

9-2017

# Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon: Two Contemporaneous Examples of Innovation in the Twelfth Century

Lisa Murray

*The Graduate Center, City University of New York*

## How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!

Follow this and additional works at: [https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc\\_etds](https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_etds)

 Part of the [Christian Denominations and Sects Commons](#), [European History Commons](#), [European Languages and Societies Commons](#), [French and Francophone Language and Literature Commons](#), [Medieval History Commons](#), [Medieval Studies Commons](#), and the [Women's Studies Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Murray, Lisa, "Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon: Two Contemporaneous Examples of Innovation in the Twelfth Century" (2017). *CUNY Academic Works*.

[https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc\\_etds/2181](https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_etds/2181)

CLEMENCE OF BARKING AND VALDES OF LYON: TWO  
CONTEMPORANEOUS EXAMPLES OF INNOVATION IN THE TWELFTH  
CENTURY

by

LISA MURRAY

A master's thesis submitted to the Graduate Faculty in Liberal Studies in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts, The City University of New York

2017

© 2017

LISA MURRAY

All Rights Reserved

Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon: Two  
Contemporaneous Examples of Innovation in the Twelfth Century

by

Lisa Murray

This manuscript has been read and accepted for the Graduate Faculty in  
Liberal Studies in satisfaction of the thesis requirement for the degree of  
Master of Arts.

---

Date

---

Sara McDougall

Thesis Advisor

---

Date

---

Elizabeth Macaulay-Lewis

Executive Officer

THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK

## ABSTRACT

Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon: Two Contemporaneous Examples of Innovation in the  
Twelfth Century

by

Lisa Murray

Advisor: Sara McDougall

The Twelfth Century in Western Europe was a remarkable time in history. Scholars have noted that Roman law was being revived, Aristotelian theory was being studied, Romanesque and Gothic art was being produced, scholasticism was being cultivated, and economic growth was being fostered by the rise of towns. These are just some of the developments that help give this era the well-known term “twelfth-century renaissance.” Despite the flourishing of creativity that this label suggests, there are few surviving, specific examples of innovation from this time that have been passed down to us. In AD 1175 the Benedictine nun Clemence of Barking translated a life of St. Catherine of Alexandria from Latin to Anglo-Norman using an eleventh-century source. A rare example of a woman author, she took drastic liberties with some parts of the story and added her own thoughts to the text. At the same time in Lyons, France, a businessman now referred to as Valdes of Lyons was founding a movement that would later be called the Waldensians. Ashamed of his former greed, he renounced his way of life and became a preacher who advocated living purely from scripture. He also paid for a vernacular

translation of biblical passages and allowed women to join his group. His preaching was unauthorized and he was ultimately excommunicated by the Church in 1184. Clemence and Valdes were strong supporters of Catholic ideals and were seeking to endorse Christian virtues. Nevertheless, their actions provide examples of innovation and a deviation from the mainstream. Two ways in which they expressed their innovation is in their utilization of the vernacular and in their reconsideration of gender. While a nun and a schismatic appear unlikely subjects for a comparative analysis, we can find in their respective stories elements of novel thinking. This thesis will study them side by side to explore their distinct forms of spirituality, and also, how these spiritualities seem to serve as precursors to arguably more noticeable changes in the High and Late Middle Ages.

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my wonderful advisor, Sara McDougall, for her astute feedback, endless patience, and extremely gracious nature. I truly could not have asked for a better advisor for this paper. I would also like to thank the MALS department for being very helpful, generous, and understanding through this process.

To my Gracie, your unconditional love was much needed and cherished at my most challenging moments. To my brother Joseph, I thank you for always providing the greatest insight and am amazed at how effortlessly it comes to you. To my father David, I will always be grateful for the lessons you taught me and for the appreciation of knowledge you passed on to me. And finally to my mother Joan, your level of support has convinced me you are a celestial being more than a human. Words cannot express how indebted I am to you.

## CONTENTS

<i>Introduction</i> .....	1
<i>History and Background</i> .....	8
<i>Use of the Vernacular</i> .....	13
<i>Relationship with Others</i> .....	21
<i>Gender and Marriage</i> .....	31
<i>Legacy and Conclusion</i> .....	46
<i>Notes</i> .....	54
<i>Works Cited</i> .....	69





## *Introduction*

Western Europe in the twelfth century is often considered a remarkable time of economic expansion, scientific discoveries, artistic pieces that evoked the classical age, and a strong exploration of the relationship between man, religion, and the natural world. As a result, this era has been referred to as the “twelfth-century renaissance” and in modern times its importance has been debated by such historians as Charles Homer Haskins, Erwin Panofsky, Colin Morris, R.W. Southern, and more recently by scholars John Cotts, C. Stephen Jaeger, Thomas N. Bisson and Caroline Walker Bynum.<sup>1</sup> Despite the advances the century has been recognized with fostering, however, it can prove challenging to find extant examples of innovation. Ironically, and perhaps necessarily due to a dearth of other channels, it was through expression of religious faith that one could produce what we would now identify as innovation.

While remaining and specific examples of innovation from this period are rare, the ones that have managed to survive manifest in varying forms. A famous narrative written during the twelfth century that can be considered innovative for its time is a vernacular translation of the *Passio* of St. Catherine of Alexandria by Clemence of Barking. A nun from the prestigious Abbey of Barking in Essex that had strong ties to the Norman and Angevin aristocratic royal families,<sup>2</sup> Clemence translated her Anglo- Norman 2,700 line,<sup>3</sup> heavily octosyllabic verse translation around the year AD 1175.<sup>4</sup> Her source is widely believed to be the eleventh-century *Passio Sancte Katerine Virginis*, or the Vulgate Text,<sup>5</sup> as it is known. Her subject, St. Catherine, was one of the most widely venerated saints in the Middle Ages. While St. Catherine’s legend states that she was martyred in the fourth century, she is believed to be a legendary figure with little historical basis.<sup>6</sup> Accounts of her passion appeared in Greek as early as the ninth century,<sup>7</sup>

and her cult began to grow in England in the eleventh Century.<sup>8</sup> In this legend, St. Catherine of Alexandria is the Christian daughter of a deceased Pagan King who is persecuted by the Emperor Maxentius in the fourth century. Before she is beheaded she is able to convert his wife, advisor, and scholars sent to beat her in a theological debate. Clemence added her own 800 lines in her translation of the Vulgate,<sup>9</sup> and William MacBain notes the drastic changes she made to the virgin martyr narrative in “Five Old Renderings of the Passio Sancte Katerine Virginis”, “she has added so much of her own moral commentary to the text and has so transformed the character of the emperor that, at times, even the *Vulgata* is lost from view” (46-47). In her essay “Female Voices in Convents, Courts and Households: the French Middle Ages” Roberta Krueger further exclaims, “her personal engagement manifests itself in many authorial interventions and telling details, such as her use of courtly language and her description of Catherine’s effect on the empress and her female attendants” (18).<sup>10</sup> As these scholars illustrate, Clemence was undertaking a translation that not only imparted her knowledge of St. Catherine’s life, but also, sent her own messages.

At roughly the same time that Clemence was translating St. Catherine’s life from Latin to Anglo-Norman in Barking Abbey, another example of innovation was unfolding on the continent in the form of conversion. In the 1170s and 1180s, the credited founder of the Waldensians, Valdes of Lyons, was gaining his following in Central France. His name comes in many variations, including Vadois, Valdesius, Waldes and perhaps most famously (although incorrectly) Peter Waldo.<sup>11</sup> He is the late twelfth-century Lyonnaise business man who relinquished all of his money, denounced his former life as greedy and sinful, and became an unauthorized preacher before being excommunicated by the Vatican at the Council of Verona in 1184.<sup>12</sup> During this time, he paid to have a vernacular translation of Bible passages provided for

him.<sup>13</sup> After becoming voluntarily poor, a small collection of people, including women, began to follow his lead and preach to the public alongside him.<sup>14</sup> Most scholarship now accept that this following developed into the Waldensians, although a minority do not completely accept the long standing claim.<sup>15</sup> Either way, he is forever associated with this heretical group that spread into Germany, Bohemia, Italy, and other European countries before some parts were absorbed into Protestantism (although there are some who consider themselves Waldensians even to this day).<sup>16</sup>

