8, all the families had many family members who were musicians.

**Teaching artist.**

The teaching artist interviewed is a Latina graduate from the Manhattan School Conservatory and is a former resident of the Corona Community. She has been teaching at CYMP since it was founded in 2010. She coaches sectionals, occasionally facilitates orchestra rehearsals and mentoring sessions, as well as the winds seminarios [workshops] offered when school is not in session.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parent E (Mother)</th>
<th>Jennifer &amp; Laura</th>
<th>Puebla, Mexico</th>
<th>Corona</th>
<th>Spanish</th>
<th>Mixteca</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parent F (Mother)</td>
<td>Jose</td>
<td>Guerrero, Mexico</td>
<td>Corona</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>Nahuatl</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent G (Mother)</td>
<td>Diego</td>
<td>Oaxaca, Mexico</td>
<td>Corona</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent H (Mother)</td>
<td>Samantha</td>
<td>Guayaquil, Ecuador</td>
<td>Elmhurst</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3.3 Parent Case Study Participants
Purposeful selection

Choosing CYP as my research site is purposeful selection (Light et al., 1990, p. 53 in Maxwell, 2005, p. 88). Maxwell states that purposeful selection, “is a strategy in which particular settings, persons, or activities are selected deliberately in order to provide information that can’t be gotten as well from other choices” (p. 88). Selecting this as my research site is purposeful as the CYP:

- Services the population I am interested in working with- bilingual and immigrant individuals in a low income neighborhood.
- Has non-selective, non-elitist inclusive criteria for admission so that any child who already has music or is interested in adding music to their languaging repertoire may join the program.
- The program is tuition-free and provides instruments to the students.
- Pursues artistic quality. It views setting and high expectations are critical to good musicianship. This includes hiring highly skilled teaching artists and providing professional development to its staff.
- Follows a community model for instruction.

Whereas traditional models for music instruction introduce music as a solitary practice (ex. private lessons), at CYP instruction always occurs in a whole group setting, with all participants actively engaged in growing the group’s funds of knowledge. This setting allowed for observations in a student-centered domain, where I observed students employing all their socio-cultural meaning making systems into place to enact their literacies.
Method of data collection

In order to address the main research question—*How does music as a third space facilitate literacy acts and literacy identities for bilingual children?* I relied mostly on field observations which I describe below, although I also draw from the interviews, and student writing around their musicking practices. Below, I detail the instruments used to collect the data.

Field observations


I systematically recorded data and made reflections via memos to create deeper understandings and refine my lens for observation. Since this is a music classroom, the classroom is alive with sound and audio-tapes were not able to capture all desired interaction. Instead, I used a notebook, observing lessons and listening to student talk to address the main research question.

I took a grounded theory approach in that I defined what literacy looks like in the classroom based on my observations. While I do not attempt to operationalize literacy, I had some guidelines to help me to focus in on the literacy practices that were taking place during my observations. These included, but were not limited to:

- Students composing using music notation or invented notation
- Equating audiation to envisioning a text, as a baseline for reading comprehension
- Rehearsal as synthesis, strengthening craft and fostering independence
- Embodiment- Lending Voice and Expression as a way of interpreting a text
• Ensemble playing as a form of engaging in successful communication

• Peer feedback as a form of evaluation and critique

I then used what Li Wei (2011b) calls **moment analysis**, “moving the analytic focus from frequency and regularity to creative and critical moments where a specific action leads to a transformation of a cycle of action.” (in García and Li Wei, 2014, p. 29).

**The lingual bias**

Block (2012) states, “Missing in far too many discussions is an active engagement with embodiment and multimodality as a broadened semiotically based way of looking at what people do when they interact (Block, 2012, p. 56). Observations allow me to look beyond what students are saying and what students are writing to other modalities. This is particularly important for bilingual students since “multilingual interactions are aided by gestures, tone, setting, objects, and interpersonal strategies for interpretive clues, not words alone” (Khubchandani in Canagarajah, 2011, p. 405). As I conducted my observations, I looked at,

- Posture
- Body distance/positioning
- Head movement (gaze, facial expression, head position)
- Gestures

Semioticians Kress & Van Leewen (1996) write that,

The meaning that can be realized in language and in visual communication overlap. That is, some things can be expressed both visually and verbally; and in part they diverge—some things can be ‘said’ only visually, others only verbally.
But even when something can be ‘said’ both visually and verbally the way in which it will be said is different. (p. 3)

Similarly in music, musicality is in many ways embodied, so how we map music using our bodies gives insight into their musical understanding.

While I would have liked to have captured these interactions by photography for later analysis, DOE IRB prohibits photographing or videotaping students. Instead, I documented these visual interactions in my research notebook and created a memo, immediately after field observations took place. Artifacts are also included in the form of student writing, drawings, music notations, and rehearsal music in the analysis chapters and in the appendix.

**Interviews**

One of my key arguments is that playing an instrument can be a transformative, social action. That there is some deconstruction and reconstruction taking place around students’ identities in the social spaces they inhabit because playing an instrument shifts perspective, positioning and power of the different actors in these social spaces. To address this, I interviewed the different “actors” in students’ musicking spaces—music students, their families and their music teachers.

I interviewed twelve music students, nine parents, and one CYMP teaching artist. I used Garage Band, a program on my laptop to record all the interviews. Maxwell (2005) writes that "the development of good interview questions (and observational strategies) require creativity and insight, rather than a mechanical conversion of the research questions into an interview guide or observation schedule, and depends fundamentally on how the interview questions and observational strategies will actually
work in practice" (p. 92). Therefore, I employed a semi-structured interview approach, so that the questions developed were meant to serve as "prompts" for me, not for the interviewee.

**Student interviews.**

Interviews with students took place at the site of CYMP. Interviews took between 20 and 40 minutes. Interviews took place before or after rehearsals or sectionals or during a break. Interviews took place outside of the auditorium or in the school cafeteria. The questions developed and administered helped create a portrait of students' musical lives. The purpose of creating a portrait of students' lives is to have a sense of the home-school practices that shape their lives and that shape their literacy identities.

As Orellana (2009) points out, how a question is phrased and the perceived intention matters to children "given relationships of power between children and adults." (p. 136). In her study, Orellana addressed this by creating semi-structured interviews. Orellana warns that interviews should take place in different contexts where students feel comfortable. In one instance in which the student felt uncomfortable, Orellana left the room and left the tape recorder playing, with the student's consent. This strategy allowed the participant to share more. Finally, Luttrell (2010) encourages the researcher to listen for the interviewee's self-evaluative language as well as their meta-statements, by asking for details and examples (273). I often restated the statement and said, "can you say more about that?" The interview protocol consisted of a series of demographic questions, followed by questions about their music experience. The protocol used appears as Appendix B. None of the students appeared distressed during the interview or asked for the conversation to stop.
Parent interviews.

I scheduled time after school when I could meet with parents to conduct the interviews. I conducted three interviews in parent homes; another three at a local coffee shop; one interview took place at the CYMP site; another took place at a Catholic church. Interviews lasted between 45 minutes to an hour. There were no incidents during the interviews and parents were very forthcoming in their responses sharing unsolicited videos and personal anecdotes of their children musicking and immigrant experience. I provide a detailed narrative of the parent interviews in Chapter 8: Music as Family Fund of Knowledge. The interview protocol consisted of a series of demographic questions, followed by questions about their music experience. The protocol used appears as Appendix C. All parent interviews were conducted in Spanish which I was able to translate the text into English, as Spanish is my native language.

Interview with a teaching artist.

I interviewed one CYMP teaching artist. The interview took place at a local pizzeria and lasted approximately one hour. The interview session served as a learning session for both the teacher and the researcher. Maxwell states that, "interviews can provide additional information that was missed in observation, and can be used to check the accuracy of the observations" (p. 94). Further, Ulichny and Schoener (2010) acknowledge that, "it is the teacher who has the most knowledge of the setting under investigation." (p. 428). The interview protocol consisted of asking the teacher the teaching artist to describe her students as music learners, to describe the community she works in, and to identify her best teaching practices. The protocol used appears in
Appendix D.

**Data Analysis**

I chose to employ an ethnographic method, using elements of grounded theory (Glaser & Strauss, 1967) as a complementary mode of analysis, to investigate the multi-literateies employed by bilingual children in the music classroom. I chose CDA as the analytic lens because, as Rogers states "it held the promise of uniting a critical social approach to the study of language and literacy with an ethnographic perspective" (Rogers, 2003, p. 24). In writing about grounded theory, Charmaz (2010) writes, "As we gather rich data, we draw from multiple sources- observations, conversations, formal interviews, autobiographies, public records, organizational reports, respondents diaries and journals, and out or own tape- recorder reflections." In discussing Connelly & Clandinin (1990), Charmaz writes that, "we revisit our ideas and, perhaps, our data and re-create them in new form in an evolving process." (p. 187).

As a qualitative researcher, using an ethnographic case study method, which follows a grounded theory approach, I collected extensive data, developing thick descriptions to inform my analysis. As such, my ethnographic case study includes observations, conversations, student writing, and semi-structured interviews with students, parents and teachers.

For field observations my units of analysis are the musicking events and the social practices with which events are connected (Anderson et al., 1980). I use the interviews and student work to develop themes and create multi-voiced stanzas around musicking and its relationship to school literacies. Charmaz, states that it is this coding process, which "starts the chain of theory development" (p. 187). It is this coding process that has
enabled me to name students' musicking in the music classroom as a translanguaging practice that reveals rich literacies.

The purpose of constructing these narratives is to focus on the particular and the local, not to make generalizations about all bilingual students in Grades 3-6 who play a musical instrument. Providing insight into the experience of the individuals in this study also offers the opportunity to transfer understandings from context to context (Barret & Stauffer, 2009).

**Method of analysis for field observations**

**Gee’s (2011) tools for critical discourse analysis.**

I analyzed field notes and interviews by coding the transcripts using Gee's (2011) critical analysis tools:

- **The Doing and Not Just Saying Tool #7**

  “For any communication, ask not just what the speaker is saying, but what he or she is trying to do, keeping in mind that he or she may be trying to do more than one thing.” (p. 44)

Just as the relationship between language and action is complex, so too is the relationship between music and action. Therefore, when analyzing transcripts of students engaging in musicking, it is important to ask, what *else* is the participant trying to do?

- **Connection Building Tool (Tool #18)**

Since I am arguing that students are making connections between music and literacy for academic purposes, this tool will allow me to look at how this connection is made. As stated by Gee, I will look for how words and grammars are used to connect or disconnect
or ignore connections to other things and how they make things relevant or irrelevant to other things.

- Social Language Tool (Tool #24)

This tool looks at how words and grammatical structures are used to signal and enact a given social language. This is an important tool since I want to see how students translanguage (speech, writing, movement) within a given text. How do they use music, literacy practices at home and in school to effectively participate in the music classroom?

- Inter-textual Tool (Tool #25)

This tool allows me to see if student mix different genres. This will give insight into whether students are alluding to school literacies.

- Identities Building Tool (Tool #2)

This says that, “For any communication, ask what socially recognizable identity or identities the speaker is trying to enact or to get others to recognize” (Gee, 2011, p. 199). This tool will allow me to see perceptions around literacies and literacy identities.

**Visual grammar analysis.**

I also used Kress and van Leeuwen’s tools for visual grammar analysis. I ask,

- Who are the social actors and how are they positioned? Who is centered? Who is decentered?

- Visual grammar resources being used?

- What are the literacies being combined to make understand?

- What is the body language in the room? (gaze, social distance, angle, posture, gestures)

**Fairclough’s textual analysis.**
Last, I also incorporate Fairclough’s (2003) text and discourse analysis (to a much lesser extent) when working with the language data, such as the use of modalization and evaluation and representation of social actors in speech.

I then wrote my reflection/analysis in the form of a memo.

**Method of analysis for interviews and student writing.**

I again used Gee’s tools and Fairclough for critical discourse analysis when analyzing interviews and student writing around musicking. I systematically selected sections from student writing reflection demonstrated literacy acts and literacy identities being enacted from student writing reflection.

I identified literacy acts and perspectives around literacy identities by connecting lines that are about a common theme, perspective topic or image (Marsh and Lammers, 2004, p. 98). Gee (2011) calls these clusters of larger blocks of information, the Stanza Building Tool (tool #12). Each stanza was composed using information about common themes and perspectives identified perspectives around literacy acts and literacy identities (tool #11). A different stanza signals a change in theme, topic or perspective. The stanzas were then grouped by themes, which form a grand narrative on how the music classroom as a social domain facilitates literacies for academic purposes (p. 74). The themes were informed by literature around critical literacy and music pedagogy. The stanza narratives are multi-voiced, weaving together voices of the students that I interviewed (Gee, 2011). This resulted in multi-vocal narratives, in which each stanza represents the voice of a different participant (students, teaching artists, and parents), in order to make the analysis dialogic. Appendix E includes a sample of a parent interview that has been transcribed.


**Researcher Reflexivity as Validity**

Indigenous people and people of color have been traditionally studied by outsiders. However, native ethnographers who are working within and writing about their own communities have increasingly challenged traditional research relationships in ethnography. L.T. Smith (2010) writes that, “the history of research from many indigenous perspectives is so deeply embedded in colonization that it has been regarded as a tool only of colonization and not as a potential tool for self-determination and development.” However, she states that more indigenous researchers working in their communities “develop methodologies and approaches to research that privilege indigenous knowledge, voices, experiences, reflections, and analyses of their social, material, and spiritual conditions” (p. 97). CRT feminist scholar bell hooks (1984) states that including the voices of researchers who live on the margin enrich contemporary paradigms, while invigorating progressive movements. Foster (2010) calls research by scholars of color as revisionist, as “it can offer new if disturbing insights, alternate and disquieting ways of thinking, can be a means of creating new paradigms and expanding existing ones, and can result in a much needed dialogue between scholars of color and their White Peers” (p. 396).

This is because we all have our own subjectivities, our own lens on how we view the world, our own figured world (Lakoff, 2002). Maxwell (2012) writes,

Qualitative research is not primarily concerned with eliminating variance between researchers in the values and expectations they bring to the study, but with understanding how a particular researcher’s values and expectations influence the conduct and conclusions of the study… and avoiding the consequences. (p. 281)
Therefore, Maxwell advocates defining the nature of the relationship, which he considers a ‘key task’ of the research proposal. Hammersely & Atkinson (1995) refer to this as researcher reflexivity.

**Positionality of the Researcher**

Myerhoff’s (1979/1994) *Number Our Days*, is a narrative ethnography that looks at a community of elderly immigrant Jews residing in California. She analyses her subjectivities as a researcher as well as her relationship with the people that she studied. As a first chapter, Myers constructs a narrative on how her Jewish grandmother influenced her own life and research. Similarly, I foreground my positionality as an insider researcher in my dissertation in Chapter 1, where I state my positionality as a Latina bilingual researcher, musician and educator and how my identities provide me with a socio-critical and culturally responsive lens for my research.

Below, I reflect on my positionality as an insider-outsider (Maxwell, 2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Insider</strong></th>
<th><strong>Outsider</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I am bilingual; I speak the same language as the families I interviewed.</td>
<td>I positioned myself as a researcher during observations and interviews.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am a former English as a New Language, then English Language Learner (ELL)</td>
<td>I do not live in the neighborhood.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am musician</td>
<td>I am more middle class than the families that participated in the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I was born and raised in Queens, in an immigrant community.</td>
<td>I am not an immigrant.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I attended NYC public school, K-12</td>
<td>I am a public school teacher and part of the school system.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I am a teacher in a NYC public school with a large ELL population. I am a former class fourth and fifth grade classroom teacher and have the resources to identify the literacy practices values by schools.

Table 4 Researcher Positionality

Rigney (1999), a native ethnographer, says that indigenous research is research carried out by an indigenous researcher, in an indigenous community, for an indigenous community. As a Latina music teacher doing research in a primarily Latinx neighborhood I am an indigenous researcher. Since I am looking at the literacy practices that occur across these spaces, my experience as a classroom teacher, a musician, and a bilingual student are key in making these connections.

Still, it is important that the researcher acknowledge their impact on the setting and the individuals in the study. Hammersely & Atkinson (1995) state that as a researcher you can’t eliminate bias but you can understand it and use it productively. Villenas (2010) cautions that, “this ‘native’ ethnographer is potentially both the colonizer, in her university cloak, and the colonized, as a member of the very community that is made ‘other’ in her research” (345). She cautions that this colonizing mentality occurs “when we fail to question our own identities and privileged positions” (346).

Following Myerhoff and Villenas, I created a chapter (Afterword) in which I share my personal history in which I too “examine how [my] subjectivities and perceptions are negotiated and changed. Not only in relation to the disenfranchised
community as [a] research participant, but also through interactions with the majority culture” (p. 353).

**Limitations**

While I gather data that identifies school literacies being practiced by students in the music classroom and at home, I do not have “hard” evidence that students are transposing these skills in school I did not interview teachers due to time constraints and unsuccessful email exchanges with schools. Interviewing classroom teachers would have been valuable in getting the perceptive of the teacher on the impact that playing an instrument has on bilingual students. However, I did observe and interview the teaching artists, which allowed me to name “best practices” in the music classroom.

Another limitation is that the study is primarily about Mexican immigrants and their American born children. Although the program reported that a little over half of the families in the program were Mexican, six out of the seven families that signed up for the study where Mexican.

Yet another limitation is that although the music program observed is open to anyone in the community, as an after-school program, students and their families choose to participate in the program. Therefore, I am looking at bilingual families who have an interest in music. Findings might be different during a school day setting where not all students may have the same level of interest in an instrumental music program.

As such, this study focuses on a very specific population- Mexican Immigrant families and their bilingual children who have an interest in music. I cannot claim external generalizability, although the intent of this study was never to do so. Instead, “It may provide an account of a setting or population that is illuminating as an extreme case
or ‘ideal type.’” (Maxwell, 2005, p. 115). This singular look allowed me to look at the lives of this growing Mexican-American immigrant community in Northern Queens who has access to the musical instruction and musical practices that I wish to explore in this study.

Finally, the Department of Education prohibits that video-recording or photographs be taken of students. This would have been helpful in when conducting visual grammar analysis. Instead, field notes and reflection memos were done immediately following an observation.
Chapter 4

MUSIC INSTRUCTION:

MOMENTS OF LITERACY ENACTMENT

In this chapter I address the question, “How does engaging in a music program facilitate literacy acts and literacy identities for bilingual children?” To do so, I focus on four vignettes constructed from observations from orchestra rehearsals, sectionals, performances, and conversations with CYMP faculty. Each vignette or narrative represents “creative and critical moments” facilitating transformative literacy practices for bilingual students. These moments are also progressions from rehearsal to planning to composing and finally to performing. They are the following:

1. Rehearsing: Conga del Fuego with Corona Youth Orchestra (CYO)
2. Collaborating and planning: Reading across clefs and student-led lesson planning
3. Composing: Corona Children’s Orchestra (CCO) strings sectional
4. Performing: No Frontier Children’s Orchestra (NFCO)

These vignettes also highlight student translanguaging practices in the classroom in a variety of flexible groupings that demonstrate the learning progression of students as literate beings—Whole group instruction, small group instruction, partnership work and independent practice. As I describe, I identify practices that facilitate high levels of student engagement and higher order thinking, content area expertise and creativity, and engagement in socially transformative practices. It is these musicking spaces, I argue, that allow students to acquire the school literacies, which include Reading, Writing, Listening, and Speaking.
Rehearsing: Conga Del Fuego Corona Youth Orchestra

Setting: Second Floor Hallway, Thursday afternoon

a. Prelude

It is a Thursday afternoon in February and the Corona Youth Orchestra (CYO) is having a full orchestra rehearsal of Arturo Marquez’s *Conga del Fuego*. Performance is key to keeping students engaged and developing musicianship so the students will have just a couple of weeks to rehearse before they perform this piece. To support this rigorous schedule, students have been meeting in sectionals, to workshop exposed or "tricky" parts with their teachers. Tonight, they are meeting as full orchestra. A guest conductor will provide another lens to the piece and will give students additional strategies for how to practice and perform the piece.

The coordinator has just received word that the auditorium is being used to rehearse for a school play. Undaunted by the news, as this is typical in an environment where co-location occurs, the program coordinator improvises and moves rehearsal to the second-floor hallway, where the school’s PTA is holding a PTA workshop and classroom teachers are still prepping in their classrooms. Minutes later, students can be heard walking up the stairs and soon the hallway is bustling with students unpacking their instruments, taking chairs from open classrooms, and pulling out folding stands from four large IKEA bags. They place their music binders on the stands and start warming up. It is clear that the students have been informed that a guest conductor is visiting by the tempo and dynamics of the hallway as the students rush to get ready. One of the French horn players looks at me and asks, *is it you?*

There is two-way traffic in the hallway. As students continue to trickle in from outside, commuting from nearby elementary and middle schools, they funnel into today’s
orchestra CYMP rehearsal, or to nearby classrooms, where a horn sectional and a
beginner string rehearsal are taking place.

Off to the side are two students practicing Mozart’s *Eine Kleine Nachtmusik*. It
is a passage that I’d observed the same students practicing the week before during a
string sectional rehearsal break. Their playing is a call to three younger string students
who come over to listen, turning this practice exercise into a performative event. Soon, a
third strings player, who had been sitting and reading through some of tonight’s music,
walks away from his stand and joins them. Nearby, a clarinetist is heard warming up to
the theme from the *Pink Panther*, unwittingly providing a counter-melody of sorts for this
impromptu performance.

Amidst all this action, the director walks around tuning the string students. He
tunes some students with his phone and then asks those who are tuned to turn around and
share their tuned open string pitches with the other students. Very similar to an ELA
class, the students that are tuned communicate with the others, adjusting their strings
accordingly. Nearby, students who had been practicing switch from bow to pizzicato,
sharing the space for which everyone can engage in musicking. Two of the students
playing the duet begin helping the director to tune, tuners in hand, while the other student
fills out a mentoring reflection checklist. As the conductor and mentor proceed to walk
around and tune the different sections, the ensemble volume gradually grows, with
sections engaged in different warm-up strategies until the director taps the stand and
everyone falls silently into rest position.

The director announces that the guest conductor is running late, and asks the
oboist if she is ready to give the tuning note. The principal oboist nods her head, and
turning to the strings sections plays an A. The Second A is tuning brass, where the brass then play the A and continue warming up, playing intervals of 4ths and 5ths. The oboist plays her last A for the winds and after tuning play a few 16th notes runs around the tuning note. After the orchestra is tuned, the orchestra proceeds by warming up with a scale. The guest conductor walks in.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reflection on the Prelude</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The lack of access to a dedicated music space forces CYMP to frequently inhabit a physical thirdspace. The observed rehearsal didn't take place in the classroom or the school auditorium, but in a second-floor hallway. From its inception, the program has inhabited the physical thirdspace. When the program first started, students would meet on the second floor of the Langston Hughes Library or at the Immigration Movement Center. There, in one large space, the program taught their paper orchestra, pre-orchestra, held sectional, and full orchestra rehearsals, often concurrently. I was a witness to this on multiple occasions and while the team and families showed great flexibility in rehearsing in breezeways, stairwells and other creative spaces, although inevitably there were times when the only choice was to cancel rehearsals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Despite the physical limitations and acoustical changes, in this thirdspace, something beautiful emerged. The hallway came to life with student engaging in a variety of independent and collaborative music practices: warming up with scales, practicing sections of the piece and improvising melodies. The students playing the duets, for example, provided a call for other students to join in their musicking, turning the hallway into a space where students engage “self-assigned” musicking. The</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The corridor became "a translanguaging spaces allow[ing] multilingual individuals to integrate social spaces... that [had] formally been practiced in different places" (García & Li Wei, p.24). As detailed in the rest of the rehearsal vignette below, the physical thirdspace, whether because or in spite of, engaged students' cognitive third space and a state of collective flow ensued.

b. Conga Del Fuego.

After a couple of measures, the guest conductor stops to discuss the use of crescendo,

"It is impressive that you can do dynamics in the hallway, but I think you can do better."

The conductor then asks the students how they change dynamics. One student suggests how fast or slow the air goes into the instrument. Another student offers changing the bow speed. The conductor calls on another student and he says how close your bow is to the bridge.

“Ok, good. Let’s start with the strings. The contact points. How many contact points can we have?

1, 2, 3, 4, 5. Let’s try playing closer to 1. What did you have to do?”

There is no response, so the conductor says,

“Ok, turn to your stand partner. Listen closely. What do you have to do to play forte when your bow is close to 1?”

Students turn to their partner and take turns bowing at different speeds. The violin section leader turns around and moves the bow lightly and quickly. They follow him.
“Very good. Now, try contact point 5. Try playing with the same weight first… that didn’t work, did it? What does your hand need to do?

“Press down harder,” a student responds.

“Yes, so closer to the bridge we play heavier and we slow down the bow. If we want to play Fortissimo. Ok, let's try the section again.”

The orchestra plays the piece, using the strategy. The section leader angles his body slightly in such a way that the violins behind him can now clearly see his bowing technique.

“Bravo! Let’s try this at a faster tempo…”

When the section concludes, the conductor signals to the orchestra to stop and reinforces the concept of contact points and bow speed.

"You see? It is an exciting pace and dynamics make that happen. Crescendo by adding more weight and playing faster and closer to the bridge…”

---

Reflection on instruction for Conga del Fuego

The conductor gives immediate feedback so that students are able to effectively incorporate the new strategy into their playing. Further, while the traditional orchestral classroom positions the teacher at the center, there are several instances in the lesson in which the teacher is decentered, as students are invited to engage in inquiry work around how dynamics are made on an instrument. For instance, through body language, the section leader models effectively the strategy and the students are successful in applying the strategy. A section leader scaffolds for younger students as

---

10 Music term referring to the speed of the beat
the rehearsal goes on by simply positioning himself in such a way that students can mirror him if they think they need to do so.

c. Creating shared meaning around Conga Del Fuego

The rehearsal continues and the guest conductor stops to give feedback, often making self to text connections to help students grasp the concept. She says:

Keep the energy in this section. This is important or else you will lose your audience. This is the part of the song where if you don’t give this an image, your family will start to think about dinner, or what’s on TV… You need to make a mental note of this. This part is where I need to keep the energy, make a note. Ok, here keep it sneaky. As if you want something but you can't get it. Make believe you are your little brother who is sneaking into your room to take your video game.

Can I borrow your violin?

She stretches her hand down and picks up the violin. She models the technique for the orchestra and asks them to try playing the passage again:

Conductor: What do you think about when you play that melody? Do you get a feeling or think of a story? or think, Oh my goodness, now I have to play a triplet! What do you think?

Student: I think about walking out of my bed late at night and not waking up my parents.

Conductor: So sneaky it’s the sneaky feeling we were feeling earlier in the piece. Let’s hold on to that image as we play this section… Ok, that was beautiful do
you think we can make it feel sneakier? Can you tell your stand partner how you will do this?...Mmmm.

[Gives a 30 second response time as students talk with their partners.]

She taps her baton on the stand and says,

Conductor: What should this part sound like?

Student: The beach!

Conductor: Ok, here we should sound like it is August and we are at the beach walking along the shore, just as the sun is setting. How should we walk on the beach? Do we march like soldiers at the beach?

She demonstrates, marching in place, as students giggle.

No, right? We walk like we are dancing. Orchestra, let’s sing this section together. Sing your part and dance with me like we’re on the beach!

Students partially comply, swaying back and forth, muttering their parts, and giving each other sideways glances for signs of judgment.

Very good. Let’s play it and see if that helps.

What do you think?...

Students nod in agreement and a violist says something seemingly affirmative to which the conductor responds with,

Me too, I liked that much better! We didn’t play exactly what was written on the page and that’s ok. If we take risks, if we play like we are dancing on the beach, we will really shine.
She asks the students to take a 15 minute break. As students put their instrument away, some continue to rehearse *Conga de Fuego*. Another student, a cellist redefines the space and can be heard playing an alternative rock song, *7 Nation Army* by the White Stripes.

**Reflection on creating shared meaning**

The music instruction in the last section of the rehearsal is literacy instruction. The conductor asks the students to engage in metacognitive strategies to work on tempo and dynamics. There is lively conversation around musical expression, as the conductor asks the orchestra to co-construct an image of what the music should evoke to create shared meaning of the piece. Asking students to use different modalities, such as making personal connections and using movement, promotes the inclusive practices that students so often need in the classroom. Having students embody the piece *kinesthetically*, as the conductor encouraged the musicians to do in this vignette, is a way of knowing that students can use to communicate or internalize meaning.

