Performing Conquest and Resistance in the Streets of Eighteenth Century Potosí: Identity and Artifice in the Cityscapes of Gaspar Miguel de Berrío and Melchor Pérez de Holguín

Agnieszka A. Ficek
CUNY Hunter College

How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!

Follow this and additional works at: http://academicworks.cuny.edu/hc_sas_etds

Part of the Ancient, Medieval, Renaissance and Baroque Art and Architecture Commons, Fine Arts Commons, Latin American History Commons, Latina/o Studies Commons, Other History of Art, Architecture, and Archaeology Commons, Painting Commons, and the Urban, Community and Regional Planning Commons

Recommended Citation

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Hunter College at CUNY Academic Works. It has been accepted for inclusion in School of Arts & Sciences Theses by an authorized administrator of CUNY Academic Works. For more information, please contact AcademicWorks@cuny.edu.
Performing Conquest and Resistance in the Streets of Eighteenth-Century Potosí: Identity and Artifice in the Cityscapes of Gaspar Miguel de Berrió and Melchor Pérez de Holguín

by

Agnieszka Anna Ficek

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts (Art History), Hunter College, The City University of New York

December 21, 2015

Thesis Sponsor:

___________________ ________________________________
Date Dr. Tara Joy Zanardi

___________________ ________________________________
Date Dr. Lynda Klich
Cities also believe they are the work of the mind or of chance, but neither the one nor the other sufficed to hold up their walls. You take delight not in a city’s seven or seventy wonders, but in the answers it provides to a question of yours.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The following thesis is the culmination of many years of research that spanned four continents. Since 2010, the imposing cityscapes of Melchor Perez de Holguín and Gaspar Miguel de Berrío have been at the forefront of my academic consciousness, until the opportunity to examine them in depth arrived. Along this journey, I am indebted to the many people who provided me with endless support, encouragement and assistance through this process.

Firstly, my advisor, Tara Zanardi, who’s academic, professional and personal advice, endless support and editorial assistance have made this project what it is. During the many seminars I had the pleasure to take with Professor Zanardi, she has always been my champion, pushing me to newer academic heights. Her tireless remarks on the many drafts I sent her helped me develop and grow as a writer, a scholar and an art historian. Her endless supply of kindness and humor made the process much easier, particularly during overwhelming moments of stress. My second reader, Lynda Klich, has provided invaluable assistance, as much for my first graduate paper in her Research Methods class as for my entire thesis. I am profoundly grateful for their endless support and kindness. Both Professors Zanardi and Klich provide examples of scholarly talent and rigor that I aspire to as I continue through my academic career.

Equally, I feel eternally grateful to the support and advice of Professor Harper Montgomery, who believed in my professional abilities and gave me the opportunity to work with her as a graduate curatorial fellow in the last semester of my graduate program. Her enthusiasm, positivity and incredible academic achievement provide models to emulate.

My two years at Hunter College gave me academic and professional opportunities, scholarships and fellowships that have made this project a possibility. In particular, this project is indebted to the support of the Kossak Foundation. The generous Kossak Travel Grant allowed me to conduct research in Bolivia and foster lasting professional ties in La Paz, Sucre and Potosí. Not only did the travel enrich my
academic work, but allowed me to grown into a stronger person. Furthermore, the generous support of Hunter College in the form of conference travel grants and the Marian Netter Award allowed to me to expand my professional network around the United States as well as in Europe and Latin America.

Many friends and family members tirelessly supported me through my journey as a graduate student. The countless friends who practiced with me and corrected my broken Spanish, educated me about Peru, Bolivia and Argentina, gave me advice and have been endless bastions of support since I came to the United States six years ago. For fear of missing any important names, I will only say, you know who you are, mil gracias y abrazos. To my colleagues at Hunter I owe endless thanks for the many nights of commiserations, drinks, coffees before exams, during finals and in this last stretch. There are many brilliant upcoming scholars I have had the pleasure to work with, but to Anna, Alana, Renata, Eugenie and Sarah I owe particular thanks for their exceptional love and support.

To my sister, Julia, big thanks for many nights of crying and laughing on the phone. I miss you always and count down the days until we are finally in the same country. To my extended family in Poland, even though I see you rarely, your support between visas, driving me to airports and consulates and your fostering of my love of the arts (that is particularly relevant to Marek), dziękuję. The biggest thank you of all, however, must go to my parents, without whom this really would not have been possible. Your support is the only reason I could have done all that I have and I can never thank you enough for allowing me to pursue my dreams across the other side of the earth. I love you.

And lastly, merci, to Bertrand, who probably won’t read this, but who went with me to the Museo Reina Sofia in 2010 where I first saw these paintings, and where this all began.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Images ..................................................................................................................................................i

Introduction ....................................................................................................................................................1

**Chapter 1: Vale un Potosí: The History and Purpose of Images of the Silver City**.....13

  *Historical Context* ..................................................................................................................................14

  *The History of Urban Representations of Potosí* ......................................................................................19

  *De Holguín and De Berrío: A Comparison* ............................................................................................34

  *Conclusion* .............................................................................................................................................38

**Chapter 2: Civic Space, Performance and the Politics of Race and Representation**...39

  *Civic Performance and the Politics of Representation: Potosí and the Corpus Christi Celebrations in Cusco* ........................................................................................................................................42

  *Civic Space as Racialized Space* ..........................................................................................................54

  *Conclusion* .............................................................................................................................................71

**Chapter 3: The Exclusionary Visual Lexicon of Urban Images**........................................73

  *The Undesirable Poor: The Exclusion of Economic Inequalities* .......................................................75

  *The Undesirable Worker: The Exclusion of Labour and the Mita System* ........................................82

  *The Undesirable Other: The Exclusion of Cultural and Religious Resistance* ...............................90

  *Conclusion* .............................................................................................................................................97

**Conclusion** .............................................................................................................................................102

**Bibliography** ............................................................................................................................................106

**Figures** .....................................................................................................................................................112
LIST OF IMAGES

Figure 1. Melchor Pérez de Holguín, *Entry of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo into Potosí* (1716). Oil on canvas, Museo de America, Madrid

Figure 2. Detail of Figure 1, inscription

Figure 3. Detail of Figure 1, day scene

Figure 4. Detail of Figure 1, night scene

Figure 5. Gaspar Miguel de Berrío, *Description of the Cerro Rico and the Imperial Town of Potosí* (1758). Oil on canvas, Museo Charcas, Sucre, Bolivia

Figure 6. Detail of Figure 5, inscription

Figure 7. Cieza de Leon, *Potosí* (1553). Woodcut print. Published in ‘Crónicas del Perú’ (1553)

Figure 8. Diego de Ocaña, *Cerro de Potosí, Octaba Maravilla del Mundo* (1599-1603). Ink on paper, University of Oviedo, Spain

Figure 9. Anonymous, *The Silver Mines at Potosí* (c. 1585). Watercolor on parchment, Hispanic Society of America, New York

Figure 10. Theodore de Bry, *Mines of Potosí* (c. 1590). Print. Published in José de Acostas ‘Historia natural y mortal de las Indias’ (1590)

Figure 11. Theodore de Bry, *Pack Train of Llamas Laden with Silver from Potosí Mines of Peru* (c. 1590). Print. Published in José de Acostas ‘Historia natural y mortal de las Indias’ (1590)


Figure 13. Detail of Figure 5, Cerro Rico
Figure 14. Detail of Figure 5, Kari kari reservoirs

Figure 15. Detail of Figure 5, smelters (huayras)

Figure 16. Martín de Murúa, *Cerro y Minas de Potosí* (1590). Ink and watercolor on paper.

Published in Martín de Murúa, ‘Historia del origen y genealogía real de los reyes ingas del Pirú: de sus hechos, costumbres, trajes y manera de gobierno’ (1590)

Figure 17. Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala, *Cuidad la Villa Rica Enpereal de Potocchi* (1615-1616). Ink on paper. Published in Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala ‘Nueva Coronica y Buen Gobierno’ (1615-1616), Royal Library of Denmark, Copenhagen

Figure 18. Francisco Tito Yupanqui, *Cerro Rico de Potosí* (11584-1588). Ink on paper.

Published in Bartolomé Arzans Orsua y Vela, ‘El mundo desde Potosí: Vida y Reflexiones de Orsua y Vela’ (1676-1736)

Figure 19. Anonymous, *Virgen del Cerro* (early eighteenth century). Oil on canvas, Casa de la Moneda, Potosí, Bolivia

Figure 20. Anonymous, *Villa Imperial de Potosí* (1755-1775). Oil on canvas, Museo de Ejercito, Toledo, Spain

Figure 21. Anonymous, *Plan de la Ymperial y Rrica Villa de Potosí y de su damoso Cerro* (1758). Ink on paper, Casa de la Moneda, Potosí, Bolivia

Figure 22. Detail of Figure 21, inscription

Figure 23. Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Sodality of Saint Rosa and La Linda* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana Corpus Christi series)

Figure 24. Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Processional Finale* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana Corpus Christi series)
Figure 25. Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Corpus Christi Procession* (c.1700). Oil on canvas, Museo Pedro de Osma, Lima, Peru

Figure 26. Anonymous, *Procession in the Plaza Mayor of Lima*, (early eighteenth century). Oil on canvas. Church of the Soledad, Convento de San Francisco, Lima, Peru

Figure 27. Anonymous Cusco Artist, *San Cristobal Parish* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana *Corpus Christi* series) (detail)

Figure 28. Detail of Figure 1, spectators in the curtains

Figure 29. Detail of Figure 23, headwear of indigenous women

Figure 30. Detail of Figure 1, women of the San Martín parish

Figure 31. Detail of Figure 5, procession on the Cerro Rico

Figure 32. Detail of Figure 1, triumphal arch, entry to Potosí

Figure 34. Detail of Figure 1, Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo under the baldachin

Figure 35. Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Bishop Molliendo Carrying the Host* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana *Corpus Christi* series)

Figure 36. Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Our Lady of Cocharcas Under the Baldachin* (1765). Oil on canvas. Brooklyn Museum, Brooklyn, NY

Figure 37. Detail of Figure 1, Inka in the masked parade

Figure 38. Detail of Figure 1, African procession participants

Figure 39. Detail of Figure 1, group observing the entry of the viceroy

Figure 40. Detail of Figure 5, roofs in Potosí

Figure 41. Detail of Figure 5, demonstrating difference in scale

Figure 42. Detail of Figure 5, miners quarters

Figure 43. Detail of Figure 5, black domestics
Figure 44. Detail of Figure 5, indigenous market women

Figure 45. Anonymous Mexican Artist, *De alguna y español produce negro torna-atrás* (c. 1775), oil on canvas, Colección Banamex, Mexico City

Figure 46. Anonymous, *Plaza Mayor de Lima Cabeza de los Reinos de el Peru de 1680*, (1680). Oil on canvas, Museo de America, Madrid.

Figure 47. Detail of Figure 1, poor women observe the masked procession

Figure 48. Detail of Figure 5, soldier entering the city

Figure 49. Detail of Figure 5, Plaza de Barratillo

Figure 50. Detail of Figure 5, artisans and maidservants

Figure 51. Detail of Figure 5, market women

Figure 52. Detail of Figure 5, man with cow

Figure 53. Detail of Figure 5, priest in courtyard
INTRODUCTION

The construction of collective identities can never fully include the diversity of an urban landscape. The Andean city of Potosí, in the viceroyalty of Peru, was recognized as one of the most important centers in the Spanish empire, due to the immense production of capital throughout the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries. Because of Potosí’s importance within the empire, artists from the city, the viceroyalty of Peru, and Europe created a complex and contentious civic identity through visual representations of the metropolis and its geographical surrounds. Despite devastating economic declines during the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries, the artists of the famous Potosí school painted the city in ways that exemplified the grandeur, wealth and luxury with which it was synonymous. These representations often showed Potosí dwarfed by the Cerro Rico, the Rich Hill where silver was mined, highlighting the importance of industry over the community within the city. This study centers on depictions of Potosí by Melchor Pérez de Holguín (Cochabamba, 1660 - Potosí, 1732) and Gaspar Miguel de Berrío (Potosí, c.1706 - c.1762) the two most well-known painters in Potosí during the colonial period, who were instrumental in the establishment of the Potosí school of painting, one of the defining movements of the colonial Spanish Baroque. In 1716 and 1758, respectively, these artists produced impressive cityscapes of eighteenth century Potosí, a cultural and economic powerhouse of the viceroyalty of Peru. These cityscapes, produced during a turbulent century in which Potosí began to lose its colonial significance, exemplify the performative embodiment in the fashioning of collective identities. Filled with complex political,
racial and economic narratives, de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s visual descriptions serve as commentaries on the social structure of the colonial city.

The earlier of the two paintings, de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo into Potosí* (Figure 1) was painted to commemorate the visit of the interim viceroy and Archbishop of Charcas, Diego Rubio Morcillo de Auñón, who travelled from Sucre to Lima via Potosí. Morcillo arrived in Potosí on April 25, 1716, on the day of Saint Mark the Evangelist (Figure 2). While it is unknown exactly when the painting arrived in Spain from Peru, it was in Europe by the first half of the twentieth century and is now in the collection of the Museo de América in Madrid. Its provenance, according to the Peruvian art historian, Luis Eduardo Wuffarden, can be traced to several collections in Toledo before it was acquired by the Amusco

---

1 The original title in Spanish is *Entrada del Virrey Arzobispo Morcillo en Potosí*, and will hereon be referred to as *Entry of the Viceroy*.

2 1642, Villarrobledo, Spain - 1730, Lima Peru. Morcillo was the viceroy of Peru twice, in 1716 as interim viceroy after Diego Ladrón de Guevara was deposed for embezzlement earlier that year. Morcillo became viceroy once more, and served from 1720-1724. He also served as bishop of La Paz and archbishop of La Plata, Charcas and Lima.

3 De Holguín documents the arrival with an inscription at the bottom right of the canvas which reads; “A esta billa imperial, dia de S. Marcos evangelista a las tres de la tarde, que se quenta 25 de abril año de 1716 entro el egcelent.mo, illus.mo ss.r d.r d. frai Diego Rrubio Morsillo de Auñon, arçobispo de La Plata, i virrei de estos reinos del Peru de lo mui ylustre de billa de Billarrobledo en La Mancha. Los mas ilustres i preferidos caballeros de esta Villa, conforme sus estados, asistieron al receveimiento de su egcelencia mineros, beneficiadores, i los sseñores azogeros. I los demas asistentes de esta Villa, mercaderes, oficiales, i hartifizes. Siendo alcades hordinarios don Francisco Gambarte i don Pedro Nabarro, i correjidor el general don Francisco Tirado de Quenca lo mando pintar.” [sic.] [In this imperial town, on the day of Saint Mark the Evangelist at three in the afternoon on the 25th April, in the year of 1716, entered the most elegant, most illustrious Señor Doctor Don Father Diego Rubio Morsillo de Auñon, Archbishop of La Plata, and Viceroy of these kingdoms of Peru, from the illustrious town of Villarrobledo in La Mancha. The most illustrious and preferred men of this town, conforming to their status, helped to receive his excellency; miners, beneficieries and the owners of the smelters. And also assisting in his town, merchants and officials. As mayors [of the city], don Francisco Gambarte and don Pedro Nabarro, and the corregidor, general don Francisco Tirado de Quenca asked to have this painted.”]
Entry of the Viceroy was de Holguín’s sole civic commission, and the only non-devotional work in the artist’s oeuvre. In the large canvas, measuring 240 by 570 cm (94 1/2 by 244 1/2 inches), de Holguín shows not only the triumphal procession marking the viceroy’s entrance into Potosí, but also the celebrations in the Plaza Mayor that followed. De Holguín divided the compositional space into three registers that depict events correlating to the celebrations marking the viceroy’s arrival in Potosí. The main register depicts the processional route along the Calle Hoyos, from the entry of the city near the Iglesia San Martín to the Plaza Mayor in the center; the two smaller registers at upper left show different views of the festivities in the Plaza Mayor. The first, more official scene portrays the viceroy’s solemn arrival at the Iglesia Matriz, accompanied by Church officials from Potosí (Figure 3), while the second is a nocturnal view of the same plaza and depicts a masked ball and parade performed for the entertainment of Morcillo, who observes the action from a canopied seat alongside the plaza (Figure 4). Throughout the composition, de Holguín has taken care to indicate the geographical and architectural markers directly onto the scene, noting the names of specific churches, such as the aforementioned San Martín and Iglesia Matriz, and official buildings, like the Cabildo, Carcel and the Casa de la Moneda.

In the main register, the central procession along the Calle Hoyos is observed by a selection of Potosí’s townspeople as it enters through a triumphal arch constructed at the city’s

---


entrance, painted red and covered with precious metals, framed paintings and ecclesiastical sculptures. The procession, which includes individuals which de Holguín has labelled as ‘señores embajadores’ (ambassadors) or the more broad term ‘personas más electas’, is made up exclusively of white men and their African attendants. In the crown, the artist has also included a conversation between two elderly viewers exclaiming the lavishness of the procession, along with his own self-portrait, observing the pageantry along Calle Hoyos. Above the viceroy, de Holguín has included Morcillo’s family coat of arms, emphasizing his Spanish origins. The procession travels on horseback and by foot through the city with the military and civic leaders at the head of the procession, followed by the viceroy and, finally, the clergy. The soldiers carry muskets and processional banners while the audience has hung banners, textiles and paintings along the processional route.

In the upper left smaller register, the entourage of the viceroy is seen entering the main square of Potosí, marked by another triumphal arch. The viceroy is greeted at the Iglesia Matriz by the resident clergy and more townspeople are seen watching the event from the balconies surrounding the city. In the background, beyond the buildings, de Holguín has included the only pictorial reference to the Cerro Rico, barely visible beyond the city. In his compositional arrangement of the scene, de Holguín has relegated Potosí’s most important natural landmark into the peripheries of the city.

The second smaller register shows the same plaza in a nocturnal scene. The space is illuminated by lighted wooden torches placed around the plaza. The compositional relationship between the spectators and the performers is reversed, with a crowd of Potosinos in the center of the plaza, intently watching a masqueraded parade circling the plaza. As in the previous register, more spectators regard the festivities from the balconies surrounding the square. The parade
reenacts the *reconquista* of Spain, with some participants in Moorish or military costume, others as saints and archangels integral to the story. The masquerade ball also pays homage to the conquest of Peru, with a member of the indigenous elite -- the only indigenous processional participant in the entire painting -- dressed in ceremonious Incaic attire.

In the 1758 *Description of the Cerro Rico and the Imperial Town of Potosí*, in the collection of the Museo Charcas in Sucre, (Figure 5) de Berrío shows a similar interest in defining the architectural and geographical elements of the city. The painting includes a comprehensive guide to the natural and built environment within Potosí and its surroundings. While the most prominent element in the composition is the impressive mountain of the Cerro Rico, dotted with entrances to the mines, the center of the canvas shows a vibrant city, radiating out into the harsh natural landscape of the Andes. In *Description*, de Berrío created an expansive, birds-eye view of the city, like de Holguín, his only secular painting. Originally commissioned by don Francisco Antonio Lopez Ortega, this work’s provenance is even less known than that of *Entry of the Viceroy*. The most important information regarding the provenance of the work

---

6 The original Spanish title reads; *Descripción del Cerro Rico y la Villa Imperial de Potosí*, and will hereon be referred to as *Description*. 
suggests that it was in the collection of Dr. Samuel Velasco Flor, a noted collector in nineteenth-century Potosí, and underwent restoration by Juan de la Cruz in 1874 (Figure 6).

The *Description of the Cerro Rico and the Villa Imperial de Potosí* shows a birds-eye view of the city while the Andes recede into the distance. The Casa de la Moneda in Potosí has in its collection an ink on paper drawing of the same scene, with an almost identical composition (Figure 7). The ink drawing is unsigned and unattributed to any artist, even though I contend that the similarities between the earlier drawing and de Berrío’s scene suggest they were both completed by de Berrío. The drawing (Figure 8) is dated 17 April, 1758 with an inscription that reads:

Corta Parte del Plan de la Imperial y rrica Villa de Potosí y de su famoso Cerro A 17 de Abril de 1758 años/Se halla este [h]emisferío peruano en altura de 19 grados y 40 minutes segun las ultimas obesrvaciones.

It is unlikely that two near-identical scenes could have been completed independently just a few months apart.

---

7 Dr. Samuel Velasco Flor collected books on Bolivia and was a bibliophilist, linguist and had a perfect command of the Quechua language. (Wright, 157) He was involved in the local, regional and national governments of Bolivia, serving as the secretary of the Ministry of Government and Foreign Affairs in 1878 (*The Alsop Claim 1878*, 76). Dr Velasco Flor also donated generously to the Bolivian National Library and was the author of *Vidas de Bolivianos Célebres* (1866).

8 The original text, painted on the cartouche in the bottom left of the composition reads; “Descripción de Zerro Rico é Ymperial Villa de Potosí / Se pintó en la misma Villa á costa de Dn. Francisco. Anto. Lopez Ortega, por el Mro. Gaspar Miguel Berrío en 24 de Septire. de 1758 / Propiedad de Dr. S.V.F. Retocado por J de la C. F. 1874” [Description of the Cerro Rico and Imperial Town of Potosí / Painted in the same town at the cost of Don Francisco Antonio Lopez Ortega, by the Master Gaspar Miguel Berrío on 24 September of 1758 / Property of Dr. S.V.F. Retouched by J. de la C.F. 1874] The connection between the initials and the alleged patron was made in de mesa and Gisbert 1962. Dr Samuel Velasco Flor was a noted collector of art and books in the late nineteenth century in Potosí.

9 “Short part of the plan of the imperial and rich City of Potosí and of its famous Cerro on 17 of April of the year 1758. It Created in this Peruvian hemisphere in an altitude of 19 degrees and 40 minutes following the most recent observations.”
In comparison to de Holguín’s painting, de Berrío’s description of Potosí places a larger emphasis on the Cerro Rico and the geographical surroundings of the city. In the top left of the composition, de Berrío has represented eighteen of the twenty-two Kari-Kari reservoirs, each of which had its own patron saint and chapel. In meticulous detail, de Berrío’s representation shows the complex network of roads and path that connect the mines to the smelters and silver furnaces, or *huayras*, but any detail with regard the representation of the workers is absent.

At the center of the painting, directly below the Cerro Rico, is the Plaza Mayor of the city. Radiating from this central point, de Berrío has depicted a curated view of urban life in Potosí, focusing primarily on the upper classes of the city who stroll leisurely through the city. The wealth of the European and Creole inhabitants of the city can also be seen in their dress. The women wear flowers in their hair, lace-trimmed skirts and bright shawls while the men, often identified as artisans, wear embroidered waistcoats and broad hats. One of the wealthier inhabitants is shown in a horse-drawn carriage which is driven by a black domestic servant. From the north, an soldier in armor rides into the city on horseback. The discrepancy of representation between the impoverished workers whose labor fueled the city’s growth and the lavishness of the representation of the wealthy inhabitants in the center is one of the most complex issues within de Berrío’s *Description of the Cerro Rico and the Villa Imperial de Potosí*, showing the inequality of representation in the Spanish colonial world.