For this thesis I will offer a comparative analysis between Clemence of Barking's translation of St. Catherine of Alexandria and the story of Valdes of Lyon's conversion. I will show that Clemence and Valdes, twelfth-century contemporaries, both exhibit elements of originality in a manner that is impactful and we can learn much from them. A reason in particular I am studying them side by side is to show that their innovations did share some similar qualities, and also, that their stories serve as precursors to ideas that would materialize more fully later in the Middle Ages. Through their use of the vernacular, through their recognition of female participation, and through the sometimes paradoxical outcomes of their actions, Clemence and Valdes have left us fascinating examples of innovation that we can appreciate. This is the crux of my thesis: to demonstrate that while one was an orthodox nun while the other a schismatic, one a woman while the other a man, one aristocratically affiliated while the other a representative of the merchant class, and one Catholic while the other a rejected Catholic turned Protestant hero, their lives are connected through elements of unconventionality that lead them to produce fresh perspective on mainstream paragons. The paper is not suggesting that they were the only ones at the time engaging in such inventiveness, for that claim would be false and irresponsible. Nor is the paper claiming that they actively sought to rebel against the authorities, which is a

nonessential point considering Clemence was not castigated for her translation and Valdes' nonconformist tendencies were not initially punished (there is no claim that nonconformity must be punished anyway). Moreover, the paper is not bound to studying the reaction to these two people's actions (although that will be done in certain sections). Ultimately, the paper seeks to prove that innovation could be attempted and successfully achieved in the late twelfth century and this fact, if nothing else, is reason enough for an academic study. They were both trying to express their faith the best way that they knew how, they were both using the unique resources that were at their disposal, and they were both customizing those resources to suit their needs. In doing so, they have presented us with examples of the process of innovation in the twelfth century. Their journeys should be examined not only to realize the potential of twelfth-century people, but also to understand the capabilities people had and the results they could find in their given culture. This last point is just as interesting as the sometimes controversial nature of their lives and work. While they both were intent on giving credence to the Catholic Church, one could argue they ultimately betrayed their intentions and inadvertently produced examples of subversion. The last point is notable, but should not be all consuming in our approach to making sense of their efforts. Certainly, subversion may have been a possible offshoot of their accomplishments (especially in Valdes' case) and this possibility has been studied before by historians and literary theorists (including many of the writers I have referenced for this paper). Still, it is not the only facet of their projects that make them interesting to study. They are also worth studying because they provide us a sampling of how medieval innovation could occur.

Having taken these factors into account, I must present sources for further and deeper analysis. Although there are post-fourteenth-century sources of Waldensian origins, these are more concerned with the group than with Valdes himself.<sup>17</sup> They offer dubious claims of

apostolic descent and their supposed fourth-century beginnings from a man named Leo, Pope Sylvester and the Donation of Constantine.<sup>18</sup> In some of these sources, Valdes is often not even mentioned or is mentioned as a medium through which their mission is finally fulfilled but without being named as the founder.<sup>19</sup> For this paper, in order to focus on Valdes, we need to remain with the materials that were produced closest to his actual life (he is believed to have died before 1218).<sup>20</sup> While I may not mention every reference in this paper, the main source documents I have used for this study are the Anonymous of Laon (c. 1220), Richard of Cluny (c. 1181-1216), The Cistercian Exemplum Collection (c.1170s), Etienne de Bourbon (c.1250), Geoffroy of Auxerre (c.1180s), Walter Map (c.1182-1192), Alain de Lille (c.1190s), Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay (c.1213), Moneta of Cremona (c.1240), The Anonymous of Passau (c.1260), and Bernard Fontcaude (c.1190). Some give crucial biographical details about Valdes while others offer important commentary. There are also many helpful secondary modern sources from whom we can gain much understanding, including Gabriel Audisio, Grado Merlo, Christine Thouzellier, Michel Rubellin, Olivier Legendre, Ernesto Comba, Euan Cameron, Pekka Tolonen, Karen Sullivan, Beverly Mayne Kienzle, Giorgio Tourn, Peter Biller among others. For my sources regarding Clemence of Barking's St. Catherine I will of course reference the work itself, but I have also consulted scholars such as William MacBain, Duncan Robertson, Dominica Legge Barbara Zimbalist, Catherine Batt, Simon Gaunt, Diane Watt Jocelyn Wogan-Browne Glyn Burgess Tara Foster Maud Burnett McNerney and others who have done extensive reading and analysis of the text.

I should also include the original intended audiences for Clemence's translation and for the story of Valdes' life. The main target audience for the translation of St. Catherine was women in Barking Abbey. However, a larger lay audience was important as well, of which

Jocelyn Wogan-Browne and Glyn S. Burgess inform us when they write in their book *Virgin Lives and Holy Deaths: Two Exemplary Biographies for Anglo-Norman Women*, “but in a text written by a female religious it suggests that mixed audiences, and mixed audiences outside Barking, were also expected to hear the life” (xxvi). MacBain believes that one of Clemence’s goals was to make the translation entertaining in a court setting.<sup>21</sup> She was not alone in her approach, for the public’s enthusiastic reaction to saints’ lives in all mediums, whether through music, drama, or art, drove hagiographers to adapt the stories so they related better to their audience’s contemporary sensibilities. Although the narratives were often translations or copied from earlier texts, hagiographers certainly incorporated contemporary motifs and use of language.<sup>22</sup> This helped give the reader a sense of it being more immediate to their concerns and of it relating to their real life. Their appeal to the contemporary shows that, while tradition was pertinent, the current public shaped the texts and the text’s relevance.

The question of who was reading the life of Valdes of Lyon and for what purpose is more wide-ranging. It is true that Valdes of Lyons, due to the textual sources and documents preserved in the French archives, is considered to be a historical person.<sup>23</sup> His life, though, has been told in different ways from different perspectives. Therefore, I will briefly summarize the background of some of the more well-known contemporary sources. According to Pekka Tolonen, author of the essay "Medieval Memories of the Origins of the Waldensian Movement", the Anonymous Chronicler of Laon was most likely a Premonstratensian monk using Valdes’ story to educate the lay in the area of Flanders on proper behavior for their social class.<sup>24</sup> *Liber visionum et miraculorum* was part of the exemplum collection written for Cistercian members as a source of spiritual and moral inspiration.<sup>25</sup> Although his background is unclear and has been disputed, Richard Monk of Cluny, or Richard of Poitiers, was a monk who wrote a chronicle of world

history. His short profile of Valdes is featured in his biography of Pope Alexander III<sup>26</sup>. In the thirteenth century the need to defame Valdes was due to the Poor of Lyons' persistence in flouting church doctrine.<sup>27</sup> Although some Waldensians did return to the Church under the name Poor Catholics in 1208,<sup>28</sup> other Waldensians continued to spread in Europe.<sup>29</sup> Consequently, Etienne de Bourbon's *De septem donis Spiritus Sancti* (1250-1260) was written primarily for preachers looking to undermine this Waldensian influence. Etienne de Bourbon, being a Dominican inquisitor, had extensive experience with thirteenth-century Waldensians and wanted to teach preachers how to detect them even when they attempted to hide.<sup>30</sup> His testimony is noteworthy because in the c.1220s he had personally spoken to Etienne d'Anse and Bernard Ydras, the men who helped translate the Bible for Valdes years earlier.<sup>31</sup> The Anonymous of Passau was also an inquisitor,<sup>32</sup> but a later one from Germany, and like Etienne de Bourbon, used people like Valdes as examples of troublemakers who needed to be identified and addressed properly. The earliest contemporary sources of Valdes of Lyon, as can be seen, contained an amalgam of cultural and political motives and differed in their degree of criticism.

Both the sources and the audiences will help us understand how Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon expressed themselves in innovative ways. As for the sources that will aid us in this endeavor, I have chosen to use modern English translations when quoting directly from the works. I understand the value of the original language in better comprehending the text's meaning and affect, but for this paper, the biggest focus that unites the narratives will be the thematic. In order to demonstrate my point effectively, it is also essential to provide the appropriate historical background of religion at this time as well as more background on Clemence and Valdes.



### *History and Background*

In twelfth-century Western Europe, the pursuit of religious expression, Christian devotion in this case, was safest when one embraced the orthodox form of religion that society validated. However, in the twelfth century many western European cultures were struggling to remain static about religion. To be fair, the founding of religious orders did not always result in conflict. New orders, first the Cistercians and Augustinians, followed later in the early thirteenth century by the Dominicans and Franciscans, were supplementing Benedictine rule and the Church ultimately accepted them.<sup>33</sup> Nonetheless, there were others reevaluating religion and they consequently created schismatic / heretical sects and confraternities.