There is again evidence of flow in this part the rehearsal. Students are fully engaged and appear to enjoy the rehearsal as evidenced by the smiles and student postures. They are challenged and feel capable of meeting the challenge. They “self-correct” and the conductor makes sure to give immediate feedback. In doing so they create to new understandings of the piece, as they play in a faster and brighter tempo. By having students actively contribute to the interpretation of the piece, rather than passively watching the conductor demonstrate proper technique, students create shared meaning. Last students engage in “self-assignment” behaviors, evidence of optimal flow. They extend learning in this space, musicking beyond the allotted rehearsal time, as evidenced by students practicing *Conga* and the student playing *Seven Nation Army*. 
Collaborating and Planning: Reading across Clefs and Student Led Lesson

Planning

Setting: School Auditorium

This second vignette looks at how a traditional orchestral program often criticized for its transmission approach to music instruction adopt transformative practices for teaching music to its students. Specifically, we see how students go from code breakers and text users to text analysts and text producers as they take on mentoring roles in the orchestra. The vignette is structured as a sequence where students go from being taught how to mentor younger students and think about taking on leadership roles in the community to facilitating their own sectionals.

a. Reading across clefs, Saturday morning

It is a Saturday morning during winter break and in attendance are four violinists, two violists, one cello, one percussionist. Students sit in a circle, around an easel with chart paper for co-planning the student led mentoring session. Students have brought their mentoring portfolio (Appendix F), writing tool, and their instruments to the session.

Connection.

The director opens up the session saying,

"We want to create a network of students, so large that there will be 2,000-3,000 students playing an instrument in the neighborhood. I know it sounds really incredible, but long-term it can happen. I don't see CYMP being run by Juilliard
or Manhattan School of Music teaching artists, the way it is being done now but by folks from the community, by you. Even if you do go to Juilliard or to Manhattan School of music, you will come back and contribute to CYMP. These mentor workshops will take place over the next 4-5 months, until the end of the year. They are designed to show you how to take over the program. To learn how an organization works, how to teach and how to coach so that you can take over. Even if you don't go into this field, as most of you won't, I think the skills that you learn here will be very valuable. It doesn't matter what career you enter, you will need to be an administrator, a teacher, a mentor at one point in time. This week you will be working with the No Frontiers Orchestra. The progress has been bumpy and it has been a challenge to get them to this point. Most of the winds are true beginners. We will focus on how to break down the first eight measures. The long-term goal is to have them play side by side, along with CCO. During our sessions we will be discussing what strategies to use, how to distribute the work, how to make practice more efficient, and how to communicate what we want them to learn."

**Reflection on connection**

The director gives great purpose to this literacy activity. Students will be developing musicianship skills, but they will be repositioned as leaders in the community. The short-term goal is to share their funds of knowledge with the new students in the music program. They will be equipped with strategies to teach students how to do this. Long term, students are being tasked with implementing social action. They are encouraged to co-construct a community orchestra for social action and
empowerment. When the director says, *It doesn’t matter what career you enter, you will need to be an administrator, a teacher, a mentor at one point in time*, the message is that students are gaining skills that transcend the orchestra setting and are geared towards helping them become college and career ready.

**Teach.**

The director passes out "Te Deum."

![Fig. 4.1 Prelude, Te Deum Score](image_url)
Director: So I think this is the first time for most of you reading a score. So when you read a score, the order of the instruments doesn’t vary. The instrumentation obviously does, but the order in which the instruments are listed, woodwinds, percussion and brass stays the same.

Let’s look at the key signature. What do you notice across the instruments?”

Student responses include,

- *Some have more sharps than others.*
- *Yeah, but some are the same. Like the trombone and the Cellos have the same number of sharps.*
- *Some have more notes than others.*

Director: Do you know why that is? Some instruments are called transposing instruments. You can take notes, as we discuss.

Student A: How do you spell transpose?

Student B: What are the instruments that don’t transpose? The violin, the flute, the oboe…

Student A: Where is the French Horn? Oh wait, is that the Corno [French Horn]?

Oh, yeah that’s the French Horn. One y dos [one and two].

Student C: Horns are in Fa.

Director: Let's focus on the string section. Let's figure out how to read the different clefs. All clefs have a reference point on the staff. The Bass Clef points to the F.

Student A: Every Good Boy Deserves Fun

Student B: That’s not right… All Good Boys Do Fine Always
Student A: Oh yeah...

Student E: [Looking at the score] So if I want to play the bass part that’s D-, D--
D-D-, C- A- D-- D, G G...

Student A: yeah [rereads the notes]

Students already have some prior knowledge of the content. They know which instruments do not transpose- violin, flute, oboe. They already know how to read Treble and Bass Clef. When a Student A, who reads bass, reads the treble as if it were bass clef, another student is able to help the student. Student A is able to later monitor student E a student who usually reads treble, in reading Bass Clef. Aware of this, he proceeds to have a discussion about the Tenor and Alto Clef as he guides students towards learning about each other’s roles in the orchestra.

Director: There's something tricky about the Tenor Clef because it can move up and down the clef. That's not the case for the viola, but it is for the Bassoon and the trombone… we can use the treble Clef to transpose to Alto Clef. The treble space notes become the lines. (Starting from the first line) F-A-C-E-G,

![Fig. 4.2 Treble and Alto Clef](image)

Student C: [pointing to the lines] so it is F-A-C-E-G. So, that’s for the lines? [partner nods]
Director: So I can read it, how can I apply it?
[goes over to the whiteboard]
So the reason for having all these clefs this is because we would otherwise have lots of ledger lines.

Student C: That is so weird though... I feel like I’m in school…

Director: So that is the function of the Clefs so that they can be played in a readable format. What else can you see in the score?

Looking at the score student responses include,

- Everyone starts at the same time.
- Almost everyone has the same part.
- Cello, Bass, and Trombone play Bass.
- Viola is the only instrument playing Alto Clef.
- French Horn and Trumpet 3,4 have the same thing.
- Trumpet 1,2 the same.
- Flutes 1\textsuperscript{st} and 2\textsuperscript{nd} points up and down.

Director: [After a few seconds of silence] Did you bring your instruments?

Student C: Yeah, I brought my violin.

Student D: Me too.

Student A [Cello]: I didn’t.

Director: Can you double up on Bass?

Student A: Yeah.

Student F: I brought my sticks [giggles]

Director: Let's all read through the piece. Ok, now let's look at the viola part… except for timpani and bass.
[Students groan, giggle, there is some shifting]

Student C: Can I write in the notes?... This really does feel like school.

There is time for students to write down the notes names on the sheet music. Some do, but others opt for practicing the viola part slowly, translating the viola notes into their clef. The violists are practicing the Violin I part together. They take turns transposing, identifying the notes before attempting to play.

After five minutes or so, one of the students says, *Let’s just play it* and the violist volunteers to play the viola part, modeling for the other sections. The students organically take turns playing the line, jumping when someone is finished. Students take different rehearsal tempos when attempting the transposing task. Everyone is everyone else listens, most following along with the school and not reacting.

Director: Good. Now that you have a feel for the viola part let's switch around, so each mentor plays a different voice.

Student A: I’ll play Violin II.

Student A: [Addressing the violins], I like your part.

Student E: Yeah, that sounds nice.

Student A: Everyone play the viola part.

[Collective groan and laughter]

Student B: Nah, let’s choose a different part. I like the second violin part.

Director: What combination of instruments would you like to hear?... to see how the two lines compare with each other?

[Students look at the music]

Student B: What about 1st Violin and Viola.
Director: Careful, that’s C#.

Director: Good, let’s try 2nd & Bass.

Timpani claps after each group performs.

Director: Now, Timpani and 1st.

Everyone claps for timpani, recognizing his support for all the previous grouping

Director says, Everyone plays viola.

Director: Now let’s become familiar with the different voices. Which are the same?

Student C: Violin I, Flute I, Clarinet I and Oboe all play the same melody.

Student F: Viola, Trumpet II and Faggotte [bassoon] play the same thing.

…

Student D: What if they don’t get it?

Student A: Rely on the kid that is more advanced to help others.

**Reflection on lesson**

There is scaffolding in place to allow for students to come to a place where they are now able to read across the clefs and understand how the different instruments work together to complement each other. Important to note is that this was not about mastery of the skill of transposition. While some students attempt to transpose from treble to alto or treble to bass, others prefer to try out other parts that they can read in their clef. There is an understanding that learning is not void of error and that everyone in the space is a source of knowledge. This is seen when one of the students asks - *what if they don’t get it?* This refers perhaps to themselves as they will not be teaching how to transpose. The other student responds with - *Rely on the kid that is*
more advanced to help others. This is a space where students feel they can challenge themselves without relating this to failure. Students rely on each other to learn these concepts and support each other in the learning process.

Translanguaging happens naturally in this classroom, as students attempt to read each other’s parts and develop an understanding of each other’s music notation system. It is necessary for the mentors to read across the different clef systems if they are to mentor students in flexible groupings. The director facilitates this emergent languaging by teaching them to read across the clefs, and helping them develop a common language.

b. Collaborative student-led lesson planning, Tuesday Afternoon

It is the second day of the No Frontier Children’s Orchestra (NFCO) intensive Seminario and the mentors have convened again to set a plan for how to elevate the technical abilities of the student they are mentoring. The students again sit on stage in a circle.

Director: What do you suggest as a group we do on the first day?

Student D: If we are running sectionals then we should listen to everyone play, see where everyone is before we help.

Student B: Does it just have to be before the first day, or can it be throughout?

Student C: Can we do what we did last we met? Pair up with different sections. In the orchestra you don't really get to listen to the other sections. So if you do that, then you can listen to your partner better.
Director: So if we went with this, what would your plan for the day look like if you were in charge for the day?

Student B: That depends on the space that we’ll be using.

Student D: That’s ok, we can work in the hallway.

Student A: Yeah we don’t need to work in the auditorium, we just need stands.

Student C: Ok, why don’t we start with sectional.

Student B: …and then we come together again.

Director: Remember, we have like 2 ½ hours. Think in terms of that.

Woodwinds and Brass can go together.

Takes a piece of paper and starts to jot down the flow of the day.

Student D: Will we be having breaks?

Student B: Five minute breaks?

Student D: I think we can’t have too many breaks because they might get distracted, discouraged to continue.

Mentors break into groups and chart the flow of the lesson.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group 1:</th>
<th>Group 2:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>● Sectionals</td>
<td>● First 15 minutes tuning. 15 minutes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Each plays their part to see who needs the most help</td>
<td>Do you know how many kids there are?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Help the one who needs the most help</td>
<td>● Scale rhythm work using Te Deum-different voices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Then the other 2</td>
<td>● Sectionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Then come together</td>
<td>● Pair up the different sections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>● Entire Orchestra</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Sectional 35 minutes
- Whoever gets it the most helps others.
- Pair up kids with others who have similar parts for 20 minutes
- Full orchestra the rest of the time.

- Intonation and scales, 15 minutes
- 30 mins. Sectional work
- 30 minutes 2 sections playing to see what it sounds like to play with another section.
- 10-15 min. break
- putting all the pieces together to see that no one is playing too quickly or slowly.

Table 4.1 Mentors Planning Flow of Lesson

Director: We have several ideas, and the good thing is that all these ideas agree with each other. Any comment on what your colleagues suggested?

Student C: E., H., and I had similar ideas. I like the ideas of pairing up sectionals. I don't like the idea of giving the kids long breaks. They will be tired, start to act up. 5 minutes and come back. I like the idea of scheduling 15 minutes of tuning.

Student B: Why? 15 minutes is a long time.

Director: Is it? When I am doing this by myself it takes me that time if not more.

Student C: Yeah, but we will have E, J, H and you to help.

Student: I think scales are really important. It helps to warm up our hands and to listen to each other.

Reflections on Collaborative Student-Led Lesson Planning

The Key feature for Common Core Speaking and Listening in English Language Arts & Literacy reads as follows:
Including but not limited to skills necessary for formal presentations, the Speaking and Listening standards require students to develop a range of broadly useful oral communication and interpersonal skills. Students must learn to work together, express and listen carefully to ideas, integrate information from verbal, visual, quantitative, and media sources, evaluate what they hear, use media and visual displays strategically to help achieve communicative purposes, and adapt speech to context and task. (p. 8)

In this vignette students are highly engaged in talk. Student listened to each other, giving their classmates the space to grow their ideas. Students took the initiative to improve the lesson by modifying the learning task to make it more meaningful or relevant to their perceived needs of the students they will be mentoring. I think scales are really important. It helps to warm up our hands and to listen to each other.

Students had ample opportunities for reflection and closure on the lesson to consolidate understanding. Students take on authentic roles in the classroom. Following this lesson, students did break out into sectional and coach students.

**Composing: Corona Children’s Orchestra (CCO) Strings Sectional**

**Setting: Classroom, Friday Afternoon**

While it was rare to see students engaging in composition as classroom lesson, in this third vignette I present an instance in which a teaching artist used composition during her warm-up, to activate student understanding of key signature.

After students practice their scale warm-up, the teacher asks them to get into a circle and tells them that they are going to jam. Students giggled and there was a lot of glancing down.
The teacher models and then signals for the next person to go. The first time around, most did not play. The teaching artist engages in a conversation around what happened. Seeing that students are abnormally quiet, she asks them to share just one word to describe how that felt.

Students offer the following words and the teaching artist writes the words down:
Spring, Powerful, Storytelling, Nervous, Depressing, Happy, Calming, Proud, Excited, Joyful, Happy, Calm, Independent, Strange, Different, Brave, Peaceful, Unsure.

Teacher: Such interesting and varied ways to describe how that felt. Storytelling was an interesting one. Can you say more about that?
Student: Well, you can tell stories. You can make images with your playing and your images can have feelings.
Teacher: Good, we are going to do that again. Let me ask you a question? Do you guys ever try making up your own music at home?
Student: Yeah, but I like to sing and then I play.
Student: I feel like pizzicato is more like how you figure out the notes, to see if you like what you are about to play.
Student: I like that idea of singing the notes before playing them. I usually pizzicato before playing.
Teachers: Those are all great ways to warm up. I’ll give you a minute to think about what you may want to play.
The second time the students go around, and all of them with the exception of one student plays this time around. Only one student plays a similar melody.
Reflection on composition with CCO strings sectional

The first time around, the students were asked to do something on demand. The teacher scaffolds instruction by modeling, the students did not have time to rehearse. The result were pieces that incorporated melodies they were playing into their compositions or used elements of their warm-up exercises as mentor texts.
The lesson was student centered and strategies were offered up that came from the students. Having students share their music-making practices, not only helped in creating strategies for how to compose melodies but also rehearsal strategies for practicing an orchestral piece- developing metacognitive awareness that builds autonomy and improves proficiency.

As a result, the second time around students were asked to engage in spontaneous musicking, and that though seemingly hesitant, they were more thoughtful in their response. For instance, several opted to pizzicato instead of using the bow. When asked why students decided to pizzicato instead of bow, one student said that they wanted to practice first. One explanation might be that given time to prepare, made him more inhibited about his craft. Another explanation could be that having students plan, changes how students approach the task. The task now requires planning and rehearsing. More wait time may have been required. There was also more variety in the melodies that students created, as if their music is guided more by the teaching strategy and internalizing the lesson, than by mimicking their peers. This resulted in more unique melodies but also a less unifying melodic theme.

There were merits to both creative literacies. While one inspired spontaneous musicking, asking students to tap into their hard-wired musicality to improvise a melody, the other exercise asked students to *plan* their melody. This resulted in more complex melodies, that perhaps sounded finished to the ear but provided a challenge for students. Although this was an unfamiliar exercise, the ease with which all the students were able to engage in this exercise speaks to the community that CYMP has established among their student.
Performing: No Frontier Children’s Orchestra (NFCO)

Setting: Library, School Auditorium, Queens Museum of Art

This fourth vignette describes a NFCO concert that took place at the end of a weeklong music workshop. Music is performative in nature. As a social practice, children play with and for their friends and families. A concert is a summative assessment, a cumulative product of weeks of independent practice and group rehearsals. The program strives to position its students centrally in the neighborhood and the artistic community. One way it does this is by providing ample opportunities to perform. They frequently perform in a variety of community spaces, including public schools, outdoor areas, local public libraries and art museums, such as the Queens Museum and El Museo Del Barrio. The program also has an active Facebook and Instagram account and updates are often made, highlighting their students and their families.

**NFCO boot camp, Friday afternoon.**

The NCFO students have been attending “boot camp” during the February week-long break. This consists of daily orchestra rehearsals and sectional rehearsals mostly facilitated by the mentors. On Thursday, the director announces that the students will be performing for their families in the school auditorium. Since this was a week in which the mentors had been heavily involved in facilitating sessions, and mentors have been coached on how to conduct, the director has asked one of the mentors to conduct NFCO participants sit side by side with their mentors, adjusting their stands, tuning their instruments and modeling posture. As parents walk in, students demonstrate “performance ready” etiquette- feet flat on the floor, instruments in rest position.

After the director addresses the families, discussing the work that was done this
week and turning their attention to the new Spring schedule, he exits the stage and sits with the percussion section. The student conductor walks onto the stage and before facing the orchestra, she faces the audience and says,

Quiero agradecer a todos los padres por apoyar a sus hijos. Tienen unos niños con mucho talento. Queremos que sus hijos tengan las mismas oportunidades que hemos tenidos nosotros. Sabemos que lo que han logrado es solo posible con su apoyo. Mil gracias.

[I would like to thank all the parents for supporting their children. You have very talented children. We would like for your children to have the same opportunities we've had. We know that what they have accomplished is only possible with your support. Thank you.]

The student turns to the orchestra, keeping her feet together and standing tall to activate her core, picks up her baton and the performance begins.

**Reflection on performances**

**Body hexis.**

“To learn a body technique is to acquire a new way of knowing, understanding and relating to the world and perhaps oneself” (Crossley, 2015, p. 473)

In this multi-leveled music program, there are different stages of musical development, yet all show a certain level of confidence in the performance they put on for their families. Throughout the time I observed students at CYMP I saw explicit instruction on posture. For instance,

- A conductor reminding the trumpets to stand tall like a tree when playing.
• A flute teacher reminding students to put pressure on the chin like a magnet, and to employ the “I-Phone Technique” - imagine you have your smartphone on your shoulder, to prevent your chin from dropping.

• A violin teaching artist reminds students to check those thumbs, to dip those feet to check their Mouse House and to keep fingers on the “fingerboard highway.”

I observed students posture and gaze shifting when there was uncertainty in what they were doing. However, by performance time posture became a visual way of assessing a certain level of mastery not only for the others but themselves as well. The manner in which students carry themselves when they are confident about what they are doing is key in shifting the habitus of students from learner to confident performer, regardless of student's level.

**Conducting as interpretation.**

I witnessed this sixth-grade mentor take on a leadership position as she communicates with the ensemble, giving this novice orchestra the cues needed from a conductor to reassure them and command their full attention. She learned this from an earlier mentoring lesson on the importance of using your body to communicate confidence and openness with the ensemble. To do this, the teaching artist reminded the mentors to have a clear picture of what you want the section to sound like and to connect the body with sound to attain the meaning you want to convey. The teaching artist demonstrated how to convey different moods using phrases such as punch, dab, slice, and tap to express how the baton should move. Students practiced leading and mirroring these moods in pairs. They then took turns conducting a section in a piece conveying these moods through their conducting. Students were able to both communicate the mood as conductors and interpret
the conducting cues from their peers. Almost instantly, students internalized a set of physical skills that they used to then interact with their peers. The explicit teaching of this skill repositioned this student in the context of the classroom.

Further, in this performance space this student mentor, who is conducting a novice orchestra in a performance setting for the first time translanguages. She synthesizes all her ways of making meaning to successfully positions herself as conductor: the seeming spontaneous judgment call to acknowledge parents’ role in their children’s learning and to do so in Spanish, her quiet and confident posture her focused gaze on the orchestra as she signals them into playing position, and her interpretation of the score she communicates to the orchestra through the movement of her baton.

**Conclusion**

This chapter provided a glimpse into the practices of students in the music classroom in an afterschool program, the progressions from rehearsing to performing, as well as the teaching practices that facilitated school literacies. I end this chapter by calling attention to the ways that the music practices here described relate to other school literacies.

- Music is taught as literacy practice.

Music is taught as literacy practice in the classroom. Students are taught not only how to decode the text, that is, the music notes. They are taught how to be text analysts, learning how to embody the music through envisionment (making an image in their mind of what they see), by eliciting colors to think about the mood of the piece, by making personal connections to the piece. They become text producers as they engage in
composition or in conducting exercises where they share their interpretation of the text with the rest of the orchestra and the audience.

● Students demonstrate a habitus of success in the music classroom.

From the very beginner who can play a couple of notes to the more advanced students who sit side by side with them, students are seen as musical. Through a multi-modal approach to learning, they are made to feel successful on stage and off stage; encouraged by the games they play with their mentors; challenged by the repertoire that motivates them and improves their artistic capabilities; building a repertoire of techniques involving the body that allow them to spatially communicate this confidence. A collaborative learning environment where challenge not competition is fostered, drives student motivation in learning their instrument and fosters empathy among students as they take on mentoring roles in the music classroom.

● Students translanguage in the music classroom bringing all their ways of making meaning into the classroom.

There is a multi-modal mode to making meaning that goes beyond using the English language and employs all the semiotics. In this third space students extend what they are learning to engage in their own music making practices.

● Teaching artists recognize the role of effective teaching practices in student learning.

Teaching artists allow for a space where students co-construct narratives as a form of embodying the music they play. Teaching artists differentiate for student learning styles using a variety of multi-modal strategies. These “best practices” used by the teaching artists is not by chance. First, the teaching artists are all graduates from top
conservatories such as Manhattan School of Music and New England Conservatory.

Secondly, the program offers a variety of professional development for its teaching artists and space for collaboration with other community based music programs in the United States.

- As a program embedding critical literacy practices, it views music as an emancipatory practice for the immigrant community and seeks to empower its participants to one day take over the program.

In a conversation with the director of CYMP, he stated the following regarding the program’s mission,

This leadership piece, I would like them to feel comfortable to raise their hand and say and feel free that they have an opinion, that it’s an informed opinion, and that that opinion is going to be heard and it’s going to be turned into action by the group… I hope that this is a space for them to be active in the community. That it’s a space for them to give back to the community. To be active in bringing about social change, so that this becomes a true community orchestra… and that the tools that they acquire here, not just help them in their musical pursuits, but in other careers, such as law or public administration.

The program’s mission is critical literacy, reminiscent of Freire’s *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. It is a program that views music as emancipatory. It recognizes the need for a space in the community that will facilitate a multi-modal way for self-expression and communication. By creating a community orchestra by the community and for the community, it looks to turn the orchestra into a transformative organization.
The students in this orchestra are not expected to become professional musicians. Rather, through rigorous orchestral training, they will acquire tools through music participation that they can employ in their professional lives and as life-long music makers and agents of social change. In this way, the orchestra is being re-imagined as a physical and cognitive third space for its participants and their families.

The director and teaching artist I interview view teaching as a political act as schools are sites of social and political acts. The curriculum used, how their teaching philosophies influence their teaching practices, the spending allocation, which includes stipends for the high school mentors, are all political choices that often perpetuate a dominant ideology. It is up to educators to refuse the perpetuation of the dominant ideology. Freire says that educators cannot just be "education specialists," they also need to have a political consciousness aimed at rectifying inequities. When schools and their teachers transcend traditional curriculum and empower their students with authentic literacies multi-modally then students and teachers engage in transformational practices socially, economically, and politically. This program seeks to do just that.
CHAPTER 5

SCHOOL LITERACIES AS CREATIVE PRACTICE:

ENACTING LITERACY ACTS IN THE MUSICAL THIRD SPACE

The music classroom as a third space allows for students to enact all their literacies as creative practice. In this chapter I identify specific ways in which the music domain facilitates literacy acts for students that can also translate into school literacies. The chapter is structured in two sections, which I describe below.

Section I looks at practices that students employ in the music classroom that support the literacies valued in school. The music classroom is defined as a place where students are receiving music instruction. For the purposes of this study the music classroom is defined as the physical spaces at CYMP where students receive music instruction. This can include a classroom, the auditorium, the school cafeteria or even a breezeway. The shape-shifting nature of the music classroom serves as a reminder to the reader that music instruction often occurs in a physical thirdspace. I also argue that it is a cognitive third space that allows students to enact their music, school and social literacies. The data reveal three connections between music and school literacy skills:

1. Audiation as envisionment in driving comprehension,
2. Meta-cognitive strategies during independent and collaborative learning, and
3. Sustaining flow as motivation.

In the second section I report on student perceptions around the way they enact their musical literacies in the classroom. This reveals ways in which students may knowingly be using music literacies in the classroom.
I use data collected from the twelve student participants in this case study to create a thematic analysis of the ways in which students enact their literacies in the musical third space. The data included in this chapter is derived from student interviews, written responses, and music work samples. Using Gee’s stanza building tool, as described in Chapter 3, I create themes to address each of the sections of this chapter.

Section 1. Connections between music and literacy strategies

As I said before, three themes connecting music and school literacies were identified in the data. These are: 1) Audiation as envisionment, 2) Meta-cognitive strategies, and 3) Sustaining flow as motivation.

Audiation as Envisionment

In reading, the ability to make a picture in your mind as you read is called envisionment. In music the ability to make musical meaning is called audiation. In reading, envisionment is often regarded as fundamental to reading comprehension. In music, audiation and musical expression are often seen as evidence that a student understands what he or she is playing (Sloboda, 2009). It is not enough to have fluency in musical syntax, musicians need to be expressive when they play. The same can be said about reading comprehension. Fluency and prosody do not necessarily mean reading comprehension. One way to tap into and develop reading comprehension is to look at someone’s ability to envision, or make a mental image as they read, which allows them to picture ideas and abstract concepts.

In this section I explore students’ ability to envision the orchestral repertoire as an indicator that students are audiating or making musical meaning. Student interviews allowed me to identify five different themes around audiation as envisionment, which I
reproduce below using the students’ own words. As the reader will see, five different themes emerged:

1. Levels of envisionment,
2. Connecting self to text,
3. Connecting text to text,
4. Eliciting a memory, and
5. Struggling with comprehension.

I describe below the different ways in which the data connected to audiation as envisionment. Students revealed different levels of envisionment, the first theme that I have identified. As I said before, below and in the stanzas throughout the dissertation, the roman numerals refer to different student voices. Where only data from one student constitutes a stanza or stanzas, no roman numeral appears.

**Theme 1. Levels of envisionment**

I.
I see a picture doing *Mammoth.*
The notes are going up and down
and they are bouncy.

II.
The New World Symphony...
The crescendos and decrescendos
start to make me think
it’s like a forest.

There is a person trying to run away.
They are scared,

but at the same time happy they are free.

III.
When I play the song *Las Mañanitas,*

I imagine a girl writing to her cousin on her birthday.

She moved from New York to Mexico

and misses her a lot.

(*Musical Noise, Appendix G*).

IV.

It’s either *Prelude* or *Minuet*

-Minuet,

I just see myself at the top of the Eiffel Tower

playing this piece.

Like the same bowing are the ones where I’m just like,

“wow that’s so beautiful.”

The ones that are different bowing patterns,

go faster or slower,

or just more quieter, but still fast.

It’s like me admiring the beautiful city,

looking at the people around me…

or looking down there are the bakery,

or looking down there the French Horn person,

or looking at the painter across the street.
It’s just magical.

In stanza I, the student simply visualizes the notes bouncing up and down to represent different pitches, signaling to low level of audiation. In Stanza II, using the Language Building Tool, we see that while the narrative is short, all the elements of the stanza building tool are there. The mental picture begins with the setting: the sound crescendos and decrescendos, eliciting images of a forest; the catalyst- there is a person running away; the crisis- the person is scared; evaluation- at the same time they are happy they are free; resolution- they are free. In stanza III, using the Doing Not Just Saying Tool, Las Mañanitas, often used as birthday song in Mexico, triggers a cultural connection for the student. Like stanza II the student in stanza III expresses internal conflict- while the song elicits emotions associated with celebration it also triggers feelings of loss- She moved from New York to Mexico and misses her (cousin) a lot. Stanza IV is told in the first-person narrative. The student provides rich detail followed by evidence to support the accuracy of her envisionment. She sets the mood of her narrative- magical.

Students also revealed the connections that they personally made to the text. I identify the connection of self to text below as theme 2.

Theme 2. Connection of self to text

Not all music will evoke a narrative as noted by the following student:

When I am playing the violin, I imagine being wrapped up by music, like a blanket.