Beyond their compositional differences, *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description* thus were created with a similar and primary purpose: to promote the elite civic identity of the European and Creole Potosinos. Both were commissioned by either men of means or important municipal dignitaries, and included extensive written descriptions in a cartouche or caption that name the
commissions and enumerate the specifics of the representations. Scholars, such as José de Mesa and Teresa Gisbert have suggested that de Berrío may have been a student of de Holguín, noting the particular similarity between de Holguín’s later paintings and de Berrío’s earliest; “[t]he technique of these work by de Berrío give [the authors] inclination to believe that he worked in [de Holguín’s] workshop.” While scant primary documentation exists, the suggestion is corroborated by the few biographical dates known about the artists’ lives, as well as their stylistic correlations.

The most prolific monographic works on de Holguín and de Berrío remain those by the Bolivian architects and art historians de Mesa and Gisbert, published in the mid-twentieth century. De Mesa and Gisbert wrote extensively on de Holguín, publishing three monographs on his life and work from the 1950s to the 1980s; Holguín y la Pintura Altoperuana del Virreinato (1956), which appeared in a later edition under the title Holguín y la Pintura Virreinal en Bolivia (1977), Melchor Pérez de Holguín (1961), a short, twelve-work catalogue of Holguín’s most known works, and Melchor Peres Holguín, mefet: su tiempo, su obra, sus seguidores (1989). The couple also published one monographic work on de Berrío, titled Gaspar Berrío (1962).

Naturally, as de Holguín and de Berrío catered to religious commissions, the research completed by de Mesa and Gisbert focuses primarily on the sacred painting of de Holguín and de Berrío and does not contain much analytical or provenance scholarship regarding Entry of the Viceroy or

---


11 “La técnica de los cuadros de Berrío hace que nos inclinemos en favor del trabajo de taller”, José de Mesa and Teresa Gisbert, Holguín y la Pintura Altoperuana del Virreinato. (La Paz: Alcadía Municipal, 1956), 176.

12 Ibid.

13 The title of the most recent publication by the couple (1989) is taken directly from Entry of the Viceroy. In the lower part of the composition, de Holguín included a self-portrait, and signed the work “Melchor Peres Holguín, mefet”.

8
Description. While de Mesa and Gisbert propose an informed foundational study of *Entry of the Viceroy* in the earliest monographic text on de Holguín, their analysis does not answer fundamental issues that are the central tenets of my study, particularly the construction of civic identity that excludes and marginalizes certain races and classes and the politics of performative images. As processional images, both of these paintings contain performative aspects that are integral to my interpretation.

This study builds on the scholarly work by de Mesa and Gisbert through a comparative approach that situates Potosí within the greater academic conversation surrounding urban identity in colonial Spanish America. It is mainly informed by the encyclopedic work of Richard L. Kagan, *Urban Images of the Hispanic World 1493-1793* (2000), which introduced a vocabulary of the common threads between urban identity and civic representation. Kagan’s study is also the first, besides that by Gisbert and de Mesa, to consider de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s paintings as a complementary dialogue regarding civic identity in the Silver City. Kagan frames his discussion of the two works in a manner that he defines as communicentrically, focusing primarily on the lived experience of Potosinos, or the *civitas*, rather than the architectural, logistical, and geographical importance of the city, known as as the *urbs*. Kagan’s extensive analysis provides a foundation regarding the works and their relationship to one another, relating them to contemporary accounts of life in colonial Potosí:

14 “[T]he communicentric view, while it often incorporated certain cartographical elements associated with description, generally did not pretend to offer a measured, topographically accurate representation of a particular town ... The communicentric view tended, therefore, to be purposefully idiosyncratic and filled with topographical distortions meant to enhance a town’s size and overall importance. Yet another characteristic of the communicentric projection was its tendency to replace the ‘distant overviews’ ... with close-up pictures that focused on particular structures -- plazas, cathedrals, and other public monuments -- which served as icons or symbols for the city as a whole ... [T]he communicentric projection singled out those locales that were integral to a particular community’s definition of itself.” (Kagan, *Urban Images*, 108-109).
The overarching idea, it seems, was to create an image of Potosí as a festive community whose loyalty to the monarchy superseded the factional divisions to which it was ordinarily subject. Such an image was idealized, but it tells us a great deal about the way Holguín and, by extension, other Potosinos, but above all the Creoles, wanted their town to be remembered.¹⁵

Kagan’s analysis, though not exhaustive, provides the historiographical basis for my thesis.

In his study, Kagan examines each major city in the Spanish colonial world separately. By comparing the formal, political and social factors of civic representations beyond those of Potosí, my study elaborates on Kagan’s research, and incorporates a discussion of the importance of procession and the privileging of Creole representation. To that end, this thesis is a comparative analysis not only between *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description*, but also between Potosí and major cities of the Peruvian and Mexican viceroyalties in the eighteenth century. To establish Potosí and the artistic output of both de Berrío and de Holguín within the appropriate colonial context, I draw on recent scholarships of civic identity, performance, and politics in the visual arts with regard to Lima (Alejandra Osorio, *Inventing Lima*, 2008), Cusco (Carolyn Sue Dean, *Inka Bodies and the Bodies of Christ*, 1999), and Mexico City (Magali Carrera, *Imagining Identity in New Spain*, 2003). Throughout the following three chapters, representations of Cusco, Lima, and Mexico City are examined to situate Potosí’s declining yet mythologized role within the greater Spanish empire.

In this study, I first investigate the fundamental issues in the history of representing Potosí. A consideration and analysis of the historical context of the city and the images of Potosí that pre-date *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description* establishes a foundational groundwork for the subsequent chapters. Moreover, an analysis of previous views of Potosí, which I have categorized into three ‘types’ of images, helps define the significance of the cityscapes by de

Holguín and de Berrío, which defy categorization, or, belong in a category of communicentric images of their own. Following the foundation outlined in the first chapter, the two subsequent chapters address conceptual issues of identity and artifice within the two paintings. The second chapter analyzes the privileged groups depicted in the two urban views, while the third concerns itself with the excluded groups who are underrepresented, or misrepresented within the constructions of urban identity. The second chapter draws heavily on theories of performative colonial politics within the urban context, explored by Carolyn Sue Dean in her study of the Corpus Christi Santa Ana series in Cusco. In this chapter, I argue that the active role in civic life was a way through which identities, both individual and collective, could be formed and were, therefore, only available to those members of the community who were allowed to participate in civic activities. Secondly, I argue that the performative elements of identity building within the context of colonial Potosí resulted in a racialized view and application of public space.

The final chapter presents a more abstracted analysis of Entry of the Viceroy and Description. In this chapter, I focus on the marginalized and de-individualized members of the community, mainly the poor, the laborers and the ethnic, cultural or racial subaltern groups whose erasure further emphasizes the centrality of Spanish and Creole hegemony. Through this final analysis, I argue that the images of Potosí by de Holguín and de Berrío are fantasies manufactured to appeal to the ideals of white elite identities within an otherwise diverse and dynamic metropolis.\textsuperscript{16} To that end, I draw upon the theories of race presented by Bruce Baum, whose study encapsulates a historicized understanding of race throughout the modern era. Baum argues that the voyages of the Spanish conquistadors into the American continent and the

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{16} In the case of de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy, the only indigenous participant in the festivities is a member of the indigenous elite, who were greatly underrepresented in de Holguín’s cityscape, and totally absent from de Berrío’s.
\end{flushright}
subsequent colonization reinforced the “medieval notions of otherness and modern racial thought”. Medieval notions of otherness ultimately stemmed from the ongoing persecution of Jews and Muslims in the Iberian Peninsula. The underlying current of Christian hegemony was extrapolated on in the New World with regard to the native populations and the importation of enslaved peoples from the African continent.

Collective identities created within the urban space prove more than just a site for self-identification. Through an extensive analysis of the exclusivity of shared identities, a narrative of dominance and power emerges, imprinting the hispanocentric ideals of citizenry onto the visual representations of the city. The subjectivities of collective identity within Potosí build up layers of artifice that obscure the diversity of the city, and detract from a syncretic colonial culture that developed after 1545. These subjectivities are, however, an inherent element of colonial society, revealing a society built on the presumption of racial and cultural superiority. Through this creation of a collective colonial identity, the artists were able to represent an artificial urban landscape that masked both the subaltern populations and the declines of Potosí throughout the eighteenth century.


18 Ibid.
CHAPTER 1: VALE UN POTOSÍ: THE HISTORY AND
PURPOSE OF IMAGES OF THE SILVER CITY

In the history of the Spanish colonial world, Potosí is equally synonymous with immense riches and the abuse and exploitation of people and land. The complex story of Potosí, its role within the Spanish colonial empire as well as the tradition of its representation in visual arts are concepts integral to the understanding of de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo into the Villa Imperial de Potosí* and de Berrío’s *Description of the Cerro Rico and the Villa Imperial de Potosí*. This chapter provides the historical context of the city and the paintings, and situates the two central works in relation to earlier and contemporary civic representations of Potosí, demonstrating the importance of these paintings within the greater story of Potosí’s cityscapes. By showing the discrepancies between the reality of life in the city and the iconographic representation of the metropolis in the works of de Holguín and de Berrío, the story of the city that was once the jewel in the Spanish Crown can be better understood. The discrepancies between lived metropolitan reality and illustrated city are particularly poignant during the period when these images were created when Potosí’s influence within the Spanish colonial empire has begun to wane. The decline in economic and civic status that was most

---

19 The title of this chapter comes from the colloquial phrase in Spanish, which is still in use today, ‘Vale un Potosí’, or ‘it is worth a Potosí’, to denote immense value and worth, not just of a material but also an emotional nature. The origins of this phrase will be explored herein.

20 Harun Farocki, *The Silver and the Cross (Das Silber und das Kreuz)*, two-channel video installation, directed by Harun Farocki (2010; Berlin, Harun Farocki Filmproduktion, 2010.), film.
strongly felt during the eighteenth century continued until the first half of the nineteenth century, when the once-great city became a remote, poverty-stricken town, with little to no influence on global or viceregal affairs. The cityscapes of de Holguín and de Berrío mask this decline by showing Potosí as a prosperous, cosmopolitan center, inflating the city’s influence within the greater context of colonial Peru.

**Historical Context**

The popular legend of the founding of Potosí begins with the indigenous llama herder, Diego Huallpa, who was chasing an escaped animal through the mountains and was forced to spend the night in what would later become known at the Cerro Rico, the Rich Hill. Huallpa climbed into the crack on the side of the mountain and lit a fire, by the light of which he saw a thick vein of silver running through the red mountain.\footnote{Eduardo Galleano, *The Open Veins of Latin America* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1997), 20-21.} Huallpa then alerted the Spanish conquistadors of what he had found. Another legend, which details an earlier discovery of the silver in the mountain, also gives one possible etymological root of the name Potosí. Local folklore told the story of Huayna Capac, the seventh Sapa Inca of the Inca Empire, who, in around 1462, found the silver deposits in the Cerro Rico. When the Incas began to extract the metal from the mountain, it is said that they heard a thunderous voice from the sky instructing the Inca to not take the silver, because it was meant for “other masters.”\footnote{Ibid.} From then on, the
Cerro Rico was known to the Quechua-speaking population as *Potocchi*, deriving from the local term for ‘thunder’, which was later hispanicized to *Potosí*.\(^{23}\)

In April 1545, Potosí was officially established and the production from the silver mines quickly outpaced the combined silver production of the two largest silver mines at that time, Mexico’s Zacatecas and Guanajuato.\(^{24}\) When the Spanish discovered gold in Peru, a new conception of wealth was adopted and entered into Castillian vernacular. After the beginning of the extraction of precious metals in the New World, tales of *el dorado* surfaced in Spain, and a new idiomatic expression was adopted to refer to anything of value; *vale un Perú*, or, ‘it’s worth a Perú.’ With the volume of silver found in the Cerro Rico, this phrase shifted and became; *Vale un Potosí*, expressing the new levels of wealth and luxury that became accessible to the Spanish conquistadors, romanticized in the collective Spanish consciousness. Potosí became synonymous with decadence and economic abundance within the quotidian use of the Spanish language, both in Spain and in the New World. Quickly, the city that grew around the mountain expanded, becoming one of the most important mining centers in Spanish America, and possibly the world, supplying silver to Spain and the rest of Europe, as well as the Ottoman Empire, China, and

\(^{23}\) This origin story comes from oral traditions in the high Andes, but there are other theories to explain the etymology of the name *Potosí*. It is suggested that the name may also have evolved for the Quechua word that refers to the sound a hammer makes when hitting silver ore. Others also question the validity of the story of Huayna Capac’s experience as simple propaganda by the Spanish to explain the Spanish extraction of silver from the Cerro Rico. While interesting, these issues are peripheral to the story of de Holguín and de Berrío. For further discussions on the origins of Potosí, see: Robert L. Smale, “*I Sweat the Flavor of Tin*”: Labor Activism in Early Twentieth-Century Bolivia, (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2010), 8-37.

Japan.\textsuperscript{25} The population of the rough and arid Andean town boomed, with thousands of Spaniards venturing to Potosí to find wealth, accompanied by thousands of free and forced indigenous workers, and a smaller population of enslaved Africans.\textsuperscript{26} Less than thirty years later, the census of 1573 put the population of Potosí at 120,000, one of the largest populations in the world, surpassed only by London.\textsuperscript{27} The 1611 census lists the population as 160,000, ten times bigger than Boston at the time. Of these 160,000, 76,000 were indigenous, 3,000 Spaniards, 35,000 Criollos, and 6,000 Africans or Mulattos.\textsuperscript{28} Potosí’s population reached its height in 1650, but declined when the rate of silver production fell, due to the decreased availability of silver ore in the Cerro Rico, the complex and costly smelting methods required to extract the metal, and the declining market prices of silver.\textsuperscript{29} The population decline continued well into the nineteenth century, by which time the city was reduced to only a few thousand inhabitants. By the time de Holguín painted \textit{Entry of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo} in 1716, the population of Potosí had

\textsuperscript{25} O’Flynn and Giraldez have defined two ‘cycles’ in the global silver trade throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. The first, named the “Potosí/Japan Cycle” lasted until the mid-seventeenth century. The second “Mexican Cycle” marks the period, beginning in 1700, when Mexican silver production overtook that of Potosí. In their analysis of the Potosí/Japan Cycle, the authors detail the trade of silver from Potosí to Spain that extended throughout Europe and Asia, including an analysis of silver smuggled from Potosí to China and Japan, often through the port city of Buenos Aires. See O’Flyyn and Giraldez, \textit{Global Economic Unity} for a more thorough analysis of the eighteenth century global silver trade. (Dennis Owen Flyn and Arturo Giráldez, “Cycles of Silver: Global Economic Unity through the mid-Eighteenth Century,” \textit{Journal of World History} 13, no. 2 (2002): 405.

\textsuperscript{26} While there was definitely a sizeable population of enslaved Africans in Potosí, many of them did not engage in mining labor. The mining labor force mostly comprised of indigenous workers who were forced into service under the mita system. The prohibitive costs and political restriction of importing slave labor from Africa to Potosí limited the work of African slaves to domestic or agricultural labor, with only a small presence in the mining sector. Issues of labor are discussed in more detail in Chapter 3.

\textsuperscript{27} Galleano, \textit{The Open Veins of Latin America}, 20.


\textsuperscript{29} Tandeter, \textit{Coersion and Market}, 78.
dropped to less than 70,000, and continued to wane, dropping further to 56,000 in 1770.\textsuperscript{30} Entry of the Viceroy and de Berrío’s Description were created in a moment of sharp descent in terms of both population and wealth in Potosí.

During the seventeenth century, Potosí became a glittering urban marvel, as one might think of cosmopolitan cities such as New York, London, or Hong Kong today. In its heyday, Potosí’s production of silver and near-incalculable wealth was notorious throughout not only the Spanish empire, but also the whole world. The production of silver in Potosí is viewed by economic historians such as Enrique Tandeter or Peter Bakewell, who have both written extensively on the mining industry in colonial Potosí, as a microcosm of the beginning of the capitalist system through which the contemporary global economy functions. While it is impossible to calculate the exact amount of silver that was extracted from the Cerro Rico, scholars, such as Dennis O. Flynn and Arturo Giráldez, posit that it is possible that the Cerro Rico produced as much as sixty percent of all the global silver mined in the second half of the sixteenth century.\textsuperscript{31} This profound injection of capital into the global economy fueled European capitalist development with more power than precious metal extraction in any other part of the Spanish Empire.\textsuperscript{32}

Despite the wealth flowing from the Cerro Rico, the city was also notorious for the poor conditions that workers faced in the mountain. Before long, the Cerro Rico became known as \textit{la montaña que come hombres}, or “the mountain that eats men.” Historians estimate that as many as eight million died in the mines of the Cerro Rico from 1545 to Bolivian independence in 1821.

\textsuperscript{30} Staller and Stross, \textit{Lightning in the Andes and Mesoamerica}, 41.

\textsuperscript{31} Dennis O. Flynn and Arturo Giráldez, “Born with a “Silver Spoon”: The Origin of World Trade in 1571” \textit{Journal of World History}, 6, No. 2 (Fall, 1995), 209.

Chroniclers and writers who visited Potosí, such as Luis Capoche, recorded the miserable conditions of the indigenous workers, who comprised the vast majority of the mining workforce: “[T]he hospital is full of Indians, and every day fifty die, because of this wild beast that swallows them alive.” The 1714 writings of Paraguayan official and academic, Pedro Vicente Cañete y Dominguez suggest that the conditions remained as wretched as in the beginning of Potosí’s history:

The metal vapor they inhale breaks them down to such a degree that, along with these heavy tasks, and the copious sweat with which the subterranean heat provokes and the excessive cold that they receive upon leaving the mine, they greet the dawn so languid and mortal that they appear to be cadavers.

The working conditions in the mines of the Cerro Rico continue to be a topic of debate and frustration today. In the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, the mines of the Cerro Rico produce titanium and zinc instead of colonial silver. Gabriela Massuh addresses the ongoing lack of safe working conditions that perpetuate in Potosí, paying particular attention to mining projects sponsored by corporations such as Río Tinto, Barrick Gold Corporation, BHP Biliton and Meridian Gold, which routinely exploit the Bolivian miners and their poor working conditions in the Cerro Rico to maximize profits. Throughout the history of Potosí, artists and authors have either directly engaged or ignored these rampant abuses and exploitative working conditions, revealing the tensions surrounding the mining industry in the city. In the cityscapes of de Holguín and de Berrío, visual references to labor and the mining industry in Potosí are either


minimized or completely absent. Even though the majority of representations of Potosí throughout colonial history privileged the production of silver and the riches of the Cerro Rico, images of working conditions or representations of laborers and miners were routinely eclipsed by depictions of ostentation and wealth. The views of Potosí created by de Holguín and de Berrío show a profound disinterest in labor, the mining industry or silver production, an important exclusion that sets the works apart from previous representations of Potosí, which I analyze further in Chapter 3.

*The History of Urban Representations of Potosí*

Urban representations are an integral part in conveying the history of Potosí. According to Francisco Godoy Vega, Potosí was the only colonial Spanish city that was repeatedly represented within its geographical environment. The relationship between the urban environment and the geographical surrounding of Potosí is apparent when de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* is compared with de Berrío’s *Description*. De Holguín disregards the natural landscape, relegating the iconic Cerro Rico to the landscape, breaking with the history of artistic representations of Potosí. As is explored in the following pages, previous representations of Potosí depicted the city as secondary to the Cerro Rico and the geography of the Andes. De Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* broke with previous conventions and traditions of artistic representations of Potosí to focus primarily on the *civitas*, the human presence in the urban space. Conversely, de Berrío’s work shows a balance between the geographic environment that preoccupied earlier views of the city and the communicentric view of the *civitas* championed in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy*.

An analysis of urban scenes of Potosí can establish a more complete understanding of visual culture and the colonial metropolitan space. Views of Potosí that predate those by de

---

Holguín and de Berrío can be classed into three categories: depictions of the Cerro Rico, images of labor, and representations of indigenous populations. Through a complex analysis of the existing artistic representations of Potosí, I argue that the paintings of de Holguín and de Berrío do not fit into any of these three categories; instead, they emphasize an artistic shift in pictorializing urban views of Potosí in the eighteenth century. The earliest views of Potosí were created shortly following the establishment of the city. These rudimentary views were intended to function as visual documents of the Cerro Rico, the mines and the veins of silver that were discovered in the mountain, but they also shed light on the way that Potosí was regarded by the earliest conquistadors. In these views, the city is most often reduced to a generic representation of urban space, with little effort to visualize the diverse populations or the city’s specific architectural details. Pedro Cieza de Leon created the first documented representation of Potosí in 1553 as part of his *Crónicas del Perú*, which detailed the Spanish expansion in the Viceroyalty of Peru (Figure 9). Cieza de Leon’s woodblock print focuses on the Cerro Rico, naming the veins of silver that were discovered in the mountain. Cieza de Leon made particular effort to depict the presence of water in the city, not only an important natural resource for the survival of the population in the arid climate of the high Andes, but also an integral ingredient in the silver smelting process. While Cieza de Leon made a rudimentary attempt at representing the urbs and civitas of Potosí, his depiction of Potosí focuses primarily on the relationship of the city to the Cerro Rico and the function of both in the silver extraction process. An engraving (ca. 1650-1700) located in the collection of the Biblioteca Nacional de España was presumably based on the Cieza de Leon print. The anonymous artist employed the same compositional organization of the image. Like Cieza de Leon, the anonymous artist concentrated particularly on the presence of water in the city, crudely exaggerating the river that flows through the city. The works of
Cieza de Leon and the anonymous artist offer simple and generic representations of the urban space, lacking any specific details of the architecture or the population of Potosí.

The Cerro Rico is the most significant feature in the earliest representations of Potosí. In 1599-1605, Diego de Ocaña produced a small ink on paper drawing of the Cerro Rico to accompany his *Relación del viaje de Fray Diego de Ocaña por el Nuevo Mundo* (Figure 10). The drawing, *Cerro de Potossí, Octaba Maravilla del Mundo*, which is in the collection of the University of Oviedo in Spain, privileges the mountain and the silver over the city. Ocaña made particular effort to document the names of the mines, usually that of a patron saint or religious figure, in his depiction of the Cerro Rico. Ocaña’s inclusion of the geographical names of the mines suggests that images of the Cerro Rico were used as more than just descriptions; they served as tools to convey specific information of commercial interest. These functions were instrumental in generating wealth in the Spanish colonial establishment at Potosí. At the base of the Cerro Rico, Ocaña included a description of the Cerro Rico and silver production underneath the drawing. The textual elements of this work further highlight the colonists’ interest was predominantly in the Cerro Rico and not the city itself: “this mountain of silver is everything.”