Earlier than the time period in question, in the story of Leutard of Chalons circa AD 1000, we see a nascent but unsuccessful challenge to the church.<sup>34</sup> Then recorded outbreaks of heretical behavior occurred in Orleans in 1022, Arras in 1025, Monforte in 1028, and Chalons-sur-Marne in the 1040s.<sup>35</sup> But a more noticeable reemergence of opposition to the Church's hegemony surfaced in the twelfth century. Early in the twelfth century, there were documented examples of men such as Peter Bruis, Henry the Monk, and Tanchelm, becoming disenchanted with Ecclesiastical power.<sup>36</sup> Other dissenting figures were Eudo of Brittany, who believed he was self-divine, and Arnold of Brescia, who rejected what he perceived to be clerical hypocrisy.<sup>37</sup> Heretical groups included the Bogomils, Passagians, Spernoists, Amalricians, Humiliati (although they were later accepted), and the Cathars.<sup>38</sup> Absolute dualism, anti sacerdotalism, and rejection of infant baptism were just some of the concepts they believed in that deviated from church teachings. The monastic orders were also beginning to stray from their origins. Traditionally, monastic clergy were supposed to embrace a special voluntary poverty, but by the late twelfth century the Cluniac and Cistercian forms of monastic life had deteriorated

into indulgence.<sup>39</sup> Such instances of undue decadence could be why more and more were growing dissatisfied with current models of religious exemplar and becoming attracted to simpler ideals.<sup>40</sup> Some people, especially itinerant preachers, were gravitating towards a more unadulterated religious experience that returned to the values of the apostles. Furthermore, philosophical, theological, and mystical works from such writers as Peter Abelard, St. Anselm of Canterbury, Hugh of St. Victor and St. Bernard of Clairvaux were transforming western European medieval consciousness.<sup>41</sup> The spiritual was still paramount, and it was being reconsidered in significant ways, but people also held an appreciation for reasoning and logic's role in understanding Christianity.

It is with this information in mind that we should examine Valdes' life in twelfth-century Lyons, which at this time was part of the Holy Roman Empire.<sup>42</sup> This was the era of a burgeoning merchant class and the rise of towns across the continent.<sup>43</sup> From its earliest history Lyons had been an important port city for trade, and by the twelfth century was a commercial, urban area of around 10,000-15,000 with a powerful and very extravagant church chapter at its center.<sup>44</sup> Valdes lived his adult life in Lyons and was a wealthy citizen.<sup>45</sup> According to records, he was a very successful man who owned several properties including a house, mill, farm, bake-house, ponds, streams, vineyards and pastures.<sup>46</sup> His initial socio-economic status is not known, but the sources do not write that he came from nobility. In his book *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy of the Middle Ages*, Lester K. Little writes of Valdes' place in his society, "Waldes was one of the great men of Lyon, though from a social standpoint, he was only newly rich" (121). His fortune, though, was made through unethical means. He is assumed to have made his money as a merchant in the cloth trade and the reviled practice of money lending with interest in properties and goods such as bread and wine.<sup>47</sup> He may also have dabbled in

investment on behalf of the Archbishop.<sup>48</sup> The Anonymous of Laon uses such words as “wicked” to describe his former life (the Church condemned the act of usury).<sup>49</sup> His life changes around the years 1170-1173,<sup>50</sup> according to Laon, when one night he heard a minstrel sing the life of St. Alexis.<sup>51</sup> Once Valdes heard the tale of Alexis fleeing his fiancée and money for a life of poverty, Laon continues, he sought advice from his local priests, who told him if he wanted salvation to follow the Lord’s words in Matthew 19:21 and, “go sell what thou hast.”<sup>52</sup> From this point on, he chose to beg for alms<sup>53</sup> as Richard of Cluny writes of him, “He being a man possessing riches, abandoning everything, resolved to live a life of poverty” (2). He also began the unauthorized preaching that caused him to be eventually excommunicated. He disappears from the sources after the 1180s, and the precise details concerning his fate (when, how, and where he died) remain unknown to this day.

The aforementioned story summarizes the most famous and cited account of Valdes’ conversion,<sup>54</sup> one in which he gains inspiration from a beloved saint. Certainly, we should remember, St. Alexis is not the only saint to serve as a moral guide for people in the Middle Ages. In fact, saints’ lives were among the most widespread form of literature. While the majority of saints in the Middle Ages were male saints such as Alexis, George, and Lawrence, female saints served as the inspiration for the popular literature genre of virgin martyr narratives.<sup>55</sup> The virgin martyrs included, besides St. Catherine of Alexandria, Juliana, Margaret, Agnes, Barbara, Lucy, Cecilia, and Agatha.<sup>56</sup> During the Middle Ages their passios underwent stages of adaptation in style and content, for their narratives crossed many different countries, traveled from east to west, and were told in many different languages through oral, written, and visual form.<sup>57</sup> Most of the passions were originally written in Latin or Greek but by the time period in question were increasingly being translated into the vernacular.<sup>58</sup> They were usually set

in late antiquity in such cities as Rome, Alexandria, Nicomedia, and Antioch. Hagiographers composed their narratives in both verse and prose. Although the narratives were often anonymously written, male clergy are believed to have been the main writers of these hagiographies.<sup>59</sup> While all people could spiritually benefit from the virgin martyr tales, the main target audience for these narratives was religious women such as nuns and anchoresses,<sup>60</sup> and an increasing number of women entered these religious institutions in the twelfth century in England and France.<sup>61</sup>

It is with this background in mind that we should study Clemence of Barking and her translation. Clemence was a nun in the Abbey of Barking but other than her name and her attributing herself as the author of *St. Catherine* no other biographical details about her are known. However, much is known about the illustrious Barking Abbey.<sup>62</sup> Barking Abbey was originally an Anglo-Saxon monastery founded in the seventh century near London.<sup>63</sup> By the twelfth century it was an elite nunnery for women, and Wogan-Browne and Burgess remind us that abbeys, “often educated young, aristocratic women before marriage, as well as housing separated, divorced, abandoned or widowed women, Barking Abbey was used in this way by the Norman and Angevin royal families” (xxv-xxvi). Clemence was at Barking Abbey during the post-conquest era of hostility/intermixing between the English and Norman French and a little before Phillip Augustus’ conquest of England.<sup>64</sup> After years of power struggles, there was tension between King Henry II and the Church. Many were still reeling from Beckett’s murder and were resentful towards Henry II for his role in the incident.<sup>65</sup> In fact, it is likely that Clemence was a nun while Beckett’s sister Mary was abbess of Barking Abbey<sup>66</sup> (In her piece, *Clemence and Catherine: The Life of St. Catherine in its Norman and Anglo-Norman Context* Diane Auslander hypothesizes that Clemence was employing the self-serving villain Maxentius

to represent Henry II and the pious heroine Catherine to represent Thomas Beckett).<sup>67</sup> This is also the time period when the genre of courtly love was becoming popular. Clemence wrote, MacBain informs us, “at a time when courtoisie and fin’amors had just swept into England in the wake of Henry II and Eleanor of Aquitaine. Her poem appears to be written quite deliberately in the style of this ‘new wave’ ”(60).<sup>68</sup> There are three surviving manuscripts of Clemence’s translation of St. Catherine of Alexandria.<sup>69</sup> MacBain speculates that she is also the author of the anonymous life of St. Edward the Confessor, but most scholars have deemed his theory unconvincing.<sup>70</sup>

Now I have established the audience for Clemence and Valdes’ respective literary texts, and I have presented my introduction, thesis, sources, and background information regarding my subjects. In order to study them effectively for the remainder of the paper, I have divided the analysis into different topics. There are certain topics, however, on which this paper will not focus. Although there may be brief and necessary references to the Waldensians, the paper will not address their group in the later Middle Ages. This study will instead study Valdes as a person in his own lifetime and the decisions he made that reflected how innovation transpired in his life. And while I will make fleeting references to other female saints and female writers, they are not this paper’s concern. Instead, we will explore the creativity and intrepidness Clemence implemented when producing her translation. These constrictions are essential for clarity and purpose. The point of this thesis is to take these two figures and, in stripping them of some long-established labels, enhance more sharply their interestingness. The first topic I will discuss is Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon and their use of the vernacular.

### *Use of the Vernacular*

In Western Europe, education was growing in this sophisticated era. The twelfth century was a time of high learning with such disciplines as grammar, law, medicine, ethics, astronomy, physics, and cosmology developing due to interaction with Greek and Arabic texts.<sup>71</sup> In the last few previous centuries, reading and writing had been restricted to the clergy and the aristocratic class who could afford to provide their children with an education.<sup>72</sup> However, in the twelfth century, more secular courts were using writing in their administrating, and students were studying for non-clerical careers in urban institutes.<sup>73</sup> In a sign of further educational expansion, universities were operating in Paris and Oxford and altering higher learning on the continent.<sup>74</sup>

As for literature, this era was evolving in terms of literary tastes. The twelfth century was creating courtly romances, and as a result, hagiography was becoming more infused with amplification and courtly language, references, and imagery.<sup>75</sup> Unavoidably, our subjects could not help but be affected by such trends. Scholars Duncan Robertson and Catherine Batt have demonstrated that Clemence's narrative of St. Catherine has very noticeable courtly influence,<sup>76</sup> particularly from Thomas' *Tristan*. And it is possible that Valdes heard the life of St. Alexis on the street in the romance-inspired version titled *Chanson de Saint Alexis*.<sup>77</sup> Most strikingly, many writers were choosing to compose their works in vernacular languages.