The music notes swirl around me
as I play my violin.

Sometimes, they inspire the notes

I play on my violin.

Custodero (2012) writes, “Sinking into music becomes a sensory experience” (p. 371). When students “sink into music” they are embodying their music. **Embodiment** is a powerful literacy practice, as it demands that students make connections to what they hear in order to locate themselves in the text. In theme 2, the student’s audiation creates the kinesthetic feeling of “being wrapped up by music” which sometimes helps her read music notes—*the music notes swirl around me as I play my violin*, and other times create her own music—*they inspire the notes I play on my violin*.

Sometimes the connection, however, is not related to the self, but to another text. This is presented below as theme 3.

**Theme 3. Connection of text to text**

It’s kinda like a bunny hopping, clicking.

The notes are short

like if you are in a meadow

and you see a bunny

and you want to get close.

It reminds me of Alice in Wonderland.

Alice is chasing the white rabbit.

In theme 3, the student’s audiation skill leads her to make connections to other texts when she writes, “It’s kinda like a bunny hopping, clicking. *The notes are short like if you are*
in a meadow and you see a bunny and you want to get close. It reminds me of Alice in Wonderland. Alice is chasing the white rabbit.”

Another theme that came up in the data which had to do with envisionment is about eliciting a memory. I identify that theme below as number 4.

Theme 4. Eliciting a memory

Most of the time I do

I make a picture in my mind

I mean, it depends on the music

If it’s something I feel,

like *Con Spirito*,

I imagine what it *reminds* me of

It *reminds* me of thunder

It had emotion

In this stanza the student makes a connection to the music evoking a feeling. However, it is a memory that triggers the emotion, signaled by her repeated use of the word *reminds*. The feeling is associated with a powerful small moment- the hair-raising sound of thunder. Envisionment is always inherently narrative. That is, although the connection is made through an emotion, the emotions stems from the memory of what thunder feels like. Salmon (2010) writes, “When music awakens children’s prior experiences, it intrinsically motivates them to express their thoughts through different sign systems such as writing, drawing, dancing and singing, making the uncovered information visible.”

*Con Spirito* awakens this student’s prior experience, allowing her to audiate and embody
the piece.

Sometimes, however, it is impossible for students to envision something related to themselves, to a text or even to a memory. Students, nonetheless, recognize envisionment as a strategy with which they have to struggle because finding an image makes understanding so much easier. This theme, number 5, appears below.

**Theme 5. Struggling with comprehension**

If I don’t really like it,

Let’s say it’s something that’s too much for me

I don’t really create an image

I try to, but I can’t really find the image

For Chamambo, I really like that song,

but I can’t imagine a picture for it

I just can’t see it

The inability to envision, can be a signal that the student is struggling to make musical meaning. The student is also able to recognize that the piece is challenging and is unable to make a mental picture. While the child likes the piece—how it sounds when the orchestra plays it, or when in a recording the child is unable to make a deeper connection to the piece. This may be occurring because the piece is technically above his level of proficiency. However, in beginning to make meaning by attaching a feeling to the piece, the student is in the initial stages of comprehension.

Envisionment plays a significant role in literacy, as well as in music as evidenced by students thinking about their musicking. It serves as the foundation for
comprehending a text. In the next section, I present the ways in which students wrote about what they envision when playing *New World Symphony*, a musical text.

**Writing around envisionment.**

In my writing there’s always a mental picture. In the old days, when a guy made a lick? He’d say what it reminded him of... “it sounds like my old man falling downstairs or “it sounds like a crazy guy doing this or that.” That’s the way I was raised up in music. I always have a mental picture. (Duke Ellington in Greene, 2014, p. 6)

Previous studies have looked at the role that listening to music plays in eliciting writing. However, little research has been done on writing responses and what they can reveal around musicking and its connection to school literacies. In the following section I asked students to reflect on pieces they are playing in writing. Writing provides another modality for students to reflect on what they envision as they play their orchestral repertoire.

**Envisioning in the *New World Symphony of Antonin Dvorak*.**

Since several students referenced *New World Symphony*, during the student interviews, I asked students to write down what they envision as they play the piece. I gave them the option of writing or sketching or both. These are some of the responses. First, I present student writing followed by my analysis of what is happening:
In Text 1, this student seems to be taking notes of what is he is envisioning. He includes bullet points and phrases to describe what is happening in the scene. He has created a story map. The child includes a description of the setting, who is in the story, what the problem is and how the character responds to the problem. This is complex imagery- despite being all alone on a stormy night, the character self regulates by singing a lullaby and that makes him hopeful for a safe return home. Interesting to note is the student’s decision to use music notes, instead of words in the speech bubble.

Text 2 also depicts someone on a ship. The characters on the ship have mixed feelings. The student writes that the boy is sad because he is leaving someone special. He does include the mother’s feelings in the text, but looking at the drawing, while the boy is frowning, the mom is smiling. It seems like this is in reference to an immigration experience, but I did not follow-up with the student or parent on this.
In Text 3, there are no people, just ships with flags and overhead are helicopters. When I asked the child what he envisioned when he sketched this he said war and soldiers coming back home. The caption at the bottom of the drawing reveals the feelings the text inspires in him—*I feel happy, sad and calm.*
Text 5.3 New World Symphony Response, Grade 3

*Jinrikisha student response.*

In envisioning the piece, one student makes the following text to text connection to *Little Red Riding Hood*:

What story that is playing is the Red Riding Hood.

I think this because it’s like tippy-toeing and the wolf is also doing that to get the food from the basket. Then she hides from the wolf and they find each other and she runs away. It gets louder because the wolf is getting closer. It gets softer because she is hiding from him. It is short because they are tippy-toeing with the tips of their feet.

The student provides a narrative of what she envisions in the form of a retelling. Making a text to text connection inspires the student to include a lot of textual evidence to support her envisionment.

Text 5.4 Jinrikisha Student Response, Grade 5

*What story that is playing is the Red Riding Hood.*

*I think this because it’s like tippy-toeing and the wolf is also doing that to get the food from the basket.*

*Then she hides from the wolf and then they find each other and she runs away.*

*It gets louder because the wolf is getting closer. It gets softer because she is hiding from him. It is short because they are tippy-toeing with the tips of their feet.*
• *It* [sounds] *like tippy-toeing*
• *It gets louder because the wolf is getting closer*
• *It gets softer because she is hiding from him*

Envisionment as audiation is one way that musical literacy connects to school literacy. Just as students in this study make self to text, text to text and text to world connections to the characters or the events they read about, which drive their reading comprehension, they also make these connections to their musicking, which drives their audiation. Student talk and writing around audiation reveal a multi-modal, multi-sensory, and ultimately multi-lingual approach to literacy, as students elicit the visual, the auditory, and the kinesthetic in order to make meaning of the musical text.

**Metacognitive Strategies**

Meta-cognitive activities nurture the effective work habits of curiosity, creativity and innovation, critical thinking and problem solving, communication, and collaboration, each of which transfer to all aspects of learning and life in the 21st Century. (National Coalition for Core Arts Standards, 2012, p.19)

Engaging in music instruction also gives students practice with self-monitoring their understandings and learnings. In this section, I report on the themes that students’ words and narratives brought forth concerning the ability to self-correct during two different events—Independent practice and Collaborative activities. I first describe how students learned through independent practice. After that discussion, I turn to how students learned through collaborative activities.

**Learning literacies through independent musicking practice.**

During my observations, I witnessed conductors, ensemble coaches and teaching artists share multiple strategies for technique, intonation, rhythm and ensemble playing.
While students were able to incorporate the strategies with assistance, under the guidance of the teacher, it is important to know if students use these self-monitoring and self-correcting strategies during independent practice. Further, students who self-monitor and use self-correcting strategies demonstrate independence, one of the seven abilities needed to be college and career ready according to the ELA Common Core Standards.

For the independent practice the themes that emerged were:

1. Establishing practice routines
2. Scaffolding student learning
3. Self-assessment

It was clear from students’ words that they were able to establish practice routines independently. This constitutes the first theme here discussed.

**Theme 1. Establishing practice routines**

One of the themes that emerged was the importance of routines, as the Stanzas below reveals:

I.
To play scales,

those help me a lot.

Because when I don’t know a note,

I just put my finger on the fingerboard

and go back to the scale.

II.
I do breathing exercises,
then I play sixteenth notes,
then I do low lip slurs,
and then I play 2 scales.

III.
When I have the chance
I do my D major scale,
and then I start playing songs.

And if I do them wrong
I do the D major scale
and then the A major scale
and then I go back to the song

IV.
I practice in front of a mirror
Students expressed having developed habits for warming up on their instruments.

Practicing scales was voiced as the most common way to work on intonation, rhythms,
and fingerings. Students also worked on embouchure, breathing techniques and
posture. But it is also important to note that students understand how to scaffold their
learning, another theme to emerge, as the stanzas below show.

Theme 2. Scaffolding learning
I.

---

11 Embouchure- the way in which a brass or woodwind players shape their mouth over a
mouthpiece. This includes lips, facial muscles, teeth and tongue.
I practice first
by looking at the music,
and doing pizzicato first

Like Les Toreadors
I didn’t know how to do it first,
So I looked at each note
And I practiced it slowly

II.
If something is hard
I clap the rhythm first

III.
I reread the music

IV.
I practice my easy music
up an octave

The students use a variety of strategies to scaffold their own learning as they
tackle a new text- isolating rhythms as seen in stanza II or targeting fingerings,
articulations, and slowing down tempo as seen in stanza I. In stanza IV the student takes
a familiar text to practice an unfamiliar technique- playing *up an octave* (in a higher
register). Using a familiar text allows the student to practice an unfamiliar skill in his or
her zone of proximal development.

But students not only monitor their practice and their learning, they also learn to
self-assess. This theme emerges in the stanzas below.
Theme 3. Self-assessment

I try reading the notes of pieces I play

without writing in the letters

and then seeing if it’s the right now

Let’s say I’m playing Mammoth,

I cover the letters

If I think it’s an A,

and then if I get it correct

I keep on playing

This student is not yet able to read music without writing in the notes but considers writing in the notes a temporary scaffold. Thus, the student develops a strategy for how to build independence and self-assess her learning.

Finally, the performance itself emerges as a way of self-reflection, but also of getting student feedback. This is the fourth theme to emerge from the students’ independent practice.

Theme 4. Self-reflection and peer feedback

Sometimes I make a video of me playing

on my YouTube channel

Like if I think I am playing something well

I make a video to show my friends

to show the world

and to see if anyone likes it
In the absence of peer feedback, this student uses social media as a form of self-reflection and peer feedback from her online community.

**Learning literacies in community.**

When students are working in the classroom as an ensemble or in partnerships they not only have to consider their playing, but consider how working with another person or a group of people changes the learning space as well as the strategies that they will use to make music. Students see the value of collaborative learning, and of a learning community, and these are themes that students repeat and which I discuss below—collaborative learning, collaborative help, and collaborative listening. Help from partners is important in collaborative learning, the first theme identified below:

**Theme 1: Collaborative learning**

I.

Sometimes, when I don’t know my fingerings or I forgot my fingering chart

I play a chromatic

or I ask my partner for help

II.

I listen to my group and go up and down with my bow when they do it

III.

This summer we were warming up to,
practicing “Les Toreadors”

and we also did scales before orchestra started

The students know that in the classroom setting they can consult their partners using different semiotic cues. They can verbally ask- *I ask my partner for help* or they can use auditory- *I listen to my group* or use visual cues- *[I] go up and down with my bow when they do it.* Because they have built a community, students are not ashamed to ask for help. This is the second theme identified below.

**Theme 2: Collaborative Help**

I.

I play low notes

with the other countermelodies

to make sure that the countermelodies

is blended

II.

I listen to them

Or if they aren’t playing the right rhythm

I play louder

III.

I really like the practice that we had on Thursdays

where it was just the flutes and clarinets

Cause that way we could see how the flutes play

and the way their rhythms sound

And the flutes could listen to us
And if somebody just gets lost,
instead of having to stop
They could just listen to the flutes
and try to find where they are
by what the flutes are playing

In stanza I, the student interprets his task- *I play low notes*, and therefore understands her role in the ensemble- *the counter melodies*, as well as her purpose in the text -to make sure that the counter melodies is blended. In stanza II, the student not only self-monitors but monitors others & critiques- *they aren’t playing the right rhythm* and applies a correction strategy- *I play louder*. The student in stanza III knows that within the orchestra there are smaller communities of practice. As a member of the clarinet section, she not only listens to her section but also knows to listen to the flute section which she can rely on them when she gets lost.

Listening is a most essential part of musicking, a literacy practice that constitutes the third theme identified by students:

**Theme 3: Collaborative listening**
I make my part count!
I look at the conductor for cues
and look for things
such as Forte and Andante

This student considers his position in the orchestra as someone who usually plays the countermelody in the orchestra and repositions his perspective from that of a marginal role to a central role by saying *I make my part count!* He knows there is power in
exercising his multi-literacies and knows not only to read the printed word, but knows to read the world around him—A conductor’s cue, the tempo markings and dynamics all become details that he synthesizes in order to reposition himself as central to making meaning of the text.

Students in the music classroom apply a variety of meta-cognitive skills with their ensemble and during partnerships. Specific strategies such as establishing practice routine, self-monitoring, self-corrective, self-assessment and self-reflection are greatly valued school literacies as they signal to a learner’s independence.

**Sustaining Flow as Motivation**

Music as a literacy act is powerful because it is a challenging activity, whose creative challenges motivates students to learning. Custodero (2012a) uses Csikszentmihalyi’s idea of flow to argue that music provides optimal flow because in order to sustain the flow skills must improve. It is this flow that activates creativity, which is essentially how individuals learn. Maintaining this flow is necessary for all learning settings.

When asked why they liked playing their instrument, their response pointed to challenge as motivation, as evidenced by the four themes that emerged which I have arranged into the following stanzas:

1. Expanding the flow through improving skill-set
2. Embracing process,
3. “Tricky” repertoire,
4. Easy music as “boring
Musicking involves all the senses and activates multiple metacognitive strategies simultaneously. This is the first theme identified:

**Theme 1: Expanding the flow through improving skill-set**

Basically, because the violin kind of looked simple

but also fun

But I thought that maybe the clarinet might be more challenging

because you had to use air

And not just your hands

And I found it more interesting that you needed to use all your fingers

Not just three fingers like you do with the recorder

The student is looking to maintain a state of flow and so she wants to improve her skill-set. She wants an instrument that will require more challenge than playing the recorder, which requires the use of three fingers and minimal air. Although she thinks the violin will be "fun," she associates the skill set as on par with the recorder because both require the use of one hand, the left hand to play the fingerings. The clarinet on the other hand requires the left and right hand and use of air. In her view, this is the more challenging instrument as it requires her to work on her skill set in order to improve. This sense of keeping the flow by embracing difficult processes is identified in the stanzas below which constitute the second theme:

**Theme 2: Embracing process**

Music is a language

because like a language it is difficult

to learn at first
but little by little you start to get it

Like the violin,
you start pizzicato at first
you learn all the basics

In a language you learn all the basics first
and then you perfect it
and then they teach you all the stuff
that makes language interesting

To keep the flow means to try out “tricky” repertoires, and not just easy one. This is Theme 3 discussed below.

**Theme 3: “Tricky” repertoire**

When asked specifically what they liked about the repertoire they were playing in their music ensembles, responses included:

1. intense,
2. tricky,
3. because of the ties,
4. because I like to practice my triplets
5. how we change the volume- mezzo forte to piano
6. because of the eighth notes that are high
7. because it challenges my musical ability. For once I get some melodies and it sounds great!
Lines 2-5 speak to students seeking to push their technique with triplet rhythms, notes on the same bow, and the additional air support and embouchure adjustments needed to play high notes on an instrument. Line 7, signals to a student wanting to be acknowledged. Perhaps he enjoys the attention around playing the melody.

Finally, there was a fourth theme that affected flow as motivation. That was the degree of difficulty of the music, leading to theme 4.

**Theme 4: Easy music as “boring”**

If challenge is motivation, the easy content described by the students in the following stanzas leads students to feel unmotivated.

I.

All I do is play quarters, halves and wholes

It’s boring for me

and I don’t like it

II.

We have a boring part

and we only play the melody once

III.

My least favorite is Twinkle, Twinkle

because it is easy

IV.

My least favorite is the scales

because the notes are going in order
These students express being bored by technically easy music—*all I do is play quarters, halves and wholes* and easy melodies—*Twinkle, Twinkle*. Including students in the decision-making process, such as setting goals, as discussed in the next section is one way to keep students in “flow.”

**Setting Goals.**

Goal seeking behavior is indicative of student continued engagement of being in “flow.” When discussing their goals, students again signaled to challenge as motivation in learning about their instrument. Students talked about technique and repertoire being challenges, constituting themes 1 and 2.

**Theme 1: Technique as challenge**

I.

I want to be able to play all the high notes

on my clarinet

before the last day of school

II.

I want to vibrate my hand

I will watch videos to see how to do it

III.

I want to double tongue

I will do it by tonguing slowly

Say ta-ka, ta-ka

And getting it faster each day

**Theme 2: Repertoire as challenge**

I.
I can do more challenging songs
Because I want to be a better musician
What notes I have to do
You have to practice a lot
You have to practice the notes
and I’m not saying
that you have to be perfect
but you have to practice every day
in order to be able to perform
II.
I want to be able to play harder music
and my dream is to be in the orchestra

Custodero’s explanation of creativity as learning comes to mind, “we create as we accrue increasingly complex skill/knowledge through sustained inquiry” (2012a, p. 370). Student specific goals and their plans for how to achieve their goals speak to this sustained inquiry and ownership as they grow as musicians.

Students in the music classroom maintain flow because they develop stamina, a skill needed to engage in a task independently for long periods of time; they set goals and ownership for their learning; they demonstrate challenge seeking behavior that drives their music engagement and learning. Having stamina, setting goals for your learning and having ownership over your learning, I argue, are all skills that are valuable in school.

This section looked at how students enact school literacies in the musical third space based on student interviews and student writing around musicking. They use the
skill of envisionment as a foundation of musical meaning, they employ meta-cognitive thinking strategies in their independent and group playing, and they embrace challenge as a way of maintaining musical flow. Section 2 looks at whether students can identify any perceived connections between music and school literacies.

Section 2. Musicking-Literacy Connections: Student reflections

In the previous section I looked at music literacies that are also valued in the context of the school. In this section I include students’ specific thoughts on how music literacies apply to school literacies. The following themes emerged from student interviews, and are described below:

1. Music and math connections,

Theme 1. Music and math connections

I
It’s taught me to keep trying
Especially in math
When I don’t get the lesson
Or I already know the answer
but I don’t know how to show that I got it
I try all the ways to find how

The student in stanza I, connects the stamina that she has developed in music to the stamina she needs to problem solve an equation in math. Music has taught her to “keep trying.” Even when she’s learned her part, she can always find additional ways to play the music. Similarly in math, even when she’s found a solution to the problem, she
can think of alternative ways to solve a problem—*I try all the ways to find how*. For this student, learning is not about the end result but the process. In comparing music and math, the student below makes the connection between **process** and learning.

II.

Like slurping

When you are going over the break
don't cheat
it's like cheating in math
you can't use a calculator
you have to **figure it out**

The student in stanza II, sees that when she is having trouble with a technique, such as—*going over the break*¹² rather than finding a shortcut to playing high notes on her instrument, she needs to learn the technique and “figure it out.” She makes this connection to math, recognizing that using a calculator may give you an answer but it won’t help you to learn a concept. By embracing process, the student will not “cheat” herself from learning. The role of teachers in helping students to make connections between music and other content areas is evident in the following stanza.

III.

If you know music you know math,
how many beats are in a measure.

---

¹²“Going over the break” on the clarinet refers to the ability to play the notes smoothly as you change from the middle register to the upper register on the instrument. For instance, going from an A to a B is a challenging skill for students because this requires you to go from pressing one key to play the A to pressing all the tone holes, including the register key, to play the B.
Teachers say math is everywhere.

When you read music,

the first thing you see is time signature

– and that’s a fraction.

The student in this stanza makes music and math connections, partly because her teachers have helped her to make those connections. She understands that notes represent fractional values of beats and that each measure is made up of notes that equal a certain number of beats as dictated by the time signature. Making explicit connections between music and math helps this student to read the world through a mathematics lens—math is everywhere. Lastly, in theme 2 students also made connections to writing and how thinking musically helped in adding details and activating prior knowledge.

Theme 2. Music and writing connections

I.

Like when I’m working
I sometimes find music in my work
Sometimes when I’m doing my writing
I feel like music connects to what I am writing

II.

Music helps me to add on to my work.
It helps me be more creative
and add more to my writing.

The students in stanza I and II reported that thinking musically helped them to generate more details in their writing. These students’ noticings are supported by studies
that point to the benefits of listening to music in helping to generate ideas in writing (Scott, 1996; Elbow, 2006; Paquette & Riegg, 2008; Salmon, 2010). Important to note is that the students in my study are not listening to music to generate writing but are thinking musically as they engage in writing. Music is a language through which they are practicing their writing.

Students also spoke to music helping them to be more creative in their writing, which speaks to music’s role in facilitating a state of ‘flow’ when engaged in a task. Salmon writes (2010) that “music has the potential to activate a child’s schemata, which can jump-start the child’s comprehension and creative writing.” Music can also activate prior knowledge as expressed by the student in the stanza below.

III.

When you are thinking of something,
and you can’t get it,
I think of music.
And then I think,
ok I’ve got this!

In my class when I am writing,
and then I think of music,
and then I remember.
Once I think of music,
I think, ok I remember
For this student thinking about music also activates her schemata, as she can recall information—*I think, ok I remember*. Various studies have made the connection between music and promoting memory. (Wallace, 1994; Snyder, 2000; Blais-Rochetter & Miranda, 2016). For these students, “music invites [them] to revisit what they know, stimulates their curiosity and promotes thinking” (Salmon, 2010)

**Conclusion**

The first section in this chapter looked at practices employed in the music classroom, and sought to make connections between music literacies and the literacies valued in the school. The following themes emerged:

1. Audiation and envisionment as a skill for comprehension;
2. The use of meta-cognitive skills to drive independent and collaborative application of music skills;
3. The importance of maintaining a state of flow in learning.

In the second section of the chapter I report on students’ perceptions around the way they enact musical literacies in the classroom. Two important themes were discussed:

1. Music and math connections;

While this chapter made concrete music-school literacy connections and signaled ways in which students knowingly enact their musical literacies in the classroom, providing evidence that students are applying these literacies in their schooling is beyond the scope of this study. However, finding out *how* Latinx bilingual students use their multi-literacies to make meaning in the music domain *is* within the scope of this study
and offered insight into ways in which music as a literacy can be used as a creative, collaborative and critical approach to facilitating school literacies. In the following chapter I look at how music students apply outside literacies to their music practice. In doing so they are engaging in translanguaging acts, approaching learning creatively as they make musical meaning in this cognitive and physical third space.
CHAPTER 6

MUSICKING, TRANSLANGLUAGING IN THE CLASSROOM AND BEYOND:
BRIDGING LITERACIES IN THE MUSICAL THIRD SPACE

Students in this study took a creative and fluid approach to literacy in the music classroom. They not only engaged in the musical literacies taught at the Corona Youth Music Program, but brought school and other social literacies into the music classroom. In this chapter we will see how the music classroom facilitates a cognitive and physical third space where students translanguage to take ownership over their learning. Through translanguaging practices students bridge their multi-literacies and extend literacy learning beyond the classroom.

This chapter is divided into three sections. They are as follows:

1. Musicking as creative translanguaging
2. Transmusicking
3. Transmusicking beyond the music classroom

Students employed all their ways of knowing to make meaning in the music classroom. From what they learned in school, to what they learned from their family and friends, all of this was used as a way of languaging in the classroom.

Musicking as creative translanguaging

This section includes examples of multi-modal creative translanguaging texts generated by students to take ownership of their learning. While students were not assigned to create these texts, they employed these texts in the music classroom bridging their multi-literacies.
One student, upon opening her binder, has several sections for her music, including her music schedule, her old CYMP repertoire, and a section with all the music she is currently working on. Another section (Fig.5.1) has a divider where she has five Emojis, each representing a different feeling (in order from left to right, starting from the top): Beaming face with smiling eyes, Grimacing Face, Neutral Face, Musicking Face, and Grinning with squinting face. There is purpose to the design of this cover. She uses emojis, a digital literacy, to represent different emotions or states of being. Each emoji has a different expression for the eyes and the mouth. The music emotion is the only emoticon that she has added details to. As the emoji listens to music with its headphones on, it closes its eyes, sticks its tongue out if pure bliss, allowing for the notes to swirl around its head. The use of emojis to represent how music makes her feel is further supported by the captions HAPPY & Relaxing Music, the emphasis on happy is made by putting the word in bold and in block letters, followed by a heart.

There is purpose to introducing this external literacy into the music classroom. The visual text is used represents her many musical interests. In this section of her binder, she includes CYMP music, songs like Katy Perry’s Fireworks or Sia’s Chandelier, and music that she has notated herself. The student translanguages, employing her school, social and digital literacies to represent all her music literacies.
She is not the only student to make modifications to her binder. Another student uses an external literacy in the music classroom, using a color-coded method to keep her music organized. On the inside of her binder jacket, she includes a legend (Figure 5.2). She has divided her music binder as follows: *Christmas, Country, Kid’s Music, Hard Music, Start off* (with) *this at home*. When I ask her about her system, she tells me she put Christmas music first, because that is the CYMP music she was working on when she created this. She explains that country, is the fiddle music that she works on at her school. Kids music refers to the music she likes to look up online. Hard music, is the
music that she is working on that she needs to practice the most. "Start off" refers to her warm-up music that she plays when practicing at home. This includes scales and music that she feels confident playing. I ask her if this is a system she learned at CYMP. She tells me that it isn't, that it's something she came up with to keep her binder organized.

This is an organizational skill that the student has most likely learned in school and is applying to her music practice. The student uses colors to signal the different sections. There are page ranges for each section. Hard music, for instance, starts on the 16th page and ranges from 16-17. This student shows that he can apply what he is learning in school into all aspect of his life, including in his musicking. Like the previous student, this student is showing that learning is a fluid process, and that she can use all her meaning-making systems to enact her literacies.

![Figure 6.2 Sheet Music Legend](image)

Figure 6.2 Sheet Music Legend
In her computer class at school, another student creates a word cloud, to represent the things that are close to her heart. She inserts the word cloud in the front jacket of her binder and uses it as a cover for her binder. In her word cloud she includes: Music (Violin, Dancing, and Singing), Reading, Family, Drawing, and Kindness. Nicholas and Starks (2014) note that these visual representations “reinforce[s] the variation and creativity of speakers as they bring together multiple elements of rich and complex communicative resources” (in García & Li Wei, 2014, p.32). Students approach musicking like languaging. They use all their communicative resources fluidly to enact their literacies.

![Word Cloud Map](image)

Figure 6.3 Word Cloud Map
Trans-musicking

Students introduce other genres into the music classroom as they enact ownership over their learning. I often heard students practicing these "outside" songs (such as the cellist playing the rock song, *Seven Army Nation*, at the end of the CYO rehearsal in Chapter 4), alongside the CYMP repertoire or playing it for their friends who often took on the role of willing audience and apprentice. While this practice was not introduced by CYMP, it was not discouraged thereby facilitating a physical and cognitive thirdspace/third space for students. In the following section I analyze the following four music “texts” that students brought into the music classroom:

- *A Thousand Years*, Christina Perry
- *En Tu Dia*, traditional Mexican Folksong
- *Original Student Composition*
- *All of Me*, John Legend

**Text 1. A Thousand Years, Christina Perry.**

One student looks up songs on the internet and writes the notes down on using colorful stationery that she keeps in the jacket of her binder. When she is not rehearsing her CYMP music, she takes out the songs and practices them. When I ask her what her favorite song is, she tells me it is *A Thousand Years*, by Christina Perry. She has heard her mom humming the song and is learning how to play it for her mom’s birthday. As seen in Fig. 4, the phrases are divided into different spaces. The music classroom allowed for this to fluidity occur, especially before rehearsals began as students set up and warmed up their instruments, during rehearsal breaks and at the end of a rehearsal.
Another student keeps the music that she practices with her uncle in her folder. Her uncle plays in a Mexican Cumbia band and was her first real teacher. The music is written on graph paper. Instead of music notes, the uncle uses solfege notes to write the notes down for her niece, written in the key of A.\textsuperscript{13} The sheet music looks worn and there are stains on the paper, signs that the music has been practiced. Still, the sheet music is lovingly inserted in sheet protectors.