---

37 The full text at the base of drawing reads; “Guayna potossi [sic.], en lengua de indio se llama este cerro pequeño queire decir hijo de potossi, al norte esta es la octava maravilla del mundo y la mayor de todas; pues es todo este cerro de plata. Tiene por la parte de abajo en circuyto y en Redondo medido con cordel once mill y trienta y tres baras. Trabajan dentro de este cerro, todo los días, ocho mil indio, todos con velas de [cera] ... Ahora será justo tratar del cerro de Potosí y del lugar y de los indios y de las cosas que hay y gastos que se hacen; que en todo el universo pienso que no hay cosa más grandiosa que ver, un cerro mayor de que Cabeza Aguda y todo de plata que no hay puñado de tierra en él que no sea plata; de donde tanto millones se llevan a España cada año” [Guyana Potossi, in the language of the indian is the name of this small mountain which means ‘son of potossi’, at the north of this is the eighth wonder of the world, and the best/largest of all; because this mountain of silver is everything. It has at the base a circular loop of rope through 11,033 posts. Within this mountain work, every day, 8,000 indians with wax candles ... Now it is fair to treat the mountain of Potosí, and the place and the indians and the things that are there and the expenses; as in the whole universe I think that there is nothing more grandious to see, a mountain larger that the Cabeza Aguda and all the silver you can find in a handful of earth would not be silver, from where millions are taken to Spain every year].

21
A more developed view of Potosí (c. 1585, Figure 11) can be found in the collection of the Hispanic Society of America. While this representation of Potosí includes depictions of the city and urban life, the presence of the Cerro Rico and the silver mining industry dominate. Like the earlier works by Cieza de Leon and that in the Biblioteca Nacional de España, the habitations beyond the wall of the Casa de la Moneda are portrayed in a rudimentary manner reinforcing the artist’s disinterest in visualizing details. In the foreground of the composition, the artist depicts the Casa de la Moneda with particular detail, showing “the furnaces and melting pots, and large piles of silver ore” and indigenous workers minting silver from the Cerro Rico. Around the Cerro Rico, the artist includes more geological features, connecting Potosí with the rest of the Viceroyalty of Peru and the immediate area surrounding the city, such as the road to Tucamán and a smaller hill, Tollochi. While the anonymous artist included more specific details of the city, particularly the representation of indigenous laborers at the Casa de la Moneda, the primary focus of this drawing is the Cerro Rico and the extraction of silver over the urban space or the depiction of civic life. Even though de Berrío’s Description and, to a lesser extent, de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy also include geographical and logistical data similar to the earliest artistic representations of Potosí, the purposes of these two works extend beyond the primarily descriptive. While early representations convey specific visual information about Potosí, the Cerro Rico and the silver mines, Description and Entry of the Viceroy present a more nuanced,

38 This watercolor of the silver mines at Potosí, the Casa de la Moneda and the Cerro Rico was subsequently bound in a volume with astrological, cosmographic and marine charts that were completed by an anonymous Portuguese cartographer. (‘The Silver Mine a Potosí’, accessed on 1 August, 2015, http://www.learn.columbia.edu/hispanic/monographs/silver-mine.php).

39 Ibid.

40 Ibid.
analytical and somewhat misleading view of urban life within the city through the construction of a specific and exclusive civic identity.

The second category of colonial depictions of Potosí is primarily of labor, particularly the working conditions faced by the miners in the Cerro Rico. The two images I have included in this category are by European artists who never visited Potosí. It can be argued that these images function as examples of the Black Legend, the propagandistic campaign against the Spanish and their colonial enterprise that developed from the writings of the Protestant British and Dutch in the sixteenth century. Attributing these images to the Black Legend narrative explains the dearth of similar images by local indigenous or mestizo artists. By exploiting the injustices of the Spanish administration in Potosí, the writers and artists were able to shift public focus from the colonial enterprises of other European nations. While the images are concerned with working conditions, the artists show the indigenous miners as ‘types’ that conform to European preconceptions of indigeneity. In these scenes of the mines and the miners working within them, the artists are not concerned with the specific cultural or physical features of the workers, but with the conditions they endure to extract the silver ore from the Cerro Rico. In stark contrast to such images of labor, local artists such as de Berrío or de Holguín show the city and the elite population of Potosí but exclude images of labor or the mining industry, particularly in the case of de Holguín.

European artists placed particular emphasis on the working conditions within the mines of Potosí and the Cerro Rico. The earliest of these representations is Theodore de Bry’s

---

41 The ‘Black Legend’ was a term coined by the Spanish historian Julián Juderías in his 1914 critical history La Leyenda Negra y la Verdad Histórica. This tendency of demonizing the Spanish colonial practices was common in French, British and Dutch visual and literary culture throughout the colonial era.

The Mines of Potosí, published in José de Acosta's *Historia natural y mortal de las Indias* (1590, Figure 12). De Bry’s print, which became synonymous with tales of exploitation within the Cerro Rico, depicts a cross-section of the hollowed-out mountain, illustrating the brutal heat and hard labor faced by the miners of Potosí, most of whom were indigenous forced laborers and, in smaller numbers, African slaves. De Bry showed the miners in the nude, illuminated by the wax candles they carry on their thumbs. The men appear almost disfigured, their faces contorted by the agony of hard labor in the depths of the mines. A majority of the men chisel the sides of the Cerro interior, while others shovel the silver ore into packs and climb a rope ladder in the center, taking the ore out of the mountain. Outside the mine, a herder leads llamas laden with packs (presumably of silver) through the landscape (Figure 13). In another engraving created for the same publication, *Pack Train of Llamas Laden with Silver from Potosí Mines of Peru*, de Bry portrays a near-nude indigenous man, wearing only a loin cloth, carrying a bow and arrow, and leading a pack of llamas laden with what appear to be packs of silver on their back. Two Spaniards accompany the llama herder, presenting a visual comparison between the men which highlights the labor conditions forced upon the indigenous Andeans by the Spanish. Both of these images are concerned primarily with the injustices committed by the Spanish more than providing an accurate representation of the labor conditions or the indigenous workers themselves.

The indigenous men in de Bry’s engravings lack any Amerindian physical features. By not attempting to depict individual physiognomies, cultural practice or sartorial elements specific to indigenous Andeans, De Bry Europeanized the image of the indigenous population and simplified the native into a ‘type’ that conforms to European notions of indigeneity. Through a misrepresented image lacking in cultural specificities of Andean indigenous groups de Bry’s
Europeanized natives implored the intended (European) viewer’s sympathy for the exploited miner through an appeal to similarity and a disregard of difference, furthering an anti-Spanish narrative of conquest. While the conditions of the mines and the exploitation of indigenous workers is comprehensively detailed in literature throughout the colonial era, the fact that de Bry never crossed the Atlantic brings his motives in creating these works into question. Whether motivated by the Black Legend or by a genuine concern for the native miners of the Cerro Rico, de Bry’s prints nevertheless present indigeneity and the indigenous experience through a Eurocentric lens. The depictions of indigeneity are particularly important in the context of de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s views of Potosí for purposes of comparison. De Hoguín and de Berrío both focus primarily on the Spanish and Creole populations of the city, effectively excluding the ethnic and racial ‘other’ from the representations of civic identity, even though the majority of Potosí’s population consisted of indigenous workers. The indigenous majority in Potosí became even more pronounced during the population declines of the eighteenth century. As differently as de Bry approached representations of Potosí and Potosinos in contrast to de Holguín and de Berrío, both the absence and presence of the indigenous miner speaks to European and Creole hegemony throughout the colonial images of Potosí. In the case of de Bry’s images, or the complex paintings of de Holguín and de Berrío, the subject was always the Spanish presence in the Andes, either through the focus on Spanish guilt over the indigenous experience (de Bry) or as the central figure in Potosíno identity (de Holguín and de Berrío).

Similarly to de Bry’s illustrations of the mines of the Cerro Rico, the 1720 illustrated account published by “Le Sieur” Bachelier, Voyage de Marseille à Lima (Figure 14), shows an interest in and empathy toward the harsh labor conditions experienced by the miners in the
depths of the Cerro Rico. According to an analysis of the visual culture of the Black Legend by Deborah Poole, Bachelier’s engravings speak to a greater prevalence of anti-Spanish rhetoric in France, and the use of the Black Legend as an abstract mode of critique leveled against the French political establishment itself:

[eighteenth-century France was... interested in the Incas as the victims of a specific sort of European political treachery. As a once-civilized nation steeped in the ... glories of their solar religion, the Incas had been forcibly destroyed by the fanaticism of Catholic Spain ... For the French philosophers, this history of another European monarchy’s barbaric past offered a convenient ... avenue through which to extend their critique of the French monarchy and church.]

Like de Bry, Bachelier’s concern for the plight of the miner and the indigenous Andean is at odds with the generalized types of indigeneity he used in his representation of Potosí. Like most European artists depicting the indigenous inhabitants of the Andes, Bachelier’s miners appear decidedly European, with no trace of Amerindian physiognomy in their features. According to Poole; “Although Bachelier ... described the culture of the peoples he observed, he was apparently unconcerned with accounting for physical features, skin color, or appearance,” which is evident not just in Bachelier’s written account but also in the illustrations that accompany it. The ambivalent representation of racial difference presented in Bachelier’s view of the mines of the Cerro Rico appears to be informed by the theories of the French physician and travel writer, François Bernier (1620-1688), who anonymously penned the 1684 article “A New Division of the Earth according to Different Species of Races of Men.” In his text, Bernier broke from the

43 Bachelier’s first name was never printed in the editions of his travel journals, referred to only as ‘Le Sieur Bachelier’. The lack of precise identity gives further credence that ‘Bachelier’ was the nom de plume of a writer who, quite probably, never visited the Peruvian viceroyalty.


46 Baum, Rise and Fall of the Caucasian Race, 52.
traditional ideas of biblical human origins to a theory of European-centered conception of race, and he divided the world’s population into “four or five distinct races.” The first race enumerated in Bernier’s writings was not exclusively European but also included Indians, Egyptians, and Native Americans who Bernier remarked shared physical similarities with Europeans. As Bernier’s article informed the predominant understanding of race in early-eighteenth century France, the lack of physical differentiation of the miners in Bachelier’s Cerro Rico holds consistent with contemporary familiarity of racial difference.

Bachelier’s view of the mines is very similar to de Bry’s 1590 engraving and it is plausible that the artist came into contact with de Bry’s work in de Acostas’s history and based his own representation of the mines on de Bry’s print. Very little evidence remains regarding Bachelier’s voyage and several scholars have suggested that the travel account is a work of fiction. Bachelier depicts a dozen miners holding tall lanterns, ascending up the ladders that lead to the surface and working the interior of the mine with pickaxes and shovels. In this image, Bachelier Europeanized the men to the point that the image lacked any geographical or ethnographic specificity to suggest it was from the Peruvian viceroyalty. The only indication that the engraving is a representation of the mines of the Cerro Rico is the caption below the

47 Bernier, quoted in Baum, Rise and Fall of the Caucasian Race, 54.

48 Baum, Rise and Fall of the Caucasian Race, 55.

The Bachelier and de Bry prints, while both concerning themselves with the realities of labor and mining in Potosí, unlike the de Holguín and de Berrío, do not place much importance in the veracity of their images or in faithful representations of either the people of the surroundings. Conversely, both de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s scenes of Potosí show a disregard for labor; instead, they give preference to faithful representations of the urban landscape and certain elite demographics within the urban community. The shifted focus of Potosí’s identity between the prints by de Bry and Bachelier and the cityscapes of de Berrío and de Holguín make for an instructive comparison that highlights the inherent exclusions in the civic identities constructed by the two Andean artists.

While de Holguín does not include any references to labor and mining, de Berrío places more importance on the infrastructure surrounding silver extraction in Potosí. De Berrío’s representation shows the rocky Andes crisscrossed with roads that take the workers to the mines and to the lakes in meticulous detail; however, the workers and miners are rendered as de-individualized black figures, with no identity and in a much smaller scale that is appropriate for the scene (Figure 15). De Berrío takes great care to show the interconnectedness of mining throughout the Description, depicting the streams connecting the Kari-kari reservoirs (Figure 16) to the silver furnaces, or huayras (Figure 17), and to the town in the center of the composition but he does not employ the same level of descriptive interest in the workers. Unlike the other

50 Bachelier claims to have traveled to Lima, Callao, Potosí, Arica and Valparaiso in Voyage de Marseille á Lima et dans les autres lieux des Indes Occentales. Avec une exact description de ce qu’il y a de plus remarquable tant pour la geographie, que pour les mœurs, les costumes, le commerce, le gouvernement, et la religion des peuples; avec des notes et des figures en taille douce. Published in Paris, the account contains a dedication signed by Durrett. Nevertheless, it is presumably a fictitious voyage composed by Durrett to capitalize on the popularity of scientific and ethnographic voyages into the Spanish colonies of South America. In his 1835-1846 Bibliotheca Americana Nova, O. Rich writes; “Father Labat, however, says that the work [Voyage de Marseille à Lima] was entirely composed by Durrett from the relations of [Father Louis] Feuill[ée], with the addition of extracts from various other authors, without any acknowledgement” (O. Rich, Bibliotheca Americana, pg 28).
images of labor by de Bry and Bachelier, de Berrío presented no concern with regard the
conditions of the miners. Instead, he produced an image that exalts the mining industry as the
major method of wealth-production in Potosí. Ultimately, de Berrío’s disinterest in the works and
particular attention to the mining enterprises infrastructure further highlights the Spanish and
Creole focus of the artist’s conception of Potosí.

The third and final category of colonial representations of Potosí includes those by
indigenous or mesitzo artists, or those that were specifically created for an indigenous audience.
Unlike images of labor that include the indigenous workers, these urban images do not concern
themselves with issues of labor or the mining of silver, but rather with the pre-Columbian
indigenous presence, or the convergence of cultures following the Spanish conquest and
establishment of Potosí. Like the central paintings of this thesis, the works in this third category
misrepresent the realities of Potosí, but in a different manner. These works depict an idealized
urban space of cultural union between the Inca and the Spanish and construct a fantasy of racial
and cultural harmony within the city. In this category, there are two types of depictions of the city
that inherently differ from the de Holguín and de Berrío paintings. The first, images by
chroniclers Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala and Martin de Murúa, who worked together on the
earlier Murúa manuscript, highlight the indigenous presence in Potosí. Unlike de Berrío’s and
de Holguín’s later views of the city, these representations, while still showing the indigenous
political establishment as secondary to the Spanish crown, highlight the importance of the Inca
empire in the high Andes, and Potosí in particular. In this regard, both de Berrío’s and de
Holguín’s works depict the indigenous Potosinos as the subaltern population of the city,
racializing public space and further highlighting the strict racial hierarchy established by the

Spanish, which is expanded on further in Chapter 2. The earlier representations of Potosí, like the Guaman Poma or Murúa drawings, show the Inca presence in Potosí as an integral part of the city’s history.

Murúa’s view of Potosí and the Cerro Rico was published in his 1590 text, *Historia del origen y genealogía real de los reyes ingas del Pirú: de sus hechos, costumbres, trajes y manera de gobierno*, which mainly concerns itself with the Incaic history of Peru before the arrival of the Spanish (Figure 18). Found in the Galvin Manuscript of the text, Murúa’s ink and watercolor drawing, entitled *Cerro y Minas de Potosí*, shows an Inca wearing the distinctive red *mascapayacha* leaning over the Cerro Rico, holding onto two crowned columns, the Pillars of Hercules, featured in the Spanish coat of arms. In this composition, the Inca takes the place of the coat of arms, the Pillars of Hercules that flank him topped by two crowns and the words *Plus Ultra*. Unlike de Bry’s and Bachelier’s views of indigenous miners as ‘types’ that adhere to European ideas of indigeneity, Murúa’s illustrations and text exhibit a high level of accuracy and attention to detail in rendering sartorial, cultural, or physiognomical details of the indigenous people of Peru. The *uncu, mascapayacha* and ear ornaments worn by the Inca are an accurate reflection of indigenous costume in pre-conquest and colonial Peru. By embedding the Incan within references to the Spanish coat of arms Murúa implies Spanish dominance over the Andes. Murúa’s ultimate goal in composing his *Historia General del Piru* was to publish the manuscript

---

52 There are two versions of the Murúa text in existence today. The most complete is in the Getty Museum, and has been studied extensively. The second, which appears to be an earlier version not submitted by Murúa for publication, is the Galvin Manuscript, in a private collection. Murúa’s representation of Potosí is part of the Galvin manuscript which has not been published. For more information about Murúa’s *Historia General*, see: *The Getty Murúa: Essays on the Making of Martín de Murúa’s Historia General del Piru*, J. Paul Getty Museum Ms. Ludwig XIII 16, ed. Thomas B. F. Cummins and Barbara Anderson.

53 The importance of sartorial accuracy is particularly applicable to de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* and is further examined in Chapter 2.
in Spain, and the compositional prominence of the crowned columns and the references to the Spanish empire may have been intentionally employed by Murúa to facilitate securing the necessary permissions needed for publication, which was subject to heavy censorship by the Church and the Crown. Despite elements of the composition that may or may not have been compromised in an attempt to publish the illustrated text, Murúa’s illustration of Potosí pays tribute to the indigenous history of the area with almost equal importance to that of the Spanish colonial establishment in the Andes. Unlike de Berrío and de Holguín, who explicitly edited out all but the smallest references to the pre-Hispanic cultures in their views of Potosí, Murúa represented the cultural history of the city, incorporating explicit references to both the indigenous and Spanish.

Elements similar to the Murúa illustration can also be seen in the later illustration of Potosí by Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala (Figure 19), who worked with Murúa in writing his Historia General del Piru. In his 1615-1616 illustrated manuscript, Nueva Coronica y Buen Gobierno, Guaman Poma’s illustration of Potosí also emphasizes the indigenous presence in the city. In the text that accompanies the illustration, Guaman Poma underscores the Spanish dependence on the silver mined in Potosí.

Employing the same iconographic elements as Murúa, such as the Pillar of Hercules, the Spanish Plus Ultra and the prominent image of the

---

54 Guaman Poma writes; “Cuidad la Villa Rica Imperial de Potocchi [Potosí], por la dicha mina es Castilla, Roma es Roma, el Papa es Papa, y el rey es monarca del mundo; y la Santa Madre Iglesia es defendida, y nuestra fe guardada por los cuarto reyes de las Indias, y por el emperador Inga, agora lo apodera el Papa de Roma y Nuestro Señor Rey don Phelipe (sic) el tercero. Plus Ultra. Ego Fulcio Columnas Eius. Chinchaysuyo. Collasuyo. minas de Potosí de plata. Cuidad imperial Castilla.” (Guaman Poma, p. 860) (“City of the Rich Imperial town of Potocchi, for the aforementioned mines are Castille, Rome is Rome, the Pope is the Pope and the king is the monarch of the world, and the Holy Mother Church is defended, and our faith is guarded by the four kings of the Indies, and for the Inca emperor, now helping the Pope of Rome and Our Lord King don Felipe III. Chinchatsuyo. Collasuyo. The silver mines of Potosí. Imperial castilian city.”).

Inca, Guaman Poma’s *Ciudad la Villa Rica Enpereal de Potocchi* [sic] elaborates and further embellishes these elements.\(^{56}\) In the center, above the Cerro Rico, stand five indigenous men below the Spanish coat of arms. Highlighting the importance of the Inca in Potosí, Guaman Poma illustrated the individual *uncu* and *mascapayacha* designs for each of the men in great detail. Furthermore, he combined the Spanish ‘la Villa Rica [Imperial]’ and the Quechua ‘Potocchi,’ creating a unique convergence of culture and language in the title of the drawing. The amalgamations of Spanish and Quechua names and the representation of symbols of both the Inca and Spanish empires suggests an idyllic union of two empires with a subtext of mutual respect and equality. While the urban space in de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s cityscapes is heavily racialized and politicized through public display and performance (as is explored in Chapter 2), Guaman Poma’s Potosí shows a tranquil and neutral urban space at the base of the Cerro Rico, overlooked by representatives of the two empires: the Inca and the coat of arms and Pillars of Hercules of Spain.

The second type of images centered on the indigenous inhabitants of Potosí is religious imagery that employs the visual representations of the city and the Cerro Rico for didactic purposes. Closely related to the Murúa and Guaman Poma views of Potosí, these works show the presence of racial diversity in the city, but do not address the inherent tensions in the racialized space of the colonial Peruvian city. These works were often displayed in churches with predominantly indigenous congregations. The use of didactic art in a religious context was a common element of the evangelical nature of Spanish colonialism, and these images particularly conflate the image of the Catholic Virgin and the pre-Columbian *pachamama* in the form of the

---

\(^{56}\) sic., Interestingly, Guaman Poma refers to Potosí as ‘Ciudad’, or ‘City’ when there exists an abundance of literature that Potosí was never granted the official title of ‘ciudad’, but was instead referred to by the Spanish as the ‘Villa Imperial’ or ‘Imperial Town’. Only urban developments of great political importance such as Lima and Cusco were granted the title of ‘ciudad’ during the Spanish colonial era.
Cerro Rico. The pachamama, or Mother Earth, the Cerro Rico, and the Virgin became one entity in works such as the *Cerro Rico de Potosí* (1584-1588) by Francisco Tito Yupanqui, published as an illustration in the 1676-1736 chronicle *El mundo desde Potosí: Vida y Reflexiones de Orsua y Vela* (Figure 20). In this drawing, Yupanqui rendered the urban landscape of Potosí with great precision, taking care to delineate particular architectural elements in the grid of the streets shown below the mountain. Unlike the earliest views of Potosí, in which the urban landscape was generalized and devoid of a concentrated effort for specificity, Yupanqui’s drawing shows a rudimentary attempt to reproduce faithfully the grid of the city. From the iconic Cerro Rico, the Virgen de Copacabana rises out of smoke on the peak. Yupanqui, most known for his sculptural works, was an indigenous artist and, presumably, was cognizant of the connection between the Catholic Virgin and the indigenous Andean concept of the pachamama. Similarly, the Virgen del Cerro from the early eighteenth century, in the collection of the Casa de la Moneda in Potosí conflates indigenous and Catholic imagery into a representation of the Cerro Rico and Potosí (Figure 21). The Virgin, her hands and head protruding from the peak of the Cerro, is crowned from heaven by God and Jesus, with the Holy Spirit, shown in the form of a dove, and Archangels Michael and Gabriel in attendance. At the base of the Cerro Rico, Charles V, a cacique, the pope and a bishop look up at the divine coronation in prayer, with a view of Potosí contained in the globe in the central foreground, positioning the city at the center of the world. Along the mountain face, didactic imagery represents the story of Huayna Capac and Diego Huallpa and the discovery of silver in the Cerro Rico, and the wealth of the Cerro can be seen through silver ore spilling out of the mines. The Virgen del Cerro, like the aforementioned


examples of representations of Potosí by Murúa and Guaman Poma, illustrates a convergence of the Incaic and Hispanic worlds in the form of the Cerro Rico and Potosí as the center of the unified empires.