For this section, I will address a prominent feature of both Clemence and Valdes' lives and legacies that showcase their innovations: their unique use of the vernacular and how that use was facilitated by their personal extraordinary circumstances. Specifically, I will show how Clemence and Valdes take advantage of their propitious situations in order to bring the

vernacular to a wider audience. I believe their reliance on the vernacular and their decision to use their atypical situations for the purpose of spreading it are themselves the biggest innovations.

Prior to showing my evidence, however, I would like to provide a brief summary on how language was changing at this time.

Literature in the vernacular languages was rapidly growing in the twelfth century, and Anglo-Norman in particular was flourishing.<sup>78</sup> In “Women and Authorship” Jennifer Summit points out that women, who often did not have the same abilities in Latin as men, benefited from the movement, “Because they were generally excluded from institutions of literacy that favored Latin, women became the privileged addressees of vernacular writing, and in the history especially of vernacular religious writing, women are legion as addressees” (104).<sup>79</sup> In one of the first high profile moments of significance, the Norman poet Wace presented *Roman de Brut* to Eleanor of Aquitaine in 1155.<sup>80</sup> This demonstrated that noble women were very instrumental as patrons of vernacular literature.

Duncan Robertson tells us how Barking Abbey encouraged women in this respect, writing in his essay “Writing in the Textual Community: Clemence of Barking’s Life of St. Catherine”, “At Barking, the cultivation of the vernacular was closely related to the “feminist” mission of the abbey. The nuns were generally less well schooled in Latin than were their male counterparts in the monasteries” (6). His comment, though, should not mislead us into believing the women of the nunnery were uneducated. Although the thriving era of Hild’s double monasteries was long gone<sup>81</sup>, Barking Abbey nevertheless provided literary access to their nuns that were exceptional even by the standards of the time.<sup>82</sup> Clemence was certainly part of a highly educated clerical structure, and she was well-versed in Latin in addition to possessing knowledge of theology and rhetoric.<sup>83</sup> This situation made Clemence an unusual woman for the

time. In her dissertation *Ciceronian Rhetoric and the Art of Medieval French Hagiography* Katherine Hill McKinley notes how Clemence mirrors Catherine in this respect, “Catherine’s abilities and education in the liberal arts were exceptional when compared to that of typical twelfth-century women of similar social status. The same can be said of Clemence” (24-25). Simon Gaunt makes the same observation in his book *Gender and Genre in Medieval French Literature*, “Clemence seems to identify with Catherine as a learned, intellectual woman” (230). However, it was not through the use of Latin but through her use of Anglo-Norman that she was able to accomplish a unique piece of hagiography.

Clemence’s translation is one of the earliest vernacular versions of St. Catherine’s life.<sup>84</sup> For Clemence, the vernacular was vital because she was delivering her narrative to an audience that consisted not only of other nuns but secular listeners as well (at this time French was the premier language at the court). Clemence herself explains her motives, “I intend to tell of someone who truly loved him and to translate her life, transposing it from Latin into the vernacular, so that it will be more pleasing to those that hear it”(3).<sup>85</sup> Clemence understands the necessity of not only ornamenting her words for aesthetic purposes, but also, of modernizing her source for her own age. She goes on to note the differing criterion from past generations, “Since times have changed, and with them the quality of people, the verse of the old translation is held in contempt, for it is imperfect in parts. For this reason it is necessary to amend it, and to deal with the world as befits the people who inhabit it” (3). This admission in her prologue shows a high level of self-awareness and practicality on the part of Clemence. She adds her commentary on the state of the relationship between language and people in her society.<sup>86</sup> She is acknowledging that standard language can actually contribute to the saint’s life becoming stale, and she fears the life and its lessons will fade if it is not able to keep up with the current.<sup>87</sup> For



Clemence, the vernacular is a vehicle that can help her disseminate her wisdom. Consequently, she is compelled to use her gifts as an educated woman to translate a life of St. Catherine, and also, to express the need to modify older works. Her idiosyncratic situation resultantly leads her to be a messenger not only of the *passio* itself but of the value of vernacularization.

Clemence, in using the vernacular to take substantial liberties with certain sections of the text, is not only validating the importance of Anglo-Norman as a medium through which religion could be expressed, and through which new literature could be created; she is also telling speakers of that language it is acceptable to do so in a language in which they functioned. Clemence's understanding of Latin, while most likely not equal to a man in her position, allowed her to use the vernacular effectively and to show respect for it. Through her peculiar status and the literacy her upbringing fostered, Clemence was able to widen others religious thought and, it is interesting but not crucial to this paper to note, anticipate future translations. In *The Role of Women in the Rise of the Vernacular*, June Hall McCash writes how the vernacular would empower women in the future, "The acceptance of the Romance and Germanic vernaculars from the twelfth century on thus opened a floodgate for women's self-expression and their efforts to learn and participate fully in courtly culture and even in the great debates that led up to the Reformation" (51). While she certainly did not create this trend, her focus on the necessity of updating language was an example of innovation that would resurface in vernacular hagiographies of the near and distant future.

Valdes of Lyon, in similar fashion to Clemence, was able to use a favorable circumstance, in his case financial clout, for the purpose of introducing religion to the masses. Like Clemence, his innovation was in using the means available to him, which for him was money, to express his own version of religion in a vernacular setting. While some saints' lives

were being written in the vernacular in the twelfth century, actual biblical passages in non-Latin languages were more restricted from the lay. In her book *Angels and Earthly Creature: Preaching, Performance, and Gender in the Later Middle Ages*, Claire Waters writes of the medieval clerical attitude, “Opposition to vernacular scripture was already an issue in this period, and the famous, or infamous, idea that the laity are to be presented with truth in simple form as infants are given milk, because they are not strong enough for solid food, is frequently featured in preaching manuals”(60). However, interest in vernacular translations of scripture was beginning to take root.

On this front, Valdes of Lyon was one of the trendsetters. Valdes of Lyon was not as academically educated as St. Catherine or Clemence, but like her he spread religious material through the vernacular, and like her he utilized his advantageous situation in order to pass his access on to others. Etienne de Bourbon describes Valdes as *non multum litteratus*, but he was not illiterate in our modern sense of the word. Valdes certainly knew how to read, but he did not have strong proficiency in Latin (only basic Latin).<sup>88</sup> Valdes would have had what is referred to as pragmatic literacy.<sup>89</sup> Etienne de Bourbon writes that Valdes “was not well educated, but on hearing the Gospels was anxious to learn more precisely what was in them. He made a contract with these priests, the one to translate them into the vernacular and the other to write them down at this dictation” (209). According to Etienne de Bourbon’s account, he hired Bernard Ydras, a young priest, and Etienne d’Anse, a grammarian and prebendary, to dictate and translate some books from the Old Testament, as well as some apocryphal and patristic texts into his native language of either Franco-Provencal or Dauphinois<sup>90</sup> (the evidence appears in d’Anse’s will, where it states in the second line *furnum qui fuit valdesii*, highly implying Valdes gave him a bake-house for his services and supporting Etienne de Bourbon’s text).<sup>91</sup> The result is

considered by many to be one of the earliest known translations, perhaps the earliest, of biblical material into the French vernacular.<sup>92</sup>

Then, according to Etienne de Bourbon, “Preaching in the streets and the broad ways the Gospels and those things that he had learned by heart, he drew to himself many men and women that they might do the same, and he strengthened them in the Gospel” (209). The Anonymous of Passau similarly writes, “he taught them the text of the New Testament in the vernacular” (258). The precedence Valdes set is noteworthy. In his essay “The Literacy of Waldensianism” Alexander Patschovsky acknowledges that Valdes “was a prime cause for the use of the Romance vernacular in imparting knowledge of the basic text of all Christian religious writing. That is an epoch making achievement” (116). To be fair, Patschovsky also questions how capable Valdes was of exegetical learning, noting of the texts he requested for translation, “Preoccupation with them presumes the existence of religious sentiment, but not necessarily of theology” (118).<sup>93</sup> Even if we accept Patschovsky’s statement, we should still appreciate the fact that Valdes provides us with a recorded case of a person of non-aristocratic or clerical rank who through his own resources accessed the Bible in their own language.<sup>94</sup> Patschovsky’s opinion about Valdes’ likely limitations is somewhat correct but perhaps overestimated. It is true that his act of translation was not done by him and did not involve the deep analysis that engaged the late medieval and reformation vernacular translations.<sup>95</sup> Yet his attempts to understand the Bible for personal edification proved to be trailblazing regardless<sup>96</sup> and he did connect the vernacular to the theological. Karen Sullivan, in her book *Truth and the Heretic: Crises of Knowledge in Medieval French Literature*, believes that Valdes of Lyon made a breakthrough in his purchase of the translation, an act others did not usually attempt, “With his reliance upon theological learning instead of prayer and devotional practices as a means of access to God, Valdes departs

radically from the tradition of Alexis and other holy layman before him” (193). Valdes, although lacking deep analytical scope, possessed the money that was becoming a force in medieval lay and emblemized a new era of religious educational pursuit. In *A History of Medieval Heresy and Inquisition* Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane writes of the significance that translations such as Valdes had on later generations, “The translation of scripture into the French vernacular was a vital step towards making the Bible accessible to laypeople, a process that would continue for centuries” (60). Furthermore, In his book *Medieval Christianity: A New History*, Kevin Madigan writes how Valdes’ achievement separated him from other preachers, “It is this interest in self-instruction by means of vernacular translation of the gospels and fathers, several historians suggest, that truly distinguishes Waldes from the mass of wandering preachers in previous decades” (189). Unwittingly or not, he was helping to initiate a movement that would swell as the centuries passed. Valdes had the means to gain religious information, if not full religious literacy in Patschovsky’s definition, and bring what he learned to an entire city. His story juxtaposed to Clemence’s highlights his agency due to his capital and her agency due to her extraordinary religious position. In their innovations they are both harnessing fortune for the sake of religious transmission.