\textsuperscript{13} The piece is written in fixed Do and is written in the Key of A, meaning that there is an F#, C#, and G# in the piece. In fixed Do this corresponds to Do#, Fa#, and So#. As seen in 6.5, the uncle has written in these accidentals for his niece in the notation.
However, not all students brought in their home musicking into the classroom. One student separated his school musicking with his home musicking and kept a folder at home. It was only on my request that he brought some of this musicking into the music classroom. Fig 6.6 is one of many songs that he either "composed" or transcribed into his instrument. The student does not use standard music notation writing down the notes as violin fingerings. When I ask him about the composition he says, “I sometimes make my own music. I have at home folder. I draw and I do math and sometimes I write down music.”

This student separates his school musicking with his home musicking and keeps a folder at home. Interesting to note is that the paper choice used by this student for

---

14 The letters in Figure 6.6 correspond to the strings on a violin- G, D, A, E (in order from lowest to highest). The numbers refer to the finger position on each string, which are each one whole step apart. So on the A string A1 is equivalent to B, A2 is equivalent to C#, A3 is equivalent to D.
notation is not school paper choice- it is graph paper commonly used in Latin American countries instead of the ruled paper. The student who was learning *En Tu Dia en LA* from her uncle also used the same paper choice. In using this paper choice, the student is grounding is compositions as a home literacy.

![Student Music Notation](image)

**Figure 6.6 Student Music Notation**

**Text 4. *All of Me, John Legend.***

Students learned how to play songs from their classmates in the music classroom. I observed several instances, where student taught other students how to play pieces, such as Mark Ronson’s *Uptown Funk*, Miley Cyrus’s *Wrecking Bal*, or John Legend’s *All of Me*. Below, one student discusses how she learned to play *All of Me*, by John Legend.
from a classmate during music class and then proceeds to practicing it at home during dinner time.

I heard Moises playing it yesterday

and I’m like, wow that sound really cool!

Can you teach me how to do it?

He said, first you have to do this and this

and I didn’t really remember so well

But then I played one right note,

and I thought wait, this sounds the same,

Ok, I played once, let me try two

and I kept my finger down and I kept running around the notes

and I’m like, this sounds the same

and Moises’s like, just do it three times

all the notes, just do it three times,

and then go to the phrase

and that’s how you do it

I went home, I didn’t really practice

On the table

When I was eating

I eat with my left hand most of the times
mostly with my left
but that day I felt like eating with my right hand
so I just kept practicing

My mom’s like, *are you ok?*

*Are you nervous or something?*

*no*

*Why are you doing that?*

*Oh it’s a song I’m trying to learn*

and she’s like, *ok*

like, *you are a weirdo*

This student sees the many ways in which the music classroom can extend her learning. The music classroom is a place where she learns her instrument and CYMP repertoire but it is also a place where she can learn from her peers. She asks her peer to model the piece for her and she practices it with his guidance. Then she can go home and practice it for herself.

The students in section 1 extend their learning by seeing the music space as a third space/thirdspace both physically and cognitively where they can implement their creative literacy practices to enact their literacy identities. The next section looks at how students engage in translanguaging, transmusicking literacy acts beyond the music classroom.
Transmusicking Beyond the Music Classroom

Students engage in translanguaging practices in the music classroom, introducing school, social and family literacies. Students also reported engaging in these translanguaging practices outside the music classroom with their friends and families. The translanguaging family practices will be discussed in Chapter 10. Sometimes, however, they are just making personal individual choices as in the cases below.

Theme 1. Student Independent Choice

I.
Happy Birthday
When I heard it, I thought it was from D
But it was from low D
Then I already know F and E, so I figured out the rest

II.
Sometimes when I have time
I try to make up my own music
Also without searching it up
For example, the Star Spangled Banner
I do every note to see if it matches
And then I put it together
Also, like Las Mañanitas

III.
I taught myself how to do this music from a cartoon show
Star vs. the Force of Evil
I don’t think you know it
And there’s this classical song I really like

It’s called *The Blood Moon Ball*

I then started teaching myself

Although the students are engaging independent music practices, they are transferring the skills that they learned at CYMP and applying it to their own music making practice and their own interests.

The Internet and social media now provides yet another way in which students can make individual personal choices. The cases below attest to that.

**Theme 2. Social media platforms as learning tools**

Students also used a variety of social media platforms as a resource to develop their music literacies.

**I.**

I saw it on the internet

I saw it was *La Raspa*

So I went to YouTube and the videos,

He had the videos,

He had these videos that were two or three minutes long

And he was with his flute

And he decided to show us what is F and what is E…

**II.**

I look up songs from Mexico on the phone

and you can look up music on YouTube

well, the mentors gave me the idea

**III.**

I have this game called Piano Tiles and the more notes you get,

And then you tap the notes and it goes faster
IV.

She plays songs with me that kind of challenge me

Like Fur Elise

I like how it sounds on the piano

I do the low notes and she does the high

We look up the music online

Social media platforms allow these students to take ownership over their own learning, making individual decisions about the text they will practice- *La Raspa*, the technique they will focus on- working on F# and E on the flute, and how they will pace themselves- *the more notes you get... it goes faster.*

**Conclusion**

When students bring in outside literacies into the music classroom, or vice versa, they inhabit a cognitive thirdspace where fluid languaging and multi-literacies are enacted in the service of learning. These translanguaging practices can occur in all learning domains, as long as students are given a space to engage in these creative and critical practices.

In this chapter I shared examples of students using their digital literacies, their home literacies and their school literacies to perform or even create musical texts. The music bonder became an anthology of the many music genres they play and create independently, with friends and with their families. These creative translanguaging practices, allowed students to extend their literacies into a community of practice where they were valued and had purpose. This speaks to the importance of a formal music instruction that is culturally responsive and allows for the translanguaging,
transmusicking practices evidenced by the Latinx bilingual students in this chapter. The music classroom as a third space allowed students to give value and purpose to their multi-literacies.

Giving value and purpose to the social literacies is especially important for immigrant and first-generation bilingual students whose home literacies do not always aligned with and are often fractured by the literacies of school. As I argue in the following chapter, developing a strong music identity allows students to experience successful literacy identities. This can have a durable and transposable effect on students' habitus and school literacy identities.
CHAPTER 7

CONSTRUCTING LITERACY IDENTITIES THROUGH MUSICKING

This chapter looks at how students construct strong literacy identities through musicking. I argue that developing a music identity strengthens the student's habitus. Musicking helps bilingual students counteract the harmful "struggling-student" narrative so many students in high ELL, low income urban schools inhabit. In this chapter I identify musicking in helping to construct literacy identities in the following ways:

1. Performing emotions- Music equips students with the emotional tools needed to mitigate stress.

2. Developing a habitus of success. Music can help students to develop a confidence that counteracts the struggling narrative they face at school. Furthermore, being perceived as literate in their music practices by their peers and the community impacts their habitus.

3. Building valuable musical identities on social media. Social platforms serve as a powerful third space for students to translanguage and enact their musical literacy identities.

4. Strengthening family cultural identities. Musicking helps strengthen family cultural ties, which give students a stronger sense of identity.

5. Students as agents of social change. Students in this study used their musicking for social impact as will be discussed later in this chapter.
6. Mentoring as transformative practice. I revisit a conversation that I had with a CYMP mentor on her music practices. This conversation reveals the many ways in which playing an instrument has strengthened her literacy identity.

**Performing Emotions**

How we feel affects our habitus, our way of being. In many ways we perform our emotions. How we feel affect how we engage with the world— from our posture and gaze, to how we interact with others around us, and how well we perform a task. It is very important that students in schools feel good, so that they feel that they are capable of meeting the rigors of schools. However, this is often not the case. Students who are struggling in school often develop negative feelings around school and are often left with a habitus of failure. Teachers often describe students who are struggling as being "withdrawn" or as acting out. Therefore the first step to meeting the social and academic rigors of school is for students to develop positive feelings around school.

In this section I look at how music can help students to self-regulate when faced with stressful situations. As one student puts it, “[music] makes me feel in a quiet and peaceful bubble no one can break” In fact, students spoke most about wellness when they spoke about music in relation to how it could help them with school. While some students could identify some specific ways in which music helped them with content area instruction [as discussed in Chapter 5], most did not make music-content area connections. Instead, every single student I interviewed made a connection between music and mental wellness. These connections are presented as the following sub-themes:

1. Self-regulation,
2. Expressing feelings, and

3. Crafting identities.

Schools tasks can perpetuate stress. Music helps these students to mitigate their stress, express feelings and craft healthy identities. Music, students tell me, is important to self-regulate as human beings, the first theme explored below.

**Theme 1. Self-Regulation**

I.

It helps me to *focus*

when I need to do work

I just play music to like *calm down*

And just *avoid* things

that might be *bothering me*

so that I can do my work

and stuff like that

II.

It helps me *calm down*

if I have a test that is hard

so I wouldn’t panic

III.

I’m 50% nicer

cause it *calms me down*

I used to get mad really fast

like if I lost a pencil,

I would get upset
IV.

And every time when I am angry
I just play the recorder or the violin
And it gets my stress

V.

As I play music, I take big breaths
and I clear my mind
and think of the music.

Then I will go back to what I was doing a
and finish it and not be mad
or stressed anymore.

When I hear music or I play music,
It helps me relax
because the music makes me enjoy what I am doing.

Specifically, students voiced how music is a self-regulating strategy that helps them cope with the rigors of school. The student in stanza I notes that music helps her to focus on her work when something is bothering him. In stanza II music helps the student to calm down if she is feeling anxious triggered by school stressors such as a test. The student in stanza III reports being 50% nicer because she can regulate her anger, while the student in stanza IV sees the instrument as a tool that "gets my stress." In stanza V music is a self-regulation strategy that changes the student's feelings around
what he is doing from "mad" and "stressed" to enjoyable. The physical act of breathing into the instrument, helps him to slow down physically, emotionally, and cognitively.

The student states—*I clear my mind and think of music.* Self-regulation is particularly important for students who are struggling to be seen as literate by their peers in school, as it promotes mental wellness.

Music not only helps students self-regulate, but it helps them express their feelings. This is captured in Theme 2.

**Theme 2. Expressing Feelings**

Expressing feelings is an exercise in identity building as the following two writing excerpts suggest. Through writing, the students capture how embodying the music not only helps them to envision the music they play, an important literacy skill, but also helps them work out their feelings. In *Musical City Noise*, a student responds to the writing prompt, *What does playing music mean to you? What role does music play in your life?* The following is a section of her response, which reveals the ways in which music helps her to express her feelings. The full texts appear respectively as Appendix G.

| These are the reasons music plays an important part in my life. If there was no music, how would I express my feelings? How would my imagination be free? Music gives me ideas when I don’t know what to do. Music means family. Music means everything to me. That is why music is an important part of my life. |

---

Text 7.1 Excerpt from *Musical City Noise*, Full text in Appendix G

For this student, music is a way to express her feelings. Feelings are attached to the imagination. Imagination inspires creativity—*music gives me ideas when I don’t know what to do.* The use of the word *free*, signals to the student feeling restricted to engage in
creative practices; her musicking serves as her creative outlet. Music also brings her close to family, to what is familiar, to comfort. That is why music is “everything” and “important.” Without music, this student would not be who she is.

The next text, an excerpt from *Musical Me*, also reflects on the role that music plays in the student’s life. The text appears in full as Appendix H.

Another way music is important to me, is it will actually set up my mood. Normally, when I play a minor scale, or a song with many minors (flats in a song, b), I think about a sad story. When I pay sharps or a natural in a song (#), it will mostly point out a happy/joyful feeling. Some people, may ask “Why do we have to play the whole notes?” or “Why do we have to play these sixteenth notes?” Well, it all depends on the kind of feeling you want to get. For example, whenever I play *New World Symphony* by Dvorak on the violin, there is a section that has 3 C naturals and 1 whole note of Bb (C, C, C, Bb---) that equals seven beats and goes from major to minor and it sounds kind of like a sad song. I like how the feeling changes. When I play an instrument, I feel the mood of the piece.

Furthermore, music is always playing an important role in my life. One way music is important to me is that whenever I play music, I kind of forget whatever happened to me that made me feel sad or mad about. One example of this is whenever I get grounded, or I get a question wrong on a test, or when a family member leaves or dies, I feel sad or maybe even mad. I would just have to play a little music. I would soon be relaxed, and I would have already forgotten about all those things. What it would mostly do is just relax me, so I would have all those things weighing in my mind.

Text 7.2 Excerpt from *Musical Me*, Full text in Appendix H
Similar to the previous student, this student gives music a privileged role in her life, writing that music is "important" and "important in my life." In this text, the student reflects deeply on how music directly impacts her feelings, her mood. How playing brings her to a different place where she can forget sadness, madness, and all those things that weight upon her. Music lifts her sense of being.

Being able to express feelings is not only important for self-regulation, but also to craft identities. This is the third theme identified in the data.

**Theme 3. Crafting Identities**

Below, the student expresses the way in which she goes beyond interpreting music for self-expression, to incorporate composition into her own music practice as a form of self-regulation:

I try to make my own melodies

Sad songs

I start singing

and making up lyrics with words that rhyme

Cause it’s a way to express my feelings
to tell this person how I feel
but they don’t really know
cause I express it in my own way

I give like little clues

It’s like when you read a book
you try to get the little details to get the plot
you try to get the not so important details
and you watch it become something big
and make it the plot

Beyond self-expression musicking is a form of building and performing identity for this student. Beyond “journaling” her feelings, she considers the aesthetic aspect of music, in allowing her to make up lyrics to tell a person how I feel. She makes direct connections to literacy and how little details matter. This student links the way she makes music to the way she reads a book. Through composition she sees herself as an author, as having ownership over her creative literacies which allow her to perform her feelings. Crafting these musical identities help students in developing a habitus of success, as evidence in the next section.

Developing a Habitus of Success

Music is more than just about feeling good. How students feel, affects their mindset. They feel confident and feel like they are part of a community. How they view themselves and how others view them in the different social domains they inhabit is crucial to building a habitus of success. The following sub-themes are addressed by the students in their interviews and written essays:

1. Building confidence,
2. Identifying with a literacy identity as social practice, and
3. Managing being inquieta.

Theme 1. Building confidence

There are different levels of commitment that students make about how they
identify themselves based on the range of markers of modalization (Fairclough, 2003).

I.

It feels like if you are playing in the instrument

It **feels** like you are like you are confident

And it… and you **feel** calm

II.

When I play music

it makes me **feel** like I’m already getting smarter

and that I’m learning so much right away

III.

I look professional, I look mature

when I pick up my clarinet

and play for an audience

It makes me **feel** important

In the context of the music domain, playing an instrument allows them to build

and speak to identities of success. In “becoming” the instrument—*it feels like you are playing in the instrument*, she experiences confidence. In stanza II looking professional and mature makes the student feel rehearsal. The students in these stanzas modify their

statements with **feel like**. Instead of saying I am getting smarter, the student in stanza II says—*I feel like I am getting smarter*. The student in III makes the declarative

statements- *I look professional, I look mature* to describe her external appearance, but internally the student does not commit-*It makes me feel important*. This might point to a

habitus of success that has not yet transferred to the school domain.
IV.
Something in my brain actually works
And that you can do much more in life
I have different categories in life
Like music is one that means so much
Unlike home chores which is another
Karate is another

The student in stanza IV points to music as a cognitive third space. The student perceives music as impacting her cognitive ability—*something actually works*. It leads her to think about the future (irreas statement)—*and you can do much more in life*, opting to you the pronoun *you* instead of I.

The following stanza comes from the *Musical City Noise* text and shows how music has transposable effect in her school identify.

V.
If I can get on stage
and sing and play in front of an audience
I can speak in front of my classmates
But it is not enough to feel individual confidence. As the theme below shows, students develop a habitus of success within a musical community where their musical participation is appreciated.

**Theme 2. Identifying with a Literacy Identity as Social Practice**

The confidence gained from playing an instrument is directly linked to being a successful participant of a musical community. It is not enough to play an instrument.
Confidence comes from enacting this literacy in a social domain as is voiced by the following students:

I.

I learn how to communicate with others … carefully

and to be a better listener

I learn from others.

II.

Well, it’s both

Mostly, when I’m with the orchestra

and I’m playing with them

I feel confident because I’m with my orchestra

And it’s like a whole family going somewhere

And I picture in my mind

And I know we can all do it

Not all the time, I’m picturing in my mind

I’m confident with the paper

and just looking at it

and mostly looking at the conductor

to not mess up

But most of us have to learn from our mistakes,

so it’s ok to mess up
This speaks to being literate only when you are deemed literate in your social domain. The student feels like she belongs to a community that feels like a family. She is accepted by her peers and feels confident enough to see mistakes as learning opportunities. She is not inhibited, and shows that she has a habitus of success. This is how all learners should feel about mistakes, rather than being silencing moments, or moments of “acting out.”

In *Confidence, Education, and Friendship*, the student expresses the importance of community in developing her literacy identities. Music is not just an individual act; it is an act that one does “together,” “practicing together” until the music is “in tune.”

Below I present the text in full.

**Confidence, Education and Friendship**

“Pluck! Pluck! Pluck!” That’s me practicing my violin for my next concert. There are many reasons why music is important to me. Music gives me confidence, music is like having another education and music means friendship.

Music is important to me because it helps with my confidence. I think this because I used to be terrified of getting on stage. In the second grade I participated in the Spelling Bee and the Science Bee and I hated it. I got so scared, I felt butterflies in my stomach. When it was my turn to answer the question, I whispered my answer and started crying! I was so embarrassed, I never wanted to get back on stage ever again.

When I started violin and I found out that I was going to have to get back on stage, I felt the butterflies in my stomach again. I was really nervous. Only this time when I got on stage, I felt confident because I was going to play with my friends.
Another reason why music is important to me because it is like having another education. I say this because I have learned so much from playing violin. I have also learned how to read music, and how to play D Major, A Major and G Major Scale. Finally, I have also learned how to teach others and lead the ensemble.

Finally, music is important to me because it represents friendship. I think this because I have made so many friends from different schools and all of them are unique. My stand partner is Edwin and he is the best. We learned to play the violin together. We practice together and check that we are in tune and are playing the right notes. He is the best to get help from!

These are some of the reasons why the violin is so important to me- for confidence, for education and for friendship. Now I want you to reflect on why music is important in your life and write it out.

Text 7.3 Confidence, Education and Friendship, Full Text

This student sees learning as a social experience. The student connects feeling confident with the encouragement she gets from her friends—*I was really nervous. Only this time when I got on stage, I felt confident because I was going to play with my friends.* Through the violin, she creates a social network that allows her to feel safe so that she can perform on stage. Although, mentioning education as a second reason for loving her instrument, it is again the social aspect-*learning to teach others lead my ensemble* that the student sites as reasons for loving her instrument. The student’s last paragraph is again social, *friendship.* Students' musicking is enacted as a shared experience, as evidenced by the use of we *learned, we practice, we are in tune, we are playing.*

Students are also made to feel literate by their families, as another student writes:
Finally, music is important to me because it brings my family together. When the radio starts playing Christmas carols my family gathers around and joins in the singing. Another reason is my family sits on the couch and asks me to play and they listen to me. My mom likes to record me on her phone and show it to my family that live outside the city. When I start playing, my little sister likes to join in and play lots of instruments like the recorder or even use boxes and pans as a drum. My last reason is that it brings my family together because when I have concert my whole family comes to see me play. My mom likes to record the concert and show it to my family.

Text 7.4 Excerpt from *Musical City Noise*, Full text in Appendix G

“Together” is again repeated in this text. But now the student expresses how her playing music brings “my family together,” a phrase she repeats twice. Musicking is a family affair, and it is one that is then shared with other family members, as the mother records her playing and then proceeds to “show it to my family.” Finally, overcoming being inquieta also emerged as a theme that musicking relieved. This is explored as theme 3.

**Theme 3: Overcoming being Inquieta**

Besides relieving anxiety, musicking has helped the student relieve being energetic, inequieta. In the following stanzas, the student speaks to the effects that being labeled as “inquieta,” someone who acts out, can have on identity, and how music has helped her focus and take the "in" out of "quieta," so she is no longer "inquieta":

I was kind of like that

Like, *I really never* raised my hand up for anything

I was really, I had a lot of energy
always had *a lot of energy*

but I didn’t know how to use the *energy*

So I always got in trouble in school,

*I never paid attention*

*I always moved around*

*I wasn’t*

no estaba….

*Inquieta*

And then my mom was like

Maybe you can choose something

That maybe can like give you something
to actually *focus* on

Something that you are interested in

And I was like, ok then I’ll try

And from there,

I started getting *more focused*
on the things that I was doing

And my mom saw a big difference

Because before then I was really *inquieta*

The narrative shared by the student in stanza III, demonstrates a big shift from the
way that she perceives herself before she started playing music. There is a strong use of negative language- *I never raised my hand, I never paid attention, I always moved around, I wasn’t*. She signals a reason for this- *inquieta*. Using Gee’s Subject Tool, the use of the word *inquieta* in Spanish as opposed to English is interesting. This is something she probably heard communicated to her at home. Still, the word is used to describe actions that were taking place in the school, meaning that her teachers were communicating these behaviors to her parents. Once she chooses to play an instrument the use of language to describe her actions changes - *I started getting more focused*. However, how she perceives her change in her behavior is shaped by her mother- *my mother saw a big difference*.

Social media is an important part of these students’ lives, thus their musicking is tied to how it is performed in social media. The next section addresses how social media has helped students develop positive musical identities.

**Building Valuable Musical Identities on Social Media**

Social media is a powerful place for students to translanguage, and enact all their ways of making meaning. As the following stanzas demonstrate, students use music to enact “Youtuber” identities.

I.
I also like to post on YouTube

Well, I deleted those posts

My friend Diego and I

We decided to do this on Thanksgiving

He came over to my house

He said, *why don’t you create a YouTube account?*
And why don’t you and me post our first video?

II.

I posted me playing the violin

I saw a violin tutorial

I would post a sample first, to refresh my audience

And then I would post the whole song the next week

Campbell (2010) writes about social media and other 21st-century technology ability to,

   bringing about subtle and unpredictable change in children’s opportunities for action through mundane processes of pressing buttons, clicking screens, and watching (and listening) to the images of their immediate world. (p. 222)

In Stanza II the student has gone beyond “pressing buttons” and “clicking screens” and created an identity as a Youtuber with her online violin tutorials. Using other tutorials as mentor texts, she knows how to “hook” her audience, providing a preview first before uploading the whole video. The student uses all five semiotic systems: linguistic, visual, auditory, gestural, and spatial in creating her YouTube video. In doing so, she goes from being a code breaker and text user to a text analyst and text producer (Freebody & Luke, 1990).

   It is also clear from the students’ oral and written narratives that musicking strengthens family cultural identities. This is the topic explored in the next section.
Strengthening Family Cultural Identity

It is my experience that music is one of the most important elements through which a child maintains a stable cultural identity, even when cultural traditions and associated life styles have all but disappeared (Walker, 2006, p 440).

The following student writing response, speaks to the role that music plays in forming a strong cultural identity, especially for first-generation immigrants.

---

**From a Musical Family**

Music is important to our family. It is life.
We all play instruments.
My uncle, plays the violin and composes songs.

He even gives concerts with his children! They play violin, piano, flute and guitar. My uncle’s group is called “Orchestra Tipica de -----.”

When my mom lived in Mexico, she used to dance. I have a photo of her dancing in a white top and a long yellow skirt and a big flower at the bottom.

My sister used to sing and play the flute in school, but now she is in a dance program. Next year, she will go to a dance school in Manhattan. When it is my turn to go to high school, *I will* also go there because they have a music program.

*I want* to learn to play the piano. This summer *I want* to go to Mexico so I can learn how to play the piano from my cousin. I will even be willing to pay him!
When I go to Mexico this summer,
I will jam with my Musical family
I know we will sound really good
because music is important to all of us.

I love being part of a musical family!

Text 7.5 From a Musical Family, full text

This student makes connections to her home, and to Mexico. For this student, music education is largely grounded in her family. Although she learned to play an instrument in school, she sees music as being linked integrally to her family and to her Mexican culture. She knows that there are many different ways of being musical—dancing, playing an instrument, singing, and composing.

She sees her family and their musicking as cultural, human and social capital. Culturally, musicking provides an entry point to various Mexican traditions. She sees human capital in her family, identifying her cousin as someone who can teach her how to play an instrument. There is social capital in that music is a family practice that strengthens her bond with her family.

There is agency and social dreaming in this text, signaled by the use of I want, I know, I will and We will, demonstrating conviction in these future-oriented music practices and imagining different possibilities. Music allows Allison to reclaim “those historical and existential experiences that are devalued in everyday life by the dominant culture in order to be validated and critically understood” (Giroux, 1983 in Freire & Macedo, 1987, p. 157).

Music allows students to perform their emotions as a way to self-regulate. They find success in their playing and through this self-expression, they develop confidence in
their multi-cultural identities. Creating strong musical identities give students a sense that they could indeed be agents of social change, as evidenced in the following section.

**Students as Agents of Social Change**

Musicking not only enacts literacy identities. It helps students to see themselves as agents of possibilities. As one student tells me:

“I feel like I need to share music with other people. I want to inspire others. In a good way, not a bad way. I think my music can do that.” (Fourth Grade student)

Students see music as a social good, meant to be used to for social action and for community impact. In the stanzas below we see students using music to make a difference in their communities.

I.

It means like, it means that it’s like

it is peacefully

music was meant for people

that want to make other people happy

II.

When I was little,

I think I was like 10

When I did the Beatles

We were at the Immigrant Movement

And they were doing some shows for getting money for the other kids

And me and my dad put on a show
My dad was playing the guitar and I was playing the violin
And my sister was singing
And we were playing *Yesterday*

III.
My school was asking for fundraising
because they needed money for the school.
So I was thinking to myself,
if I ask people for money without doing anything
I wouldn’t get money.

So I took out my violin—
But my mom was a little worried and she was like,
*are you sure? Are you sure?*
But I was just like in the train
and a lot of people really liked it.
And they started giving money.

All the way from Queens to Staten Island
I played all the songs from orchestra
and the songs that my dad taught me.

IV.
*Le puede servir a otra persona*
Se lo di a mi vecina
y ahora ella también puede tocar

[It can help someone else
I gave it to my neighbor
and now she can also play]

Music is a literacy that goes beyond aesthetic and personal gratification. The students in these verses see music as a critical literacy. It is a good that can be used for social impact, whether that means making someone happy (stanza I), performance as social action (stanza II, stanza III) or giving another an instrument as capital (stanza IV). One student created an Instagram page with all her musical practices. In it, she highlights the performances at CYMP, the teachers and mentors that have supported her. She also uploads a picture of her playing at the park to collect funds for victims of an earthquake in her family’s hometown in Mexico. She puts up a sign that reads, “Recaudos para Los Damnificados del Terremoto,” [Collection for the Earthquake Victims] a tip jar labeled “Donations” and what looks like bags of clothes behind her.

One of the reasons that musicking inspires social agency is that students that students have musical agency. The performative nature of playing an instrument and sharing it with others gives students musical agency. Also contributing to this sense of social agency is culturally responsive practices at CYMP that empower students to see their musicking as transformative. Students are encouraged to take on mentoring activities, so that music is not just about making music for the self but always about community collaboration. As we will see in the next section, musicking is a transformative practice because it facilitates the development of strong musical identities.
Mentoring as Transformative Practice

In this final section I look at how one of the students at CYMP talks about her experience as a mentor and how this impacts her literacy identity.

It was really good,

they really like me teaching them

Instead of telling them

Oh, you have to do this and this

I expressioned my face

And said, *ok guys let’s start doing this!*

Music instruction goes beyond it being merely “lingual.” The student sees herself as a facilitator. She is not there to *tell* the students what to do but to help students make musical connections. She is there to motivate students, not to tell them what they have to do during practice, but to encourage them—*ok guys, let’s start doing this! She* acknowledges other forms of interactions besides the lingual, the use of gaze—*I expressioned my face* in communicating with her students.

Music also enables a repositioning of role from a not-knowing student to someone who can share expertise, as the following stanzas make obvious.