*De Holguín and de Berrío: A Comparison*

When the two images are examined within the context of early modern depictions of Potosí, I contend that both the de Holguín and de Berrío cityscapes broke the typical iconographic mold that centered on the Cerro Rico, the working conditions of the miners, and the political union of the Spanish and Inca empires. As pointed out by Kagan, the views of Potosí by de Holguín and de Berrío privilege the *civitas* over silver production. The subtext implied by the shift in representation is two-fold. Firstly, this form of representation underscores the cultural life outside of Potosí’s economic role in the Spanish Empire, an important representational change that corresponds with the dramatic decline of Potosí’s silver production. Secondly, this shift of focus implies a deliberate obstruction of both the decline of silver production and the cruelties that were, and continue to be, the reality for so many Potosinos. By no longer privileging the Cerro Rico, the artists both withhold representational agency of the city’s poor and working classes, but concede the diminished importance of the Cerro Rico and its dwindling silver production through the privileging of communicentric images.

While this shift may be explained by the continued decline of Potosí’s role in Spain’s colonial economy, it also shows a strengthening of racial hierarchies within public space and visual representation. This change was not universal, however, and images of Potosí that excluded the *civitas* continued to be produced into the eighteenth century. One such example is
the *Villa Imperial de Potosí* (1755-1775, Figure 22), at the Museo de Ejercito in Toledo. While it was created at the same approximate time as de Berrío’s *Description* and the two works bear a compositional similarity, the anonymous artist created a work concerned with the geographical and geological surroundings of the city rather than the diverse cultural life within it. The anonymous painting is ultimately more comparable to the previously discussed early modern images of Potosí, which focus almost exclusively on the Cerro Rico.\(^5^9\)

While the anonymous Toledo view of Potosí is compositionally similar to de Berrío’s *Description*, the functions of the two works were decidedly different. The Toledo view, which excluded the *civitas*, was created as a visual record of the city and its surrounding geography for the viceregal military. Conversely, de Berrío’s communicentric emphasis on the daily life of the city sets his *Description* apart, not only from the previous depictions of Potosí, but also from the contemporaneous anonymous cityscape.

Both de Berrío and de Holguín explicitly include references to geography, but while de Holguín focuses on the urban environment, de Berrío positions Potosí in its greater geographical context within the viceroyalty. Unlike the view of Potosí by de Holguín, de Berrío’s description of the city includes topographical elements of the landscape surrounding the city. While both works portray civic life, only de Berrío includes an extensive view beyond the city’s limits onto the mountainous surroundings around Potosí. Unlike the views of Potosí from the early modern period, or the anonymous image in the collection of the Museo de Ejercito in Toledo, however, de Berrío creates a view that combines both the communicentric elements of civic representation

---

\(^{59}\) At the time of writing, several sources, including the Museo de Ejercito, claim that the *Villa Imperial de Potosí* was painted by Francisco Xavier de Mendizabal. The memoirs of Mendizabal however, in line with Godoy Vega’s assertion, confirm that Mendizabal was the owner of this work and not the artist. Still in active duty in the Royal army in Peru at the time of Peruvian independence, it is impossible for Mendizabal to have painted the work in the mid-late eighteenth century.
with the importance and compositional dominance of the Cerro Rico. Conversely, de Holguín almost completely obscures the Cerro Rico from his *Entry of the Viceroy* with the processional celebrations welcoming Viceroy Morcillo into Potosí, showing the mountain subtly rising above the buildings in the smaller register, obscured by the city itself. Positioned in the top-center of de Berrío’s composition, the Cerro Rico is the most prominent element in the birds-eye view of Potosí, towering above the sprawling urban space below.

Despite the compositional similarities and differences of *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description*, the works functioned as representations of an ideal city and its *civitas*. In both examples, the artists created an edenic urban space, at the center of which was the white urban population. The overwhelming presence of white figures in both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s cityscapes as compared to the minimized roles of indigenous or Afro-Peruvian groups highlights the ideal Potosí as the city of luxury and excess inhabited by the Spanish and Creole elite. Through the exclusion of miners and other laborers from the image of the colonial Andean city, de Holguín and de Berrío also created a space where wealth and luxury objects are distanced from their modes of production. The emphasis on not just the white elite of the city, but Potosí’s reputation as a city of excessive wealth is particularly palatable upon closer examination of the two paintings. *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description* helped fashion a civic identity that masked the ongoing crises in Potosí caused by dramatic falls in silver production and population. Despite their differences, both artists construct views of Potosí that address issues of local geography and the civic identity of the city.

**Conclusion**

What sets the views of de Holguín and de Berrío apart from previous representations of Potosí is the combination of the geographical, architectural, and communicentric elements of urban
identity. While there are many problematic issues with the exclusionary or idealized representation of the civitas of Potosí, which are elaborated in the following two chapters, both artists created cityscapes that are differentiated from previous images of the city, which are either logistical in purpose or lack the nuance and detail of Entry of the Viceroy or Description. Both de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s representations of Potosí present a particular view of the city’s imagined collective identity, unequivocally privileging the civitas over the physical and geographical realities of the city. The story of Potosí and its civic identity are directly related to its pictorial representations. Both de Holguín and de Berrío drew on a rich history of representing a city that captured international fascination and disdain. The views by de Holguín and de Berrío are complex and problematic images that defy categorization, unlike the previous images of Potosí that can be categorized into three main image types. The earliest views of Potosí from the sixteenth, seventeenth, and even eighteenth centuries focus on the Cerro Rico, portraying the geographical specificities of the mountain in great detail and rendering the city below in only rudimentary and generalized ways. Even though de Berrío does place the Cerro Rico in the center of the composition of Description, the image not only focuses on the identity of the city as related to the mountain, but also incorporates details that extend a seemingly more complete description of the identity of Potosinos and the city as a whole. Both de Berrío and de Holguín create a civic identity that is exclusive of laborers and miners who constituted the largest group of the city’s residents. While there is a history of images concerning the hardships and inhumane conditions faced by the miners of the Cerro Rico, de Berrío and de Holguín have excluded such identities and dialogues from their views of Potosí, fashioning a city in which the notorious exploitation of human and natural resources is distanced from the presented image of wealth and luxury. Even as European artists such as de Bry and Bachelier mythologized the extreme
exploitation of miners in line with the narrative of the Black Legend, the two Andean-born artists chose to represent the city as an edenic urban space for a largely white *civitas*. Lastly, the views of Potosí painted by de Berrío and de Holguín include no, or very little, reference to the pre-Columbian past of the Andes and the area surrounding Potosí. Unlike chroniclers such as Guaman Poma de Ayala and Martin de Murúa, who idealized Potosí as a convergence of indigenous and Hispanic cultures in their early representations of the city, *Description* and *Entry of the Viceroy* are decidedly contemporary images, which function as fictions and ideals of the city in the first half of the eighteenth century. Furthermore, neither of the two focal artists presents an explicitly religious context in their renderings of Potosí. Even though both de Berrío and de Holguín were primarily painters of sacred subjects, neither artist explored the way in which the Cerro Rico, the Amerindian *pachamama*, and the Catholic Virgin could be combined to create an image of racial, religious, and cultural syncretism. Through the fabrication of a civic identity, de Berrío and de Holguín manufactured a city that reflects the lifestyle of the exclusively elite, mostly white Potosinos, emphasizing the affluence, Catholicism and racial homogeneity of the most elite echelons of Potosí.
CHAPTER 2: CIVIC SPACE, PERFORMANCE, AND THE POLITICS OF RACE AND REPRESENTATION

“I am rich Potosí,
I am the treasure of the world,
I am the king of mountains
and I am the envy of kings”60

On October 8, 1621, news that the Spanish King Felipe III had died reached Lima. On the Plaza Mayor, the bells of the Cathedral tolled one hundred times in honor of his memory.61 Black cloth covered the city and hung from the windows and balconies in mourning for the Felipe III. In February of the next year, a proclamation that Felipe IV was the new king of Spain reached the colonies, and the city’s black cloths of mourning were replaced with celebratory banners and draperies to welcome the new king of the Empire. A portrait of Felipe IV arrived in the port city of Callao that same year. The painting was so heavy that it took four men to carry it into the center of Lima. The portrait was placed on a throne in the Plaza Mayor as a surrogate for the actual man, who would never visit Lima, and two hundred infantrymen, one hundred artillerymen and mounted companies of musketeers gave an extravagant salute while the residents of Lima cheered from the balconies, rooftops and streets.62 In Inventing Lima, Alejandra Osorio includes this ceremonious account of the veneration of the king’s portrait in Peru and the political purposes of large public spectacles and processions throughout the streets.

60 “Soy el rico Potosí, del mundo soy el tesoro; soy el rey de los montes, envidia de los reyes.” Hanke, Lewis U. ”El otro tesoro de las Indias: Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela y su Historia de la villa imperial de Potosí.” Actas del Segundo Congreso Internacional de Hispanistas. Instituto Español de la Universidad de Niméga, 1967.


62 Ibid, 82.
and civic spaces of colonial cities in the Spanish empire. The simulacrum of the pomp and royal ceremony of Madrid that Osorio describes taking place in Lima was repeated throughout the viceroyalty of Peru to reinforce the hegemony of Spanish power in viceregal Peru, and, consequently, to impress upon local populations Spanish racial and social hierarchies.63

In Potosí, public performances and processions were used in the same manner to impress upon the population the totality of colonial government. The ceremonies enacted a form of ‘performance of empire’ that were accompanied by the extensive use of visual imagery, particularly painting, in civic spaces to augment the Spanish colonial administration in the daily life of the viceroyalty. Not only did visual imagery take the place of a royal presence, as in the case of Felipe IV’s portrait, but also it integrated a performative language into the colonial establishment that could be easily understood by the indigenous majority to strengthen further a hierarchical and racialized construction of society and public space.

The issues of performance and the politics of representation in colonial civic spaces, such as those exemplified in de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s scenes of Potosí, are integral to the understanding of colonial structures of power within the high Andes. Like the stately example of the King’s portrait in Lima, the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo’s entry into Potosí in de Holguín’s painting and the festivities depicted provide a visual example of the continuum of performance and pageantry essential to the Spanish colonial establishment on a local level. Not only do de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy and de Berrío’s Description typify communicentric views of the city of Potosí, they also serve as documents detailing the performative elements of colonialism essential to the social structures that facilitated Spanish and Creole dominance throughout the Empire. Moreover, the two works show civic spaces as racialized through the inequality of

63 Ibid.
representation of different peoples within the cityscape, favoring the white inhabitants of the city. This inequality of representation is more strongly present in de Berrío’s *Description* with the privileging of European and Creole figures throughout the composition and the near-erasure of the African and indigenous communities, who mostly comprised the extensive mining labor force. The inequality of representation in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* is not as obvious as in Berrío’s *Description*, but the depiction of indigenous and African inhabitants of Potosí as pacified and passive actors within public life illustrates the idealized European view of subaltern communities as complicit in the white construction of the civic space.\(^{64}\)

This chapter is divided into two main parts. The first elaborates on the issue of civic performance and the ways in which performative culture facilitated the imperial ambitions of the Spanish crown. In particular, this section will focus on the pictorial narratives of political procession, particularly those in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy*. The second part deconstructs the racialization of public space in de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s views of Potosí. While the erasure of populations and cultures through a Eurocentric construction of the cityscape is expanded upon in Chapter 3, the absence of subaltern populations is inextricably intertwined with the racialization of public space and how it served the purpose of colonial power structures. Both de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s works represent the city in a moment of celebration, obfuscating the documented decline of Potosí in the eighteenth century. Digging below the celebratory surface of the two cityscapes sheds light on the use of performance for the purposes of augmenting colonial hierarchies of power and also exemplifies how the racialization of civic space enforced the inequality inherent to the foundations of the Spanish establishment in the New World.

Civic Performance and the Politics of Representation: Potosí and the Corpus Christi

Celebrations in Cusco

The arrival of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo in Potosí was a momentous event that exemplified the dual influences of the Catholic Church and Spanish colonial administration which extended even into the harshest geographical areas of the Peruvian viceroyalty, blending the secular and the religious. In early 1716, Philip V named Morcillo, the then-archbishop of Charcas, as the interim viceroy of Peru, following the removal of Diego Ladrón de Guevara, who was stripped of the title of viceroy for embezzlement. De Holguín highlights the importance of Morcillo’s secular and holy offices through the incorporation of both his titles in the description of the painting, and the prominent display of religious and allegorical images, framed along the processional route. As the artist’s only known secular work, *Entry of the Viceroy* follows the iconographic and compositional conventions of devotional imagery and processional representations found in colonial Spanish religious painting. Most notably, the work has been almost universally compared to a series of Corpus Christi paintings found in the Museum of the Archbishop in Cusco, originally created for the Santa Ana church, built over the pre-Columbian Inca shrine of Marcatampu. Initially made by de Mesa and Gisbert in 1953, the comparison has been accepted by most art historians:

---


66 For an expanded analysis of the paintings displayed along the processional route, see: Lucia Querejazu-Escobari, *El programa emblemático en la entrada del virrey Morcillo a Potosí en 1716* (2011).

67 Colonial churches were often built directly on the sites of important sites in native religion, in order to transition the population from indigenous beliefs practices to Christianity. Bauer, Brian S. *The Sacred Landscape of the Inca: The Cusco Ceque System*, 66.
The antecedents of the *Entry of the Viceroy Morcillo*, while not abundant, can be found in scenes painted for official or religious orders. We should not forget the series of eight [later found to be sixteen] paintings of *The Procession of the Corpus [Christi] of Santa Ana del Cusco* which were painted in the second half of the seventeenth century, which are the most closely related to Holguín in theme and composition. In these paintings, we see the entire sequence of the court, triumphal arches and churches in the background, portraits, ladies on balconies, etc. The same spirit informs the canvases of Holguín and those of Cusco, there is a similarity of composition, disposition of persons and scenes, etc.\(^{68}\)

Painted in the last quarter of the seventeenth century, the sixteen canvases represent confraternities, sodalities, and indigenous parishes processing in the streets of Cusco with icons of their patron saints, celebrating Corpus Christi, a holiday that became emblematic of the cultural convergence in Cusco, since it marked the moment when the Christian and Inca calendars aligned.\(^{69}\) Along with the processions, the anonymous Cuzqueñan artists also included individualized portraits of local political and ecclesiastical authorities.\(^{70}\)

Carolyn Sue Dean contends that the Corpus Christi series “[differs] from the majority of colonial period artistic output because [it is] neither biblical nor hagiographic in subject, but rather depict[s] a local, experienced event.”\(^{71}\) This assertion illuminates the case of *Entry of the Viceroy*, especially as de Holguín’s only known non-devotional painting. While the *Entry of the Viceroy*...

---

\(^{68}\) De Mesa and Gisbert, 1953, p 130; “Los antecedentes de la “Entrada Virrey Morcillo”, si bien no abundan, habrá que buscarlos en cuadros pintados or encargos oficiales o religiosos. No debemos olvidar la conocida serie de ocho lienzos de “La Procesión de Corpus” de Santa Ana del Cusco que pintados en la segunda mitad del siglo XVII, son lo más próximos a Holguín en tema y composición. En estos cuadros, también vemos toda la sucesión de un cortejo, arcos triumfales e Iglesias en el fondo, retratos, damas en los balcones, etc. El mismo espíritu informa los lienzos de Holguín y los de Cusco, hay similitud en la composición, disposición de personajes y escenas, etc. Ello demuestra que a pensar de la lejanía material de las ciudades, un solo hálito artístico común, se esparcía por todo el virreinato: era el barroco andino del que participan en mayor o menor grado los maestros de las tierras altas.”

\(^{69}\) twelve canvases are in the Archbishop’s Museum of Religious Art in Cusco, while four others are in private collections in Santiago de Chile; three in the collection of Carlos Larraín Peña and one in the collection of Ricardo Claro Valdés (Ricardo Mariátegui Oliva, 1983, pg 23).


\(^{71}\) Ibid.
Viceroy and the Santa Ana series have compositional and iconographic similarities, de Mesa’s and Gisbert’s assertion that the Santa Ana Corpus Christi series acts as an antecedent of artistic lineage between Cusco and de Holguín’s representation of Potosí implies an overly simplified artistic uniformity across vast geographical distances, and does not address the inherent politics of image-making in the colonial context. I contend that the similarities between the Santa Ana series and Entry of the Viceroy extend beyond the formal elements of the Andean Baroque into the complex politics of representation within the Spanish colonial establishment, using Dean’s research on the Santa Ana series as a model. The aesthetic similarities privileged in de Mesa’s and Gisbert’s comparative analysis of the two works do not address their propagandistic elements, the function of these works within the Spanish program of visual culture, or the role in which images played in reinforcing dominant power structures. A more nuanced comparison, building upon the research on the Santa Ana series by Dean, reveals that processional scenes were created for a specific political purpose within the program of visual culture created by the Spanish colonial administration. Furthermore, the presumption that the Santa Ana series was the most important antecedent for de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy precludes works from the early eighteenth century that follow the same compositional construction and contain similar political subtexts throughout the viceroyalty of Peru, from Lima to Cusco. Looking beyond the relationships between the Santa Ana series and Entry of the Viceroy into processional elements in de Berrío’s Description as well as similar scenes from throughout the Spanish empire further illuminates the ways in which processional paintings were visual tools used to colonize and politicize civic space and public life.

Nine of the sixteen canvases that comprise the Santa Ana series demonstrate the distinct processional participation of five Cuzqueña parishes; San Sebastian, San Blas, San Cristobal,
Hospital de los Naturales and Santiago, and four monastic orders that had a presence in colonial Cusco; Mercedarian, Augustinian, Franciscan, and Dominican. The other seven canvases show important iconographic elements of the Corpus Christi procession in Cusco, including a re-enactment of the Last Supper, saints that were of particular devotional importance in Cusco; Saint John the Baptist, Saint Peter and Saint Rose of Lima (Figure 23), and depictions of the contemporary civic and religious authorities in Cusco at the end of the seventeenth century. The final canvas, the largest of all sixteen, represents the Processional Finale entering the Cathedral of Cusco at the Plaza de Armas (Figure 24). In terms of iconography and composition, the Santa Ana series and *Entry of the Viceroy* employ the same visual techniques as de Holguín to depict processions through the urban landscape, privileging the city over the natural mountainous surroundings. In these two examples, the imposing Andes are relegated to a small section of the compositional space. Both Cusco and Potosí were dependent on the natural landscape surrounding them, either for mineral extraction, strategic position or the cultural significance of the city. The Santa Ana series and *Entry of the Viceroy* exemplify the communicentric view of either city, focusing on the inhabitants and their cultural practices over the geographical and strategic place of the city within the natural landscape. Furthermore, the two artists represent their cities in a high level of detail, including architectural specificities and individualized portraits of the inhabitants of Cusco and Potosí.

Both the Santa Ana Corpus Christi series and *Entry of the Viceroy* employ a cathedral- or plaza-centered view of the city. In both cases, the plaza or cathedral becomes a microcosm of the greater urban environment. Similarly, another anonymous representation of Cusco in the *Corpus Christi Procession* (c. 1700, Figure 25) minimizes the representation of public space to

---

create a contained view of a more complex and expansive urban entity. In his analysis of representations of urban Cusco, Kagan suggests that the *Corpus Christi Procession* was possibly influenced by the earlier Santa Ana series. The later *Corpus Christi Procession* bears more resemblance to de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* due to the elongated rectangular form of the single canvas, following the processional path. Even though the level of skill and detail is comparable between *Entry of the Viceroy* and the Santa Ana series, the long rectangular form lends itself more fluidly to the depiction of the processional route, than a series of stouter canvases, in which the action of the procession is condensed to fragments as opposed to a continual performative whole.

It is imperative to note that these two works are not the only ones employing these iconographies and compositional techniques, but offer two examples of a visual formula of processional representations that extended throughout the viceroyalty of Peru, as well as in New Spain. The same convention appears in the early eighteenth-century *Procession in the Plaza Mayor of Lima* (Figure 26), currently at the Convento de San Francisco in Lima, in which the processional route around the Plaza Mayor in the historic center of Lima is represented in two elongated canvases that take a similar form to the later *Procession of the Corpus Christi* and *Entry of the Viceroy*. Employing the tropes of processional iconography, the Limeñan artist shows the procession’s spectators leaning out of the mozarabic balconies that line the Plaza Mayor, activating the private interior space of the vernacular architecture as an extension of the public space of the processional route.

The Santa Ana series and *Entry of the Viceroy* exemplify the highest level of artistic skill in colonial Andean painting in applying visual tropes such as the baldachin and the use of triumphal arches typical of colonial processional imagery to present a highly politicized
view of urban space. Both de Holguín and the anonymous Cusco artists specifically employed
the suggestion of interior spaces along the processional route by positioning spectators in the
windows and displaying flags, banners and textiles draped from walls and windows, an
iconographic element adapted from Spanish processional imagery. This technique of combining
private interior space with the public setting for the procession further engages the *civitas* with
the public urban experience and extends the public space into the private space of the home. The
flags and curtains suspended along the route break the stasis and rectilinear pattern of the urban
architecture with curved lines and bright colors. The fabrics appear to be moving in the wind;
their dynamic forms directly contrast with the straight lines of the architecture of Cusco and
Potosí, adding visual interest and a sense of spectacle to the festivities. The presence of fabrics in
the forms of banners, flags and curtains further elucidate the interaction between the human
presence and the urban architectural setting, both compositionally and iconographically. The
viewers and processional participants engage with the temporary textile installations along the
processional route; most prominently visible in the Santa Ana scene of the *San Cristobal Parish*
(Figure 27), where a group of three young boys just to the left of the central figure of the patron
saint, pull back a red curtain suspended along the processional route in order to be able to view
the action. Similarly, in *Entry of the Viceroy*, several figures, particularly an old woman, near the
center of the main scene, can be seen peering through the fluttering textiles along Calle Hoyos in
order to see the Viceroy and his entourage entering Potosí (Figure 28). The presence of the group
of young boys in the Santa Ana series and the woman in *Entry of the Viceroy* provides a
compositional break in the otherwise repetitive nature inherent in processional representations.

The textiles in the cityscape convey a heraldic function as well as a compositional one,
designating particular cultural groups, confraternities or organizations that are present within the
procession. One such example in *Entry of the Viceroy* is the building directly adjacent to the primarily indigenous parish of San Martín, which is decorated with indigenous textiles that are stiff and multicolored in contrast to the light, monochromatic fabrics that line the other buildings along Calle Hoyos. The indigenous textiles suspended from the Iglesia San Martín are *llicllas*, woven textiles worn by women in the pre-conquest Andes. The particular design of the *llicllas* not only reaffirms the women’s indigeneity, but also suggests kinship ties denoted by the colors and patterns woven into the textile. In the Santa Ana series, the textile elements, such as banners and flags that are carried by the processional participants, differentiate cultural groups, confraternities and parishes in communal religious festivities such as Corpus Christi. The textile banners were used to represent the religious and civic organizations around the city and were often carried by the noble indigenous participants in the Corpus Christi procession. Similar banners and standards can be seen in the procession in de Berrío’s *Description* (Figure 31). The descending procession in de Berrío’s cityscape contains many of the same processional elements as the Santa Ana series. A majority of the processional participants carry white banners while one of them holds a particular flag to denote the specific confraternity or parish involved in this religious procession. The flag-bearer is accompanied by a small group who hauls the devotional image down the mountainside from a small chapel on the outskirts of the city.