Although their starting points were very different, and their levels of knowledge cannot be compared, Clemence and Valdes both took advantage of their prosperity to participate in a literary movement that would grow over the next three hundred years. While neither were the first to use the vernacular, they were original in their approach to it and they were perhaps exceptionally daring in their application. When studying them side by side, moreover, we discover that their relationship with the vernacular could be indicative of a mindset that would propagate beyond their own lifetimes. We learn that an uneducated man, if he possessed money,

held a degree of power that could advance his cause and that an educated woman, if she was able to gain a high position in a discriminatory society, could still find a way to openly cement her literary legacy. The change in attitudes towards literacy is obvious in both accounts, and their remarkable life benefits catalyzed their success.

### *Relationship with Others*

In Clemence of Barking's translation and Valdes of Lyon's conversion, we can find three linking factors when studying how their innovations are expressed in relationships to others: the rise of refined/more pacifist exposition: the deeper exploration of the human condition and its relation to materialism, an emphasis that was facilitated by their creative borrowing of the *ubi sunt* theme (which laments life as transient)<sup>97</sup> and *apostolica vita* ideals (which seek to return to the simple ways of the apostles),<sup>98</sup>: and the broadening of a community that is not necessarily against their innovations. Their attitudes are shaped by the self-guided nature of their projects, and their choices result in less sensationalistic forms of religious expression. One notable trait they both adopt in their stories is a de-emphasis on violence in favor of embracing more placid forms of faith. They become concerned with how people can connect with each other through more solicitous means. This is not to say they completely abandoned more traditional beliefs regarding punishment or damnation, but my argument is that the irenic aspects in Clemence's translation and in Valdes' life story outweigh the more bellicose ones. In order to see how their innovations were displayed in this regard, we should briefly revisit the trends of their time period to give context.

Although medieval saints' lives often contain long devotional speeches, suffering has also been essential to the plots. In "Violence, Community and the Materialisation of Belief" Robert Mills writes rather starkly, "Saints lives afford ample opportunities for the representation of violence. Legends of martyrs who are stripped, beaten, burned and beheaded find their place alongside tales of saints who beat their demonic adversaries to a pulp, saints who self-harm, even saints who commit murder" (87).<sup>99</sup> In many saints' lives of the Middle Ages, hagiographers depicted gruesome tortures, created frightening monsters to tempt, and enhanced fighting for

entertainment purposes.<sup>100</sup> Some famous battle scenes include Margaret's defeat of the dragon and Juliana's arrestment of the demon. Clemence is loyal to the vulgate in that she shows Catherine's torture scene, beheading, and Maxentius' killing of the other characters. Still, her version of St. Catherine manages to insert a shift in thought, which Simon Gaunt frankly notes, "the account she gives of her heroine's martyrdom is less violent and less erotic than other accounts of the martyrdom of virgins" (228). We can see specific examples of this in her prologue, for she does not engage in the *miles Christi*<sup>101</sup> motif in the same manner as the vulgate. In "Rooting, Subverting, and Reclaiming: An Analysis of Clemence of Barking's Catherine of Alexandria as a Pre-modern Gendered Text" Gina Froese writes that the vulgate author's images are "deeply militaristic" and that his descriptors are, "inherently violent and aggressive in nature. They portray both the saint and divinity as otherworldly warlords who require Christian followers to prepare for physical hardships and brutal battles" (53). In contrast, Froese judges, "Clemence's image and interpretation of the divine is nearly opposite of the Vulgate's. Her contemplation of the spectrum of qualities she views as inherent in the definition of God move in the opposite direction of warrior God the Vulgate author invokes" (57). Froese's point is evident in Clemence's opening lines, where she conveys a desire to see virtue distributed among the people, "All those who know and understand what is good have a duty to demonstrate it wisely, so that by the fruit of its goodness others may be encouraged to do good deeds and to want what is good, as far as they are able" (3). And she adapts the famous debate scene to display the theories of great thinkers from the High Middle Ages. In her narrative, the Emperor Maxentius is so confounded and insulted by her refusal to worship the traditional gods that he sends for fifty of the best scholars from around the world to debate her on theology and the divinity of Christ. The scholars argue how unreasonable it is to believe that God would choose to die on the cross

as a way of redeeming humankind. But to Maxentius' and the scholars' discomfiture, St. Catherine is able to counteract them in a rebuttal that Clemence greatly expands from the vulgate version. In her closing speech, Catherine explains, "He did not change his nature, but honoured ours by his own. His could not be harmed, but ours was exalted by his" (17). The debate scene combines Clemence's eloquent writing with the influence of, among others, Saint Anselm of Canterbury.<sup>102</sup> Clemence takes the new philosophies that were educating her generation to put St. Catherine's passio in a more gentle light. From the omission of supernatural beasts, to the elimination of warlike language, to the spotlight on relatively new theological concepts about Christ's passion, Clemence's version of her is especially adept in avoiding the overly sadistic or voyeuristic.

The more civil tenor that we see in Clemence's narrative can also be found in the urban metropolis of the nearby European continent. □□ Valdes is a representative of a rising class in this society in the twelfth century, the merchant class, and his status is that of one with no confirmed military background. Far from being a fighter, Valdes interrupts a rather uneventful life in a city setting to address a spiritual crisis. Like Clemence and her interpretation of St. Catherine, the search for God assumes more benign qualities. His contribution in this regard has been acknowledged; in *The Limits of Ethics in International Relations: Natural Law, Natural Rights, and Human Rights in Transition* David Boucher compares Valdes' values to that of the Church when he writes that the Waldensians, "sought to follow the teachings of the Gospels. In contrast, the Church gave greater emphasis to the development of principles relating to the justice of resorting to war (*jus ad bellum*), and the right of just conduct of war (*ius in bellum*)" (62) and in *Pacifism* David Martin further notes that men "like Peter Waldo and St. Francis renounced their backgrounds of commercial luxury and entered into an apostolic ministry for



others. However, when they did so it is interesting to observe once again the appearance together of the pacifist and the eschatological themes” (41). These observations of his history suggest that he did not view aggression as an appropriate solution. Although he was ultimately excommunicated, Valdes is not recorded to indulge in truculent challenges to the Church the way that men such as Arnold of Brescia did. He did not direct any violent opposition towards the Church, in fact requested their permission, did not see himself as unorthodox and was initially embraced by the Church for his efforts. His search for faith is dependent on incorporating the peaceful into his mission. His method, like Clemence through Catherine, is to convince his audience of faith’s preeminence using other means than antagonism, and to remind people that they need to repudiate excess and vanity in order to gain God’s grace.

An example of such an appeal to others, if we expand the theory further, is Clemence and Valdes speeches on the soul’s eternity and how obedience to God should supersede any obedience to greed or superficiality. To underscore this point I will cite an account from the Anonymous of Laon. The passage takes place on the Feast of the Blessed Virgin and the townspeople are shocked to see Valdes, who by now had abandoned his former life, handing out money to the poor. However, Valdes, as Lester Little has conjectured,<sup>104</sup> would not shy away from their reaction, but rather, use the situation to his advantage. Valdes decides to give a dramatized declaration when he climbs up on a post and starts unapologetically explaining his newfound priorities to the skeptical residents:

My fellow-citizens and friends, I am not insane, as you think, but I am avenging myself on my enemies, who made me a slave, so that I was always more careful of money than of God, and served the creature rather than the Creator. I know that many will blame me that I act thus openly. But I do it both on my own account and on yours; on my own, so that those who see me henceforth possessing any money may say that I am mad, and on yours, that you may learn to place hope in God and not in riches.<sup>105</sup>

This episode from Valdes of Lyons' story gives us an example of his innovation through the act of his candid, confessional nature. He is not an intellectual superior, but rather, an imperfect and repentant person who is using self divulgence to obtain a positive end. Unlike other repentant sinners, such as the harlot saints who retreat from the world to undergo a strict rigorous prayer and deprivation cycle supervised by a clerical mentor,<sup>106</sup> he is trying to guide others very publicly without any previous stamp of authorization or under any organized process. His innovation is in the openness of his mistakes and his sympathetic concern that others do not end up like him. And unlike other itinerant preachers, who were intent on exposing the Church's hypocrisy, Valdes targets himself. His disgust as it relates to materialism is self-directed and internal, then redirected outward to help others.