Ok, to be honest

At the beginning of the orchestra I was a little bit bored

But then I started gotten lightening up

And I started doing a lot of music

And I decided to show the kids how fun it is

how to do it
Using the Gee’s Activities Building Tool, at first, the student is not motivated by this literacy practice as she hasn’t positioned herself as a mentor. However, when she takes on the role of mentor and begins to model for her students—*and I started doing a lot of music*—she understands her role as a mentor in this literacy act. This realization signals a shift in perception of the task assigned—*I started gotten lightening up*. To “light up” mentors develop empathy for their students. Mentors believe in what their mentees are capable of, and use appropriate strategies to involve them, as in the next stanzas. As such, both mentor and mentees are happy, are engaged in their success.

All of the kids were really good-

Funny and a little bit moving a lot,

but respectful

But that’s how kids are

Games, yeah

I used Simon Says

What posture and fingerings

ey they have to do

But I don’t always say Simon Says,

I try to confuse them

And when they make a mistake

I’m like looking at them and smiling

And they are looking at me like,
“what did I do wrong?”
And I look at them,
and then they fix it.

All of them are really happy
and when they see me,
they’re always looking at me
and they’re like “yay”
And whenever I see them,
I really like [teaching] them things
because they are really bright and I really like it.

The mentor uses effective strategies to redirect her students. She uses the game Simon Says to assess how well students understand concepts such as posture and fingerings. She mentors with compassion. She views the students as bright, respectful, and really good. When it’s time to address room for growth, if it’s behavioral she says that’s how kids are. If it is a ‘mistake,’ she says- I’m like looking at them and smiling. Instead of giving them the answer, the mentor gives them an appropriate gaze and wait time, allowing the student to self-correct.

The mentor feels validated by this experience, evidenced by the repeated use of I statements and declaratory remarks- all of them are really happy when they see me; they’re like ‘yay’; I really like it.

Within this empathetic mentoring musicking experience, mistakes are good spaces for learning, and are not considered “errors.” Both the mentor and the mentee
makes mistakes, mistakes that lead to improvement, not shame nor punishment, as errors are often seen in school. This is the theme developed in the following stanzas.

Mentoring helps me how
Yes, I teach them but I also teach myself
Because then I’m like,
“I should have known that”
and I’m looking at the paper
and I’ve been finding my mistakes
and using my mistakes
to tell them what not to do

And then I use the opposite
I then I tell what right to do
And I start finding more mistakes
that I used to do

We were doing this music called
Russian Sailor Dance

And there was this part
When I looked closely
I noticed it
I had been doing it wrong
this whole time!
I was waiting there
And then one of the kids corrected me
I’ve been doing this wrong
this whole time
And then I fixed it
And then we learned from our mistakes

And when I’m in the class with them
I’m also part of that class,
we’re there together

Mentoring helps this student to think critically about herself as a learner- *I’ve been finding my mistakes and using my mistakes.* In doing so, she’s developing new strategies for how to learn- identifying not only strategies that help her learn but also habits that do not help her grow as a learner. Even though she is the mentor, she is open to feedback and aware that mistakes are opportunities for growth. She sees learning as a social practice and embraces all the different roles that the music space facilitates for her music learning. She demonstrates a confident and successful habitus of learning.

**Conclusion**

Fig. 7.1 Tenets of Critical Literacy in *Girls, Social Class & Literacy* (Jones, 2004, p. 74)
When we think of creating a successful space for learners, we need to consider how the student is positioned in the classroom. Figure 7.1 gives us a lens for how students construct or perhaps re-construct literacy identities through their musicking. When thinking about critical literacy, Jones asks us to consider an individual’s positioning, perspective and power. Does the individual hold a central, marginal or even silent role in the classroom? How much power (if any) does the student hold and how much power do the other actors in the classroom hold over the student? How is the student perceived and how do other students perceive them?

In this chapter I have argued that Latinx bilingual students who play an instrument are undergoing some deconstruction and reconstruction of identities in the social spaces they inhabit because playing an instrument shifts the perspective, positioning and power of the different actors in these social spaces, allowing students to deconstruct and reconstruct their identities and enact social action.

Musicking shifts student **perspective** around literacy identities, by feeding the socio-emotional. Music makes students feel good when they are stressed; playing music gives them confidence; playing music helps students to connect with their family cultural identity. Within the context of the music space, students build a habitus of strength which **re-positions** their role in the music space and possibly beyond. As students **reconstruct** their literacy identities they gain **the power** to take **social action**. They display their musical identities on social media, take on mentoring roles in the orchestra, and find ways to use music for community impact. Musicking builds identities of strengths.
Chapter 8

Music, Social and School Literacies: The Role of the Teaching Artist

I interviewed a teaching artist whom I will name Samantha from the Corona Youth Music Program. First I wanted to know what the teaching artist thought about the relationship between music engagement and school literacy. I also wanted to know whether she could identify teaching practices within her teaching that facilitated these literacy connections. Lastly, I wanted to know her perspective on the role the family plays in helping to make these literacy connections. I conclude this chapter by looking at the ways in which Samantha follows a culturally responsive framework for teaching, creating a thirdspace/ third space environment for students to enact all their literacies.

The teaching artist that I interviewed for this study is a Latinx female who has been a teaching artist since the program was first started in 2010. She is a graduate of a top national conservatory who has a deep commitment to providing access to instrumental instruction to all. Her interest in this community is largely due to growing up in Corona and attending elementary school until her family moved to Long Island. She coaches sectionals, occasionally conducts the orchestra, as well as facilitates the mentoring workshops. She also admittedly volunteers her time, providing private lessons to students who are auditioning to high schools or summer orchestral programs. The teaching artist is beloved by the parents in the community who see her as playing a key role in the program.

Perceptions of Music-School Literacy Connections

In this chapter, I first present what Samantha sees as the music-school literacy connections. The teaching artist’s narrative revealed four themes which I address below:
1. Co-constructing narrative,
2. Text to self-connections,
3. Connecting with an audience, and
4. Recognizing the role of effective teaching practices in student learning.

Theme 1. Co-constructing narrative.

Samantha approaches a piece of music as a literacy text and helps her students make aesthetic judgments when interpreting and performing the text. In the following example, she creates a culture of collaboration, asking student to co-construct a narrative for the piece the students are working on,

I started doing storyboards with the kids when I started running orchestra rehearsals

Ok, we are playing this big Prelude

we are playing this music here,

but we’re not-

we can play the notes and the rhythms

we’re musicians

Our job is to tell a story, we are storytellers

that’s our job

What does this music sound like to you?

...let’s start there

and when you get a bunch of kids to contribute their ideas

and you can see if there’s a cohesive idea
or if it’s something for everyone
let’s make a story together
and if it’s not
let’s take five and write a story on the back of this paper
something that this reminds you of

During whole group instruction, the teacher connects musicking to storytelling. She gives them a specific strategy- What does the music sound like to you? She has students engage in collaborative talk, mining for ideas they can use to create a powerful image for the text they are workshopping. For Samantha this also serves as an assessment of whether students have made a connection to the piece individually or collaboratively- you can see if there’s a cohesive idea or if it’s something for everyone.

When students need additional support, she provides another strategy- let’s take five and write a story on the back of this paper something that this reminds you of. She has them reflect independently, slowing down the pace of the lesson, and giving them time to create meaning for themselves. Another music-school literacy connection that Samantha makes is connecting the music being played to who the students are. This is explored in the next section.

Theme 2. Text to self-connection

When we were playing New World

What do you think this piece is about?

a party, a this, a that...

and it also gives you a cue into what these kids are about
what they appreciate
what sticks to them

*It reminds me of a time that I went to the park with my dad*

(ok, that kid has a lot of insight)
you get the chance to know how they would describe things
how you can further talk to them
what kind of doors you can open with them emotionally
there you go, creating that human connection

*oh, today in music we were playing a piece*

*and it sounded and my teacher said it could remind us of anything*

*and it reminded me of when we went to that ballpark dad*

and then that dad is now involved in that class

Samantha knows that students make meaning when they can make personal connections, and that the stronger the connection the more they are going to engage with the text in a meaningful way. She uses these moments to learn about her students and to differentiate instruction that helps them make connections to the lesson. By asking her students to make personal connections, she is extending meaning for her students outside the music classroom, giving the lesson real world connections. She is engaging in critical literacy practices. Further, she recognizes the role the socio-emotional role that the family has in children's learning.
Yet another music-school connection that Samantha makes is the connection she encourages her students to make to the audience. This is the theme explored below.

**Theme 3. Connecting with an audience**

Sometimes during audition prep,

What does this sound like to you?

Does this sound fan farey?

*Yes, it sounds like a King and a queen*

*It sounds processional*

I put a post-it note on their excerpts with the word

And that immediately gets them prepared to play

If they just have to think royalty,

They think, *oh yeah, King Charles the VI*

And that will immediately get them prepared to play the music

and that’s what I like to pass on to my students

because sometimes you are not going to get all the notes,

you are not going to get all the rhythms

and they need to know that that’s ok

that it’s not about that

Because when you are performing

who is really going to count everything you missed?
when you perform you are telling a story
you are taking the listener on a journey

During a one-one session, the teacher activates critical thinking and analyzing, by putting a post-it with the word “processional.” This allows her students to read beyond the notes, making their own aesthetic judgments about their playing. Throughout my observations, I witnessed her students rehearsing with a post-it on their music, as in

Finally, one last theme that Samantha recognizes in her practice is her role in student learning. As the teaching artist, she is part of the journey, as she expresses in the next section.

Theme 4. Recognizing the role of effective teaching practices in student learning

You have to be part of that journey,
otherwise no one is going to take that journey with you
And you have to get into the storytelling too
otherwise if you don’t care [the students] aren’t going to care

…and getting as much descriptive words as you can from them
and it’s repeatedly asked out until I get 20 from them
and I try to feed them to get them sometimes
to get them in the direction we want to go

The teacher sees her role primarily as helping her students make meaning of the text. She models the strategy for her students and thinks of ways to build excitement
around the material. She has to be part of that journey if she expects her students to join
in that vision.

In the next section I focus on ways the teaching artist perceives as effective
musicking teaching. These are the following:

1. Differentiating for student learning style: Music as interdisciplinary,
2. Culture of music rigor
3. Broker with, and part of, community, and
4. Human connection.

I address each of these themes below.

Effective musicking teaching

Theme 1. Differentiation for student learning style: Music as interdisciplinary

The teaching artist noted that she had different approaches to teaching so as to
acknowledge her students’ learning styles.

I try to connect as many school subjects as possible in my lessons
to keep them engaged
so that’s why I don’t teach the same curriculum to everyone

some kids I really get into the physics of how the instrument works
and they are very much into the science of the sound waves
if you tell the kid blow more air and they can’t do that
then we need to think mph
we need the air to come out of our body faster
because how do we have sounds?
sound waves and sound vibrations
So, you do a little bit of a more physical approach

My third grade horn student is very much into science
when we started to talk about those mph and sound waves
she instantly knew what to do with her body
it was pretty amazing

For Samantha, student engagement is key in making meaning and this means tailoring her instruction to meet her student's needs and interests. She understands that embodying music for some is evoking an emotion, painting a picture. However, for others, there needs to be a concrete, kinesthetic connection as is seen with the science arts integration approach. This inter-textual approach allows a student to make meaningful connections between different literacies to make new meanings.

Samantha's frequent inclusion of student voice throughout her interview is evidence that these practices that she is incorporating these practices into her lessons. She also gives concrete examples of the strategies she uses, how she applies them, and how she assesses how well the student understood and applied the concept.

**Theme 2. Culture of music rigor**

So often, we think of text complexity as being the only way to provide rigor. This is especially true in the age of common core, where students receive instruction in higher, more complex reading level. For instance, Charlotte’s Webb is a level R, according to the Teachers College Reading Writing workshop model. Once a fourth-grade level text, the book is now being read by second graders in schools participating in the Ready Gen reading program in New York City schools. This results in student feeling frustrated and habitually experiencing failure in the classroom. In the following section the teacher provides an alternate approach to creating a culture of rigor in her classroom.

I can tell when the kids are exhausted
and I provide them with some relief
I always try to carry a pop song with me
or something sight-readable
in case we can’t get any work done
and their brains are fried
then we just do that

Because that’s music is supposed to do
it’s supposed to refresh you
it's supposed to be a breath of fresh air
you’re not supposed to think of anything else

and whether that audience is you or someone else
you’re telling a story
you still need to tell a story
even if you only know one story
and you can play that note 15 different ways
now you are telling your own story
that’s even cooler

Instead of having her beginner students play a complex passage that will only frustrate her student, she provides rigor by having them practice in their Zone of Proximal Development. By doing so the student feels and is positioned as successful. The student experiences a habitus of success.

Theme 3. A Broker with, and part of community

Using Gee’s Identities Building Tool, we see that the teacher positions herself as a broker in helping her students gain access to the different learning opportunities that are going to make them lifelong music makers and play a strong role in the community. Central to the student’s music making is not the teacher, but the parents as evidenced in the following two stanzas:
They have a lot of pride that their children play a musical instrument and they have a lot of pride that we are taking the time to teach them. They always call me Ms. Teacher. They have so much value with what we do and I think that gets passed on to our students.

While Samantha mostly uses “us” and “we” to signal that she is a partner, an ally of the community, in this narrative there is a shift to the use of the non-aphoric “they” Fairclough (2003). This is done to so as not to undermine the primary role that the parents have in their student’s music education— their passion and perseverance for creating a rigorous musical community. In doing so she reflects on her positionality as an outsider of this community, decentering her role in the student’s learning and re-centering the parent's role in their children’s learning.

Samantha also believes in the power of the immigrant family community, as the stanzas below reflect:

I think that the parents are starting to connect with each other about things that they are struggling with in knowing that they are not alone in this struggle in being here in an immigrant community that’s under threat of gentrification and other enforcing agencies shall we say

I know that gentrification is a huge issue we have numerous students who have had to move out Queens and that’s really hard to see When you think of how vibrant this community is you would think that the city would like to preserve that
and I think that our families are afraid to have a voice
because they don’t want to draw attention to themselves
but I think that they need to be *encouraged*
and that this program should be *encouraging* them to speak out
about their pride, their families, and communities
and to speak about what they’re contributing

Because the world needs to see that
our nation needs to see
how *this immigrant community*
is contributing to our society
and to our greatness

Although she believes that agency comes from within and that her role is that of
an ally to a community under siege from the current economic and political climate, she
speaks of families being silenced- *being afraid to have a voice.* She’s inviting them to
take a central role, acknowledges that they need to be *encouraged* repeatedly, but does
not suggest who should be doing the “encouraging.”

She uses words such as vibrant, pride and contributing when describing the
community. She sees this community as playing a strong role in “our society” and in
“our greatness.” The teaching artist has great awareness of the socio-political context in
which she teaches. As seen in the next section, she uses this socio-political awareness to
teach to make what she refers to as *a human connection.*

**Theme 4. A human connection**
Samantha sees music first and foremost as establishing a connection with her students.

So it's human connection… They're having a very personal experience it is the human connection that keeps on bringing them back. For instance, Roberto texted me for my birthday out of nowhere at 10 p.m. She finds the text stored in her smartphone and reads it to me,

‘I just want to thank you for always dedicating your work and time to me without it I wouldn’t be in MAP or National Take a Stand. Long story short, thank you and I love you’

and that’s not because I have taught her French Horn. That’s because I have always been there for her with or without the instrument. I’ve provided a human connection for a student. I was the person who said, ‘How does that make you feel? Do you want to talk about that?”

Samantha sees building a strong rapport with her students as key to good teaching practices. As I discuss in the conclusion, Samantha employs culturally responsive practices in her teaching.

**Conclusion**


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1. Conceptions of self and others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Teacher sees herself as an artist, teaching as an art.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Teacher sees herself as part of the community and teaching as giving something back</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
to the community, encourages students to do the same.

c. Teacher believes all student can succeed.

d. Teacher helps students make connections between their community, national, and global identities.

e. Teacher sees teaching as “pulling knowledge out” – like “mining.”

Table 7.1 (Landson-Billings, 2009, pg. 38)

Samantha sees not only her playing, but her teaching, as an art. She sees herself as part of the community, having once been part of the community herself and choosing CYMP as a way of giving back to her community. Samantha believes that all students can succeed and employ inclusive practices in the classroom, using differentiation, with culturally responsive teaching strategies that tap into students’ funds of knowledge, allowing them to make connections between their home and school literacies. She fosters translanguaging, allowing students to tap into their interests and make meaning in a variety of interdisciplinary ways.

2. Social relations

A. Teacher-student relationship is fluid, humanely equitable, extends to interactions beyond the classroom and into the community.

b. Teachers demonstrates a connectedness with all students.

c. Teacher encourages a “community of learners.”

d. Teacher encourages students to learn collaboratively. Students are expected to teach each other and be responsible for each other.

Table 7.2 (Landson-Billings, 2009, pg. 60)
Samantha has a strong rapport with her students, which extends beyond the hours of the classroom. She called her students to check on their progress throughout the week, prepared students for auditions, attended their concerts outside the CYMP program and even invited her students into her home for additional lessons.

### 3. Conceptions of knowledge

a. Knowledge is continuously recreated, recycled, and shared by teachers and students. It is not static or unchanging.

2. Knowledge is viewed critically.

3. Teacher is passionate about content.

4. Teacher helps students develop necessary skills.

d. Teachers see excellence as a complex standard that may involve some postulates but takes student diversity and individual differences into account.

Table 7.3 (Landson-Billings, pg. 89)

Samantha and her students engage in co-constructing knowledge. They engage in shared planning lessons and they co-construct narratives to aid in the embodiment of the music they play. She differentiates for her students, considering their interest to scaffold their learning to help students develop necessary skills.

Educators like Samantha who make a “human connection” with families, and employ culturally responsive practices that foster students’ translanguage practices create a third space for social dreaming and transformation.
CHAPTER 9

MUSIC AS FAMILY FUND OF KNOWLEDGE

Neighborhood Vignette: The Sound of Silence

It is August close to 9 p.m. and Flushing Meadows Park is still teeming with people enjoying the last weekend before the unofficial start of Fall. The sun has set and the lamp post shine over walking paths surrounded by meadows. It is hard to see, but there are families finishing up their picnics and barbecues. There are children running around, playing ball and not too far away the unmistakable sound of a live banda playing. I walk towards the sound and find a conjunto of 8 men dressed in uniform—red shirts, dark pants and black sombreros. In the dark, I can make out trumpets, clarinets, a double bass, percussion and a tuba. In front of them, there is a makeshift dance floor created by the picnic tables that surround them on either side. There are five or six couples dancing and several children intermittently join.

After two or three songs I approach the ensemble and they inform me that the family is celebrating their son’s baptism. They play for family and friends who request them on special occasions. As I walk back to the lit path, I recognize one of the guests in attendance, a mother from the school. She is there with her children who are sitting and listening to the performance. She informs me that they are playing traditional music from their hometown of Puebla.

Campbell (2010) writes, “many of the world’s societies continue to advocate the full participation of their members in musical performance and invention” (p. 219). Similarly, the parents of the children attending CYMP share in this cultural expectation, choosing to enroll their children in this afterschool program. At any given time, there is
always a wait list of parents waiting to enter the program. In one meeting I had with the parent coordinator at the school, we were stopped twice because parents wanted to know how they could enlist their children in the music program. To find out more about the literacy practices of students and their families at home I interviewed eight families.

First, in Section 1, I provide a brief description of each of the eight families interviewed. This will be followed by Section 2, discussion of what the parents perceive as the importance of music instruction and the role of music in the family.

Section 1
Family Portraits

Joaquin’s and Natalia’s Mother- Guerrero, Mexico

Smith (2006) writes about the central role of the Catholic church in Mexican immigrants in building networks, advocacy work and relief. It is early on a crisp Saturday morning as I approach a Catholic church in Northern Queens. A banner on the top proclaims, "All immigrants welcomed here." By the steps I see what appears to be bags of clothes that have been left as donations by the front steps. As I approach the rectory, a woman asks me if I need assistance and points me to a large room, the school's gymnasium. There are approximately 50 people, mostly women and children waiting for their children to finish with Saturday school. I recognize the mother from the information session I held at the school and as I approach her she meets me with a warm smile. They are waiting for her son to finish Saturday school and invite me to sit down. Her youngest son, approximately three years old, sits beside her playing a game on her Smartphone. The mother has been connected to the program for three years, beginning with her middle child, her son who is now in the third grade. The daughter, now in the sixth grade, also
expressed interested in joining the program, and although there were no more instruments available, she convinced her father to buy her "un violin baratito" (an inexpensive violin). She is now one of the mentors in the program. The mother always loved music, and though she does not play herself, she always longed to play an instrument that she saw watching bandas in her hometown. When she goes to parent-teacher conferences, teachers always say that the daughter is outgoing and loves to participate in class, while her son is quiet and needs to contribute more to in class. Still both students are doing well across all content areas.

**Sara’s and Alejandra’s Mother- Puebla, Mexico**

Another mother I interviewed is a parent volunteer at the school. She is a single mother and has two daughters in the program. The eldest daughter joined the program five years ago and the youngest daughter three years ago. Although she used to live in Corona and loved the community, she was priced out and had to move to another area in Queens. Priced out again, she moved to Staten Island in a neighborhood that has a large Mexican community. She has a two-hour commute from Staten Island to bring her daughters to the program, via public transportation, which includes taking the Staten Island Ferry and two trains to attend the program.

When I arrive at the school, the girls are leaning against a tree, their violins on their backs, their backpacks on the floor. They are quickly eating their dinner, chicken and rice that their mom prepares for them before going into rehearsal. The mom has already gone inside to prepare for rehearsal. I approach her in between conversations she has with parents regarding rehearsal schedules as well as parents who want to sign up for the program.
I meet their mother in Staten Island for our interview. I take the same route she takes to get her children to school: the 7 train, followed by the 1 train, which takes me to the Ferry terminal in South Street Seaport. There I wait amongst residents and tourists alike. I take a seat outside and look at the city grow farther and farther away. When I reach Staten Island, it has been close to two hours since I boarded the train. I call her and she meets me at the Staten Island terminal and I interview her at a local coffee shop.

The mom reports that the girls are doing ok in school. The youngest daughter, especially, complains of too much homework. They mostly get 3s on their report card.

**Jocelyn and Roberto’s Mother & Father- Puebla, Mexico**

I first meet the Jocelyn and Roberto’s parents during one of the rehearsals. Jocelyn tells her parents about me. I arrange to meet the mother at her house. It is a Saturday afternoon when I arrive at the house, and as I go to ring the bell a boy leans out the window and says *jale* [pull]. I walk up to the third floor where the mother and father greet me; eventually the grandmother also joins us. The family has just experienced the loss of the grandfather, yet they welcome me into their home and both parents sit to talk with me about their musical practices.

For this family, music is truly a musical affair. The father plays the string bass and is part of a Cumbia band, publishing his music on iTunes. He has built a music studio on the first floor of their home. Rehearsals are often held throughout the week and the children have been taking on the role of audience members since they were little. Not until the younger daughter and then the older son begin CYMP, did they become music makers themselves. The youngest daughter, Jocelyn, currently in the fourth grade plays
the clarinet and has been in the program since the first grade. She takes on a mentor role in the household, encouraging her brother, Roberto, a sixth player, to play the violin. Roberto joined CYMP only last year and now plays in CYO with Jocelyn.

The parents report that both children are doing very well in school. They keep their homework and practice schedule and are receiving good grades at school.

**Raquel’s Father- Puebla, Mexico**

Raquel’s father and I meet at Dunkin’ Donuts near the school. The father is from Guerrero, Mexico. Raquel plays the trumpet and has been in the program since the second grade, she is now in the fifth grade. The father states that academics are something that he is not as invested in, as he is responsible for working in order to provide for his family.

The arts are very important to him. From teaching his children Nahuatl, to folkloric dancing, to learning how to play an instrument so that he can music with his children, the father sees the arts as a way to language with his family. The arts are a way to make cross-generational, cross-cultural connections with his family. He models his love for music to his daughter. He learned how to play the *platillos*, the snare drum, so that he could join a band that his friends from back home formed. He often joins his daughter while she practices, looking up YouTube tutorial as they learn to play notes on the trumpet.

A follow-up interview falls through. I have learned that the family has lost their lease and have had to relocate. The daughter no longer attends the program.

**Jennifer’s and Laura’s Mother- Puebla, Mexico**
I meet a mother off-site at a Dunkin Donuts near the school site. This parent has two children in CYMP. Both children are fluent Spanish speakers. The mother reports that both daughters are doing very well in school across all content area. One daughter is in the fourth grade and received all 3s and 4s in the last report card. The other daughter is in a middle school geared towards the arts and maintains an 85 average. Apart from being passionate about music- the daughters practice every day and both aspire to be musicians when they grow up, the oldest daughter loves to dance, and the youngest daughter is involved in karate. The mother is fluent in Spanish and communicates in Mixteco with her mother who lives in Mexico.

Jose’s Mother- Guerrero, Mexico

Jose’s mother, also from Mexico has a child diagnosed with a learning disability and is an ICT classroom. Jose also suffered from health problems, which she believes are exacerbated by the rigor of school. The mother has noted a dramatic decline in health problems since Jose began learning to play his instrument. Jose also loves to draw and paint. He also loves to look up songs online and make up his own music. He has his own music in his folder. When I interview the mother, she tells me he is working on learning to play a song from “The Book of Life” for his mother. Although the mother reports that Jose loves to play music, there is little time to practice the instrument at home and most practice is done at CYMP, which he attends two-three times a week.

Joe's mother is a very active member of the PTA in her son's school. She recently helped to fundraise money for their afterschool programs. They have raised enough money to purchase ten violins and twelve violin lessons.

Diego’s Mother- Oaxaca, Mexico
I meet Diego’s mother in her apartment, on a third-floor walk-up. She has one son in the CYMP program and hopes to enroll the other two once they are older. She is uncertain of the future that awaits her family during the country’s current political climate and sees her son’s ability to play an instrument as well as his bilingualism, his ability to speak Spanish as skills that will help him in the future.

Samantha’s Mother- Guayaquil, Ecuador

Samantha’s mother, is from Ecuador. She is also a parent volunteer at CYMP. Unhappy with her daughter’s progress, she took her daughter out of her local public school and placed her in a nearby charter school, where the mother finds she is doing better academically. She also attributes her daughter’s improvement in grades at school as well as her well-being to the music program. When I first meet Samantha, she is eating by herself apart from the other students. When I approach her to ask her how she is doing, she tells me that her friends are absent.

Section 2

The Role of Music in the Family

… the validation of the experiences of students and the lived practices of households is an important aspect of critical pedagogy. (Gonzales, 2005, p. 41)

In the following section I identify the themes that emerge out of the nine interviews I conducted. I construct stories using the transcripts I created of the interviews that I had with the nine parents. I coded and analyzed the data first, before translating the conversations from Spanish to English (Bonilla, 2011). I provide the original transcript and the English translations side by side for member checking purposes. I omitted sound representations such as "um" and "ah," and false starts to make the text more easily read
(Institute of Oral History, 2001). I create a multi-voiced narrative to identify overarching themes present in amongst the parents in this community.

Three themes emerged from the interviews with parents which I develop below.

The three themes are:

1. Music as home literacy,
2. Perceptions on children’s participation in the orchestra, and

**Music as Home Literacy**

In these cultures, some are seen as ‘good at’ making music, but all normally endowed persons are as capable of doing music as they are of breathing. If they talk, they can sing; if they walk they can dance; and if they can hear or feel the vibrations of musical sound, they can respond to them. Music belongs to many, and they engage in it because they can and because *it is a cultural expectation to do so.* (Campbell, 2010, p. 219)

Music is a Fund of Knowledge for the families in the study. As will be discussed in the following section, CYMP is a program that facilitates the musicking that children from this immigrant community are already encouraged to do. Most of the parents that I interviewed had relatives who played music and were active members of an ensemble. In this section I discuss the following sub-themes that emerged from interview questions around family musicking:

1. Family as music brokers,
2. Musicking as collaborative family practice,
3. Music as family glue: Siblings, parents and grandparents,
4. Las Mañanitas as mentor text, and
5. Music as cultural mobility.