Textile also plays a role in processional identity in the sartorial depiction of the figures in *Entry of the Viceroy* and the Santa Ana series. The women depicted atop the Iglesia San Martín, besides one European woman accompanied by her African maidservant, wear typically

---


74 Dean, *Inka Bodies*, 11.
indigenous dress complete with capes or shawls, which were usually fastened with *tupu* pins, and embroidered turbans worn by Andean women, which, like the woven *licllas* suspended from the parapet, suggest membership in a particular indigenous cultural group.\(^75\) Dean explores the same sartorial elements in the Santa Ana series, particularly in the canvas showing *Saint Rose and ‘La Linda’* (Figure 29) in which the women are wearing similar costumes as the native women in *Entry of the Viceroy*, complete with the embroidered turbans, various hairstyles and other outwardly markers of race and culture (Figure 30).

*Entry of the Viceroy* and the Santa Ana series both employ idealized and orderly representations of public procession. Neither de Holguín nor the anonymous Cusco artist includes any serious suggestion of the reality of the processional experience, which included rowdy crowds and outbursts of violence. Conversely, de Berrío’s procession in *Description* is unorganized, dispersed and spread across the mountain outside the city. The disorder of processional representation by de Berrío also extends into the suggestion of violence as one processional participant lies prostrate on the ground near the chapel while a man on what appears to be a donkey or horse stands above him. In his 2010 film, *The Silver and the Cross*, Harun Farocki remarks on this particular element as the only iteration of violence against the indigenous body in de Berrío’s idealized view of Potosí. The willful ignorance of the violence inherent in Potosí is further extrapolated in Chapter 3, but bears mentioning here with regard to the processional elements contained in both de Holguín and de Berrío’s views of Potosí. Several of the other participants appear to be running from the site into the workers’ quarters on the

\(^75\) Dean identified the turban in her discussion of the Santa Ana series: “Most have braided their long raven hair; many wear small woolen and embroidered turbans, while some have headbands. The turbans are worn by females in over half of the canvases of the Corpus Christi series. ... They may be a particular Andean ethnic style.” Carolyn Sue Dean, “Painted images of Cuzco’s Corpus Christi: Social Conflict and Cultural Strategy in Viceregal Peru” (PhD diss. University of California Los Angeles, 1990), 307.
outskirts of Potosí, suggesting further that a fight has broken out and the man has been either injured or killed. The disarray of the procession provides an element of the harsh reality of devotional performance in the colonial Andes. It challenges the orderly processional imagery of the Cusco or de Holguín scenes in which drama and compositional disharmony is limited and contained only to small irregularities in an overall regulated processional flow.

Like the use of textile and fabrics in processions in colonial Peru, the triumphal arch is also a recurring iconographic element in processional imagery, as has been documented in textual sources by chroniclers such as Bernabé Cobo (1582-1657), Joseph de Mugaburu (active 1640-1697) and Bartolomé Arzans Orsua y Vela (1674-1736). In late seventeenth-century Lima, Mugaburu provided the first references triumphal arches in Lima for the arrival processions of Viceroy Lemos (1667), Castellar (1674) and Salvatierra (1678). The temporary structures erected to honor viceregal entrances into major cities were usually made of wood or plaster, or other light-weight and easily-manipulated material. For added splendor, the arches were covered in silver and decorated with colorful fabrics, as evidenced by their representation by de Holguín. Dean has revealed that in Cusco, triumphal arches were erected for the processions marking the arrival of viceroys Toledo (1571) and Lemos (1668). The proliferation of references to temporary triumphal arches used in both religious and profane processions and their presence in both the Corpus Christi series and Entry of the Viceroy is not surprising (Figure 32). Dean describes temporary triumphal arches as visual cues to herald a victor, whether in the

---


78 Dean, Inka Bodies, 18.
abstract form of devotional objects in the Corpus Christi, signaling the triumph of Christ, or in the political triumph of a viceroy entering a community. Both triumphal arches shown in Potosí and in the Santa Ana series are imbued with an imperial subtext, functioning within the European cultural paradigm.

Colonial authorities often employed temporary constructions, such as canopies, floats and temporary altars in processional events to augment the narrative of Spanish victory and conquest and instill the colonial hierarchy in the general urban population in cities such as Cusco and Potosí. When considering these *Entry of the Viceroy* and the Santa Ana series as representative of colonial narratives, the triumphal arch reinforces the conquest by both the Catholic Church and the colonial establishment over the communities and cultures indigenous to the Peruvian highlands. In a tradition that extends back to the Roman Empire, temporary structures are used in both Corpus Christi celebrations and to mark the arrival of the viceroy, reinforcing Spanish and Catholic dominance within the urban spaces of Cusco and Potosí and politicizing the processional space into a microcosm of conquest and colonialism.

The ephemeral architectural elements of religious and profane celebrations in the colonial world not only add to the jubilant nature of these events, but also create an atmosphere that elevated the status of colonial political and church officials as well as religious icons. In the case of *Entry of the Viceroy*, Archbishop Morcillo enters the city under an elaborate baldachin canopy with gold tassels, held above his horse by eight clergymen in red robes (Figure 33). De Holguín represents the archbishop’s hands in a gesture of benediction to the city, reinforcing his dual religious and civic authority. In the top left register, the archbishop enters the Iglesia Matriz under the same baldachin, similarly attended to by the same group of clergymen. At the open

---

79 Ibid, 9.
entrance of the cathedral, priests welcome the processional group. Similarly, the baldachin is employed by the artists of the Santa Ana series’ Bishop Molliendo Leaving the Cathedral (Figure 34) and Processional Finale, in which the Bishop of Cusco, carrying with him the monstrance and the host, is accompanied by a group of city councilmen who carry the baldachin canopy. Within the context of the Santa Ana scenes and Entry of the Viceroy, the depiction of the baldachin marks key moments of the procession, highlighting the bishop or the viceroy within the processional crowds. The visual and processional significance of the baldachin canopy in colonial visual culture is most clearly demonstrated in Marian representations, depicting statues of the Virgin under canopies similar to those above Bishop Molliendo in the Santa Ana series, or over Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo in Entry of the Viceroy. The Cusqueñan Our Lady of Cocharcas Under the Baldachin (Figure 35) from 1765 exemplifies the traditional use of the baldachin “as a cloth canopy fixed or carried over an important person or a sacred object.”80 Emily A. Engel provides an iconographic analysis of Our Lady of Cocharcas and its Spanish influence, particularly with regard to the baldachin in religious processions. According to Engel, the baldachin supported by four poles decorated with ribbons and flowers, was an integral part of the processional platform (known as the paso de palio) that usually transported the advocation of the Virgin in religious ceremonies across Spain.81 The use of such processional elements in the Hispanic colonies, including in Peru, was directly imported from the Iberian Peninsula, where the use of processional altars for religious ritual existed for centuries before the conquest.82 In the examples of the Santa Ana series and, even more so, in Entry of the Viceroy, the distinct Marian


81 ibid.

82 ibid.
connotations of the baldachin in a processional context are altered. The application of the baldachin in situations that do not involve the Marian image suggests that this processional element became a marker of social and religious elevation equivalent to the elevation of the Virgin in Catholic theology and religious practice, highlighting the fluidity between religious and civic political administrations in the Spanish colonial world. Furthermore, while the religious and processional function of the baldachin is not unique to the Andean colonial world, its use, particularly within images of racially striated societies such as Potosí and Cusco, takes on a highly politicized iconographic significance, reiterating narratives of colonial power.

Both the Santa Ana series and *Entry of the Viceroy* demonstrate the fluidity between liturgical celebration and civic performance. The religious and political establishments in Spain and its colonies existed symbiotically and acted in a concentrated manner in the management and implementation of colonial hierarchies and strategies of racial and cultural superiority. In both de Holguín and de Berrío, the pictorial representation of public processions further highlight the complex political and social narratives that were played out in public spaces, and particularly in the diverse and sometimes volatile city of Potosí. Through their engagement with the processional performance within the urban landscape, the spectators and participants engaged in a tense display of identity that was mediated by the political motivations of the artist. While de Holguín’s processional work alludes to the greater tradition of representing public performance and pageantry in colonial Peru, the disorderly procession in de Berrío’s *Description* disputes the idealized and regimented notion of pageantry and suggests violence and chaos were inherently associated with such public displays of religious and political allegiance.
Civic Space as Racialized Space

Public performances, processions, and their representations within the urban space were used by the Spanish to reinforce structures of colonial authority inherent in the colonial establishment. In Potosí, the economic center of the Spanish empire throughout most of the seventeenth century, these hierarchical structures were part of a system that was both fueled by and resulted in economic inequalities within the community that and further enhanced the inherent imbalance of power. Infused into the power structures themselves was the inherent racial differentiation that sustained a complex and distinct system of categorization and oppression in the Spanish colonial world. The racially-striated society constructed by the Spanish influenced the construction of urban and civic spaces, a key underlying theme in the Potosí cityscapes of de Holguín and de Berrío. The racialization of public space was a result of the contemporary attitudes toward race and differentiation in the Spanish colonial world. Public space reinforced and strengthened prevailing attitudes towards subaltern indigenous and Afro-Peruvian communities. Cityscapes of Potosí and other urban epicenters, such as Lima or Mexico City, negotiated these complex dialogues between race and public space.

De Holguín and de Berrío apply particular approaches to race within their images of Potosí, altering and challenging the notions of Peninsular superiority, while denying representation or engagement to indigenous or Afro-Peruvian communities. While they both highlight the centrality of white Creole Potosinos within their cityscapes, both artists deviate slightly from the racial hierarchy imposed by the Spanish that privileged peninsular Spaniards over Creoles. Conversely, the artists represent the Creole populations as the height of civility in Potosí, excluding any defined representation of Peninsulares. The idea of Creole superiority is most strongly presented in Bartolomé Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela’s Historia de la Villa Imperial de
Potosí (1702-1736). In his chronicle, Arzáns, like most Potosinos, equated the city of Potosí with the Cerro Rico. Arzáns’s Historia presents a chronicle of the silver city critical of the secular Spanish authorities responsible for the administration of the silver mining industry. While documenting the rapid decline of the city, Arzáns constructs specific ideas about which individuals comprise the civitas of Potosí and reinforces the hierarchy of race within the city.

Kagan’s examination of Historia within the context of urban images shows that Arzáns’s text attributes the decline of the city on the population of Spaniards, Africans, and most mestizos while enumerating the virtues of the creoles of Potosí. Arzáns describes only ‘los naturales de Potosí’, or the creole population, in any favorable manner. In what was for the time a contentious notion, Arzáns implies that the loyal and noble creoles, or peruanos de Potosí, constituted a nation within the viceroyalty of Peru. Arzáns distinguished creoles from their Peninsular parents by ennobling them with particularly positive qualities; “[a] Peruvian from Potosí has never been disloyal to their Catholic majesties nor have they ever committed the crime of lesé majesté nor have they usurped the royal fisc.” The privileged place afforded to creoles in Arzáns’s Potosí challenged the prevailing notions of racial hierarchies in the Spanish world, which placed peninsular Spaniards decidedly above the American-born creoles.

83 Bartolomé de Arzáns de Orsúa y Vela was born in Potosí to an impoverished creole family and worked as a schoolteacher. His Historia was written using existing sources and archival research that was continued by Arzáns’s son, Diego, upon his death in 1736. The manuscript remained unpublished until 1965, when it was published by Brown University thanks to the research of Lewis Hanke.

84 Kagan, Urban Images 188.

85 Ibid.

86 Ibid.

87 Ibid, n90.

The Bourbon Reforms of the eighteenth century had undermined the place of the creole in the viceregal political system, furthering the discontent of Creole Potosinos such as Arzáns. The Reforms uprooted local creoles from government, instituting a salaried absolutist bureaucracy administered by peninsular-born Spaniards. While the new administrative practices of the Bourbon colonial establishment had serious consequences for the indigenous communities of the Andes, the economic, social, and political effects in Potosí, and particularly the mining industry, strongly impacted the established, ruling Creole class. The power amassed by the Creoles under the Hapsburgs was greatly minimized by a top-down model of bureaucracy that concentrated administrative control in the hands of Bourbon-appointed official sent to the colonies from Spain. To voice directly the discontent with the colonial administration, Arzáns suggests that the greed and exploitation of Potosí were directly related to the actions of the newly-arrived Spanish administrators who destabilized the Creole system of government through the Bourbon reforms. By extension, Arzáns placed the blame for Potosí’s decline on the shoulders of the Bourbon administrators and bureaucrats. While Arzáns was steadfast in his support of the church and the Crown, his claims of corruption, greed, and exploitation within Potosí fractured the civic space, a notion that is reflected in de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s representation of the city.

Despite his overt criticism of the peninsular Spaniards, Arzáns does not call for the rights of Indians, mestizos or blacks; instead, he presents a variation of the racial hierarchies that already existed in the Spanish world predicated on white supremacy over indigenous and black populations. These hierarchies were visible in the layout and representation of the city, which


90 Ibid, 197.
privileged the white inhabitants over the racial and cultural subaltern groups. Like Arzáns, de
Berrío and de Holguín visualize a civic space that is racialized, stratified and predicated on a
European or Creole supremacy that definitively excluded the majority of the population from the
representation of civic space in Potosí. By representing civic engagement and participation as
available exclusively to the white population of Potosí, save for a few members of the elite
indigenous class, the artists produce the artifice of a racially exclusive metropolis that obscures
the diversity of the city’s reality. Similar to the experience of the indigenous population of Cusco
in the case of the Corpus Christi, the participation in the ritualistic celebrations that embody civic
pride and liturgical practices was denied to the indigenous Potosinos, allowing only the elite
minority of the indigenous population to carry out a minimal role in the processional
performance. As evidenced by the minimal and passive indigenous participation in de Holguín
Entry of the Viceroy, the performative display of colonial citizenry was denied to indigenous
Andeans unless it serviced the greater narrative of Spanish cultural and political dominance over
the indigenous ‘other.’

External racial identification was paramount in the hierarchies of the Spanish New World
and reflected in the structure of cities that privileged the white inhabitants over the racial ‘other.’
De Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy depicts racial identity through such external markers, a
process that has been researched extensively by Thierry Saïgnes. In his research, Saïgnes
suggests that external markers, such as costume, were inextricably linked to racial and cultural
identities in the colonial Andes. To emphasize the integral importance of racial markers in
colonial society, Saïgnes explores in detail the case of the Yanaconas in the region of Potosí. In
the pre-conquest Andes, the quechua word ‘yanacona’ literally translated to ‘black slave’ and
signified those who left the *ayllu* kinship system to work for the reigning Inca and his family.  

During the colonial period, the term ‘yanacona’ came to refer to indigenous men who left the *ayllu* in order to avoid forced labor in the mines and worked instead in support of the Spanish conquistadors. The act of leaving the *ayllu* was accompanied by a sartorial shift that signified the malleable nature of colonial racial identities. While limited, the opportunities to integrate into acceptable society through outward Hispanicization were open to indigenous Andeans. The Yanaconas were described by a chronicler in 1645:

> The absentee Indians... finally lose their ethnic affiliation [*llegan a perder su pueblo*], changing their habit and style of dress, and adopting that of the yanacona: cloak, silk stockings, and shirt. To disguise this deceit they set themselves to learn a trade as tailors, cloggers, silversmiths, silkweavers, and others. They and their sons register themselves as yanaconas, and by paying a mere eight pesos each year plus five pesos in different jurisdictions, they become exempt from the mita service.

This structure of privilege that disenfranchised the racially and culturally subaltern groups thus provided certain avenues to transform one’s racial or ethnic classification through self-fashioning and acculturation to the dominant Spanish identity. The racial identity of the Yanaconas was deeply connected to external and particularly sartorial markers of race, closely linked to concepts of class and profession that were interwoven into European concepts of race since the early Modern period. From the late fourteenth to the eighteenth century, the functional understanding of race was connected to descent or origin. The connections between race and class remained murky until the emergence of a meritocratic system of class during the European

---


92 Ibid, 132.


94 Baum, *Rise and Fall of the Caucasian Race*, 42.
Enlightenment, that differentiated profession and class from the previous connection to decent or origin.\textsuperscript{95} The racial transformation of the Yanaconas through sartorial and professional identification evidences that external markers were inextricably linked in the eighteenth-century Andean concept of race, suggesting that the meritocratic system of class could be used as tool for deracialization and social mobility.

By shedding the markers of their racial, cultural, and familial ties with particular \textit{ayllus}, the yanaconas exempted themselves from the place of indigenous Andeans within colonial society and ultimately mitigated their racial difference within a society where racial and ethnic ties often strongly correlated with economic responsibilities to the Crown. Saignes cites the 1603 legal case against the Carrillo brothers, mestizo men who claimed that their European heritage exempted them from participating in the forced labor system in the colonial Andes. A judge in the small town of Tacobamba, south of La Paz determined the brothers’ duty to serve in the mita based on an external identification of race. Concerning the matter, the judge wrote: “they are Indians... for that is how they consider themselves, and at present they wear their hair and clothing like Indians.”\textsuperscript{96}

The ‘other’ assimilates into European conventions of self-fashioning in order to gain representation within the urban space in de Holguín’s processional scene. In \textit{Entry of the Viceroy}, the entire city of Potosí is dressed in fine European clothing, besides the few particular elements that speak to racial differentiation, such as the aforementioned indigenous women who wear the Andean ‘turban’. Some of the women observing the procession wear the \textit{manto} and \textit{tupu} pins which, along with their darker complexions, speak to their indigeneity. These indigenous women

\textsuperscript{95} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{96} Ibid, 186.
are, nevertheless, portrayed on a much smaller scale than the European and male processional participants, and are generally obscured by other observers or by the city’s architecture. The indigenous presence, particularly that of the forced workers of the mita, were largely ignored by both de Holguín and de Berrío, problematizing the urban views of Potosí through the exclusion of the largest segment of Potosí’s population, that is further discussed in Chapter 3. De Holguín’s inclusion of Hispanicized indigenous and African Potosinos, however, speaks equally to the erasure of racial ‘otherness’ in idealized views of the Silver City. The overwhelming Hispanicization of costume in *Entry of the Viceroy* underlines the profound impact that the conquest of the Andes had on racial identities. The erasure or assimilation of subaltern identities indicates a racial and civic uniformity and subtly conveys the racial hierarchy present in Potosí and in de Holguín’s view of the city.

Only one participant in de Holguín’s painting, in the nocturnal scene in the upper register, wears a costume that is decidedly not European: an Inca dressed in the traditional costume of the *uncu* and *mascapayacha* (Figure 36). Aside from the ceremonial costume of the indigenous elite, his darkened skin tone further highlights his indigeneity. In contrast, two of the parade participants dressed in Moorish costume are represented as Europeans in costume through their pale complexions, comparable to the Spaniards who participate in the procession. Within the main register, markers of indigenous dress are present but mainly down-played or mixed with European costume. Nevertheless, de Holguín differentiates his subject’s race through highlighting differences of skin tone. Like the Europeanizing elements of the indigenous

---

97 Taking into account the European or Creole conception of race and ethnic differentiation, the author recognizes that the “authenticity” of this image is dubious. This argument, while relevant, lies outside the parameters of this study, which aims at a more holistic analysis of representations of the colonial urban landscape of Potosí. For further discussion regarding the “authenticity” of indigenous costume in colonial Peruvian imagery see the aforementioned research of Carolyn Dean or Maria Timberlake.
audiences, the skin color and physiognomic markers of ‘Africanness’ are countered with European lace collars and velvet waistcoats (Figure 37). The few dark-skinned Africans who take part in the Viceroy Morcillo’s procession through the city wear European costume with no sartorial clues as to their race or their status as either freed or enslaved Africans. They, even more so than the indigenous Potosinos, are effectively Europeanized or absent from the civitas to show an overwhelmingly Spanish or creole city.

Opulent dress, or, perhaps dress that was seen as too opulent for the wearer, suggests the inherent social ills, such as alcoholism or prostitution, synonymous with mining towns such as Potosí that were regarded through the lens of a highly-racialized society. The Spanish administration in the American colonies was predicated on complex regulations with regard to race that stipulated dress, behavior and social position. The tensions created by the racial hierarchy in the Spanish colonial world were more keenly perceived in diverse and heterogenous metropolitan centers, like Potosí, where interracial contact was an integral part of city life. In the left of the procession on Calle Hoyos in de Holguín’s painting, an African woman is dressed in what appears to be a fine silk mantle held together by the tupu pin (Figure 38). Beside her, leering over the balustrade is a chubby man with a rounded, flushed face. His demeanor, stance and the red color of his cheeks suggest he has been drinking. He has his arm around the woman, who stares without emotion into the parade. The couple is part of a small grouping, containing another two women of indiscernible race, a man and a small child. Both men in the group actively look over the balustrade into the processional scene, while the women look away, hide in their shawls or stare blankly into the action below. The men are earnestly involved in the civic life, even if they only observe, while the women act passive and unperturbed by the action. The presence of the African woman is of particular note for three reasons. Firstly, she is the only
woman of African descent who is not depicted as a domestic servant. Secondly, she wears the costume of indigenous Andean women; the manto and tupu pin, but in noticeably different colors from those of the other indigenous women watching the procession. Finally, her clothing, race, and the context of the group with whom she is portrayed suggest that she may be a sex worker.

During the heyday of Potosí and into the city’s decline in the eighteenth century, alcohol consumption and social vices such as prostitution were rife. While no concrete numbers of their population exist, prostitutes were a common feminine trope in colonial popular culture in Alto Peru, appearing as regular characters in satire and public performances. The figure of the prostitute in the popular arts was usually identified not by name but by her race and her profession, illustrating the pervasive othering and sexualization of indigenous and African women in the viceroyalty of Peru. In the case of de Holguín’s painting, the clothing worn by the African woman also indicates that she may be a prostitute. Throughout the colonial era, the Spanish crown imposed strict sumptuary laws on mulattas and free women of African origin. According to the work on early Spanish colonial slavery by Frederick P. Bowser, free black women were particularly affected by the sumptuary laws as early as 1574, which precluded them from using silk, pearls, gold, or mantillas. Throughout the sixteenth century, municipalities such as Lima passed similar laws specifically targeting black woman and mulattas, allowing them to wear nothing more luxurious than wool. According to Bowser, the sumptuary laws were

98 Along the parade route, a lavishly-dressed white woman is attended to by a black maidservant who holds a parasol above her.


100 Ibid.

intimately connected to the prevailing colonial notion that black women and mulattas were more prone to engaging in social ills such as prostitution; “[t]he presumption was that such fripperies [fine clothing, jewelry] were the fruits of prostitution, and the women who favored them were therefore directed to seek honorable employment.”