Clemence also felt the need to remind her audience of the hopelessness of the material, and she alerts her audience to the dangers of sacrificing God's love and mercy for societal validation and riches.<sup>107</sup> She expands the theme from the vulgate in St. Catherine's speech to Porphyry explaining that all the wealth in the world cannot save someone (lines 1666-96), as well in the response St. Catherine gives when Maxentius offers to build a statue in her honor, "but tell me what the birds which fly over me will do? Will they spare me on your account, so as not to alight on me? In no time in all they will have pecked out my eyes and sullied out my shining

face. Even your dogs will abuse me. Such, King, is your praise” (23). Clemence employs the offensive imagery in order to, like Valdes, take a closer examination at the sometimes skewed balance between God and human beings and how human beings become unrightfully supreme in the terrestrial mind. She understands the need to reject obedience to riches instead of God in a similar manner that Valdes advises the Lyonnaise, for in her translation she magnifies the disingenuous feelings Maxentius’ servants feel for him and explains why they and the clerks refuse to accept Christianity despite its evident truth, “People are quicker to believe a rich man’s error than a worthy man’s truth. This was the case long ago and it still is, I believe, for people more readily lie out of fear than tell the truth out of love” (19). Like Valdes, Clemence makes her audience more keenly aware that power and false praise from human subordinates has no true merit and is based on spurious faith, just as Valdes makes his audience aware that success on Earth cannot replace, and actually hinders, salvation.

Certainly, Clemence and Valdes’ words to others, which has already been noted in the preceding paragraphs, exhibit a more profound relationship with a receptive and expanding community. Valdes was taking his message to the highly populated, diverse setting of Lyons, an act that anticipates mendicant friars. Similarly, Clemence was addressing a readership that was large, sophisticated, and sundry for its time. Their responses to such a challenge were to subsume a higher human component into their goals. St. Catherine, being saved, must convince others to accept the same state. In Clemence’s translations she, as in the earlier translations, converts others through the traditional miracles of being able to retain virginity, of being able to withstand such suffering, of being able to use God’s inspiration to speak, of being able to escape many ignoble attacks on her life, and of being capable of enduring such harsh conditions in jail. And the feats, as we know, do not originate with her. In “Power and Authority” Claire M. Waters

uncovers the true source, “It is also frequently exercised that any power the saint exercises is God’s power: miracles are responses to the saints’ intercession, but of course are performed by God” (72).<sup>108</sup> Martyrs like St. Catherine, as Waters is reminding us, are never truly alone in their mission. However, the divine presence is accompanied in Clemence’s edition by the higher participation of other people in the story. There are three scenes in particular in which she expands the audience reaction from the vulgate: when St. Catherine defeats the clerks at the debate (lines 1011-56),<sup>109</sup> when the populace mourns the Empress’ execution (lines 2335-54),<sup>110</sup> and when the people grieve for St. Catherine before her beheading (lines 2513-30).<sup>111</sup> By doing so, Clemence is forging a community that does not simply exist as passive observers to Catherine’s fate and miracles, but rather, become proactive and discerning.<sup>112</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess note how different this approach was from other hagiographies of the time, “we are encouraged to hear the varying voices of the more peopled world of her narrative,” and continue, “The varying response of the members of the crowd, not all of whom are immediately converted, is unusual in saints’ lives” (72, note 49). By including the audience, Clemence augments the other characters and extends her message from the text to the audience of the Abbey and the court. Clemence of Barking was not only widening the literary world she borrowed from earlier hagiographers, but also reaching the outside world of the twelfth century.<sup>113</sup>

Valdes, in a sign of awareness that echoes Clemence’s innovative tendencies, decides to integrate the community into his plan. His relationship with the community is fraught with layers that signal changing times and also his own perspective regarding the importance of others. Rather than searching for God with the help of celestial beings, he enlists a scribe for translation, the local priests for advice, and followers to help him preach. Moreover, after his

conversion, Valdes repays the people he had financially wronged and provides aid during a famine.<sup>114</sup> These actions show that while he becomes a beggar, he is not simply leaving to restart a new life of apostolic poverty, but trying to make amends for the past sins he committed against victims of his money-lending schemes. He also tries to plan his family's future. According to Laon, Valdes places his daughters in the order of Fontevrault (and also gives them a sizeable amount of money) and offers his wife a choice between his real estate or moveable goods and "though greatly saddened by the necessity, she chose the real estate" (201). What we see in Valdes is a man who leaves his family in an unsettling manner, yet, does in some way attempt to compensate for the loss he anticipates his family will feel as a result of his decision. His story shares with Clemence's narrative the more complicated dynamics between people in medieval religious expression, but also, how innovative minds attempted to renegotiate these relationships.

The Cistercian exemplum story further provides communication between Valdes and the larger community in their story, which depicts Valdes receiving what the reader would infer as a vision. In this very brief account that was part of a larger collection, a disheveled Valdes is frantically going from door to door. Upon seeing his manic state, horrified residents ask why he, a man who had been so wealthy, has changed for the worse. His reply to them is that he saw disturbing images of the future and was trying to warn them of their impending spiritual doom.<sup>115</sup> The exemplum story is important to mention because it suggests amicability between Valdes and the Cistercians. Michel Rubellin offers this opinion in "Valdes: un exemple a Clairvaux? Le plus ancien texte sur les debuts du pauvre de Lyon" and believes that it would have been Archbishop Guichard de Pontigny who related the story to the Cistercian order, proving he did not disapprove of Valdes' initial intentions.<sup>116</sup> In fact, he may have been seeking to use Valdes' conversion to promote asceticism. This was a time when Archbishop Guichard de Pontigny, who

was elected in 1165, was trying to establish an uneasy peace with the count.<sup>117</sup> In order to effectively accomplish this task he needed to reform the clergy, and the clergy had many improprieties that needed to be ameliorated. One of them was avarice. Once living a communal existence, the canons in Lyons built their own residences within the church.<sup>118</sup> Then in 1173, around the time of Valdes' conversion, their church received a rather substantial sum from a settlement with the Count of Forez due to an earlier sacking of their cathedral area St. John the Baptist.<sup>119</sup> Archbishop Guichard was struggling to get all of the canons to agree to his proposed reforms.<sup>120</sup> Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane argues for Valdes' value in helping the Archbishop, "Allies were necessary, and they were to be found among the laity: specifically, as Michel Rubellin argues, in men such as Valdes, whose fervent commitment to apostolic principles Guichard believed could be productively channeled for reformist ends" (60). His conversion, then, shows his innovation not only in trying to improve others, but also by assisting in uniting the community as a whole.

When studying Clemence's translation and Valdes of Lyon's conversion together, we notice how interactions with others denote a level of innovation in thought on the topics of violence, materialism, and audience. In studying Valdes' life with Clemence as it relates to these subjects, we also find that his life evinces a frailty perhaps familiar to her. In much the way that Clemence is reimagining the life of St. Catherine, Valdes is recontextualizing the life of St. Alexis. Karen Sullivan notes Valdes' very public interpretation, "Far from seeking the darkness and silence Alexis so cultivates, Valdes wishes to be seen and heard by all" (201). This act of public display connects Clemence and Valdes; Clemence was a rarity in that she was a woman openly attaching her name to a work exploring artistic independence and excursus, and Valdes was a rarity in that he was a lay person without any clerical training openly adopting a lifestyle

not recommended for his class. In this sense, Valdes and Clemence are akin to each other because they were both leaving themselves vulnerable in abandoning expectations of normative behavior. The incongruence of their backgrounds with their goals largely contributes to their processes of self-guidance in their approaches towards other people. They were thus exposing themselves without a clear precedent in an increasingly forward-thinking era.