**Family as music brokers.**

Not only did families say they play music but several parents referred to their family members as musicians, implying a certain level of proficiency in their playing.

| I. Mi papá es músico el toca clarinet… el tocaba en una banda. Ellos formaban un grupo muy grande. | I. My dad is a musician… he used to play in a band. They were a large ensemble. |
| II. Entonces eso fue… nada mas veía a sus tíos y a su papa y poco a poco les gusto | II. So that’s how it was… they only looked at their uncles and their dad and little by little they liked it |
| III. De hecho tengo un tío que a ya en mi pueblo el tocaba un instrumento que se llama timbal | III. In fact, I have an uncle over in my town he played an instrument that was called timbale |
| IV. Mi papa toca violín solo es de oído sin notas Música de a ya de mi pueblo, de puebla | IV. My dad plays the violin only by ear, without notes Music from there from my town, from Puebla |
| V. Tengo un primo que bueno él estaba aquí pero el ya se fue Nada más se dé él | V. I have a cousin, that well he was here but he left I don’t know about him any longer |
el tocaba la guitarra
y él le gustaba
y él se inventaba su música
inclusivo la tocaba en la calle
VI.
y a si fue que los niños se enteraron
y me siguieron y les gusto
como los niños son inquietos,
cuando llegaron
Mi niño y mi niña pues llegaron
y querían agarrar
querían tocar los instrumentos
y pues se les presto
y a y me di cuenta que les gusto

He played the guitar
and he- he liked it
and he made up his own music
in fact, he played it on the street.
VI.
and that is how my children found out
and would follow me, and they liked it
since children are
when they got home,
my son and my daughter got there
they wanted to take them
they wanted to play the instruments
and so I lent them to them
and that’s how I found out they liked music

The family members not only play the instruments, but they play music of “the pueblo,” traditional music. Although the genres are different, the instrumentation is the same- the string bass, the violin, the trumpet, the clarinet. As one parent put it,

Desde chiquita estoy escuchando esos instrumentos. El violín, la guitarra, la trompeta...Porque eso es lo que se toca en la música de nosotros, música de banda. Nunca toqué, pero a siempre he querido. Y ahora ¡mire! Tengo dos músicos en la casa. Es muy bonito.

[I grew up listening to these instruments. The violin, the guitar, the trumpet… because this is what is played in our music, banda music. I never played, but I have always wanted to. And now look! I have two musicians at home. It’s very beautiful.]
Families pass down their love for music to their children and in doing so strengthen cultural ties.

Musicking as collaborative family practice.

For the families I interviewed, music is not a solitary endeavor meant to be performed at a certain level of mastery. Music is a social practice where everyone is a frequent participant. Of the nine parents that I interviewed, eight had more than one child enrolled at CYMP or in another music program. As seen below, family members are encouraged to engage in music practices as a means of communication and family bonding.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I.</th>
<th>I.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Llegó el día de la fiesta y yo le dije tu te paras allá y escuchas la canción que te vamos a tocar es para ti no papi yo quiero participar, yo quiero tocar le dije, Bueno, si quieres tocar pues adelante ahi está el trombón y ella lo agarró, el trombón ahí estaba Ella acompañado nos en su festejo pues ahí estaba participando</td>
<td>The day of the celebration came and I said you stand there and listen to the song that we are going to play it’s for you no daddy, I want to participate, I want to play I said, Ok, if you want to play go right ahead there is the trombone And she took the trombone and there she was she was accompanying us in her celebration well, there she was participating</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. A mi gustaría , como tenemos tres hijos
formar una banda    to form a band
que mi esposa toque la estarola,  that my wife play the estarola
mi niña la trompeta,  my daughter the trumpet
y mi otro hijo que sé yo  my other son, I don’t know
los platillos  the cymbals
a lo mejor así en un futuro va a ser  maybe in the future it will be so
sí, eso a mi me gustaría  yes, I would like that to happen

Musicking is described as a social practice. In stanza 1, it is the child’s birthday and she is celebrating, not as a passive listener, but as an active music maker. From the dad’s point of view, everyone can make music, and she is included in the performance. In the second stanza there is a bit of social dreaming. In the future, he hopes to have a band with his children. Music is first and foremost a family practice and is not exclusive to the expert.

Not only do family members play music but as the following stanzas show, family members use music making to engage in storytelling.

I.
¿Si la oyes?
El tema se trata de cuando uno viene
De inmigrante
Y deja la mama allá
¿Si oye el principio de la canción?
II.
Papi cántanos una canción
Mejor les cuento dice
Ah, también cuéntanos un cuento
Él les cuenta cuentos, bueno

I.
Do you hear her?
The song is about coming to this country
As an immigrant
And leaving your mother there.
Can you hear the song?
II.
Dad, sing us a song
I’d rather tell you a story, he says
Oh, also tell us a story
He tells them stories, ok
In the first stanza, a father has composed a song with his cumbia band. He tells me that in the background, his daughter, then in pre-kindergarten can be heard singing *En Tu Día*. The song is dedicated to his mother who lives in Mexico. In the second stanza, the father shares his life, engages in story-telling through singing. In both stanzas, music is seen as story-telling about the immigrant experience. The father in stanza II shares his story with his family, while the father in stanza I shares his story with a larger immigrant community on a digital media platform. Both narratives speak to the transnational identities of immigrant families and the literacies they pass on to their children.

**Musicking as glue to family: Siblings, parents and grandparents.**

Not only did family members serve as music brokers, but children themselves did so too for other members of their family. As Campbell many “many of the world’s societies continue to advocate the full participation of their members in musical performance and invention” (p. 219).

In the following narrative, we see the role that children play in integrating their sibling’s integration into CYMP community. Parents take pride in music being the glue that builds relationships with siblings, as in the narratives below.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I.</th>
<th>I.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Creo, en dos meses el aprendió como dos o tres canciones de la orquesta que él ya sabía. Y él todo el día con la hermanita o sea que ella es la que más le decía No está bien Hazlo otra vez Y ahí estaban los dos</td>
<td>I think in two months he learned two or three songs from the orchestra That he already recognized And all day with his sister She was the one that told him the most That’s not good Do it again And that what the two would do</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y mire ahora, él ya sabe El aprendió más rápido Las notas del violín Y los dos una hora practican juntos</td>
<td>And look at them now, he already knows how to play He learned more quickly The violin notes And the two practice for an hour together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>II.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porque muy rápido estuvo en el mismo nivel - -- que la mayor Estaba haciendo dos cosas, Leía y veía y en parte escuchaba la música o sea empezó después y están en el mismo nivel Son capaces de tocar la misma pieza Y son buenas las dos ¡Y empezó un año después!</td>
<td>Because she quickly caught up - to her sister’s playing ability She was doing two things She would read and she would look on and also listen to the music What I mean to say is, she started afterward and they are on the same level They are able to play the same piece And they are both good And she started a year later!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>III.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Es que fue bien chistoso, ella lloraba porque</td>
<td>And it was really funny,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Having a sibling who was already enrolled at CYMP helped to socialize the child into music. In stanza I, it is the younger sister who motivates, the older brother to play, giving him feedback when he plays and inviting him to practice with her at home. In stanza four the younger brother motivates, the older sister to play. In stanza II, the older sister motivates the younger sister. In all three stanzas, the students undergo this silent period where they observe their siblings in school and at home as they practice. The siblings become models, or mentors for them as they learn how to play the instrument. Although the student in stanza I does not play the same instrument as his sister, listening to her practice has helped him develop prior knowledge of the orchestra repertoire. They benefitted from prior exposure to music instruction and a social approach to learning music.

In the following narrative, the child takes on the role of facilitator or mentor not just for the siblings, but now for the parents:
IV.
En la casa me dice a veces, Pa ven, vamos a practicar y sí practicamos
yo no sé mucho de la trompeta pero sí, ella se siente bien yo agarro y toco con ella …
Ella me enseña sus notas, pero como le digo, no sé nada de notas
yo solo lo veo como va apachurrando las válvulas y bueno también me estoy interesada

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IV.</th>
<th>At home she sometimes tells me Dad come, let’s go practice And yes, we practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>I don’t know much about the trumpet But yes, it makes her feel good I take the trumpet and play with her …</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>She teaches me notes But like I said I don’t know anything about notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>I only watch I watch how you press the valves And well, I am also interested in learning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The father uses the music space as a chance for his daughter to take on a role that will give her agency. He understands that this is important for their habitus- *I don’t know much about the trumpet, but yes, it makes her feel good.* Further, for the father this is an authentic learning experience, demonstrating a real interest in the practice- *And well, I am also interested in learning.* And it is musicking that keeps grandparents near children.

Several parents and their children referenced their grandparents when discussing their musicking. Parents commented that their children played for their grandparents who live abroad when they call them on the phone. Children who have grandparents living in the United States rely on them to take them to CYMP. One parent commented that the grandmother was responsible for taking her children to CYMP, while she and her
husband worked. She also ensured that her children do their homework and practice their instrument.

In the following section I present the role of the grandparents from the parent’s voice.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pero el abuelito de ellos</th>
<th>But their grandfather</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>O sea, mi papá</td>
<td>my father</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Se sentaba ahí</td>
<td>He would sit there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escuchando como practicaban</td>
<td>Listening to how they would practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y luego les decía</td>
<td>and then he would tell them,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Ay niños,</td>
<td>“Oh children,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>creo que nos vamos ir al tren</td>
<td>I think we are going to go to the train</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ustedes tocan y yo junto la limosna,</td>
<td>You will play and I will collect the tips,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>el dinero.”</td>
<td>the money.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is something really powerful in the act of just sitting and listening, especially when there is a trans-generational connection being made. Again, the grandfather, although not playing an instrument is musicking. Small (1997) would argue that by being a figure of encouragement- taking them to their rehearsals, sitting with them while they are rehearsing and engaging in a little dreaming, *Oh, I think we are going to go to the train*- these grandparents are a central figure in grandchildren’s musicking experience.

In these narratives we see that children of immigrant parents are used to participating in a collaborative environment. Studies have found that children often act as language brokers, serving as translators for their parents working together to make
meaning (Orellana, 2009). Vélez-Ibáñez and Greenberg (2005) write that funds of knowledge in Mexican American families are transmitted through thick social contexts. In this social space, “cultural expectation for exchange, expectations that are reinforced by ritual and other forms of exchange throughout the life cycle” (pg. 61). This also happens with music practices occurring in the home. As such, collaborative learning is something that should be encouraged in the classroom.

Another theme that emerged in parents’ interviews about the role of music as home literacy is the importance of one musical composition. Las Mañanitas was brought up again and again as an important mentor text, as described in the next section.

**Las Mañanitas as mentor text.**

Las Mañanitas is a song that is popular across Latin America, especially in Mexico where it is often sung at special occasions, such as birthday parties, baptisms and communions, and almost always performed in a social setting. Four of the nine parents interviewed shared anecdotes around this popular song, as did the students in during their interview. This piece is used as a mentor text for family musiciking. This song was rehearsed by learning to play it by ear, asking a family member to teach them the fingerings, downloading the sheet music online, or looking up a tutorial on YouTube. Through this piece, families were able to create shared meaning and strengthen their family and cultural bonds.

| I. Él le quiere tocar Las Mañanitas para el cumpleaños Me pregunto que lo buscara en el internet, pero no encontramos una manera | I. He wants to play Las Mañanitas for her for her birthday He asked me to look for it on the internet but he could not find a way |
las pudiéramos encontrar las notas para el clarinete.

II.

Normalmente lo que tocamos en la banda se especializa tocar más que nada, es como Las Mañanitas.

Para la imagen, una imagen religiosa normalmente es eso y entre otro tipo de géneros musicales también.

III.

Y este el 23 de Julio 2016 ella hizo su primera comunión y les hicimos una fiestecita y ahí dije ahí vamos a participar vamos a tocar Las Mañanitas y también hay otra música que se llama En Tu Día que también es parte de festejar un cumpleaños y ella emocionada.

IV.

y yo le digo porque no abrimos el YouTube y vemos qué canción vamos aprender y abrimos esa página y vemos Las Mañanitas y lo que estoy entendiendo es por letras lo que es c, d, f, g, e in which we could figure out the notes for the clarinet.

II.

Normally we play in the band. It specializes in playing, more or less songs like Las Mañanitas.

For the image, a religious image normally it is that and other forms of music genres as well.

III.

And July 23 2016 she did her first communion and we held a celebration and I said, that’s where we’ll perform we’ll play the Las Mañanitas and there is another song, En Tu Día that’s also about celebrating a birthday and she was so excited.

IV.

and I tell her why don’t we open YouTube and see what song we are going to learn and we open the page and we watch Las Mañanitas and am able to follow using fingering there’s C, D, F, G and E and well that’s as if I was reading music.
In verse I, the child grounds himself in his home musical culture and wants to celebrate her sister’s birthday by playing Las Mañanitas for his sister. In stanza II and III, Las Mañanitas elicits the religious connection that so many of the families expressed having in their interview. Music and religion have a strong cultural connection (Smith, 2006; Campbell, 2002). In stanza IV, we see the use of Las Mañanitas as a mentor text, since this is a familiar song for both the father and child. YouTube, a visual and auditory learning application provide different entry points for the daughter who is learning to play an instrument in a formal setting and the father who is learning in an informal setting.

Finally, musicking was seen by families as important tools of cultural mobility. This is the last theme that described.

Musicking as cultural mobility.

Mobility implies not merely movement of people from one country to another to make a new life, but the mobility of linguistic and other semiotic resources in time and space… history and location. (Blackledge & Creese, pg. 34)

Like language, music is passed down to the children of the immigrant studies in studies. They have a family of musicians, locally and transnationally that pass down music traditions in a variety of ways. Children too are expected to take a role in the preservation of these cultural practices, as they musick with their families and even teach other family members to play an instrument themselves. The central role that music
plays in the lives of the families in this study affirms Clark’s (2005) finding that banda 
music is meant to preserve a musical aspect of Mexican cultural identity for their 
children.

The importance of languaging through music is exemplified in this narrative, 
where a father uses musicking to strengthen his transnational identity:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ya nos conocíamos</th>
<th>We already knew each other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>por qué venimos del mismo pueblo</td>
<td>because we came from the same town</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>del mismo estado en México</td>
<td>the same state in Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y pues aquí ya nos volvimos a juntar</td>
<td>and then we got together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y este pues se pensó en esa banda</td>
<td>and so we thought about forming this band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>porque a veces extrañamos las costumbres</td>
<td>because sometimes we miss our traditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o las raíces que traemos de México</td>
<td>or the roots that we bring from Mexico</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extrañamos, entonces dijimos que sería</td>
<td>We miss, so then we said it would be a good idea to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buena idea formar una banda</td>
<td>form a band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Esta persona el líder de la banda</td>
<td>This person, the leader of the band</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y el lleva el saxofón,</td>
<td>and he plays the saxophone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y él era el que nos guiara</td>
<td>and he was the one that would guide us</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y la otra persona este lleva el tambor</td>
<td>and the other person plays the tambourine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y también uno escucha cómo va el ritmo del tambor</td>
<td>and also we listen to the rhythm of the tambourine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>and when they invited me,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Unlike the other parents interviewed, this father did not begin to play music until he moved to Queens. Although he is a novice, their historical commonalities allow them to come together in this new music space in the service enacting their Mexican identities. Music is a semiotic resource that facilitates cultural mobility across time and space for this parent and the members of the band.

**Perceptions on Children Participation in CYMP**

In this section I look at families' perceptions around participating in CYMP and playing an orchestral instrument. In the context of culturally responsive music pedagogy, there has been pushback regarding using the orchestra as the main vehicle for music instruction. One of the biggest critiques of the El Sistema inspired programs is that this is a bourgeoisie program that uses a western canon to indoctrinate working class children into middle class values (Bull, 2016). In chapter 5, I argued CYMP does not follow a transmission but a transformative model. That is, it seeks to empower students by giving
them additional tools, not replace their home literacies as a means of community building.

However, is the orchestra culturally relevant to parents? The following four themes refer to the importance that parents attach to their children’s participation in the music program:

1. Musicking as “Orgullo,”
2. Music as Capital: “La Lucha” for a better future,
3. Music as an expensive capital, and
4. The Orchestra: Culturally Responsive?

**Musicking as “Orgullo.”**

Parents often referred to their children’s participation in the orchestra as “muy bonito,” *very beautiful.* They expressed how happy they were that their children were participating in the program. The mother in the interview below reveals a narrative of “orgullo,” *pride.*

| Hemos tenido una experiencia muy bonita | We had a really lovely experience |
| Que así me sentía así como muy orgullosa | That made me feel really proud |
| Es que tuvieron un concierto, no recuerdo si fue en Manhattan o algo así | In that they had a concert, I can’t remember |
| eso fue durante el día | If it was in Manhattan or something like that |
| Y en la tarde nos habían invitado a un cumpleaños | It took place during the day |
| Llegamos a la fiesta | And in the afternoon they had invited us to a birthday |
| We got to the party |
y ellas llevaban su violín
Entonces en el cumpleaños había dos niños mayores que mis hijas
Y ellos, ¿Tocan el violín?
Si tocan el violín
¡Por favor tócanos el violín!
Y mira, las niñas sacaron el violín
¡Y dieron un concierto ahí!
Y la gente grabándolas y aplaudiéndolas
Y luego había un chico tocando la guitarra.
Y él toca la guitarra
Y mi hija tocó el violín
Y era como si ya hubieran practicado
O sea que ya habían tocado
¡Y nunca se había visto!
O sea es algo increíble
Y hasta el chico, este
Después lo volví a ver
y mencionó un video
Me dice, ¿Vio el video?
Dije, no vi nada

and they had their violins with them
So at the birthday party there were two children
Older than my daughters
And they said, you play the violin
Yes, we play the violin
Please play the violin for us!
And look, the girls took out their violin
and gave a concert on the spot!
And people were recording and clapping for them
And then there was a guy playing the guitar
And the guy was playing the guitar
and my daughter the violin
And it was as if they had practiced
That is to say as if they had already performed together
And they had never even me!
That is, it’s something incredible
Even the guy
Afterward I saw him again
and he mentioned a recording to me
He said, did you see the video?
I said, no I haven’t seen anything
The narrative is highly evaluative and expresses the mother’s admiration for her daughters’ accomplishments. There is the repeated use of *increíble* and direct speech—*Es increíble, su hija es una maestra* [It’s incredible, your daughter is a maestro], or presented as declarative statements—*O sea es algo increíble* [I mean, it’s something incredible].

The parent narrative also reveals this idea of transmusicking. The children are successful music makers on their violin in a different social setting than the orchestra. They also play in a different genre and on demand. In doing so they can extend their knowledge across different genres and social domains.

**Music as capital: Lucha” for a better future.**

Music builds bridges of meaningfulness between home and school experiences as well as between academic abstractions and lived sociocultural realities. (Abril, 2013, p. 7)

For the parents below, playing music is about “la lucha” for a better future. They see music as central to their children’s education. There is *worth* as music is a social capital that becomes a human capital for the children. There is agency in “la lucha.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I.</th>
<th>I.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Es un poco loco, ¿no?</em></td>
<td><em>It’s a little insane, no?</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Venir de Staten Island hasta Corona</em></td>
<td><em>To come from Staten Island to Corona</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Pero todo es el esfuerzo por la música</em></td>
<td><em>But all that effort is for music</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Porque yo sé que vale la pena</em></td>
<td><em>Because I know it’s worth it</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o sea les estoy creando digamos un medio futuro para mis hijas</td>
<td>That is, I am creating a means for a future for my daughters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A mí me preocupa que en un futuro que yo no le pueda pagar la educación o sea, que ellas estudien una carrera bien pagada</td>
<td>I worry that one day I will not be able to pay for their education That is, that they do their studies in a well-paying career</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pero yo siento que por lo menos yo estoy haciendo algo</td>
<td>But I feel that at least I am doing something And with that something they will be able to quote the orchestra’s motto, “play and persevere”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y con ese algo ellas van a poder</td>
<td>That is, they now have a weapon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>como la frase que tienen en la orquesta, “tocar y luchar”</td>
<td>and that is their violin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O sea, ellas ya tienen un arma y es su violín</td>
<td>They already have something powerful which is music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ya tienen algo poderoso que es la música</td>
<td>So with that, I feel like we are halfway there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entonces con eso, yo siento que estamos a medio escalón</td>
<td>We are halfway there</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estamos a medio escalón</td>
<td>II. I work, their dad works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>They have everything they need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yo trabajo, tu papá trabaja</td>
<td>Bread for all</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No les falta nada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Un pan para todos</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Tienen comida

“Y para que a ustedes no le falten nada
Nosotros tenemos que trabajar
O sea que échenle ganas a la escuela
Vayan a clase de música”

III.

Si les digo
ya les dimos la lucha
ya de estar en este país
Tal vez por lo mismo del hogar
Pueden llegar a ser estudiosos en hacer

Y tienen muchas oportunidades
como el profe,
ahorita ya ese programa
y le digo a mis hijos que es gratis
y aunque uno dice

uno pues se la gasta el tiempo
en una o otra cosa
porque así nos decía su papá
que ustedes van par acá
que ustedes van para allá

They have food

“And in order for you to have this
we have to work
So, try your best at school
go to music class”

III.

If I tell them
We already gave them the fight
Of being in this country
Maybe for the same reason the home
They can become well studied

And they have lots of opportunities
Like the teacher (director of CYMP),
Now that program
And I tell my kids that it’s free
And even though one says

One, well wastes times
In one thing or another
Because that’s what their father would say
That you’re going here
That you’re going there
Parents see themselves as central to their children’s education, and that includes their music education. The mother in stanza I recognizes her contribution in the long commute she makes to get to the program and says “les estoy creando digamos un medio futuro para mis hijas” [I am creating a means for a future for my daughters]. The mother in stanza II refers to being hard working parents- *y para que a ustedes no les falten nada nosotros tenemos que trabajar* [And in order for you to have anything missing, we have to work]. The mother in stanza III frames her narrative with this concept of "la lucha," the struggle. There is the struggle to migrate to this country. The struggle to provide a good home- *tal vez por lo mismo del hogar* [Maybe for the same reason the home]. There is even a struggle to validate music education to her husband as evidence by the use of an *I*- statement to support her struggle— *le digo, yo le dije a él…* [I tell him, I let him know].

Parents see great worth in music, a powerful tool in education. The parent in stanza II does not distinguish between day school and music school— *o sea que hechen*
le ganas a la escuela, Vayan a clase de música [We have to work so, try your best at school go to music class]. So too does the mother in stanza IV who fundraised money to buy violins for her son’s school. For the mother in Stanza III, music is a weapon for her daughter to “tocar y luchar” [play and persevere].

**Music as an expensive capital.**

Music is a Fund of Knowledge for immigrant families but learning how to play an instrument is seen as an expensive capital. For many families, playing an orchestra instrument is cost prohibitive unless they have access to a program like CYMP.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I.</th>
<th>I began looking for piano schools</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Me empecé a buscar las escuelas de piano</td>
<td>And I found one, but it was very expensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y encontré una pero era muy caro</td>
<td>So I couldn’t pay for it</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entonces yo no lo podía pagar</td>
<td>Because I would have to pay for the piano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porque aparte tenía que comprar el piano y pagar por las clase</td>
<td>and for the classes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>II.</th>
<th>II.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>apenas este año,</td>
<td>Just this year,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lo que es la presidenta de la comunidad</td>
<td>the PTA president</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ellos juntan dinero</td>
<td>we fundraised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>haciendo muchas actividades</td>
<td>during several events</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>el PTA</td>
<td>they work really hard</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ellos trabajan muy duro</td>
<td>I and am one of the mothers on the PTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y yo soy parte de las mamás</td>
<td>and we have to do several things to see in and I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>que se integra ahí</td>
<td>am part of the moms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y este hay que hacer varias cosas</td>
<td>and we have to do several things</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>para ver en que área los niños necesitan,</td>
<td>to see in what area the children need,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>que cosas necesitan</td>
<td>what things they need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y este año compraron violín</td>
<td>and this year they bought violins</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>están pagando mucho para que un maestro</td>
<td>they are paying a lot for a teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>les dé a los niños 6 clases de violín</td>
<td>he gives the children six violin lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>después de escuela</td>
<td>afterschool</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pero es muy limitado</td>
<td>but it’s very limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo los escuchaban</td>
<td>They only listened</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solo los veían</td>
<td>They only saw them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pero no eran curiosa</td>
<td>But they weren’t curious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Como yo siempre fue una persona</td>
<td>Since I was always a person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Que no dejaría que tocar nada</td>
<td>that wouldn’t allow them to touch anything</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No pueden tocar porque si ustedes tocan lo dañan y eso cuesta</td>
<td>You can’t touch because if you touch something, you will break it and it’s costly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O que sé yo</td>
<td>Or what would I know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entonces se crecieron como no tocar</td>
<td>Then they grew up knowing not to touch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puedo ver, pero no puedo tocar</td>
<td>I can see, but I can’t touch</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As noted by the mother in stanza I, not only do parents have to pay for lessons, they are also responsible for paying for the instrument. The mother in stanza II explained to me that while the school has a music program it was a general music classroom where children were learning to play the recorder. In this narrative we consider not only the cost of purchasing the instruments but also hiring a teacher or teaching artist to provide weekly lessons. While the parent in stanza III has an instrument, the fear of breaking an instrument is so great, that the parent does not tap into their funds of knowledge to teach their children an instrument. While many public schools now provide music at the elementary school level, few have a band or instrumental program. This is a huge disservice to these immigrant communities where families have music as a fund of knowledge but the cost becomes a barrier to access.

**The orchestra: Culturally relevant?**

Parents, while aware that their children were not learning the same genre of music that they grew up with, did not seem to resist the difference in genre. In fact, they were very aware of and embraced their children’s bicultural selves. When speaking to a mother and father,

No hemos tocado junto
En si a ellos no le gusta el género de la cumbia
En la orquesta
Les digo y ellos no  
No los puedo convencer  
Para mí, con tal de que estén aprendiendo música está bien

Yo le digo, a ti te gusta la cumbia  
Y a mis hijos les gusta la música clásica  
Por eso ya es lo que les gusto  
Ya es diferente  
Ellos lo tocan así con notas, y ustedes a lo que caiga.  
Porque no es con notas.  
Es solo lo que escuchan, es que empiezan a tocar.

[As is, they do not like the cumbia genre  
In the orquestra  
I ask them, and they say no  
I can’t convince them,  
They play like that, with the notes (referring to her children)  
and you (referring to her husband), however you can.  
Because it’s not reading notes, it’s only listening to each other,  
that you begin to play.]

The families I spoke with saw cultural connections to CYMP. Although the genres were different, they saw cultural and social connections. As I mentioned before, this is a community that is very literate on banda music, which traditionally includes orchestral instruments such as the violin, the trumpet, and clarinet. Secondly, families embrace this translanguaging or transmusicking because this is something that immigrant families already do in the hybrid spaces they inhabit. Children of immigrant families embraced all their musical identities, making connections between them to transmusick.
Last, provides the equity necessary for students to engage in the transgenerational, transmusicking practiced in these transpaces, as voiced by the families in this case study.

**Perceptions of Music-School Connection**

To conclude this chapter, I look at parents’ perceptions around music engagement and school literacies. Many of the themes that parents identified were similar to those identified by students and the teaching artist. They are here discussed as follows:

1. Self-regulation,
2. Building stamina,
3. Developing flexible thinking, and

**Self-regulation.**

Mental wellness is essential to school readiness, something children were able to identify for themselves during the interviews. Parents too pointed to the relationship between music engagement and mental wellness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Cuando hace la tarea</th>
<th>I. When she does her homework</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>se pone los audífonos</td>
<td>she puts on her headphones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y empieza a cantar</td>
<td>and starts to sing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>como que se relaja ella misma</td>
<td>she seems to relax herself</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Desde primer grado,</td>
<td>II. He’s had intense pain in his stomach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>muy intenso su dolor de estómago</td>
<td>since the first grade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>y no le encontraron nada</td>
<td>And they couldn’t find anything</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o sea por eso ha sido una bendición</td>
<td>That’s why this has been a blessing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>de vez en cuando le duela la cabeza</td>
<td>Once in a while he will get headaches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pero no tan intenso</td>
<td>but they are not as intense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>III.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Como que no ser explosivo</td>
<td>To not be explosive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tal vez en cualquier momento que le digan ciertas cosas</td>
<td>Perhaps in a situation where they may say some things to him</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Que él se altere como que la música le ha enseñado a estar tranquilo</td>
<td>from having an aggressive reaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>porque en la música tiene que estar tranquilo</td>
<td>It’s as if music has taught him to remain calm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>o sea ser pasivo, escuchar</td>
<td>because in music you have to be calm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>eso sí lo tienen</td>
<td>that is remain passive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>listen that he is able to doing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Building stamina.**

Parents view music as helping their children with their **stamina**, to perform a task for an extended period.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spanish</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Y hasta ahorita</td>
<td>And until now,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ellos no bajan las calificaciones</td>
<td>their grades haven’t dropped</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ellos van muy bien en la escuela</td>
<td>They are doing very well in school</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

223
El niño por lo mismo sea por lo mismo
La mente lo tiene en la escuela
o en la música
II.
Pero hasta ahora
se esfuerza más
y vi que cuando empezó más días
en la música
y eso como que le ayudó
III.
Pues yo creo que
la música hace que se relaje más
hace que el cerebro se concentre más
el cerebro es como una máquina
Que lleva más ritmo en la lectura,
en la escritura y todo

According to the parent in stanza 3, music allows her child to establish a rhythm that allows her to be more focused and more relaxed in her schoolwork. The idea that music helps students to find that personal tempo that they need in order to tackle school tasks successfully is reminiscent of Gardner's idea of music as a cognitive organizer.