A similar relationship between the sartorial and race in Mexico City is described by Magali Carrera, who writes about late-seventeenth-century restrictions placed on indigenous Mexicans with regard to the wearing of jewels and luxurious fabrics (brocades, silks, or gold and silver embroidery). The prevailing colonial attitudes toward women of color suggest that the African woman in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* conforms to the trope of sexualized African women. The clothing she wears is lighter and more luxurious than most women along the parade route, with the exception of a white woman who is attended to by a black domestic servant. The quality of her attire indicates she has disregarded the sumptuary laws and that de Holguín relied on common tropes of women of color from the popular culture of colonial Potosí. She is physically engaged with the inebriated man beside her, further alluding to her role as a sex worker. De Holguín’s placement of the African woman on the fringes of the composition symbolically relegates her to the periphery of social engagement. The focus of the painting largely remains on the procession of male Potosinos through the city. The procession dominates the public urban space while the women and racial and ethnic subaltern classes are relegated to the liminal space, effectively positioning them outside the active *civitas* of Potosí.

In a common urban construction recognizable in contemporary urban organization, the most wealthy, and, by default, peninsular or creole, inhabitants of the city resided nearest to the

---

102 Ibid.

center, while the working classes and the poor were relegated to the peripheries of the metropolis. While de Holguín’s depictions of race and racialized urban space are conveyed through outwardly markers of differentiation, such as physical appearance and sartorial choice, de Berrío inscribes colonial racial hierarchies directly onto the urban space of Potosí. Sartorial indicators of race are also present in de Berrío’s Description, but due to the size of figures and the compositional layout of the canvas, the primary mode of representing race and social class is through the differentiation of spaces within the city. In the center of the urban sprawl of de Berrío’s Description, the structures have red roofs, which demonstrate that the occupants or owners could afford the luxury of fired clay tiles. The lower-middle class dwellings can be identified by the brown roof tiles of unfired clay, which appear outside the city center (Figure 39). Noticeably, the quality of civic, religious and domestic urban structures gradually decreases as one moves away from the center of the city. The structures in the center of the city contain more architectural details, such as colonnades, facade embellishments, and fountains in the courtyards.

Radiating out of the city center, the structures not only change in grandeur but in scale and in the precision of artistic rendering (Figure 40). De Berrío’s detailed brushstrokes are reserved for the center of the city, while the artist depicts the dilapidated workers’ quarters in a scale too small to house the figures in the city streets, and with a looser, less precise artistic execution (Figure 41). In direct contract, the smelters and churches in the city’s outer limits retain the same level of detail as the structures in the city center, suggesting that de Berrío was more concerned with the infrastructure of the mining industry than with the men who generate the wealth of the city through their mining labor. Signifying a gradual change in the inhabiting social classes, the shift is also reflective of the racial realities of Potosí. As Potosí was a
particularly striated urban space in the viceroyalty of Peru, race and economic differentiations are strongly recognizable through the indelible marks they left on the urban landscape, which de Berrío conveyed in his painting.

Countering the twentieth-century trend of suburban living, the centralization of urban economic power is reflected in the detail the artist afforded the central districts of the city, and the dilapidated quality of the workers quarters. This radial construct of class as written onto the city’s organization can be regarded as a reflection of concentrated wealth radiating out of the city, or the poverty of the miner’s quarters radiating into one of the wealthiest cities on earth. In the case of Potosí’s geographic positioning, this centralization of social class and, by extension, race, was also impacted by the practicalities of the mining industry. By placing the habitations of the impoverished miners at the urban outskirts by the foot of the Cerro Rico, the miners were closest to the mines and smelters. This practicality of urban design also effectively kept the homes of the wealthy Potosinos removed the industrial mining structures. While the urban design of Potosí reflected the role of the city as a mining center and of wealth production in Spanish America, it also reinforced an economically and racially segregated urban populace by removing the population of mostly indigenous and African laborers and miners away from the center of the metropolis.

De Berrío’s representation of the city’s inhabitants correlates to that of their urban surroundings. Within the city center, he portrays the white population of Potosí in detail. Moreover, the social and economic elite of Potosí have the leisure to consume both the cultural and commercial wealth of the city, while the racial and social subaltern classes attend to the needs and desires of the economically privileged. In the whole composition, only four black men are pictured; two house servants in conversation and two who are driving horse-drawn carriages.
for unknown masters (Figure 42). De Berrío has completely excluded African women from the urban space. In direct contrast to the near-complete erasure of African Potosinos, he has included indigenous women in the urban space, but not indigenous men, the absence of whom is discussed further in the following chapter. There is, however, a distinction in the way de Berrío depicted indigenous women and the white urban population of Potosí, based on the difference of racial and economic classes in the colonial social structure. The white men and women of the city are portrayed leisurely conversing or moving freely throughout the city, a privilege of both their racial and economic status. In contrast, indigenous women are placed exclusively within the market setting, selling goods in the outer district of the city, or in the plazas (Figure 43). In her study on gender and ethnicity within the colonial economy of Potosí, Jane E. Magnan describes the role that indigenous women played in the economic life of the city:

> Indigenous women came to be associated with certain sectors and spaces of the urban economy, beginning with the coca in the Plaza del Metal and expanding to coca, wax, and textile trades in latter decades. There colonial vendors were not unlike the chola market women of the nineteenth century, who used their prominence in trading ventures to consolidate a powerful identity in Bolivian national discourse.¹⁰⁴

> While Mangan’s assertion that the indigenous market women of the colonial era, like the ‘type’ of the chola market women of the nineteenth century, informed the discourse of national identity in Bolivia, in the context of de Berrío’s cityscape, it is clear that they exist within a strict racialized and gendered social hierarchy. They are depicted sitting or crouched along the streets, a body language that conveys a subservient role to the white population of the city, who move with ease in the city center. White women can be seen gesturing to their companions and playing with their skirts, which lift slightly to reveal lace petticoats. They are actively engaged in the urban life of Potosí, while the indigenous market women are portrayed in a stoic manner, almost

---

as if they are fixtures on the streets. Furthermore, the presence of the indigenous market women in the central district of the city highlights the differentiation between labor and leisure. In contrast to the white women who leisurely stroll through the streets of Potosí, the indigenous women represent the labor inherent to the urban experience. Despite the economic freedom their market role allowed colonial indigenous women, this independence did not allow them to move fluidly into a more elevated social class, shedding light on the lack of social mobility in the Spanish colonial world.¹⁰⁵

The racialization of urban spaces is not a theme that is unique to views of Potosí. The striated and hierarchical nature of colonial society was reflected in urban design and urban images throughout the Spanish colonies, particularly in the eighteenth century. The most pervasive example of the highly racialized society expressed in visual culture is in the casta paintings produced to classify and define the various racial groups that resulted from intermarriage in the empire.¹⁰⁶ The inclusion of urban scenes within certain examples of casta imagery transferred the racial exclusivity expressed in the casta paintings onto the cityscape and alluded to the predominantly white privilege of the city center.

Like the almost-exclusively European or Creole Potosinos featured in the center of de Berrío’s Description, similar connotations of race are placed on the view of Mexico City in De Alvina y Español produce negro torna-atas by an anonymous artist (c. 1775, Figure 44). The painting depicts a wealthy family on a balcony overlooking the alameda of Mexico City. The

¹⁰⁵ For a more detailed analysis of women in colonial Latin America, see Susan M. Soclow’s Women in Colonial Latin America. For a further analysis of the economic realities of indigenous women in Potosí, see Jane E. Mangan’s Trading Roles, Gender, Ethnicity and the Urban Economy in Colonial Potosí.

¹⁰⁶ While casta paintings are mostly associated with viceregal New Spain, the genre was also produced, though to a much lesser extent, in colonial Peru. For example, see the 1783 Vicente Albàn series of casta paintings produced in Quito in the collection of the Los Angeles County Museum of Art and the Museo de America in Madrid.
Spanish father observes the exclusively white city dwellers strolling through the alameda, disregarding his wife and child, adopting what Carrera terms the ‘panoptic view’ of both race and the urban environment. The Spaniard’s act of observing the city through a telescope affirms his authoritative role, not only within the family and the city, but also within the complex construction of race in the eighteenth-century Spanish empire. The woman, an *albina*, kneels and looks up, either to heaven or her husband in a gesture of desperation, her black son touching her shoulder. The reality of her race was revealed with the decidedly dark complexion of her son, classified as a ‘negro torna-atas’, the term used for a dark child born to seemingly white parents. The body language of the familial grouping and their relationship with the city below highlights the racialized elements of urban life in the Spanish empire. While the father, a Spaniard, continues to observe the urban dominion before him and the white inhabitants therein, the mother and son face out from the urban scene, away from a world that is decidedly closed to them now. The *casta* painting echoes the racialized sentiments of de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s views of Potosí, but in a more explicit gesture of racial exclusivity that expresses an important lesson about the role of race in the urban life of Mexico City. Similarly, de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* relegates the racial subaltern into roles that are either marginalized or Europeanized if not excluded all together. The African and indigenous presence in the processions, pageants and audience is depicted as secondary to the heavy Creole and European representation of the city space. Through this misrepresentation of demographic realities, de Hguin racializes the urban space into one dominated by the white minority.


108 Ibid.

109 Ibid, 110.

Similarly, the 1680 view of Lima by an anonymous artist, *Plaza Mayor de Lima, Cabeza de los Reinos de el Perú* (Figure 45) exemplifies a similarly creole-centric view of the viceroyalty’s capital. While the Spanish and Creole population in Lima was far larger than in Potosí, this view of the city asserts a comparably racialized view of urban space. Like the aforementioned *casta* painting and several of the processional works from Lima and Cusco, this view of the Plaza Mayor portrays the central plaza as a microcosm of the city as a whole.\(^\text{111}\) Employing modes of representation similar to de Berrío, such as red numbers corresponding with a descriptive key, blue-grey mountains receding into the distance beyond the city, and a vibrant populace within the urban space, the anonymous artist captures the viceregal capital as a dynamic city full of life. The urban space also visualizes the same racial inequalities as the *Description* of Potosí by de Berrío. The Limeños who move freely through the city, or who are transported in carriages are white, while the population of black or indigenous limeños remain at the periphery, both literally and metaphorically, depicted as servants, street-sellers and water-gatherers. The deeply-entrenched racialization of public space in the images of Lima highlights the prevailing notion that colonial cities were reserved for an exclusive subset of the colonial population and provides the broader visual context for the cityscapes by de Holguín and de Berrío.

De Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* presents external and sartorial markers of race that elevate and privilege white Potosinos within the performance space of the urban environment. The performers within the city are mostly white, and exclusively male, while what little racial and ethnic diversity can be seen in the scene is relegated to the spectators of the procession. Similarly, the way in which de Berrío depicted different racial groups moving throughout the city

in his *Description* correlates with the racial hierarchy that dominated society in the Spanish colonial world. As the white Potosinos stroll leisurely through the city, the few persons of color in the scene are in the service of the more affluent whites, like the black servants in the foreground or the indigenous market women sitting on the sides of the streets. The Hispanicization of sartorial markers of race, ethnicity, and identity were the main way through which de Holguín presented the racialization of public urban space, while de Berrío imposed it directly on the city’s plan, representing the more elite structures in great detail and rendering those that catered to subaltern populations in a sketchy and disproportional manner. It is clear in de Berrío’s scene that the indigenous and African populations of Potosí, and the public spaces they dominated, were secondary to the lavish grandeur of the peninsular and creole space at the heart of the city. The external markers of race in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* and the direct correlation between racial and economic status and public space in de Berrío’s *Description* expose the racialization of Potosí’s urban spaces that leaves no doubt to the dominance of the Peninsular and Creole population.

**Conclusion**

The performance of politics and the performance of race in the colonial urban space are elements of de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s views of Potosí that are equally important and difficult to examine individually. The politics of race, and the inherent racial inequalities in the colonial political system were entrenched in the collective colonial consciousness through carefully orchestrated public processions, such as the *Entry of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo* and religious festivals such as the Corpus Christi. These public performances were utilized by the dominant Spanish voices as agents of colonial power. The public performance of identity in pageantry and within the urban space through external markers of race further ingrained these
racial narratives into the social and physical makeup of the city. In their urban images of Potosí, de Holguín and de Berrío created an image of the city that, by eliding the subaltern racial and ethnic classes, was both predicated on and appealed to the Creole and Peninsular notions of racial superiority. By Hispanicizing the African and indigenous Potosinos, de Holguín asserts an idealized image of subaltern urban participation. Through emulation and acculturation, the disenfranchised could gain the privilege of representation within the urban space. The privileging of the white population of Potosí within urban representations was also instrumental in the construction of the city in de Berrío’s Description. He imagined and represented this idea of dominance directly in the structure of the city, by privileging the center of the city over the areas that served African or indigenous populations. Even though both artists used different methods to highlight the racialization of the urban space in Potosí, their works were predicated on the exclusion of Potosinos who did not fit into the idealized view of the city. Through visual representation, de Berrío and de Holguín present a particular political narrative of urbanity and the inherent racialization of public space in the colonial Andes.
CHAPTER 3: THE EXCLUSIONARY VISUAL LEXICON OF URBAN IMAGES

“The Potosí was a ‘mouth of hell’ which swallowed Indians by the thousand every year” 112

The exclusion of certain populations from the construction of an idealized civitas reveals much about the colonial definition of urbanity. In the case of the two cityscapes by de Holguín and de Berrío, the exclusionary nature of representing the urban population reveals the complexities and hidden realities of life in eighteenth-century Potosí. Entry of the Viceroy and Description expose narratives of power and dominance when examined in the context of declining wealth and the ongoing violence of colonialism. Through the exclusion of certain groups, as well as the poignant diminishing of labor and mining in images of Potosí, a glorified view of the city emerges in the two paintings. Since their creation, these works have been regarded as documentary images, visual records of wealth in Potosí’s age of decline. Examining these paintings as idealized city views, as opposed to documentary images, brings to the fore their visual narratives of artifice in the fashioning of civic identity.

Building on the issues of racial dominance and the political purposes of images discussed in the previous chapter, as well as the history of representing the city discussed in Chapter 1, this chapter examines what is not included in the two most famous colonial views of the Silver City. Divided into three parts, it addresses the exclusionary nature of the city visualized by de Holguín and de Berrío with regard to both the urbs and the civitas, and how the omission of labor, poverty, and alternative religious and cultural practices reveals much about the prevailing notions of the idealized city of the eighteenth century Andes. The first part presents an analysis of the exclusion of poverty through a discussion of the architecture of the city and the ostentatious

display of wealth in both de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s representation of Potosí. Building on the
discussion of poverty, the second part examines the exclusion of references to labor and mining
in the two scenes. In creating and representing a society of leisure devoid of hard labor, or
idealizing ‘light labor’, de Berrío and de Holguín obscured the city’s notorious reputation linked
with the abuse of workers and distanced the ostentation and luxury from the means of production
that, in reality, existed side-by-side in eighteenth-century Potosí. The examination of
contemporary accounts of the realities of silver extraction and production in contrast to the civic
identity constructed by the artists reveals two different but interconnected colonial era Potosís:
one of finery and freedom, and one of poverty and forced labor. The inequalities between these
two Potosís, made more profound by the continued and violent implementation of the mita
system, provide an early example of the development of unrestrained capitalism. Finally, this
chapter closes with a discussion of the exclusion of subaltern populations and cultural practices
of the city. The homogenization of identity discussed in Chapter 2, which directly contrasted
with the well-documented diversity of Potosí in the eighteenth century, resulted in a divide
between the official civic identity and the subaltern, which correlates with the economic and
labor disparities of the city. An examination of the exclusion of alternative or ‘undesired’
identities, realities and narratives from the civic identity of Potosí created by de Holguín and de
Berrío posits the city itself as one of contradictions and inequalities, and, more pertinently, as a
place of violence and human exploitation.

The Undesirable Poor: The Exclusion of Economic Inequalities

By the eighteenth century, Potosí had already experienced several economic downturns and
declines in both silver production and population. While the Cerro Rico and the incalculable
amounts of silver that were extracted from the mines within it became international symbols of
wealth, power, and luxury, the crippling poverty that affected a majority of the city’s residents was excluded from literary and pictorial depictions of the civic identity of Potosí. Contemporary accounts of Potosí, particularly the critique leveled against the city’s administration by Bartolomé Arzáns Orsúa y Vela, act as fundamental documents of the economic hardships that were a reality of daily life for the majority of Potosinos. Arzáns devoted particular attention to recounting “with abundant detail the pageant of that mining center where wealth and poverty, avarice and generosity, religiosity and bitter hatreds, cruelty, and intrigue all flourished and unusually in extreme manifestations,” as J.E. Phelan has written.113 In their cityscapes, de Holguín and de Berrío only reveal one side of these dualities. Unlike the written accounts of life in Potosí, the visual records left by these two artists included only minute references to poverty in their cityscapes. The vacant and dilapidated dwelling quarters in the outskirts of de Berrío’s Potosí can be seen in direct contrast to the obvious wealth and life in the city’s center. The inhabitants of these poor workers’ quarters are either excluded entirely or shown in a scale so small that they do not include any identifying features. In his representation of the city, de Berrío has effectively stripped the poorest and most vulnerable Potosinos of their individuality and identity, erasing their very existence almost entirely from the city. Conversely, the artist takes care to render the elite members of the community, such as priests, soldiers or artisans with details that reflect their particular role within the city.

In de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy, there is even less suggestion of the poverty found in Potosí. In the nocturnal scene in one of the smaller registers of the composition, three female figures, covered in shawls, sit at the entrance to the town jail (Figure 46).114 This subtle visual


114 This building is named as ‘el carcel’ in the day-time view of the main plaza.
allusion to the intersections of poverty and crime reveals a pointed commentary on the unwanted poor in Potosí. The three figures are decidedly separated from the civitas and the celebrations and processions taking place in the main square. Their dress contrasts with the splendor and detail of the costumes of the participants and spectators of the events, and their hunched shoulders and diminutive stances show no correlation to the pomp and ceremony taking place in their immediate vicinity. Not only are they differentiated through their posture and dress, but also through scale. Like de Berrío’s unintelligible figures of the lower socio-economic classes of Potosí, de Holguín has also diminished the size of the figures alluding to Potosí’s poverty. Furthermore, the faces and any distinguishing features of the three figures are obscured by the shawls that cover their faces and bodies, producing the same de-individualizing effect as the small scale representations by de Berrío. De Holguín also alludes to the correlation of poverty and crime by placing these figures at the entrance to the town jail, showing the poor as decidedly on the threshold of acceptable, law-abiding society.

The gender of the three figures in de Holguín’s view of Potosí relates to what Ann Zulawski called the “feminization of poverty”. In her research, Zulawski argues that the masculinization of labor, which will be elaborated upon in subsequent parts of this chapter, correlates to the feminization of poverty. While men had clear ways to earn their bread, women were relegated to auxiliary tasks away from the capital-generating silver industry of the city and were, as Zulawski argues, the most economically and socially vulnerable members of colonial Potosí. The restrictions placed on indigenous women denied them the rights to enter into legally binding contracts and transactions, and so, due to the lack of a formal agreement,

---


116 Ibid.
domestic workers were often denied wages or even, in the case of darker-skinned women, forced into slavery on the charge of being African. The oppression faced by domestic servants on the basis of gender and race further impoverished many of Potosí’s women, ‘feminizing’ the image of urban poverty in the colonial era.

The correlation between poverty and crime, in conjunction with vice, is alluded to by the representation of alcohol sales and consumption in de Berrío’s *Description*. In the Plaza del Barratillo, identified as thirty-three in the key, de Berrío shows a worn-out structure near the decrepit worker’s quarters where wages were paid to both free and forced laborers (Figure 48). Just outside the building stands a makeshift market, barely decipherable through the lack of detail, where many of the miners convert their wages directly into drink, either pure-grain alcohol or *chicha*, which were highly regulated by the Spanish authorities. During the colonial era, alcohol was seen as the cause for all manner of social problems, including poverty, rebellion, and violence. In colonial Potosí, however, the consumption of alcohol, along with that of coca leaves, was a method used by the miners in order to bear the inhuman conditions of the mines. At over 12,000 feet above sea level, the effects of the alcohol were hastened by environmental factors, and the incidence of liver disease such as cirrhosis was common. While the colonial authorities made efforts to regulate the consumption of alcohol, mine owners often used it as a

---

117 Zulawski cites a 1689 case in which a woman name Doña María Sánchez de Doria claimed her domestic worker, also named María, was a slave. The domestic worker claimed she was, in fact, an indigenous woman. Similarly, Zulawski cites a 1705 case pertaining to the freedom of the indigenous woman Juana Feliciana from Doña Petronilla Medellín (Archivo Nacional de Bolivia, Tierras e Indios, Sucre).

118 Jeffrey A. Cole writes about the consumption of alcohol within the mita system: “As they awaited their assignments, the Indians drank *chicha* (maize beer) and wine, and chewed coca. Finally, sometime after noon, the alcohol-pacified mitayos were taken to the mines or mills to which they had been assigned for the week.” (Cole 31).


barter commodity to avoid paying wages, directly providing their workers with hard alcohol in return for their labor.\textsuperscript{121} The resulting dependence of the working classes on alcohol is highlighted in de Berrío’s depiction of miners spending their wages on drink as soon as they are paid. Nevertheless, this was by no means a call to action or an image of empathy. The way that de Berrío depicts the inebriated miners correlates with the long-standing stereotype of the ‘indio borracho’, or the ‘drunk Indian’.\textsuperscript{122} Creole writers and commentators from the early colonial period onward have alleged that alcohol consumption and drunkenness were definitive parts of the indigenous identity.\textsuperscript{123} This preconception, along with the link between alcohol and all social ills in the colonial imagination highlighted the supposed moral inferiority of indigenous groups in the Andes. Even though the dependence on alcohol and drugs such as coca was fueled by the mita system and the conditions of the mines, the creole voices of colonial Potosí, those that are privileged in de Berrío’s view of the city, ascribed these social problems as inherent racial defects, which further justified the subhuman treatment of the indigenous workers.

The lack of social mobility, directly related to the racial and economic barriers established by Potosí’s colonial administration, further fueled poverty throughout the city. Even though Potosí was synonymous with producing astounding levels of wealth, the distribution of this wealth hardly touched the poorest and most vulnerable members of society. As the inequalities of wealth distribution became more and more ingrained, the average Potosíno became dependent on credits from local vendors, loans, and pawning possessions in order to satisfy the economic demands of urban living. As stated by Jane Mangan:

\textsuperscript{121} Grant, \textit{Alcohol and Emerging Markets}, 229.

\textsuperscript{122} Rebecca Earle, “Algunos Pensamientos Sobre ‘el Indio Borracho’ en el Imaginario Criollo” \textit{Revista de Estudios Sociales}, 29 (April, 2008), 20.