## *Gender and Marriage*

When studying Clemence of Barking's translation with the story Valdes of Lyon as they relate to innovation, we find their choices engage in what I would define as feminist gestures mostly unseen or respected at this time. For this section on gender and marriage, I will focus on two topics in which women are prominent: the presence of female evangelism and the role of wives in their respective stories. For the unit on gender I will explore the raised profile of the female characters in Clemence's narrative and Valdes' decision to allow women to preach alongside men in his group. For the unit on marriage I will argue that Clemence's portrayal of Maxentius' marriage to the Empress and the story of Valdes losing a public dispute with his wife actually reassert rather than defy traditional gender constraints. By studying the subjects of gender and marriage together, we can better see the conflicts of interest that are burrowing beneath the surface.

I will first discuss gender, and more specifically, the role of female preaching and conversion in Clemence's writing and in Valdes of Lyons' movement. Before going further, it is helpful to be reminded of the mindset that prevailed in regards to women. Generally, women in the Middle Ages were seen as inherently weak and troublesome due to Eve's sin. Aristotelian biological theory held women were the matter that was subordinate to the man's form.<sup>121</sup> This strengthened the already accepted notion that women were below men in the High Middle Ages, and in her book *The Lady as Saint: A Collection of French Hagiographic Romances of the Thirteenth Century* Bridget Cazelle perfectly illustrates how the Church embellished on such views when they adjudged women, "as an imperfect, incomplete, and defective version of the male-hence the typical description of the medieval church of woman as the source of all evil, a



door to Satan, and the gender of inferior intelligence”(48). While this may have been the position of the Church, the secular world of the self-governing regions of Western Europe were not uniform across the continent in their attitudes toward women, for some societies offered women more independence than others. Variations aside, it would prove challenging to find any that offered what we now recognize as gender equality.<sup>122</sup>

It was during such a time that Clemence decided to translate the life of St. Catherine. Her world was not the best era or place for women, as Anglo-Norman culture did not appear to offer quite the same rights or opportunities that pre-conquest Anglo-Saxon society had extended.<sup>123</sup> Certainly, Clemence was fortunate in that she was in Barking Abbey, one of the most elite institutions that a woman could be in at this time. As a nun she would have had more responsibilities and prestige than an anchoress.<sup>124</sup> The limitations of her gender, then, was somewhat assuaged by her position and this could have contributed to her decision to reveal herself. As we know, Clemence’s text is one of the few pieces of hagiography in the twelfth century with a confirmed female author. She closes the text with, “I who have translated her life/Am called Clemence by name/I am a nun of the Barking of Abbey/For love of which I took this work in hand” (43). The act in itself is not wholly significant, for there had been female-authored works in the Middle Ages before, including most notably Hrothsvitha of Gandersheim in the tenth century. There were also women contemporaneous or nearly contemporaneous to Clemence creating literature such as the female *trobairitz* of Southern France, Heloise, Hildegard of Bingen, and Marie de France. Barbara Zimbalist, however, deems Clemence’s work especially daring due to the literary modifications she presented under her name, proclaiming in her essay “Imitating the Imagined: Clemence of Barking’s Life of Saint Catherine” that she “authorizes

herself as a participant in the hagiographical tradition and proclaims herself qualified to pass critical judgment on the literary and aesthetic merits of previous (and presumably male-authored) versions of Catherine's life" (105). In her view, Clemence is going a step further because she is not only adding her name to her work, she is assigning to herself the worthiness to alter the work despite her gender. Clemence is openly providing her audience with a narrative that did not depend exclusively on the previous male-authored sources and she is interpolating her own insight into the text.

One of the ways Clemence achieves this goal is by offering her female characters a form of power through preaching and conversion. Barbara Zimbalist writes, "Clemence's decision to structure Catherine's speech acts as *oratio recta*-direct discourse-in imitation of Christ creates an evangelical mode of imitation at odds with women's social positions in the Middle Ages" (106). The preaching she employs in her translation is exceptional in that it is a woman writer (Clemence) constructing a female saint functioning as a preacher (St. Catherine) for a willing, engaged female audience that is converted (The Empress).<sup>125</sup> This all-female dynamic is almost unfounded in the twelfth century and is definitely an example of her innovation. The extra attention she gives to the female characters is a way of inserting herself and her principles into the text, and Gina Froese contends, "The work is structured to support a medieval reconstruction of gender that redefines the dynamic between women and power" (90). However, we should consider the possible implications hiding behind the prerogative of the female characters. Undoubtedly, Clemence still had to struggle with being restrained by clerical and courtly preferences despite her special privilege and despite the model of female empowerment she puts forth.

In order to explicate Clemence's dilemma, I will broach the subject of female resistance in virgin martyr narratives. A level of independence for women in medieval literature has been the martyrs' success in dying as virgins and overcoming male protagonists.<sup>126</sup> Clemence follows the trend in showing Catherine's desire to remain unmarried and also in her ability to sever the Empress from Maxentius through the act of conversion. In the narrative, we should recall, Maxentius is both bewildered by and drawn to Catherine. He offers her anything for her to renounce Christianity and be his second wife. In a line added by Clemence, however, he refuses to include in that deal the Empress' dowry, "You will be in second place in my palace, and together with the queen you will possess all my realm, except for her dowry, for I do not wish to wrong her in that regard" (22). We can view this line as proof that Clemence wanted to accord more value to Empress in Maxentius' kingdom.<sup>127</sup> However, the Empress, who Clemence designates a "handmaiden of the Lord",<sup>128</sup> is also a strong symbol of Christian devotion. Moreover, Catherine's speech to the Empress before her execution is heavy with references to a perfect afterlife with God, "Everything which reaches there becomes sweet. Everything is sweetened with the sweetness which derives from him. Nothing has strength to resist this sweetness" (37). Duncan Robertson notes the importance of the saint's speeches, "Catherine calls women to imitate her example and follow her vocation, renouncing earthly marriage in favor of the love of God, who offers them eternal 'delit' and 'dulcue'." (17).<sup>129</sup> Catherine's description of heaven, then, raises an unnerving question: how much of Clemence's innovation was compromised by or forced to conflate with clerical attempts at controlling women?<sup>130</sup> In other words, when was Clemence speaking for herself and when was she speaking for the clergy? Numerous studies have been done by such scholars as Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, Catherine Sanok, and Karen Winstead regarding whether narratives such as Clemence's provided

models of resistance for a female recipient.<sup>131</sup> On the one hand it seems like they certainly did, especially in the later Middle Ages.<sup>132</sup> On the other hand, the Church, as is well known, used hagiographies as a method of showing the necessity of submitting to their authority the way that virgin martyrs and other converts in the text submit to God.<sup>133</sup> Although Catherine's talents as a preacher is unparalleled in the text, and she routinely beats the male characters with her oratory skills, her goal of converting the Empress is a partial reminder that religious women in real life should be submissive to the Church's ideals. The storyline is the Church's way of saying they should reject earthly romances much in the way that Catherine rejects paganism and a marriage to Maxentius, and much in the way that the Empress rejects her prior, sinful life. Wogan-Browne and Burgess write of Clemence's success in achieving this end, "In Clemence of Barking's version, Catherine's redirection of the queen towards a better lover, a better kingdom, and an eternal rather than a transitory happiness is, as MacBain argues, made more emphatically and strikingly than in any other French vernacular treatment of the legend" (xxxiv). Perhaps Clemence saw her translation as an opportunity to increase the pronouncement of the female characters, yes, and doing so might have given her a sense of personal satisfaction; but she is also being forced to use her talents to espouse a sort of misogynist convention, for the more focus she puts on the Empress' conversion the more she could be implicitly reinstating the Church's wishes. Clemence is a brilliant female writer in an oppressive era for women, and no matter how much she personally contributes to the narrative, she cannot deviate too much from the Church's expectations of religious women. Clemence's level of success in separating her own intentions, whatever they truly were, from that of the Church is a matter that complicates her innovations. She was an open woman writer able to present strong female characters, true,

and we should be indebted to her willingness to do so, but she was also in a controlled environment handling a story that would invariably support clerical values.