Flexible thinkers.
Parent’s made connections between music and the brain. Parents mentioned hearing a special report in the news or reading about the benefits of music on the brain. For example, this parent tells me that not only is music for cognitive growth but also for social growth.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spanish</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yo creo que les abre más la mente</td>
<td>I think it opens their mind</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Les deja más flexible para pensar más rápido</td>
<td>It allows them to be more flexible, quick thinkers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porque antes pensaban diferente</td>
<td>Because, before they thought differently</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Su manera de pensar era más lento</td>
<td>Their way of thinking was slower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pero ya están más abiertos</td>
<td>But now they are more open</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>También aprenden a convivir con más gente</td>
<td>They also learn to coexist with more people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>conocen más gente</td>
<td>they get to meet more people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creo que por eso tienen mejores calificaciones</td>
<td>I think that’s why they have better grades</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Porque la mente es más abierta</td>
<td>Because they are more open minded</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This parent describes being open minded as a cognitive and social trait. Cognitively, being open minded means being flexible and quick—so perhaps being able to come up with multiple ways of approaching a problem. Socially, the parent sees the collaborative nature of playing in an orchestra as helping them to embrace diversity and work well with
everyone. Being open minded cognitively and socially has helped the student to acquire school literacies - *Creo que es por eso que tienen mejores calificaciones* [I think that’s why they have better grades].

**Home-school disconnect.**

Some of the parents discussed the disconnect that seems to exist between the home and the school. For example, there was a sense of powerlessness in this father’s inability to help his daughter who is struggling in school. This speaks to the barriers to school that exist for many families.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Como que en la escuela ha bajado un poquito,</th>
<th>It seems like in school her grades have somewhat dropped</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>yo a veces le quiero ayudar</td>
<td>I want to help her sometimes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>como persona o como hombre</td>
<td>As a person, or as a male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>estoy más dedicada al trabajo</td>
<td>I am more dedicated to working</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>entonces no tengo mucho tiempo</td>
<td>So I don’t have too much time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>en estar con ella</td>
<td>to spend with her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Está solamente mi esposa</td>
<td>It’s just my wife</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>He visto que si ha bajado un poco</td>
<td>And I’ve seen that yes,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pero cuando yo puedo</td>
<td>her grades have dropped a bit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pues ahí la ayudo y trato de motivarla</td>
<td>but when I can</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a que eche ganas</td>
<td>well, I help her and try to motivate her</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a que se enfoca en su responsabilidad</td>
<td>to try her best</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

226
If we juxtapose this to the parent’s earlier discussion of his role in his daughter’s learning, we see two polar different approaches to the child’s education. When discussing his daughter’s music, dance and native language learning, he sees himself as a partner in her learning. He teaches her dances from his native Puebla. He sits with her while she teaches him how to play the trumpet, using YouTube as a tool for learning. He records her progress on his smartphone, reflecting on her progress. There is agency and *orgullo* in these practices.

In the next stanzas, he is describing his involvement in teaching his daughter Nahuatl,

De hecho, como somos varios que vivimos aquí hemos tratar de rescatar ese dialecto que hace como dos años se había formado un pequeño grupo de niños habían como ocho o diez niños y se juntaban en una casa de una de mis personas y el propósito era eso

In fact, the couple of us who live here want to try and rescue this dialect so that about two years ago, we formed a small group of children there were eight or ten children and they would get together in one of my friend’s house with the purpose of that
de inculcar el dialecto a los niños
empezaron con la numeración del uno al
diez
y los niños,
vaya que si se lo aprenden rápido!
pero no sé exactamente por qué lo dejaron
ya no han seguido impartiendo esas clases
pero vamos a ver este año
a lo mejor seguimos

to instill the dialect to the children
they started learning numbers from one to
ten
and the children,
how quickly they were able to learn!
But I don’t know why exactly, we stopped
There are no more classes
But we will see how it goes this year,
we will most likely resume them

There is agency in this father’s voice as he talks about rescuing his language and co-
constructing knowledge with his daughter through all these different modalities.

However, when he talks about his daughter’s school education there is use of qualifying
language. He uses words like but, well, and I don’t. He states “como persona o como
hombre estoy mas dedicado al trabajo,” [as a person or a man I am more dedicated to
work] and “no tengo mucho tiempo en estar con ella,” [I don’t have a lot of time to spend
with her]. Seeing what happens in school as something foreign, he distances himself
from his daughter’s learning.

**Conclusion**

I would be remiss if I did not say that there was concern about the future with the
parents interviewed. In four out of the eight families interviewed, some parents cited the
price of rent as a means for concern. One of the parents I interviewed was actively
searching for an apartment. Another parent had moved three times in the last few years as a result of the rising rental prices. One parent voiced concern about the current political climate, citing the possible need to return to Mexico.

Despite these stressors, families embody the orchestra's motto: "Tocar y Luchar" (Play and Persevere). In a time when there is increasing silencing and fear among immigrant families, especially from Latin American countries, to have a community whose self-expression is sound is a pretty defiant act. The families in the study show us that inhabiting this third space does not necessarily mean living in "liminality." As families navigate this contentious political and educational climate they use their funds of knowledge to foster literacies for their families. The arts and language connect to the culture of the home, to school, and empowering families by giving them a voice in their child's education. Learning happens multi-modally and fluidly and families use all their resources to co-construct hybrid identities as immigrants and children of immigrants. Music is part of their funds of knowledge but so is what they are learning at CYMP. They use both resources and in doing so they translanguage, seeing the orchestra as growing their repertoire of literacy skills. In this way music is a both a cultural and social capital.
Chapter 10

FINDINGS, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND NEXT STEPS

Every day I go outside I love to hear the city noise, but I don’t think of it as
city noise, I think of it as actual music (Musical City Noise, Appendix G).

Take the 7 train, dubbed the “United Nations” or the “International Express” into
Queens on a Monday morning and you will hear a confluence of languages as each stop
is an opportunity to meet people from all corners of the world. Get off at Junction
Boulevard with students and parents on their way to the many schools in the
neighborhood and you will hear Colombian salsa coming from the panadería [bakery], a
Mexican Cumbia playing from the ladies selling avena [oatmeal], and bachata music
from a livery driver parked on the corner of Roosevelt Avenue, queuing up to pick up
passengers. Traffic is especially heavy in the morning, as cars get off the nearby highway
and make their way down Roosevelt avenue; school buses stop traffic altogether, honking
their horns for students to come out from their homes; traffic agents shepherd pedestrians
crossing the street. Sounds crescendo and decrescendo as trains pull in and out the
station overhead adding to the multi-sensory and bustling city soundscape of Corona.

Dissertation Recap

The students who live in the immigrant community of this study employ a
multimodal way of navigating this vibrant neighborhood. This study looked at the
musicking practices of students and their immigrant families as valuable literacies that
are used to translanguage across all social domains. In chapter 4, I focused on literacy
moments in the music classrooms that were representative of the ‘creative and critical'
literacies that were often witnessed at CYMP. In chapter 5, I identified music literacies
that can also serve as school literacies. In chapter 6, I looked at how the musical domain facilitate translanguage, allowing students to approach literacy creatively and thus employ all their ways of knowing to make musical meaning. In chapter 7 I looked at how students' musical identities help them create a strong habitus for success, essential to developing strong school identities. In chapter 8, I write about the teaching practices of one teaching artist at CYMP, looking at how she uses culturally responsive pedagogy in her classroom. Finally, in chapter 9 I discuss the role that families have in students' music literacy and identities. In this final chapter I summarize the key findings, provide recommendations and next steps for research. I begin first by discussing the key findings.

**Section 1. Key Findings**

While I provide a summary of the findings at the end of each chapter, in this section I identify six big "take-aways" from this study. These will be presented in the following order:

1. Musicking facilitates creative and critical literacy acts;
2. These literacies address the Seven Common Core Capacities;
3. Literacy acts and identities are fostered in music classrooms when a culturally responsive model for music instruction is in place;
4. Providing formalized music education for the Latinx Bilingual population is a social justice issue;
5. Families are the motor for students’ musical languaging;
Finding 1. Musicking Facilitates Creative and Critical Literacy Acts

... translinguaging enables us as speakers to go beyond traditional academic disciplines and conventional structures, to gain new understandings of human relations and generate more social structures capable of liberating the voices of the oppressed. (García & Li Wei, 2013, p.42)

There is a fluid way of learning evidenced by how the students in this study enact their multi-literacies in the music classroom. Students enacted their multi-literacies creatively and critically in the following ways:

- **Engaging in collaborative practices to perform literacy acts and literacy identities.** Students create communities of practices, forming their small groups to enact their literacy identities. They work collaboratively when they rehearse together, teach each other songs, and give each other feedback. In these communities of practice they feel and are seen as successful in their musicking and build strong music identities.

- **Embodying music through envisionment.** Students envision their musicking and often make self to text and text to text connections to embody the music they play.

- **Applying meta-cognitive strategies to their musicking.** Students tap into meta-cognition, employing self-monitoring and self-correcting strategies during rehearsals as well as independent practice. This includes developing practice routines, scaffolding their learning, self-assessment, self-reflection and peer feedback. In this way music was shown to be a privileged cognitive organizer for the students in the study.
• **Seeking challenge as a source of motivation and flow.** Challenge motivates students. They like to push the tempo of the music they play, they set goals to practice challenging music, they seek new music online independently, and in doing so they maintain a state of flow where they grow their stamina as they get better at their craft.

• **Extending learning beyond the physical classroom.** Students music beyond the classroom. They music with their families who are the motor for their musical identities and they use social media platforms as a resource for the repertoire they play and the music they create. They use music as a tool for social action, performing to fundraise for causes that are close to their hearts. In musicking outside the classroom they extend their literacies.

• **Engaging in critical and transformative literacy practices.** Students see beyond the printed notes on their sheet music and consider the role that music plays in their lives. They consider their positionality in the orchestra and are repositioned as central in the music making practices of the different music communities they inhabit. In this way, music is a critical and transformative literacy practice.

• **Transmusicking to make musical meaning.** Just like student’s translanguaging does not belong to a language system, music making or musicking does not belong to the music system itself. It is in human action (expression) and social practice, that musicking occurs. Children are part of many musical domains and rather than keeping these domains separate, like language, they have a fluid way of moving through these spaces to enact their musical identities. Students sing songs with their friends and look up sheet music to play for their families. They
compose melodies in standard or invented notation. They play the instruments they are learning at CYMP or play magic piano on their phones. They practice in formal rehearsal settings independently or with their friends. They play at home with their families or entertain their families at celebrations. Students possess a toolbox of music making strategies they use across various musical third spaces. In doing so, students in this study engage in transmusicking practices enacting their multi-literacies.

Since we are in an era where being school literate is defined by the Common Core State Standards, the next section looks at how the practices observed in this study address the Common Core Reading, Writing, Speaking and Listening Capacities.

**Finding 2. Creative and critical literacies facilitated in the music space address the seven Common Core Capacities**

The Common Core Standards, which dictates school literacy, lists seven capacities for students to be College and Career Ready in Reading, Writing, Speaking, Listening, and Language. These creative and critical literacies that occur in the music domain align with the seven Common Core Capacities needed to be college and career ready which are as follows:

1. Demonstrate independence,
2. Build strong content knowledge,
3. Respond to varying demands of audience take, purpose and discipline,
4. Comprehend as well as critique,

---

5. Value evidence,
6. Use technology and digital media strategically and capably, and
7. Understand other perspectives and points of view.

Below, I provide evidence for how the students in this program are meeting the seven capacities.

1. Demonstrate independence

a. Students can, without significant scaffolding, comprehend and evaluate complex texts across a range of types and disciplines, and they can construct effective arguments and convey intricate or multifaceted information. Likewise, students are able independently to discern a speaker’s key points, request clarification, and ask relevant questions. (p.7)

Students in this study can independently select and perform a variety of texts using various self-monitoring and self-correcting strategies. They can make meaningful connections to the songs using these texts for a variety of reasons (ex. self-regulation, perform with others, entertainment, mentor others, social impact). By seeking out challenge, they maintain engagement as they build independence and expertise.

b. They build on others’ ideas, articulate their ideas, and confirm they have been understood. (p. 7)

If we consider “others’ ideas” as the music written by composers, then we can say that students interpret other’s ideas when they engage in practice and rehearsal sessions, interpreting the music through decisions around dynamics, articulation and tempo. In an ensemble, students listen to their sections and across sections, knowing when they need to complement their peers and when they need to stand out.
Through performance, either for small audiences (self, friends or family), large audiences (concert), or unknown audience (YouTube), students are able to confirm that their musicking has “been understood.”

2. More broadly, they become self-directed learners, effectively seeking out and using resources to assist them, including teachers, peers, and print and digital reference materials. (p. 7)

Students are self-directed learners in the music space, independently musicking across cultural and physical spaces. They use a variety of resources—teachers, parents, siblings, grandparents, friends and social media to assist them in their music making practices across different social domains.

2. They build strong content knowledge

Students establish a base of knowledge across a wide range of subject matter by engaging with works of quality and substance. They become proficient in new areas through research and study. They read purposefully and listen attentively to gain both general knowledge and discipline-specific expertise. They refine and share their knowledge through writing and speaking. (p. 7)

Students engage in deep exploration of their music as text through independent, partner and whole group practice. Driven by a deep state of flow, these texts were often performed after 3-4 weeks of practice. Students are motivated by rigor and were able to explain why during their interview. As a result, they continue to grow as musicians, gaining specific expertise. They refine their knowledge through group rehearsals and independent practice. They share their knowledge through writing, speaking and performing for others.
3. They respond to the varying demands of audience, task, purpose, and discipline

a. Students adapt their communication in relation to audience, task, purpose, and discipline. They set and adjust purpose for reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language use as warranted by the task. (p. 7)

Students are very aware of their audience and adapt accordingly. They know when they play to entertain, to mentor, for self-reflection, for evaluation, or to impress a friend or family member. They also use different strategies to convey different ideas. As one student says, *I play a note in many expressive ways in a measure.*

b. They appreciate nuances, such as how the composition of an audience should affect tone when speaking and how the connotations of words affect meaning. They also know that different disciplines call for different types of evidence. (p.7)

Students are aware of dynamics, tempo and other technique. They see these as essential in the pursuit of telling a story through music. They think about their audience and understand that music is not a solitary practice but a communal practice, meant to be shared and enjoyed by all.

4. They comprehend as well as critique

Students are engaged and open-minded—but discerning—readers and listeners. They work diligently to understand precisely what an author or speaker is saying, but they also question an author’s or speaker’s assumptions and premises and assess the veracity of claims and the soundness of reasoning. (p.7)

Students seek to make meaning of their musicking. Students can explain why they are able to make strong connections to some songs, and why they cannot make
personal connections with other songs. They can critique and adjust technique using music terms such as breath, dynamics, and tone.

5. They value evidence

Students are engaged and open-minded—but discerning—readers and listeners. They work diligently to understand precisely what an author or speaker is saying, but they also question an author’s or speaker’s assumptions and premises and assess the veracity of claims and the soundness of reasoning. (p.7)

Students are aware of basic instrumental techniques and the importance of posture. They describe various emotive and expressive qualities of their musical repertoire. They can use music terminology. They can determine appropriate musical responses to the visual (notation), oral, and physical (gesture).

6. They use technology and digital media strategically and capably

Students employ technology thoughtfully to enhance their reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language use. They tailor their searches online to acquire useful information efficiently, and they integrate what they learn using technology with what they learn offline. They are familiar with the strengths and limitations of various technological tools and mediums and can select and use those best suited to their communication goals. (p.7)

Students used social media in a variety of ways. They looked up tutorials, created tutorials, and created social campaigns on social platforms.

7. They come to understand other perspectives and cultures
Students appreciate that the twenty-first-century classroom and workplace are settings in which people from often widely divergent cultures and who represent diverse experiences and perspectives must learn and work together. (p.7)

They have an anthology of repertoire which made up of their various musical cultures. The music in their binders represent the CYMP music, their family’s culture, and their own children’s culture.

**Finding 3. Literacy acts and literacy identities occur in culturally responsive communities of learning**

The traditional instrumental music education paradigm has been highly critiqued for following a transmission model, whereby the teacher is providing knowledge to “empty vessels.” However, from my observations and my interviews I witnessed a culturally responsive program that embraced culturally responsive practices. Rehearsals were often students centered, encouraging inquiry and student talk. The students took ownership over their learning, taking on leadership positions in the orchestra as mentors, regardless of their level of expertise.

**Culturally responsive teaching practices in the music classroom.**

Teachers created a culture of respect as evidenced in the observations and conversations with teaching artists, the CYMP director, students and families. In *The Dreamkeepers: Successful Teachers of African American Children*, Landson-Billings (2009) provides three tenets for culturally responsive pedagogy.

1. **Conception of self and others.**

The teaching artists observed saw music as a social empowerment tool. They saw music as a social capital that families already own and the community orchestra as a tool
for enacting their music literacies. By giving parents and students key roles in the orchestra, they showed they are committed to enacting this vision of social empowerment. Teachers believe that all students can succeed and employ inclusive practices in the classroom, using differentiation strategies to meet the needs of all their students.

2. Social relations.

The teaching artist I closely observed had a strong rapport with her students, which extended beyond the classroom. She called her students to check on their progress throughout the week, prepared students for auditions, attended their concerts outside the CYMP program and even invited her students into her home for additional lessons. Students readily took on mentoring roles, regardless their level of proficiency.

3. Conception of knowledge.

Teaching artists and their students engaged in co-constructing knowledge. They engaged in shared planning lessons and they co-constructed narratives to aid in the embodiment of the music they played. They differentiated for their students, taking into account their interest to scaffold their learning.

**Mentoring as a transformative literacy practice.**

Culturally responsive practices allow for transformative teaching. It allows students to engage in the translinguaging practices that facilitate authentic learning that makes the orchestral experience meaningful. Students see themselves as agents of social change, when they use music to fundraise or encourage friends and family to play music. The mentoring model where students can share knowledge creates a transformational space for students to share and create knowledge and to enact their bi-musical identities.
These instances of social transformation occur because of the non-competitive community of practice model, which is a culturally responsive pedagogy practice for the Latinx bilingual child. Instead of competition, a focus on rigor shows how challenge generates student engagement, a state of flow is activated and learning occurs.

**Colonizing the music of the colonizer.**

There is a very compelling argument that the orchestra colonizes indigenous music and that it indoctrinates the working class into middle class values. I think that this argument is very one-dimensional as it doesn't take into account the fluidity of music making and the potential for music as social capital. If we were to make the same argument for why students shouldn't learn the standard English language of schools, this would be a great disservice for students who need to acquire this language variety to succeed in school. Instead, we need to encourage students to approach language creatively, creating an extensive toolbox for languaging to facilitate multilingualism and multi-literacies. I argue that student music practices aren't being colonized; rather these spaces allow for a growing repertoire of literacies that foster their trans-musical identities.

It is also argued that most of these orchestral programs are mostly composed of females to indoctrinate them into middle class values (Bull, 2016). CYMP has a distribution of 60% female and 40% male. However, it could also be argued that as an all Latinx, predominantly female orchestra, this make-up challenges the predominantly male and all white orchestra in the United States and around the world. It provides the orchestral experience that many low income and students of color attending inner-city
schools do not have access to. This program is addressing the issue of equity in the arts.

**Finding 4. Access to formalized music education is an issue of social justice**

If children are inherently musical and music is a fund of knowledge for many of the families in the study, then why formalize music education? Campbell answers this by stating,

> While children are musical without expert guidance, they become more musical as a result of it. Their lives are enhanced through instruction in and through music as they become all that they can musically be- and more human as a result of knowing music at many levels, in many guises. What children musically do and say is the launch for further development. (Campbell, 2010, p. 248)

While children are already musical, they need access to the resources and that will allow them to turn their musicking into social capital. Simply put, they need access to a good education. Students need access to resources such as instruments, good teachers, and a culturally responsive curriculum so that they can strengthen their music literacy and make connections to school literacies.

The students at CYMP extend their learning from the orchestra into the community as they take on leadership roles in the orchestra, used music as a tool for social impact, and create musical communities outside of the orchestra.

**Finding 5. Families are the motor for musical languaging**

Families are the motor for musical practice. Immigrant families bring with them a variety of languaging resources or funds of knowledge that are grounded in culture and history. Music has a strong connection to their faith, holidays, and family gathering. Most families have several family members who played a musical instrument, some even
as paid musicians. Music also facilitates trans-generational and trans-national ties. Last, families engage in active forms of music making so that they are highly performative.

Families are highly involved in their children's music education. That's because music has intrinsic value. From traveling long distances to assist CYMP, attending weekend rehearsals and performances, ensuring that children practice, serving as parent volunteers, and celebrating through music at home and at family gatherings, parents in this study show great investment in their children's music education. Parents express "orgullo" in having their children participate in the orchestra. This creates a positive habitus not only for the children in the study but for the families as well, who feel that they are contributing to their children’s education and *la lucha* (struggle) for a better future.

**Finding 6. Music spaces contest liminality, repositioning students and their families in the community.**

The families in the study show how inhabiting a third space does not necessarily mean living in “liminality.” As families navigate this contentious political and educational climate they use their funds of knowledge to foster literacies for their families. Learning happens multi-modally and fluidly and families use all their resources to co-construct hybrid identities as immigrants and children of immigrants.

While music is part of their funds of knowledge, CYMP is key to enacting this fund of knowledge. As an expensive capital, families expressed relief that they had access to a tuition-free program that also supplied them with an instrument. Further, students transferred what they learned at CYMP into their communities of practice. Some students reported performing at family functions, using the skills that they learned
at CYMP to play across different music genres. Another student used what he learned in the orchestra to join a Mariachi band, earning income through his musicking to support his high school expenses. Families use both resources and in doing so they translanguage, seeing the orchestra as growing their repertoire of literacy skills. In this way music is both a cultural and social capital.

Section 2. Recommendations

In this section I make the following recommendations for instrumental music instruction in public schools:

1. Include music as part of the multilingual ecology of a school,
2. Promote family engagement in the schools that taps into Funds of Knowledge,
3. Create a P-12 Music Continuum,
4. Allow for Inter-visitations,
5. Implement culturally responsive practices in the music classroom, and
6. Debunk the talent myth.

Recommendation 1. Include music as part of the multilingual ecology of schools

An ecology of local language practices and perspectives would mean… that local language practices are a set of activities dynamically integrated across physical, social, mental and moral worlds. From this perspective, therefore, we are not trying to find a relationship between language and the world, language and the mind, language and society… but rather asking how it is they were ever separated. (Pennycook, 2010, p. 130)

So often educators complain of a lack of engagement between the home and schools. Yet so many of the parents that I interviewed, while expressing a disconnect
with schooling, were so invested in their child’s musical endeavors. Heath et al. (2001, p. 15) refer to performing arts as, the “third area between school and family.” Regardless of English language proficiency, music is a universal language allowing families to engage in their child’s schooling.

This can look like,

● Using music as a tool for generating student writing across the genres. Have students compose their music lyrics or instrumental compositions, embedding this work in units of reading and writing.
● Using songs from different cultures as a mentor texts to engage in close reading strategies.
● Bringing in family members and people from the community to share their music practices in school.
● Using music as entry-point for establishing school readiness.

Recommendation 2. Promote family engagement in the schools that taps into funds of knowledge

Find ways of enabling the young to find their voices, to open their spaces, to reclaim their histories in all their variety and discontinuity… [with attention] paid to those in the margins. (Maxine Greene, 1995, p. 120)

There is so much critique in education, especially in music education, that teaching is not student-centered enough. The orchestral space creates an organic platform to do just that. Creating student and family mentors is key to bridging home and school literacies, and establishing a social transformation model for instrumental ensembles. For instance, having student mentors facilitated rehearsals and sectionals
shifted the role that students have at CYMP as central in this learning community. Next steps, would be to strengthen family engagement through music. So many of the families in the studies are musicians or expressed a deep interest in playing an instrument. Having a family orchestra where parents and children could music together in a school setting could be very helpful in making that home-school connection and strengthening family engagement in schools. While this may not be feasible due to budget constraints, there could be other ensemble arrangements that could facilitate this kind of family work. For instance,

- Have family and community members come in and facilitate workshops. There is so much capital in the community: guitarist, violinists, trumpet players. Regardless the level of proficiency, they are a community of music makers
- Families could construct working instruments as is already done with the paper orchestra model
- Recorder and classroom instruments ensemble. This is an inexpensive to bring in parents and have them engage in musicking with their children.
- Family choir. There is a parent choir at CYMP.

**Recommendation 3. Implement a p-12 Continuum**

While there has been a big push to increase the arts in New York City, there is still little evidence of an increase in access to instrumental learning. So many of the programs work to expose students to the arts, and even then it is a very piece-meal approach, providing instruction in 6-8 week cycles before moving on to another art. While this is important in developing the well-rounded student, and providing art as wellness, there is also the need for students to grow as music learners and develop
expertise. Many of the students and families I spoke with attested that while music instruction in school was often provided in the elementary classroom it stopped in middle school. The New York City Arts in Schools Report seem to support this observation.

Further, many of the specialized middle and high school arts programs require a certain level of expertise, creating real barriers to entry. This is similar to the barrier to entry that occur for low income students of color in specialized high schools, where more affluent students are enrolled in weekend and Saturday prep program creating an unfair advantage. When you look at specialized arts schools, like LaGuardia Highschool and Frank Sinatra Highschool, or the highly subsidized Saturday music programs such as the MAP Juilliard program and the Jazz at Lincoln Center Middle School Academy, the expectation is that students already have a strong arts background.

One way to counteract this would be to provide "boot camps" that would prepare students with repertoire and lessons needed to pass auditions as a way to ensure access to all learners. There needs to be a p-12 continuum by thinking about music education as complementary and integral to being college and career read.

**Recommendation 4. Encourage Inter-visitations**

An unexpected, but unsurprising finding, were the culturally responsive teaching practice of the teaching artists at CYMP. Their socio-critical, socially responsive approach to teaching this almost entirely immigrant community is what makes this program a strong ally for the community. Both the classroom teachers and teaching artist would benefit from seeing student engagement in another context where student learning is taking place. They can ask,

- **How are students positioned in this space?**
● *What practices are in place that are facilitating this level of student engagement?*

● *What multi-modal practices can I incorporate into my classroom?*

**Recommendation 5. Adopt culturally responsive practices in the music classroom**

Some teachers include repertoire representing what has come to be known as “multicultural music.” Exactly which cultures they include is primarily a personal choice and might not necessarily reflect the community in which the school is situated. It is often intended to serve as an introduction to music from around the world instead of the music of the students’ own world. (Jones, 2006, p. 2)

I argue that multi-cultural pedagogy in the music classroom goes beyond playing “multi-cultural” texts and the orchestra does in fact lend itself to the cultural practices of this community. Families I spoke to saw CYMP as a way to tap into the musical literacies that are hard to access because of economic and institutional barriers. Having formal music education helped students develop the skills necessary to engage in musicking. I think back to the student who joined a mariachi band after learning how to play the violin at CYMP. The student who teaches her father how to play the trumpet, learning songs like Lightly Row and las Mananitas. The two sisters who engaged in spontaneous musicking at a birthday party, discovering their musical voice in a new genre. These students transmusick, using what they learn at CYMP as their extend their other cultural literacies. Still, more can be done to bridge these practices and dialogue around how to trans-music, embracing both home and emerging school, social, and digital music literacies.
Recommendation 6. Debunk the talent myth

“The danger comes when people perceive talent as a rare genetic endowment and then question the use of instruction for the untalented masses.” (Campbel, 2010, p. 217)

Western culture considers musical ability as inherent, something that individuals are predisposed to, not something that is learned. Even many music educators believe this. In Talent is Overrated, Colvin (2010) writes about a research study in England that polled educators across various subjects on perceptions around talent. Results found that 75% of all music educators consider the ability to play a concert instrument, to compose or to sing, a gift or talent. The response rate was higher, when compared to teachers of other subject areas (p. 17). Scripp et al. (2013) argue against the idea that music is inherited, either genetically, culturally or environmentally, because it leads to inequitable access to music education in our schools (p. 58). Educators need to refrain from using words like talented, gifted, genius, God-given, natural, special, aptitude and proclivity, and instead view music ability as "acquired expertise" (p. 60). Further, he views music as a social endeavor and argues that talent, "is a word with strong roots in ‘innatism' that has long existed in our culture of individualism" (p. 95).