\textsuperscript{123} Ibid.
The economy of the town was saturated with raw silver and coinage in comparison to other colonial cities: the silver mines injected unrefined silver into the market, the royal mint stamped out coins, and dozens of silversmiths produced innumerable pieces of valuable wrought silver. Tons of silver sat around the city in various forms, yet mechanisms of distribution favored local elites and royal coffers. Thus, the economic practices of the majority non-elite population relied on credit, not pieces of silver, to fund life’s expenses.124

While the mine owners and entrepreneurs, mostly of Spanish or creole groups, made their fortunes in Potosí, the wages of the mita workers, the lowest in the city, did not allow even for the most basic of living expenses. At the dawn of the mita system, in 1596, it was calculated that, on average, one would need twenty-six pesos per month, or more, for food alone. In stark comparison, the mitayo would only earn ten pesos per month, relegating the entire population of forced laborers into an unsustainable level of poverty, a situation contributing to the decimation of the indigenous population.

The greed of the mining elite and the economic inequalities of Potosí were remarked upon by Martín de Murúa in his 1613 Historia. Murúa believed that the same self-indulgence that facilitated the extreme poverty of the city reflected in the architecture and appearance of the community; “It is not tidy or even well-built... they [the Potosinos] are not interested in building, only the churches are of solid construction.”125 The lack of organized and well-built structures is apparent in de Berrío’s Description, particularly in the crumbling outskirts of the city surrounding the central districts. But the composition, use of color, perspective, and the representation of Potosinos draw the eye away from what Murúa called untidy or badly built, and toward the splendid churches and official buildings of the center. The city’s center is where the capital of the silver mines could be seen, and it is this wealth that de Berrío showcased in his


125 Murúa, as quoted in Kagan, Urban Images, 186.
view of the city. While the workers’ quarters are devoid of people, the city’s center shows a bustling metropolis, full of well-dressed ladies, artisans, and markets selling a cornucopia of imported goods. De Berrío intentionally edited out the poorest and most vulnerable Potosinos, along with details of their living conditions, to present an artifice of universal wealth and abundance. The exclusion of the city’s poor also belies the economic problems facing Potosí in the mid-eighteenth century. In the late-sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, Potosí was full of public celebrations, known for lavish bordellos and salons where wealthy miners could dispose of their newfound capital. An account of a religious festival from the heyday of the city shows the level of indulgence that was a part of urban living:

In 1608 Potosí celebrated the feast of the Holy Sacrament with six days of plays and six nights of masked balls, eight days of bullfighting and three of fiestas, two of tournaments and other dissipations.\(^{126}\)

After several economic downturns, decreased silver production as well as the increasing costs of imported mercury used in the smelting process, the wealth of the city dropped dramatically, and its place as the Spanish Empire’s economic powerhouse was overtaken by Zacatecas in Mexico. The general decline of the Potosí, which would have been apparent in the appearance of urban architecture by 1758, is also not specified in de Berrío’s view of the city. In *Description*, Potosí is portrayed as if it were still a thriving colonial metropolis, with elaborate architectural details in the city’s center and fine lace visible on the skirts of the well-dressed ladies reinforcing its legendary status.

The exclusion of poverty from the civic identity and the denial of the city’s less lucrative status, provide a false image of wealth and beauty in the city. Both de Holguín and de Berrío made calculated choices to exclude the poor from their representations of Potosí. The presence of

a deeply impoverished majority, particularly identifiable as the racial and ethnic ‘other’,
detracted from the official history of wealth and splendor that brought thousands of Spaniards
and Creoles into the high mountains in search of fortune. The poor workers, miners and
domestics were not considered as citizens of the great city of Potosí, but as collateral damage in
the search for treasure. In the small visual allusions to the unwanted poor in the form of the three
women sitting outside the city jail in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* or the ‘indios borrachos’
in de Berrío’s *Description*, the artists have presented a social commentary on the undesirable
elements of urban life. Nevertheless, it is not a social commentary in the contemporary
understanding, built on notions of social justice, but is instead a repetition of the Spanish and
Creole narrative that assumed inherent racial or social defects as instrumental to poverty. Both de
Berrío and de Holguín ignore the systemic violence of poverty and the exploitation of domestic
and mining labor, instead choosing to adhere to the widespread colonial stereotypes that explain
the economic inequalities of the city.

*The Undesirable Worker: The Exclusion of Labor and the Mita System*127

The mita system of forced labor that was instituted by the Spanish in 1573 was integrally linked
to the high levels of poverty in the city of Potosí and the racial and ethnic divisions in economic
status. The effects of the mita system were so pervasive that even today miners in Potosí refer to
their wages as mita.128 Designed by Viceroy Francisco de Toledo as a way to meet the need for a
huge unskilled labor force in the silver extraction process, the mita continued to shape the

---

127 The term *mita* comes from the Quechua word *mit’a*, which refers to a period of service. Mita workers were not
only assigned to the mines, but also to other industries, such as the textile production in the Andes. For the purposes
of this analysis, the mining obligations of the mita workers will be discussed. For a more comprehensive analysis of
the mita laws and forced labor in the Andes, see Jeffrey A. Cole, *The Potosí Mita: Compulsory Indian Labor in the

economic and social life of the city until it was abolished by Simón Bolívar in 1825, at the birth of Bolivian independence. For almost the first four decades of silver extraction from the Cerro Rico, a forced labor system was not necessary as Spaniards and indigenous Peruvians alike flocked to the city in search of silver. By the 1560s, however, the easily accessible veins of high-grade ore began to run out and new refining processes needed to be established, as miners were forced to dig deeper into the mountain. A majority of the remaining silver ore in the depth of the mountain was not of the same quality or purity as the earliest yields, the extraction process became more demanding, and profits fell. The wealth of the city subsequently diminished and the free labor force that dug deep into the Cerro Rico chose to earn its bread in less dangerous and more rewarding occupations. Mines in other parts of the Americas, such as the Caribbean, Brazil, and the Peruvian lowlands also faced labor shortages, which were ultimately filled with the importation of black slaves. This option was not viable in the high altitudes of Potosí, where the cost of importing a large slave labor force was financially prohibitive. While African slaves did come to Potosí and were forced to work in the mines, they mostly arrived via an illegal trade channel from Brazil via the Río de la Plata - a practice that the viceregal authorities were unwilling to encourage. Through the excessive need for higher profits and lower wages, the mita system was created, forcing hundreds of thousands of indigenous men into the harsh conditions of the mines, exposed to noxious gases, for more than two and a half centuries.

In the cityscapes of de Holguín and de Berrío, there is little to no reference to the system of forced labor that was such an integral part of Potosí and the immense wealth generated by the


131 Ibid.
mining of silver. The artists focus instead on the civic wealth and splendor that reflects the reputation that Potosí held further afield. According to Eduardo Galeano, Potosí became an epicenter for untold opulence:

By the beginning of the seventeenth century, it [Potosí] had thirty-six magnificently decorated churches, thirty-six gambling houses, and fourteen dance academies. Salons, theaters, and fiesta stage-settings had the finest tapestries, curtains, heraldic emblazonry, and wrought gold and silver; multicolored damasks and cloths came from Granada, Flanders, and Calabria; hats from Paris and London; diamonds from Ceylon; precious stones from India; pearls from Panama; stockings from Naples; crystal from Venice; carpets from Persia; perfumes from Arabia; porcelain from China. The ladies sparked with diamonds, rubies and pearls; the gentlemen sported the finest embroidered fabrics from Holland. Bullfights were followed by tilting contests, and love and pride inspired frequent medieval-style duels with emerald-studded, gaudily plumed helmets, gold filigree saddles and stirrups, Toledo swords, and richly caparisoned Chilean ponies.132

Almost all of the luxuries described by Galeano can be found in the depictions of Potosí by de Holguín and de Berrío, even if the origin of these luxurious imports cannot be immediately identified. In de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy, the silks and tapestries that line the parade route followed by Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo, the splendid dress of the men and women in de Berrío’s city center and the armored soldier who rides into the city in Description all speak to the wealth of Potosí (Figure 47). In de Berrío’s Description, the artist has even alluded to the vibrant import and export trade in Potosí by depicting and marking the trading roads leading to La Plata, Cusco, Buenos Aires and the Coast. Along each of the roads, pack trains of llamas carry goods into the city, performing a procession of economic abundance around the city of Potosí. Nevertheless, there is no reference to the production of silver, or its export from the city to fund the import of such luxury goods. In both de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s views of the city, there exists a disjunction between luxury objects and the mining of silver that bankrolled the excesses of elite Potosinos, distancing the fine wares from the violence that allowed the city to flourish.

In direct contrast to the details afforded to conspicuous wealth in the city, there is little to no reference to the laborers who produced the raw materials that funded the luxury of the city. In de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy*, there are no workers, no miners and even the Cerro Rico is relegated to a portion of the smaller registers of the composition. The exclusion of the working class in de Holguín’s view of Potosí is particularly poignant when viewed in juxtaposition with the text in the cartouche in the bottom right of the composition. In this text, de Holguín specifically names miners as participants in the celebrations to welcome the new viceroy to Potosí. The words do not, however, correlate to the elite *civitas* visualized in the cityscape. While de Berrío includes depictions of the workers in all stages of the silver-extraction process in his *Description*, the small scale of the workers and the lack of detail in their representation suggests that the artist considered them as less integral to the identity of the city than the wealthy Potosinos shown in the city’s center, whose depiction encapsulates the importance of wealth in the city of silver. The artist’s disinterest in the representation of the city’s workers also lacks any definitive commentary about the system of free and forced labor in the mines of the Cerro Rico. Particularly relevant to the miners who gather at the Plaza de Barratillo to collect their wages, the lack of detail makes it impossible for the viewer to differentiate the free workers from the forced laborers (Figure 48). Conversely, the higher echelons of society in Potosí are differentiated through sartorial details. Artisans and white maidservants are individualized through their clothing (Figure 49). A pair of artisans walking through the city’s streets wears the trademark brown cloaks of their profession, while the dresses of the maidservants lack the finery of those of the most elite women of Potosí. Even black domestics are shown in the same detail as the urban elite, with the same specificity in their sartorial choices. In contrast, the African slaves who work
in the mines are indistinguishable from the indigenous free and forced laborers represented as rudimentary stick figures on the mountainside.

The representation of urban labor in de Berrío’s *Description* contains similar issues as the representation of the miners on the Cerro Rico. Urban labor, referring to the working classes within the city proper, is mainly made up of indigenous market women. Differentiated from domestic laborers who are depicted in a high level of detail in the painting, the indigenous market women are shown as stationary and fixed elements of the urban surroundings. In the depiction of the street markets, de Berrío focuses on the cornucopia of imported fruits and vegetables and on the buyers, but not on the sellers who are almost indecipherable from the goods available to be purchased. The marginalization of market women from the collective urban identity of Potosí is not only visible in de Berrío’s *Description*, but also in colonial textual records of the city. Mangan writes that while many of the chroniclers who composed *historias* of Potosí often mentioned the indigenous market women, few official lists of merchants and traders include women.¹³³ From the Spanish perspective, these women were seen as a nuisance by the authorities and faced double discrimination in the city’s administration for being both female and indigenous (Figure 50).¹³⁴

The few representations of labor in de Berrío’s view of Potosí are bucolic scenes featuring Spanish or Creole laborers. The distinction between indigenous labor, synonymous with the mita system of forced labor, and the work performed by white Potosinos is highlighted by the celebration of white toil in pastoral images of the landscape in contrast to the erasure of indigenous mining labor. The resulting racial imbalance in labor and its representation presents a

---


¹³⁴ Ibid.
picturesque view of labor in the city. The views of cows and oxen walking through the city’s outskirts with the white farmers offers a vision of labor conflated with leisure, a view of labor that is relatable, approachable and non-confrontational (Figure 51). While other images of mining labor, such as the prints by de Vry and Bachelier mentioned in Chapter 1, show the inhumane conditions inside the Cerro Rico silver mines and confront ideas of humanity and dignity, de Berrío erases any social commentary confronting the most pertinent issue in Potosí’s history. Conversely, the safe pictorialization of a farmer walking the streets with a pair of oxen or a group of men breaking rocks while a procession to the Kari-Kari reservoirs passes by, present an aestheticized view of labor. This aestheticization of agricultural work and the simultaneous exclusion of mining drudgery, transforms Potosí into an idealized city, where leisure and labor become almost indistinguishable.

This idyllic view of farmers, oxen and aestheticized labor presents an antithesis to the idea of the city as an urban metropolis and transforms the urban landscape by introducing the pastoral. Much like in Oliver Goldsmith’s poem *Deserted Village* of 1769, the idealized views of labor in de Berrío’s *Description* present an opposition to the corruption and sin associated with urban living.135 *Deserted Village*, written in England during a moment of heightened tensions between the urban and rural communities, has been explored by literary scholars as one of the most prominent examples of the eighteenth century literary pastoral.136 But further than just the pastoral, *The Deserted Village* highlights English tensions between urbanity and country life, exalting the bucolic through nostalgic prose. *The Deserted Village* addresses similar concerns as de Berrío’s *Description* about this tension between the urban and the rural, but within a different


context. Most notably, both Goldsmith and de Berrío use the idea of the pastoral to illustrate a conflict between what Goldsmith termed ‘light labor’ and ‘toiling pleasure’, or between the light bucolic labor and the toil of the mines. De Berrío’s opens a dialogue between urban and pastoral images of the Andes, differentiating it from de Holguín’s which remains exclusively focused on the urban. By introducing the pastoral into the urban, de Berrío softens the view of Potosí as a city of sin and excess and presents the city as an inclusive and utopian place.

The few glimpses of agrarian scenes in Description do not, however, engage the same condemnation of the city that is the crux of Goldsmith’s argument in Deserted Village. Within the context of Potosí, the richest city in the world during the seventeenth and early eighteenth century, Goldsmith’s argument that the ‘best companions, innocence and health; and [the] best riches, ignorance of wealth’ would ring hollow. As a city of ‘unwieldy wealth and cumbrous pomp’, particularly in the celebrations shown in de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy, it is important that de Berrío has not overplayed the contrast between the bucolic and the urban but instead engaged the two seemingly disparate modes of living into a harmonious dialogue of Potosí and its surroundings. In so doing, de Berrío’s Description responds to a broader and more global tendency of the idealized arcadian existence, appealing to both the pastoral and the urban, and ideas of the picturesque, preempting the work of European writers such as Goldsmith, William Gilpin, and Edmund Burke in Britain who wrote on these issues at the end of the eighteenth century.

De Berrío’s bucolic farmers who engage in ‘light labor’ around the city of Potosí distort the realities not only of labor but also of production and farming. The environmental reality of

---

137 Goldsmith, Olive, Deserted Village.

138 Ibid.
Potosí precluded much in the way of cultivation and farming, forcing the importation of the majority of the food consumed. The sixteenth-century chronicler Luis Capoche wrote:

Nothing in the way of food can be raised in Potosí or its surroundings except some potatoes (which grow like truffles) and green barley, which does not form grain, because the cold is continuous and outdoes that of old Castile and Flanders, for there is no time in which the elements are in peace and harmony enabling the land to yield its fruit to him who possesses it. The land is much folded and naked without trees or greenery.\(^{139}\)

Very few crops or animals could survive in the high altitude or the bitter cold of the high Andes. Food costs, as a result of importing vegetables, meats, and fish into the city, rose astronomically. Furthermore, de Berrío’s view of the Spanish or Creole farmer neglects the fact that a majority of farmers in the surroundings of Potosí were either indigenous workers avoiding the mita draft, or African slaves imported from Buenos Aires to make up for the lack of indigenous agricultural labor as a result of the mita.\(^{140}\) The idealized view of the farmer as a criollo, therefore, not only obscures the environmental realities of the high Andes, but also, coupled with the exclusion of mining labor in de Berrío’s *Description*, misrepresents the labor struggles between the mining and agricultural industries in Potosí.\(^{141}\) While the allusion to the pastoral and what would later be termed the picturesque connects de Berrío’s *Description* to the larger global discussion of the visual culture of the landscape, it neglects an authentic depiction of Potosí, its labor, and the harsh existence faced by local farmers.

The view of labor within the context of Potosí as ‘light labor’, which blurs the distinctions between hard work and leisure, does a disservice to the excluded miners and mitayos who worked through some of the most barbaric conditions within the depths of the Cerro Rico.

---

139 Capoche, *Relación General*, 75.


141 For a more complete analysis of the labor struggles between the mining and agricultural sectors in colonial Potosí as well as issues of slavery, see *Miners of the Red Mountain* by Peter Bakewell.
Some of the most poignant accounts of the mistreatment of indigenous workers come from clerical sources. The church was also complicit in the exploitation of workers, particularly in the absurd fees charged for hospital care or for a funeral if a miner died at work. The annual fee for the church-run hospital was seven reales from the mitayo’s below sustenance wage. The fee leveled against mitayos, provided a stable source of income for the hospital, but was also the source for much unrest within the community and was, therefore abolished in the seventeenth century. While mitayos and indigenous Potosinos had to pay a yearly fee for hospital care, Spaniards and Creoles were treated without charge.\textsuperscript{142}

In both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s views of Potosí, the church is often portrayed favorably, overlooking the gross injustices it perpetuated against the indigenous laborers during the colonial era. While de Holguín and de Berrío placed ecclesiastical architecture in the center of their views of Potosí, images of labor, which funded the lavish churches in the city, were ignored. The inequality of representation between the church and the miners is most poignant in de Berrío’s Description. While the workers’ quarters on the outskirts of the city are rendered without any identifying details, the church of Nuestra Señora de Jerusalén (labeled as number 12) has been represented with a high level of attention to architectural details and a priest walking through the courtyard (Figure 52). While de Berrío details the particulars of the clothing of the priest, who stands in the courtyard of the church, he rudimentarily depicts the workers in the courtyards of the smelting plant directly next to the church. The shift in scale and detail in this case cannot be attributed to perspective. There is a clear and deliberate narrative that privileges the church over the worker, and this particular scene in de Berrío’s painting exemplifies the erasure of labor and the privileging of certain elements of the urban community,

\textsuperscript{142} Bakewell, \textit{Miners of the Red Mountain}, 177.
creating a view of Potosí based on artifice and representational privilege, disconnected from the realities of labor and production.

*The Undesirable Other: The Exclusion of Cultural and Religious Resistance*

De Holguín and de Berrío both constructed an idealized Potosí. In both views of the city the subaltern in terms of culture, race, or religion is excluded to depict instead a homogeneous civic identity. In the few allusions to the ‘other’ in Potosí nothing can be seen of the violence, oppression, or the active resistance of the excluded and exploited populations of the city. The few images of the ‘other’, whether of black domestic slaves, indigenous market women, or rudimentary stick-figure representations of the mitayo extracting silver from the mines, are portrayed in the act of playing and performing to certain codes of conduct prescribed by the imposed Spanish hierarchical notions of race, ethnicity, and gender. The representation of these ‘approved’ performances, and their minimal role within the overall depiction of the city tell an artificial story of the city reality. The architecture in both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s paintings does not give credence to the indigenous stonemasons who created facades that combine indigenous culture with the European baroque. Furthermore, the overwhelming presence of the Catholic Church in these views of the city obfuscates the practice of alternative religions, both pre-Columbian and African, that were practiced by a large part of Potosí’s non-white majority.

The presence of the Catholic Church and its many religious orders is strong in both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s views of the city. This overwhelming Catholicism is not surprising since these city views are the only secular paintings in their oeuvres. It is therefore not unexpected that religiosity and the performance of Christianity play a pivotal role in their constructions of Potosíno identity. As religious painters, both de Berrío and de Holguín were familiar with church iconographies and the visual lexicon of devotional art. As such, these works
can be viewed as both Catholic paintings as well as civic views, since the city’s residents’ Catholic identity was embedded in their overall personas as Potosinos. The integral role that the Catholic Church played in the daily life of Potosinos does not, however, account for the homogeneity of religious and cultural identities visualized in the city. Even as the power of the Catholic Church throughout the Spanish-speaking world was paramount and almost equal to that of the king, the practice of alternative religions continued despite efforts to eradicate them well into the twentieth century. The depiction of the indigenous population in de Holguín’s view of Potosí is strongly centered on devotional or religious practice. The majority of the few indigenous Potosinos in his view of the city are shown in the context of the church, presenting the notion of a successful evangelical effort in the high Andes. Furthermore, the most prominent structure in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* is the Iglesia de San Martín at the eastern end of Calle Hoyos. This church catered to a largely indigenous population and was integral to the evangelization efforts of the Spanish conquistadors, as evidenced through the collection of devotional paintings found within it, aimed at newly-Christianized indigenous worshippers.143 Setting the origin point of the procession at San Martin not only makes sense geographically, but also presents de Holguín with the opportunity to depict pious indigenous worshippers, devoted to both the church and the viceregal authorities. Depicting indigenous Potosinos, who made up the majority of the population of the city, as obedient followers not just of Christ, but the colonial authorities, furthered the colonial agenda of pacification and evangelization in the high Andes. The pacified and Christianized Indian, like those shown looking out from San Martin in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy*, also provided the crown with a huge labor force and limited the strength of indigenous resistance to the Spanish colonial authorities (Figure 30). As with most of

the representations in de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s views of Potosí, the depiction of indigeneity as pacified and devoted to the church and the crown does not allow for the depiction of active resistance that continued throughout the colonial era. In both examples, the artists rarely show indigenous people, particularly in regards to labor or poverty. The few times that indigenous people are granted the right of representation within the city of Potosí, they are pictorialized playing the role prescribed to them by the colonial authorities and the evangelizing church. Just like the violent experiences endured by the indigenous people through the mita system of forced labor and the racial inequalities of wealth distribution, the practice of indigenous religions is not referenced or even alluded to in the Potosí constructed in the paintings of de Berrío and de Holguín.

De Berrío’s choice to represent the few indigenous figures in his *Description* in the act of Christian devotion reveals a biased European perspective on the indigenous community of Potosí. While evangelical efforts on the part of the Spanish were effective on the surface, many Andeans actively maintained elements of pre-Columbian religious practices, particularly in the context of the silver mines. Olivia Harris, who has worked extensively with the Laymi and Llallagua indigenous groups in northern Potosí writes about the continuing veneration to pre-Columbian deities as well as the altered practice of Christian religion in the Potosí region. Harris describes the libations that are drunk by the locals “for God and his consort the moon, then for the mountains and for *pachamama*, the earth.”144 Most importantly was the indigenous veneration of the devil, also known as ‘tio’ in the depth of the silver mines of the Cerro Rico or

---

by the indigenous Aymara or Quechua names yawlu, saxra, supay or wak’a. Complementary to the pachamama, who represents the land, nourishment, and fertility, tio represents mining and wage labor, a distinction that is not inherent to pre-Columbian society but that developed through the instigation of the forced labor systems in the colonial world. It is widely believed by professional miners throughout the Andean cordillera that it is necessary to make regular offerings to the devil as they descend into the mines; as Harris notes: “[t]he defining character of these devils is not so much evil or malevolence as abundance, chaos and hunger.” A positive relationship between humans and the devils in the mountains is maintained through offerings of food, coca, tobacco, and alcohol as well as animal sacrifices performed on particular days. The complexities of mines and the syncretic indigenous culture that arose from the mita labor system are not present in de Berrío’s Description or in the god-fearing indigenous worshippers of de Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy. The few indigenous inhabitants of Potosí who are present within these views of the city are shown as complicit in the colonial system. Like the indigenous observers of the festivities surrounding Viceroy Morcillo’s entry into the city, the indigenous Potosinos in de Berrío’s Description are not extended the privilege of faithful representation within the urban context and are relegated to an idealized ‘type’ of native who is receptive to the European incursion on his land.

The example of the Laymi and Llallagua indigenous groups are just two of a highly heterogeneous system of indigenous cultures that can neither be wholly encapsulated nor individually examined in the parameters of this study. Nevertheless, a generalized understanding


146 Ibid, 313.

147 Ibid, 312.
of indigeneity in the high Andes and the racial and cultural practices and tensions that existed between various groups and the colonial authorities sheds light on the exclusionary and fabrication of a *civitas* in de Holguín’s and de Berrío’s cityscapes. Furthermore, the practices of indigenous groups are not exclusive to Potosí. The worshipping of ‘tío’ in the mining community is a practice shared by indigenous groups in other mining centers throughout the Andean world. Similar practices exist in the Qamawaran belief system around Oruro, formerly a center of gold mining in the Bolivian Andes. These tensions were as often fractured along cultural lines as they were through the differences of linguistic understanding and participation between the Spanish and the Quechua- and Aymara-speaking groups that populated the Andes.

Traditionally, the area of Potosí was populated by Aymara-speaking cultural groups that were colonized by the incursion of the Quechua-speaking Inka Empire and subsequently by the Spanish. The differences of the urban experience within the indigenous population of Potosí differed greatly based on cultural and linguistic affiliation. During the colonial era, the area surrounding Potosí was mainly populated with Aymara speakers who, as time went on, were more commonly found in rural and remote-rural areas surrounding the city. Under the Spanish administration, with the forced relocation of Quechua-speaking mitayos to work in the mines of the Cerro Rico, the urban population of Quechua-speaking indigenous workers grew and soon became more prominent than the original Aymara-speaking communities. These important differences in indigeneity and the tensions that exist between cultural groups were often

---


149 Rosaleen Howard-Malverde, “Pachamama is a Spanish word”: Linguistic Tensions between Aymara, Quechua, and Spanish in Northern Potosí (Bolivia), *Anthropological Linguistics* 37, no 2 (Summer, 1995), 141.

150 Ibid.

151 Ibid.
overlooked in the representations of indigeneity in colonial visual culture. In both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s representations, the indigenous Potosinos are portrayed as uniform ‘types’, either as devoted parishioners in San Martín, or as de-individualized miners or market women. The nuance of different forms of indigeneity had no place in the Spanish establishment, where race superseded cultural or linguistic affiliation. In a world where the opposite of the European or Creole was the Indian or African, the subtleties of culture were lost in the dominant Spanish narrative that was portrayed through the images of de Berrío and de Holguín.

Violence and resistance were important elements of the indigenous experience within the colonial Andes. But, like cultural subtleties or alternative religious practices, both violence and resistance are absent from the peaceful and idealized views of indigenous participation in urban life in de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s cityscapes. De Holguín’s Entry of the Viceroy includes no reference to violence; instead it portrays the civitas of Potosí as a peaceful and law-abiding citizenry. Similarly, de Berrío’s Description shows only one suggestion of the violence that was suffered against non-white Potosinos on a regular basis. The origin of this depiction of violence is ambiguous and incorporated into the religious procession taking place in the hills surrounding the city. Due to the lack of representation that the artist afforded depictions of the racial and cultural ‘other’, the specific circumstances of the situation cannot be ascertained. Ultimately, the only information that can be derived is that a brawl has erupted during the procession and that one of the men lies on the floor, possibly dead. The violence seems incidental to a public performance or procession and does not contain references that may provide a narrative of racialized violence stemming from the inequalities in colonial Potosí, or whether it might be an incident of indigenous resistance to the Spanish authority in the Andes. The lack of detail with regard to this incident speaks to the exclusionary nature of representing groups that do not fit
with the preferred civic identity of Potosí, whose violence or behavior does not interrupt the overarching pageantry of the scene.

The exclusion of alternative religious and cultural practices is intricately linked to the elision of poverty and labor as it is ultimately based upon the same complex systems of racial classification established by the Spanish colonizers, legitimized by the Catholic Church, and enforced by the local Creole administration, stemming from medieval religious notions from Spain during the expulsion of the Jews and Muslims. These exclusionary aesthetics that influenced the way in which de Berrío and de Holguín chose to represent Potosí are also not unique to Potosí or the high Andes. A similar vein of an exclusionary visual lexicon can be found in urban representations throughout the Spanish colonial world. With the instigation of complex racial systems of classification, the city itself became a model through which to portray the ideal population, which was decidedly wealthy, Christian, and Hispanic. In depictions of Mexico City, the same racial and cultural exclusion is visible. In the case of an eighteenth-century *biombo* (folding screen) by an anonymous artist entitled *Allegory of New Spain*, the artist has shown a veritable ‘garden of earthly delights’ with dancing couples, jesters, bullfighters among other forms of rococo merriment. But the overriding notion of the ideal urbanite is portrayed through racial terms that resonate with the narrative of superiority that was imported to the Americas through extant Spanish ideas of otherness. The urban space shown in the biombo exclusively belongs to the Spaniard or the Creole. Any indigenous or African claims to the urban space are nullified through their exclusion in its representation. Like in the idealization of Potosí

---

152 Baum, *Rise and Fall of the Caucasian Race*, 33.

153 Ibid.


155 Baum, *Rise and Fall of the Caucasian Race*, 33.
in the works of de Berrío and de Holguín, the *Allegory of New Spain* shows the urban citizen as a consumer of luxury who is white, wealthy, and Christian.

**Conclusion**

The creation of a collective urban identity was based on the unifying characteristics of the *civitas* in a particular city. In the case of the Potosí shown in the eighteenth-century paintings of de Holguín and de Berrío, the urban identity that the artists constructed was based often on the exclusion of subaltern populations in favor of presenting the civic body as comprised of Spanish and Creole Potosinos who aligned with the idealized view of the colonized Andes. With the declining silver production and the reduced flow of capital into the city, the artifice created by de Holguín and de Berrío in their views of Potosí helped bolster the city’s reputation through a long period of economic downturn. By fabricating images of wealth, prosperity, and pageantry, the artists glorified an urban environment that contradicted reports of hard labor conditions and extreme poverty.

By excluding representations of poverty, labor, and resistance, the resulting images focus heavily on the urban, elite and Spanish or Creole experiences of the city, disregarding the contribution of African and Indigenous Potosinos in the creation of a diverse metropolis. Furthermore, the exclusion of non-Europeans also distances the luxuries of the city from the modes of production, mainly the labor of the mines and mints, and the economic inequalities that resulted from poor wages and a racially-biased system of wealth distribution. In both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s views of Potosí, the primary actors are the urban elites, while African and indigenous identities are often excluded from the *civitas* or shown in the peripheries. By erasing images of the violence of colonialism and the inequalities inherent in Potosí, the artists’ images contribute to narratives of dominance and power that become more complicated and nuanced
through the exclusionary nature of civic representation. Through the erasure of identities and experiences, the city of Potosí was shown as a ‘garden of earthly delights’, providing a visual experience of wealth and luxury over the reality of injustice and exploitation.\textsuperscript{156} The paintings show a pageantry of wealth and economic gain, ignoring the high cost of the fineries described in accounts of Potosí’s wealth.

Both de Holguín and de Berrío include only slight references to the poor, working class or racial or cultural ‘other’, suggesting that the poverty prevalent in the city, resulting from low wages, a high cost of living, and the exploitative mita system of forced labor, was but a minor issue to the daily life of the city. In de Holguín’s \textit{Entry of the Viceroy}, only three shadowy female figures, shown obscured and separated from the festivities welcoming the viceroy hint at the poverty found in Potosí. Their place at the entrance to the city’s jail suggests the liminal space that poverty inhabited in the civic identity, bordering on the edge of representational acceptability. The three women are shown in a much smaller scale than the rest of the pageant participants, and are compositionally separated from the celebrations to welcome Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo into the city. Similarly, the poorest inhabitants of Potosí in de Berrío’s \textit{Description} are rendered in a scale that does not suggest perspectival accuracy. While the members of the clergy and the more elite members are rendered in high detail and are shown actively participating in the public life of the city, the poorest residents of the city are suggested through rudimentary stick-figures along the mountainsides. Like de Holguín, de Berrío likens poverty to vice and crime through his depiction of the Plaza de Barratillo where the miners are shown receiving their wages and immediately spending them on jars of hard liquor and \textit{chicha}. De Berrío clearly draws parallels between the impoverished worker and the trope of the \textit{indio}

\textsuperscript{156} Kagan, \textit{Urban Images}, 158.
borracho, producing an image of the city that reinforces prevailing narratives of vice and poverty integrally connected to eighteenth-century notions of race.

Closely linked to the erasure of poverty in the two views of Potosí is the erasure of depictions of labor or the idealization of labor within the city. Contemporary written accounts of Potosí focused heavily on the controversial system of forced labor, the mita, while there remain few references to the labor that generated Potosí’s wealth in the works of de Holguín and de Berrío. While the absence of any views of labor in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* can be suggestive of a day of rest for the city to celebrate the arrival of Viceroy Morcillo, it does not explain the disproportional depiction of European or Creole Potosinos participating or observing the festivities. De Holguín’s omission of work and labor from his view of Potosí de-emphasizes the racial, cultural, and economic diversity of the city. Similarly, de Berrío’s de-individualization of mine workers and indigenous market women contrasts significantly with the idealization of bucolic ‘light labor’ in *Description*. While the mitayos are shown as barely-recognizable human forms and the market women blend into the urban landscape, the white farmer strolls casually through the streets with his oxen, shown as a leisurely respite from urban living right outside the city’s center. The difference of representation not only lies in the racial inequality of labor in the eighteenth century, but also in contrast to the free labor of European or Creole Potosinos and the forced labor of indigenous mitayos and African slaves. The idealization of labor and the omission of toil and grunt-work in both the mining and urban environment further helped construct an artifice of urban identity that was consistent with the official narratives of Potosí, its wealth, finery, and its role as an internationally cosmopolitan metropolis.

While the exclusion of poverty and labor in the cityscapes of de Berrío and de Holguín suggest the construction of an urban artifice, they are both predicated on the exclusion of the
Subaltern identities, whether they be religious, cultural or racial, were overlooked in the creation of a communal identity based on dominant notions of civility and acceptability. The simplification of a complex and nuanced *civitas* into a construction that favored the European and Creole experience of Potosí also excluded issues of resistance to the colonial encroachment on the performance of individual and communal identities. The pervasive presence of the Catholic Church in both the performative elements of both de Berrío’s and de Holguín’s views of the city, as well as the urban architecture eliminates alternative religious practices that were often embraced by the lower- and working-classes in the city, and related to pre-Columbian or African religious and cultural practices. The references to religiosity in both *Description* and *Entry of the Viceroy* provide a decidedly Catholic view of Potosí’s spiritual and cultural life, constructing a homogenous *civitas* within the *urbs* of Potosí, punctuated with churches. This dominant Catholic narrative alters the few references to indigeneity, removing allusions to indigenous resistance, culture, or the diversity within the indigenous populations and replacing the nuanced reality of the indigenous experience with a pacified and Christianized ‘native’, with unwavering devotion to both the Church and the Crown. The erasure of the diversity of indigenous identities presents a homogenous acceptance to the ongoing act of colonization that is performed through the city streets in both *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description*.

The exclusionary nature in the visual language of the cityscapes of de Berrío and de Holguín ultimately reveals as many nuances within the colonial image world as it obscures. An examination of the minute references to otherwise excluded elements of the urban identity such as poverty, labor, and resistance reveals the suggestion of a subaltern civic identity beneath the dominant narrative imposed by the colonial authorities and the Church.
CONCLUSION

*Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description* can be interpreted from various perspectives and with a host of different connotations and subtexts. But these two paintings are, above all, visual evidence of the complex and problematic issues of representation within the Spanish colonial urban context. Through the cityscapes they created, de Holguín, and de Berrío not only documented the experience of Potosí for the wealthy elite, but also manufactured an idealized city whose artifice exposed the inherent inequalities of the colonial enterprise. Seen through the lens of the twenty-first century, with the purpose of decoding the privilege of representation, these paintings reveal pointed realities and fantasies regarding class, gender, and race, as well as wealth production and consumption that ring particularly poignantly even in the postcolonial world. The purposefully limited view of the city’s populace lining the Calle Hoyos in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* suggests a political subtext that speaks to the Spanish and Creole ideal of the ‘other’. De Holguín’s depiction of indigenous and African Potosinos conveys the image of a successful colonial project, through which the Hispanicization of subaltern populations leads to an acculturated and passive community, unquestioning of Spanish and Creole dominance. Through external markers of race and identity, de Holguín pushes Potosí’s thriving diversity to the margins of Spanish hegemony. A similar agenda can be detected in de Berrío’s expansive view of Potosí and its geographical surroundings. While the artist included geographical specificities and enumerated details of the habitations and dress of the wealthiest Potosinos, he denied the miners and laborers of the lower socio-economic classes the privilege of representation in the civic space. The racialization of public space and urban identity was not only an issue of artistic
preference or aesthetic convention, but correlated to the deep-seeded ideas of race and superiority that were entrenched in the social and political fabric of the Spanish empire.

De Holguín and de Berrío painted Potosí during the eighteenth century, a time during which the city was experiencing serious declines in silver production, wealth, and population. This particular historical context adds another layer of pretense onto the analysis of the works. The city’s remoteness and harsh climate precluded the birth of new industries to supplement or replace lost capital with the drop of silver production and export. While Potosí was rapidly losing its status as one of the wealthiest and largest cities in the world, de Holguín and de Berrío crafted views of the city that showcased the immense wealth and luxury of a small few, excluding the poor and working class Potosinos who did not fit into the edenic representation of privilege and abundance of the elite. Of the many layers of artifice in these two paintings, their historical context reveals propagandistic purposes behind their commission to obscure the obvious difficulties of Potosí and retain its identity as the jewel of the Spanish crown. At its core, this study is one of fashioning urban identity, and the opulence of the city’s center as depicted by de Holguín and de Berrío exemplifies the ability of the artist to mythologize the city through exclusive and fictional aesthetics.

In the artists’ desire to depict a collective urban identity based on unifying characteristics of the civitas, excluded identities shed light on the city’s values and reputation. The inclusion, or fabrication, of a white and wealthy majority helped bolster the city’s reputation in the wake of economic downturns. The waning of Potosí’s economic influence in the viceroyalty primarily affected the Spanish and Creole populations, which decreased significantly as white Potosinos left the city, leaving an ever-larger majority of indigenous and mestizo inhabitants. While wealthy artisans, financiers and mine-owners had the opportunity to move from Potosí’s
unforgiving remoteness, altitude, and climate, the population imbalances became more pronounced. During the eighteenth century, the non-white population was the overwhelming majority of the city but was summarily excluded from the most important images of Potosí.

As testaments to the colonial paradigm, both *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description* offer an insight into the centrality of the Hispanic identity in colonial Peruvian visual culture. This centrality is ultimately exclusive and simplifying, reducing non-Hispanic identities into vague tropes taken from popular culture at the time, or excluding them completely. The privileging of Hispanic identities ultimately also racializes the public space of Potosí and highlights narratives of political dominance presented in the active life of the city. Performative aspects of politics and identity are integral to *Entry of the Viceroy* and *Description*. In each case, the artist has included processional and celebratory scenes in the greater representation of Potosí. The city therefore becomes the setting through which a performance of political power can be played out, further cementing notions of dominance, social acceptability, and the complex construction of race. By portraying the city as a performative space, de Holguín and de Berrío present urban identity that includes only certain performers. Through the compositional construction of each of the paintings, the centrality of elite Hispanic identity is made abundantly clear, while indigenous, African, and lower economic class identities are, literally and metaphorically, reduced to the peripheries of the city. The procession and performances associated with the arrival of Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo in de Holguín’s *Entry of the Viceroy* share many elements with the Santa Ana series depicting the Corpus Christi in late-seventeenth century Cusco. In either case, the undertone of the image celebrates the triumph of the Spanish crown and the Catholic Church within the Andean cityscape. The triumphant entry of the holy icon or the viceroy is marked using modes of visual communication, such as the triumphal arch or the baldachin, which speak
directly to the dominant colonial voices in viceregal Peru during the eighteenth century. While questions of peninsular and creole Spanish identities are problematized in these images and during the eighteenth century in general, they ultimately embody the same ideas of nationhood and racial dominance that privileges white Potosinos over the ‘other’.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Flynn, Dennis O. and Arturo Giraldez, “Born with a “Silver Spoon”: The Origin of World Trade in 1571” *Journal of World History*, 6, No. 2 (Fall, 1995), 201-221


The Hispanic Society of America and Columbia University. “The Silver Mine a Potosí”, accessed on 1 August, 2015,

Howard-Malverde, Rosaleen. “Pachamama is a Spanish word”: Linguistic Tensions between Aymara, Quechua, and Spanish in Northern Potosí (Bolivia), *Anthropological Linguistics* 37, no 2 (Summer, 1995): 141-168


de Mesa, José and Teresa Gisbert. *Holguín y la Pintura Altoperuana del Virreinato*. La Paz: Alcadia Municipal, 1956


FIGURES

Figure 1: Melchor Pérez de Holguín, *Entry of the Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo into Potosí* (1716). Oil on canvas, Museo de America, Madrid

Figure 2: Detail of Figure 1, inscription
Figure 3: Detail of Figure 1, day scene

Figure 4: Detail of Figure 1, night scene
Figure 5: Gaspar Miguel de Berrío, *Description of the Cerro Rico and the Imperial Town of Potosí* (1758). Oil on canvas, Museo Charcas, Sucre, Bolivia
Figure 6: Detail of Figure 5, inscription
Figure 7: Anonymous, *Plan de la Ymperial y Rrica Villa de Potosí y de su damoso Cerro* (1758).

Ink on paper, Casa de la Moneda, Potosí, Bolivia
Figure 8: Detail of Figure 7, inscription
Figure 9: Cieza de Leon, *Potosí* (1553). Woodcut print. Published in ‘Crónicas del Perú’ (1553)
Figure 10: Diego de Ocaña, *Cerro de Potosí, Octaba Maravilla del Mundo* (1599-1603). Ink on paper, University of Oviedo, Spain
Figure 11: Anonymous, *The Silver Mines at Potosí* (c. 1585). Watercolor on parchment, Hispanic Society of America, New York
Figure 12: Theodore de Bry, *Mines of Potosí* (c. 1590). Print. Published in José de Acostas ‘Historia natural y mortal de las Indias’ (1590)
Figure 13: Theodore de Bry, Pack Train of Llamas Laden with Silver from Potosí Mines of Peru (c. 1590). Print. Published in José de Acostas ‘Historia natural y mortal de las Indias’ (1590)
Figure 14: Bachelier, *Mines of Potosí* (1720). Print. Published in Bachelier, ‘Voyage de Marseille à Lima’ (1720).
Figure 15: Detail of Figure 5, Cerro Rico
Figure 16: Detail of Figure 5, Kari kari reservoirs

Figure 17: Detail of Figure 5, smelters (huayras)
Figure 18: Martin de Murúa, *Cerro y Minas de Potosí* (1590). Ink and watercolor on paper.

Published in Martin de Murúa, ‘Historia del origen y genealogia real de los reyes ingas del Pirú: de sus hechos, costumbres, trajes y manera de gobierno’ (1590)
Figure 19: Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala, *Cuidad la Villa Rica Enpereal de Potocchi* (1615-1616). Ink on paper. Published in Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala ‘Nueva Coronica y Buen Gobierno’ (1615-1616), Royal Library of Denmark, Copenhagen
Figure 20: Francisco Tito Yupanqui, *Cerro Rico de Potosí* (11584-1588). Ink on paper. Published in Bartolomé Arzans Orsua y Vela, ‘El mundo desde Potosí: Vida y Reflexiones de Orsua y Vela’ (1676-1736)
Figure 21: Anonymous, *Virgen del Cerro* (early eighteenth century). Oil on canvas, Casa de la Moneda, Potosí, Bolivia
Figure 22: Anonymous, *Villa Imperial de Potosí* (1755-1775). Oil on canvas, Museo de Ejercito, Toledo, Spain
Figure 23: Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Sodality of Saint Rosa and La Linda* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana *Corpus Christi* series)
Figure 24: Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Processional Finale* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana *Corpus Christi* series)
Figure 25: Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Corpus Christi Procession* (c.1700). Oil on canvas, Museo Pedro de Osma, Lima, Peru

Figure 26: Anonymous, *Procession in the Plaza Mayor of Lima*, (early eighteenth century). Oil on canvas. Church of the Soledad, Convento de San Francisco, Lima, Peru
Figure 27: Anonymous Cusco Artist, *San Cristobal Parish* (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana *Corpus Christi* series) (detail)
Figure 28: Detail of Figure 1, spectators in the curtains
Figure 29: Detail of Figure 23, headwear of indigenous women

Figure 30: Detail of Figure 1, women of the San Martín parish
Figure 31: Detail of Figure 5, procession on the Cerro Rico
Figure 32: Detail of Figure 1, triumphal arch, entry to Potosí
Figure 33: Detail of Figure 1, Viceroy Archbishop Morcillo under the baldachin
Figure 34: Anonymous Cusco Artist, Bishop Molliendo Carrying the Host (c. 1680), oil on canvas, Museo de Arte Religioso, Cusco (From the Santa Ana Corpus Christi series)
Figure 35: Anonymous Cusco Artist, *Our Lady of Cocharcas Under the Baldachin* (1765). Oil on canvas. Brooklyn Museum, Brooklyn, NY
Figure 36: Detail of Figure 1, Inka in the masked parade

Figure 37: Detail of Figure 1, African procession participants
Figure 38: Detail of Figure 1, group observing the entry of the viceroy

Figure 39: Detail of Figure 5, roofs in Potosí
Figure 40: Detail of Figure 5, demonstrating difference in scale

Figure 41: Detail of Figure 5, miners quarters
Figure 42: Detail of Figure 5, black domestics
Figure 43: Detail of Figure 5, indigenous market women
Figure 44: Anonymous Mexican Artist, *De alvina y español produce negro torna-atrás* (c. 1775), oil on canvas, Colección Banamex, Mexico City
Figure 45: Anonymous, *Plaza Mayor de Lima Cabeza de los Reinos de el Peru de 1680*, (1680).

Oil on canvas, Museo de America, Madrid.

Figure 46: Detail of Figure 1, poor women observe the masked procession
Figure 47: Detail of Figure 5, soldier entering the city

Figure 48: Detail of Figure 5, Plaza de Barratillo
Figure 49: Detail of Figure 5, artisans and maidservants
Figure 50: Detail of Figure 5, market women
Figure 51: Detail of Figure 5, man with cow
Figure 52: Detail of Figure 5, priest in courtyard