Shinichi Suzuki, a music education innovator of the 20th century saw innate talent as an “unscientifically substantiated and superstitious view” that needed to be discarded from the language around music learning (Suzuki, 1983, p. 38). He developed teaching methods based on the ability of all children to learn the natural language of music. While Suzuki used talent when describing music ability, he believed that all children could gain
music ability as long as they had appropriate resources and teachers who implemented their best teaching practices.

The belief that talent determines musical ability is not culturally responsive. Music is not genetic, it is social.

**Section 3. Next Steps**

In thinking about how to extend this research, the next step would be:

1. **Study other communities of practice**

   The Mexican population in this community has a rich arts background. Was this a singular experience or would I have seen similar results in other immigrant bilingual/multilingual communities?

   Looking at other musical ensembles besides the orchestra is also important. This study looked at the orchestra, but does not argue that this is the only instrumental ensemble that will allow for the fluid musicking needed for creative literacies to emerge.

2. **Study in-school instrumental programs**

   There has been a lot of hype about the increase in arts funding in NYC public schools. Has there been a change in the number of instrumental programs in high immigrant, low income schools? Are these programs facilitating a music continuum or are they more about exposing students to the arts? That is, are these programs giving students in low-income, high immigrant communities musical agency? Are these programs helping students to develop social and human capital, or are they more about meeting a state mandate? Further, are these instrumental programs adopting culturally responsive or sustaining practices that allow for the collaborative and the non-competitive space witnessed at the Corona Youth Music Program?
3. Observe music students in the classroom

In this study I argue that students are repositioned in the classroom as a result of developing their musical identities. I observed students in this study take on a central role in their learning and learning communities and from interviews. I also had parents and students discuss the role that music played in their school. However, a study which looks at how students are positioned in the classroom and if there have been any changes since beginning to play an instrument can give further insight into the durable and transferable effect that a strong music habitus can have on a student’s learning identity.

4. Consider the role of the classroom Teachers in learning identity

The role of the teacher in students feeling they are successful learners in the classroom is significant. Looking at how teachers perceive students who perform a musical instrument is a worthwhile endeavor. Do teachers’ perceptions of their students change when they learn that students have this “talent?” Further, teachers would be a great way to help triangulate data by identifying the ways in which music helps their students in meeting the demands of the classroom.

5. Look at impact of music instruction on Emergent Bilinguals.

This study looked at bilingual students, students who spoke at least English and Spanish. It did not look at the musicking practices of emergent bilinguals, students whose native language is Spanish and are in the process of learning the English language. These are the students who are most likely to be silenced in the classroom, as they have yet to acquire the English Language of the schools. How can participation in an instrumental program help students to develop the literacies valued in schools?
6. Mentoring as transformative practice

Repositioning students in leadership positions in the music classroom shifts the practices in the orchestra from transmission to a transformative. In future studies, I would look at the musicking practices of middle and high school students. While most of the mentors at CYMP were middle and high school students, I was unable to interview them because they were out of the parameters of my study.

Conclusion

It’s like a language that can’t be spoken
It can be spoken
But it’s mostly spoken over an object,
an instrument
Sometimes it’s spoken over a song,
over another language
That’s what music basically is,
It’s inspiring
It’s just magical

- CYMP student

The way in which students and their families languange around their musical practice is inherently poetic. When students spoke about their musicking, words seemed to flow like the notes from the instruments they play. This signals to how strongly they felt about their musicking and supports this dissertation’s view of musicking as literacy practice.

This study looked at what happens when you bridge school knowledge with home knowledge. The students in this study were participants of a very formalized form of instruction - the orchestra. Yet, CYMP’s culturally responsive approach to learning music
allowed for beautiful hybrid literacies to emerge as students translanguaged in this third space. The orchestral space also promoted student’s leadership skills, repositioning students as central to their own learning and to the orchestra’s growth. In this third space, students were free to bridge their multi-literacies and identities, translanguaging in the service of meaning, enacting critical literacies and creating a strong learning habitus.
References


Foster, M. (2010). The power to know one thing is never the power to know all things:


New York City Comptroller Scott Stringer *Culture Shock: The Importance of National Arts Funding to New York City’s Cultural Landscape* March 2017


New York City Department of Education. Division of English Language Support and


in cognitive sciences, 11(9), 369-372.


(2004). Are some children more gifted for music than others? In


Villenas, S. (2010). The colonizer/colonized Chicana ethnographer: Identity, marginalization, and co-optation in the field. W. Luttrell (Ed.) *Qualitative


Zenatti, A. (1969). Le Développement génétique de la perception musicale...

Centre national de la recherche scientifique.

http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/3A4AEC4C-14BD-49C4-B2E6-8EDF5D873BE4/213766/201516DemographicReportv5FINAL.pdf
Appendix A

List of lessons observed

1 Flute lesson
1 French Horn Lesson
2 Strings Lesson
6 Orchestra Lessons
4 Mentoring Sessions
1 in school performance
1 Seminario
3 outside performances
Appendix B Student Interview Questions

I used the protocol from Campbell’s Song In their Heads (2011), Appendix 2 as mentor text for developing my student interview protocol.

**Interview Protocol- Student**

Name of student:

Pseudonym (assigned by me for the report):

Gender:

Age/grade:

Interview Setting:

Classroom Teacher:

**General Questions**

1. How long have you lived in your current home?
2. How long have you attended your school?
3. What do you like most about school? Least?
4. What do you like to do outside of school?
5. What are you really good at?
6. What will you be when you grow up?

**Musical Questions**

1. How does music make you feel?
2. Is music important to you? Why?
3. Think back to your favorite piece to play? What does it make you think of? How does it make you feel?
4. If you were trying to convince a friend to play your instrument, what would you say to persuade her to learn to play?
5. What do you like about CYP?
6. Can you tell your favorite moment at CYP? Why?
7. Do you also have music in your school? Tell me about that.
8. Do you play any other instruments besides the ______?
9. Do members of your family play a musical instrument? Which one(s)?
10. Do you make music with your friends? Family?
11. What do you really want to know about music?
12. Do you think music makes you be a better learner? How?
13. How do you think music helps you in school?

Before I play with a partner or in an ensemble, I get ready by.... When I am playing with my ensemble, one thing that I do make sure that I blend with my group is to...
Appendix C Parent Interview Questions

**Interview Protocol- Parent**

Name of Parent: ______________

Pseudonym (assigned by me for the report): ______________

Parent of ______________________

Gender: ________________________

Interview Setting: _____________

**General Questions**

1. How long have you lived in your current home?
2. What languages do you speak at home?
3. What do you like most about your child’s school? Least?
4. How is your child performing in school?
5. What other after school programs is your child involved in?

**Music Questions**

6. Why do you bring your child to CYP?
7. What do you like most about the program?
8. Do you or any members of your family play a musical instrument? Which one(s)?
9. Do you listen to music as a family?
10. Do you make music with your family? How?
11. How do you think your child’s participation in a music program helps your child?
12. How do you think this music program specifically helps your child meet school requirements?
13. Have you noticed any changes in behavior or school performance since your child began attending CYMP?
Appendix D Teaching Artist Interview Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Artist Interview Questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>● Tell me a little about the community that you work in.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● How do you engage your students in music making practices?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● How do you engage your families?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● What strategies work best in your class for your students?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● After defining Thirdspace theory for the artist ask, <em>How is music like a thirdspace?</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● How do you bring in student’s own musical interests? practices?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● In what ways do you see music helping student socially? academically?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● How do you/ does the program include students’ cultural backgrounds?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● What challenges exist for you? For your students/ families in participating in this program?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix E Sample Full Length Parent Transcript

Al principio estaba con los dos y todo esto. Y este, y el maestro llego para que miraba y le iban a dar violin a la nina. Y dice mija, yo la lleva con la senora. Yo quiero estudiar violin, yo quiero la clase tambien.

Pero es que no tienen violin, y el maestro decia que no tenian violin. Porque apenas estaban empezando. Y le dice el maestro. Esta bien dice. Si tu puedes conseguir un violin tu entras, tu puedes entra.

Y le lloro a su papa. Le dijo, llo quiero un violin, llo quiero un violin y le compro uno baratito

Y a si fue como ella entro a y, a las classes de violin

Es que fue bien chistoso, ella lloraba por que queria entrar

Ella iba a las clases. Como ella estaba mas grande, tenia 9 años llo creo Y se quedaba en las clases a escuchar. A mirar como iban los pequenitos Como les iba ensenando a los pequenos. Y mirando como agarar el violin y todo eso Para que ella aprendiendo.

La maestra le dio la oportunidad de entrar a esas clases. Y es chistoso y ahorita mire que le sigue gustando hasta ahorita. Le puede server a otra persona. Ahora esta ella ofreciendo a otra persona. Se le quiero dar a otra persona por que.

No, no tocamos instrumentos. A nosotros le gusta la musica.

Su papa igual. El tambien le gusta la musica. Nunca pense que fue haci. Mi deseo fue a mi me gusta la musica a mi siempre me gusta mucho. Cuando llo los dormia.. Les gusta esa musica.

@student tambien tiene violin. Y llo no le dije a la maestra. Y asta que no le dio el clarinet.. Y ahora me dice Ms.-- que le va muy bien.

El le pone mucho empeno. Yo lo digo que lo del violin si fue como un poquito mas distraido. Pero no mas dieron el clarinet y el solito mami dice ya aprendi una nota todos los dia que va dice mami mejor la nota osea que como a el le entusiasma que lo puede hacer.

Yo les ponía musica porque yo miraba en la tele que decían que eso les ayudaba relajar.. Asta esta fecha porque dicen que les ayudan en su cerebro. Yo no recuerdo muy bien como lei la informacion pero dicen que les ayuda bastande cuando estan el las panza.. Y ahorita cuando estan mas grandes yo les pongo igual la musica. Y aunque ese nino se tiene un poquito. Otra vez esa musica… pero les gusta. O cuando estaba chiquito.. Osea
que les llama la atención. Per en mi nunca pensé que le gustaba tocar instrumento. Es una experiencia mus bonita.

Las canciones de México.. Arron Roni. Como las rondar. Son canciones que usas

Llo me e dado cuenta que mi hija esta estudiando y escuchando la música. Cuando estamos en misa, el padre esta dando el sermón. Eso le ayuda

Y encluso e escuchado que esto es bueno. Les ayuda a abrir la mente, a ser mas abiertos, a no ser tan encerados.

Incluso su papa les dice. Papi cante nos una cancion. Mejor les cuento dice
A también cuenta nos un cuento. El les cuenta cuentos bueno como de su vida
Pero como con una ideo como de para ellos. O también les canta como canción pero no es la canción exactamente si no que el le pone letras extras osea que como el le cambia las letras y el dice otras cosas
Y cosas que a ellos que les gusts que les haga como una canción con ese ritmo pero que tenga otra otra forma de ver letra.

Ose que a sido hasta difícil. Incluso a su papa no le llame mucha atención los instrumento y todo hace pero aun así los apoya. Y a veces incluso cuando van mal y que no hacen caso les dice
Ya no vas a ir a la clase de música entonces. Y a final de cuentas es la mama que sale y dice no, si tienen que ir. Porque también dicen que es una forma de recreación. O están muy solos. Mejor que estar llendo de a qui para alla.

La como esta un poquito grande ella se va solita. Si bastante. Tengo un primo que bueno el estaba aquí pero lla se fue. El tocaba. Y el le gustaba y el se inventaba su música. Nada mas se de el…

El papa le gusta mucho el football pero ellos no mucho. Que es una coso como muy contradictoria

El lla tiene tiempo por que el empeso con el violin. El empeso con los botes, y ay subio con la flauta

I have that!

Ellos se pusieron a practicar ---- y ------ y el agarra la flauta. En la casa hacen concierto entonces.
Con razón escuchaba que en la casa es hoy que. Tu ya no tocal el piaño, ya no tocas el violin, ya solo es boo, boo. Tu paraces un buo.
El como tienen un poquito mas de reconocimiento del sonido. Ellos se basas, cuando entro mi hijo docen que No importaba que ellos no tenían el instrumento por que ellos escuchaban. La barbilla, adonde las maños en el bote.

Como ellos mismos están aprendiendo mas asi se aferra en que ella lo puede ser. y eso es bueno porque asi no se derrota.

Inclusivio ellas están con clase de música. Es un poquito mas difícil. Yo creo que eso es bueno porque le estaba ayudando al Joaquin, el le quiere tocar Las Mananitas para el cumpleaños.

Me pregunto que lo buscara en el internet, pero no encontramos una manera en que las pudiéramos encontrar las notas para el clarinete.

Tienes que tratar de aprender como. Yo veo que le pone interés en eso

Una mas fuertes…

Le gusta dibujar, es muy creativo. Le pone muchos detalles. Igual la nina como entro En música tiene un 10. Ahora les cambiaron porque tiene arte. No puedes decir que no puede

Tiene la abilidad de ver lo que esta haciendo y que tiene que hacer

---- es la música y dibujar. Y el es callado y demuestra lo que siente. A veces no participa. Porque dice que no sabes. Pero yo le digo que preguntar no es que no sabes si no que te interesa en aprender mas.

Eso lo a hecho. Papi le digo pero tu lo has hecho. Por eso tienes que aprender

Porque todos conoces todos a mi hermana. De ella si se dio conocer en la escuela.

Necesitas que ser mas participativo.

El le va un poco dificil en las matemáticas. Las estrategias. Todos me dicen que es un amor. No hace problema. No es lo que hablan . Usted tiene que estar tan orgulloso. El es tan tranquilo. Lo que le falta es participar.

En esta escuela no hay . El tuvo en pre-kind en y kínder. Pero luego en primero, le ponen materias mas fuerte.

Yo creo que a sido como de ser un niño tranquilo. Como que no ser explosivo tal ves en cual quier momento que le digan ciertas cosas. Que el se altere como que la música lo le a ensenado a estar tranquilo porque en la música tiene que estar tranquilo. Osea ser pasivo escuchar. Eso si lo tiene
la cosa es que no lo tiene en hablar lo mas que nada expresarse. Pero en si, yo creo que le a beneficiado en ser una persona como .... Emocionalmente es muy amoroso, como que no le ve uno ese no por que tiene algo malo
El es pasivo, oseo como que el es asi. Pero el es mas tranquilito. También les ayuda a tener un control a ser lo que ellos están hacienda. Quiero que sean mas productivos. Osea como si llo tengo mis clases.
Sabiendo lo que tienen que hacer

El es que hable mas el español. El lo habla mas un poquito y lo escriben mas un poquito
Por que incluso a veces cuando llo les digo hablen me español en la casa ellos están hablando ingles Dijo mi mama que español. Osea para que les entienda. Pero llo también les escucho. Pero a el le gusta mucho el español. El en su escuela con sus hermanitos un poquito. Pero con nosotros español

Si por que nosotros hablamos en español. Lla con su hermana pues aprendio en Ingles y lla con la escuela
Porque el entro a la escuela y llo les dije que el hablaba mas español que ingles y en ese momento a mi me dio medio. Porque digo que tal si me ponen en una de esas clases de los que necesitan ayuda en ingles. Y cuando me dijieron que hablabla mas español digo bueno pero lo vamos a evaluar para ver si entra a la clase directamente en Ingles o necesita ayuda para que cuando el quiera decir algo
Pero no el entro bien el sabia todo lo principal que tenia que saber y entro a su clase normal
Pero el Español si a sido en la casa, solamente en la casa.

No, es lo curioso de el que tiene que mi hija tambien lo tiene. Pero el es mas curioso porque el lo escribe a veces con equivocarse con una letra. Por decir aunque lo pone con la que pero escribe aunque
Osea como que el deletra la palabra pero no lo escribe en español asi como lo deletrea el.
No se ni como lo aprendio escribe mas español El es el que escribe mas que mi hija Pero bien como bien detallado. Mas detallado.

En Español. Si en Español con sus tios que an venido de Mexico. Con sus primos a veces vamos con mis familiaries o con mis compadres pero ellos hablan en ingles. Ellos se hablan en Ingles. Osea come que ellos tambien esa familia esta como mas concentrada en ingles que en español.

Pero en si yo siempre les digo el español ustedes tienen que aprender.
Porque es muy importante para ustedes saber los dos idiomas. En ese aspecto para mi es muy bonito ver las cuando están hablando en ingles y escuchar los que hablan español es bien bonito.
Bien orgullosa les digo por ustedes yo les digo porque uno quisiera aprender lo igual como ustedes
Pero no puede ustedes aprenda lo de nosotros si les digo ya les dimos la lucha ya de estar en este país.
Tal vez por lo mismo del hogar pueden llegar a ser estudiosos en hacer.
Y tienen muchas oportunidades. Como el profe, ahorita ya ese programa
Y le digo a mis hijos que es gratis.
Y aunque uno dice uno pues se la gasta el tiempo en una o otra casa
porque a si nos decía su papa que ustedes van par alla que ustedes van para alla.
A veces no me haces de comer y te vas para lla. Le digo, yo le dije a el a mi es muy importante mis hijos
Para mi es algo importante que hacer para. Me gusta que ellos aprendan eso. Y yo tengo una cunada también que es igual a si. Dice, no llo prefiero meter los mejor en muchas actividades
Que ellos estén absorbiendo todo ahorita. Porque eso les ayuda a ellos. En ser mejores personas
Dice. A tener los en la casa. En el teléfono, en el aparato porque es lo único que hacen
Appendix F Sample Work in Mentor Portfolio

Corona Youth Fellowship Workshop

Topic: Classroom Management

Workshop Goals:
Understand ways to influence your students by:

1. Building Relationships
2. Practicing Credible and Approachable body, voice and language
3. Using Positive Language
4. Turning Garbage into Gold or Enforceable Statements

Strategy #1: Relationships, Relationships, Relationships!
- Name Game and I Love My Neighbor, especially my neighbor who ...

Strategy #2:
- Credible Body Language
  - Credible Body of Freeze Body or “Mountain Stance”
    - Standing still
    - Being in front
    - Toes pointed ahead
    - Weight on both feet
    - Short oral directions
    - Wrists “unbroken” with hands/arms at sides or bent at the elbow
  - Voice: Head is still and straight: voice is flat and ends on a down note.
  - Language: Short commands. Begin with the action.
  - PRACTICE:
    
    Your name
    Where you were born
    What you play

Approachable Body Language
- Approachable Body or Relaxed and Inviting
  - Relaxed posture
  - Feet angled
  - Weight on one foot
  - Lengthier sentences
  - Wrists/arms softer

- Voice: Head is tilted and bobs: voice is rhythmic and ends on an up note.
- Language: Longer sentences.
• PRACTICE:
  What is your name?
  Where were you born?
  What do you play?

• PRACTICE: MIX IT UP!
  Name
  Birth Place
  Play

• PRACTICE: Raise Your Hand vs. Speak Out
  o Always have a non-verbal signal with a common verbal direction

• PRACTICE: Getting a Student Back on Track
  o Approach from the side, eyes on student work, short language, and breathe

Strategy #3: Using Positive Language – When you catch yourself saying Don’t

• Don’t talk
• Don’t pluck
• Don’t tap your bow
• Don’t shout out

PRACTICE: Compliment Sandwich

Strategy #4: Using Enforceable Statements
3 Rules:
  1. Use enforceable limits (take good care of yourself in front of your students)
     • “I’ll be glad to allow the orchestra to begin playing as soon as everyone is in
       ready position.”
  2. Provide choices within limits: “Would you rather continue to play with your instrument
     appropriately or work with an imaginary bow?”
  3. Apply consequences with empathy: “What a bummer. Do you need to find another
     place to work?”

QUESTIONS AND REFLECTION
Appendix G Musical Noise

Musical City Noise

Everyday I go outside I love to hear the city noise, but I don’t think of it as city noise, I think it is actually music. All the sounds combine to make beautiful music. If you listen carefully, I think you’ll hear it too! This makes me realize that music is important in my life. Music plays an important part in my life because it makes me use my imagination, it gives me confidence, it inspires ideas and it brings my family together.

Music makes me use my imagination. When I play the song Las Mananitas, I imagine a girl writing to her cousin on her birthday. She moved from New York to Mexico and misses her a lot. In “Twinkle Twinkle Little Star,” I imagine a star in the pitch black sky and she is shining bright. When I am playing the violin, I imagine being wrapped up by music, like a blanket. The music notes swirl around me as I play my violin. Sometimes, they inspire the notes I play on my violin.

Music is important to me because it has taught me to have confidence in myself. It taught me not to be afraid anymore and face my fear. If I can get up on stage and sing and play in front of an audience, I can speak in front of my classmates.

Finally, music is important to me because it brings my family together. When the radio starts playing Christmas carols my family gathers around and joins in the singing. Another reason is my family sits on the couch and asks me to play and they listen to me. My mom likes to record me on her phone and show it to my family that live outside the city. When I start playing, my little sister likes to join in and play lots
of instruments like the recorder or even use boxes and pans as a drum. My last reason is that it brings my family together because when I have concert my whole family comes to see me play. My mom likes to record the concert and show it to my family.

These are the reasons music plays an important part in my life. If there was no music, how would I express my feelings? How would my imagination run wild? Music gives me ideas when I don’t know what to do. Music means family. Music means everything to me. That is why music is an important part of my life.
### Appendix H Musical Me

Music has taken place almost my whole life. Ever since I was in Kindergarten or first grade, my musical talent began to take place and show itself. My first string instrument was the violin. Today, I still play the violin, as well as the viola, and the clarinet. This is another way music is important because it has taken place almost my whole life, like a lifetime hobby, it also seems like it was my destiny to play music.

One way music is important to me, is the very first time I played music I bond between my cousin and I emerged. When I received my very first violin (When I was 6 or 7), I immediately started playing. I entered the Nucleo Corona Orchestra as a beginner for about a year. Then I turned advanced when I was in the 2nd grade. I was playing in the advanced orchestra called CYO (Corona Youth Orchestra). Both my cousin, Nicholas and I were going to the youth orchestra, both were 1st violin, always getting higher notes in a song as well as the rest of the 1st violins. I was never a 2nd violin because I always kept a steady beat, unless I was supposed to because of a ritard. I was also never insecure bout the notes to play. Playing in the orchestra has made me become closer to my cousin, and now there is another talent in my family. Just like my cousin Luis taught me to play the violin, I am teaching my brother Luis to play the clarinet and the violin.

Another way music is important to me, is it will actually set up my mood. Normally, when I play a minor scale, or a song with many minors (flats in a song, b), I think about a sad story. When I pay sharps or a natural in a song (#), it will mostly point out a happy/joyful feeling. Some people, may ask “Why do we have to play the whole notes?” or “Why do we have to play these sixteenth notes?” Well, it all
depends on the kind of feeling you want to get. For example, whenever I play New World Symphony by Dvorak on the violin or viola, there is a section that has 3 C naturals and 1 whole note of Bb(C,C,C, Bb--) that equals seven beats and goes from major to minor and it sounds kind of like a sad song. I like how the feeling changes.

When I play an instrument, I feel the mood of the piece.

Furthermore, music is always playing an important role in my life. One way music is important to me is that whenever I play music, I kind of forget whatever happened to me that made me feel sad or mad about. One example of this is whenever I get grounded, or I get a question wrong on a test, or when a family member leaves or dies, I feel sad or maybe even mad. I would just have to play a little music. I would soon be relaxed, and I would have already forgotten about all those things. What it would mostly do is just relax me, so I would have all those things weighing in my mind.

My last reason music is important to me is that it reminds me of the good times I’ve had. One example, is when the Nucleo Orchestra program was celebrating their 5th year of making and we played a few songs that we have learned like “Les Toreadores,” or “Down a Country Lane,” or Capriccio Espagnole.” Another example is when my family gets together for celebrations like Birthdays or Christmas, I play duets with Nicholas. (But it feels funny when my cousin is playing at my birthday).

These are all the reasons music is important to me.
Appendix I, Glossary

Audiation- A cognitive process that allows the individual to mentally hear and comprehend music in order to play expressively. This term has garnered increasing popularity in the education field for its parallels to the literacy skill of envisioning.

Bimusicality- a practice that occurs on a continuum, involves performance in two cultures and an understanding of the music in its original context. While someone can be considered bi-cultural if all three points are present, the degree of proficiency and cultural understanding will vary because of the capability and experience one has with a musical culture (Clements, 2008, p.22 in Soto, 2016, p. 10).

Body Hexis- Body hexis speaks directly to the motor function, in the form of a pattern of postures that is both individual and systematic, because linked to a whole system of techniques involving the body and tools, and charged with a host of social meanings and values (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 87 in Block, p. 58, 2014).

Capital- Term coined by Bourdieu. There are three types of capital: Social, Human and Symbolic capital.

Critical literacy- In critical literacy, reading goes beyond reading the word, to reading the world. That is, all individuals need to be aware of their perspective, their position in the world and what power they possess. Critical literacy acknowledges the “interrelationship between the sociopolitical structures of a society and the act of reading” (Freire & Macedo, p. 142.).
El Sistema- Founded in Caracas, Venezuela in 1975, el Sistema is a government-supported public school education policy that believes in access for all children, families who want to join the system and the pursuit of musical excellence at all levels of student participation.

Envisionment- The ability to form a vivid mental picture of what you are reading. This is essential and foundational reading skill that readers must have in order to make meaning of what they are reading.

Ethno-musicology- intercultural studies in music, the study of music in culture, comparative organology, fieldwork techniques, including recording technology, and attention to analytical problems (Campbell, 2002, pg.18).

Flow- Csiksznmihaalyi (2009) found that engagement in tasks which requires one’s best efforts generate flow. In order to sustain flow, one’s skills must improve to meet the challenge, and in turn the activity must also improve. This results in a self-perpetuating situation where skills and challenges must match and must be high. It is this flow that activates creativity, which is essentially how individuals learn.

Habitus- a set of dispositions, which through a gradual process of inculcation get molded into the body and become second nature (Bourdieu, 1991, p. 12).

Languaging- Language is a noun, while languaging is a verb, grounded in in human interactions instead of established ideas. Mignolo (2000) writes, “languaging in language
allows us to describe ourselves interacting as well as to describe the description of our interactions” (p. 254).

**Mode**- A regularized organized set of resources for meaning-making, including, image, gaze, gesture, movement, music, speech and sound-effect (Jewitt & Kress, 2003, p. 1)

**Musicianship**- “…is about acquiring known information and emerging knowledge to create, perform, share and even disseminate their own music. This includes the ability to ‘pick out’ stylistic elements from any new music they listen to, and to be able to assimilate these ideas into their own practices using available technologies.” (Leong, 2003, p.157)

**Multiliteracies**- New Literacy studies look at literacy, “not as a singular thing, but as a plural set of social practices: literacies” (Gee, pg. 62).

**Multi-modality**- A communication in the widest sense, including gesture, oral performance, artistic, linguistic, digital, electronic, graphic and artifact-related (Pahl & Roswell, 2006).

**Musicking**- Coined by Daniel Smalls (1997) it is used to describe music as a human (inter)action not a noun.

**Third Space**- Gutierrez (2008) interprets the Third Space (spelled differently) as learning ecology, both spatially and cognitively, where students use a variety of tools to foster their socio-critical literacy and cognitive development. She acknowledges vertical forms
of learning, which I take as the cognitive development of the individual, and the horizontal development, which considers the individual’s practices across different communities.

Thirdspace- According to Soja (1996), thirdspace is, “an-Other way of understanding and acting to change the speciality of human life, a distinct mode of critical special awareness that is appropriate to a new scope and significance being brought about in the rebalanced trialectices of spatiality-historicality-sociality”, which “gives rise to something different, something new and unrecognizable, a new area of negotiation of meaning and representation” (p. 61).

Translanguaging- “An approach to the use of language, bilingualism and the education of bilinguals that considers the language practices of bilinguals not as two autonomous language systems as has been traditionally the case, but as one linguistic repertoire with features that have been societally constructed as belonging to two separate languages.” (García & Li Wei, 2014, p.2).

Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD)- The difference between what a learner can do independently and what they can do with help. First introduced by Lev Vygotsky, ZPD identifies the level potential development of the learner.