I would like to continue this discussion of female evangelism as it relates to Valdes of Lyon. I aver that Valdes of Lyon's allowing of female preachers correlates with Clemence's larger attention to Catherine's conversion of the Empress in that it heightens women's visibility in religious life. Etienne de Bourbon writes how Valdes initially developed his following, "He also sent out persons with the basest occupations to preach in the nearby villages. Men and women alike" (209) and Richard of Cluny notes likewise, "He caused many men and women to become his accomplices in a like presumption: whom he sent to preach as his disciples" (3). The decision, one should be aware, does not prove gender equality on Valdes' part. In *Two Cities: Medieval Europe, 1050-1320* Malcom Barber reminds us not to over romanticize early Waldensianism as a pillar of feminist proclivities, "from the mid-1170s there is evidence of female Waldensians actively preaching, although they played no part in the leadership of the movement (Biller 1996)" (173). The issue, though, is not one of equality but of presence. Valdes' flexibility regarding gender roles should be the focus rather than the actual freedom of the women themselves<sup>134</sup>. And his choice very likely invoked a stunned response. Gabriel Audisio surmises the reaction in his book *Preachers by Night: The Waldensian Barbes, 15th-16th Centuries*, "It must have been a shock indeed to the Lyons public to see women preaching in public on a par with men"(8). Valdes' actions, however, should not designate him a conscious progressive in this regard. These passages aid us in establishing Valdes' innovation, certainly, but we should consider the mindset behind Valdes' choice to allow women into his sect. One, even if this proposal may not appear very flattering, could be a degree of indifference. Although

Valdes permitted women to preach in his group, there are no substantial, personal interactions, positive or negative, between him and female followers in the contemporary sources of his life. In this sense he differs from the likes of Robert d'Arbrissel, whose empathy led him to pay special attention to prostitutes and abused wives,<sup>135</sup> or Tanchelm and Henry the Monk,<sup>136</sup> who were both besmirched with stories of exploiting female followers for hedonistic purposes. Valdes' innovation, then, could have been caused by the fact that he was not emotionally invested in women or selective when it came to the demographic of his group. He did not go out of his way to either embrace or spurn women. His initial attitude toward them, if not the attitude of other early Waldensians, may have been one of apathy more than one of support or intended inclusiveness.

Another theory in regards to motivations could be his strong convictions. The liberality of Valdes' actions may reflect his unfamiliarity with church tenets and/or his sincere belief that the Bible transcends human representation of its contents. To study further and understand better, one must remember how the earliest sources used his female preachers as a way to reinforce the rights of only men to expound the Gospel. Their reactions are not important on their own merit, for the reactions to Waldensians have been studied for centuries and do not need to be studied again. They are crucial, however, in establishing what the mainstream permitted in order to contrast their standards with that of Valdes'. Let us examine the concept some more. In "The Prostitute-Preacher: Patterns of Polemic against Medieval Waldensian Women Preachers" Beverly Mayne Kienzle cites Geoffroy of Auxerre's story from c.1180 of two women preachers from Clermont, who, after being scolded by the bishop for preaching in public, go on to later scream at him in their defense.<sup>137</sup> Although they are not explicitly identified, Kienzle has assumed them to be early Waldensians. If she is correct, this would be a rare story of Waldensian

women followers during Valdes' recorded lifetime. In the story the women are portrayed as morally loose, telling people, "After the preaching every day we were feasting splendidly; almost every night we were choosing new lovers for ourselves; bothersome to no one, without care, without toil" (102). The account is striking because it shows that a woman's mere presence in an evangelical setting was disconcerting to the authorities, so much so, as Kienzle notes, it signaled to Geoffroy of Auxerre that the world was nearing the apocalypse.<sup>138</sup> Roxanne Mountford, in her book *The Gendered Pulpit: Preaching in American Protestant Spaces* observes, "As historians have discovered in the letters and treatises published in the twelfth century, the fact that Waldensians encouraged women to preach was even more horrifying to the church officials than the fact all Waldensians were defying church authority" (9). The story, with its description of the female preachers as undesirables, also demonstrates that the sources were slandering them as a way of invalidating the Waldensians.

Kienzle then turns to two other sources, Bernard Fontcaude and Moneta of Cremona, who give examples of why the Waldensians considered female preaching allowable.<sup>139</sup> According to them, the Waldensians cited certain biblical passages to show that God did condone women preachers, but Bernard Fontcaude and Moneta of Cremona insist they were misreading them and that their uneducated minds was the only reason a woman preacher would be tolerable. From this perspective, women's preaching was evidence of their incompetence as a group and of their low standards<sup>140</sup>. This reaction is important not so much in understanding the Church's concerns, because they are not the focus of this thesis; however, like in the first example with the women preachers from Clermont, it is important because it indicates how disconnected Valdes' original actions were from the mainstream when building his following. Despite the repugnance many expressed at his decisions regarding women preachers, he never

outright banned them. This suggests he was either wholly ignorant of others' disapproval, did not care about it, or legitimately believed the scriptural basis for his actions and that scripture simply took higher priority than their alarmed responses. He truly wanted to abide by church rules, but despite numerous warnings, never stopped preaching and despite the likely reaction of shock that Audisio posits never kept women from preaching either. His loyalty to the word of God, or what he believed the word of God was saying, may have led to his lack of oversight. We can speculate that Valdes' devotion to his own perception of true expression of faith was so strong that it led him to disregard what was established as normative. His innovation in allowing women preachers, then, reflects his emphasis on Biblical authenticity.

I have now presented my argument regarding Clemence, Valdes and how female preaching expresses their innovation as it relates to gender. I will now turn to the subject of marriage. In addition to the preaching elements I have covered previously, Clemence of Barking's translation and Valdes of Lyon's conversion include accounts of marriages broken by religion. While the stories show appearances of innovative undertones in that the wives assert themselves and the husbands cannot contain them, the broken marriages are not advocating unconventional choices. On the contrary, we will find that the elevation of the wives misleading when probed further. Before introducing these stories, let us briefly recount the emerging structure of marriage in the twelfth century. At this time marriage was extremely important and taken as a central symbol of Christ's relationship to the Church. On a familial level, marriage had always been and continued to be a crucial commodities exchange involving women via the transfer from one household to another.<sup>141</sup> It was a way of controlling women, gaining a dowry/property, and integrating into important families.<sup>142</sup> In the twelfth century, though, theologians



were using Roman law to revisit such issues as the bride/groom's consent, consummation in marriage, family's involvement, public ceremonies, and the clergy's role/power.<sup>143</sup> Gratian's *Decretum* and Peter Lombard's *Libri IV Sententiarum* were having a profound impact on attitudes towards the individual's rights in choosing to marry and also who they would marry.<sup>144</sup> Alexander III added to the wave of progression by confirming the participants' right to assent to or reject marriage.<sup>145</sup> With so many monumental changes occurring, it is not surprising that Clemence's translation and Valdes' conversion show how disarranging the consequences of conversions can be through the act of marital separation.

In Laon's account of Valdes' life, Valdes gains inspiration from St. Alexis' tale of fleeing his marriage. However, Valdes didn't flee his community like St. Alexis did and appeared to reject his wife quite openly. He did not equate his marital separation with sin. In fact, it appears his separation was a gesture of how much his new life meant to him. It seems, though, as if the wife was able to gain a form of uncommon visibility, if not empowerment, in a legal dispute. The Anonymous of Laon gives us details of how Valdes, after becoming voluntarily poor, accepts alms from a former friend but not from his estranged wife. One day as Valdes was leaving church, the friend assures him, "As long as I live I will give you the necessities of life" (202). Valdes' wife, upon hearing the story, proceeds to go to the Archbishop and force Valdes to take alms from her and only her, "Like one beside herself, she rushed into the presence of the archbishop of the city to complain that her husband had begged his bread from another rather than from her," (202) then seizes him by the throat while imploring "Is it not better, husband, that I should redeem my sins by giving you alms than that strangers should do so?" (202) the result being that "This situation moved all who were present to tears, including the archbishop

himself” (202) and the Archbishop ruling in her favor “And from that time forth, by command of the archbishop, he was not permitted in that city to take food with others than his wife” (202). The verdict shows disapproval on the Archbishop’s part when it comes to Valdes’ abandonment of his wife, which Euan Cameron alludes to when he writes in his book *Waldenses: Rejections of Holy Church in Medieval Europe*, “Archbishop Guichard, in ordering Valdesius to take support from his wife, denied any validity to his self-imposed religious divorce”(14). In losing the decision to his wife, Valdes is admonished for his actions and it appears that his wife has won a battle over her husband. In his book *The Devil’s World: Heresy and Society 1100-1300* Andrew P. Roach characterizes the situation as a woman boldly taking matters into her own hands, “Valdes’ wife was so shocked that she brought a case to the archbishop’s court on the basis that if anyone should support her eccentric husband, it should be her. She won.” (80). Putting aside the complex issue of women’s rights in the medieval era, which certainly cannot be captured or fully explained in this account, this story can appear in the modern eye to be, as Roach presents the case, a victory for a medieval woman.

However, the story must be studied in the context of the time it was written. This is where the role of the wife succeeds in validating lay marriage. Although marriage offered benefits socially and economically, and was certainly preferable to promiscuity, it was ultimately an inferior state fitting for the lay. In his essay “Clerical Celibacy and the Laity” Andre Vauchez writes of the distinction the Church made:

Ever since the Carolingian epoch, in effect, the Church had defined a favored path to salvation for each category of Christians in accordance with their place in society. In this perspective, marriage and family life had been proffered to lay people as means of salvation at that same time that celibacy was presented to the clergy as the instrument of their sanctification (183).<sup>146</sup>

Even though hagiography celebrated virgin saints' success in evading their suitors, lay people were not expected to follow the martyrs' example literally. Valdes' renunciation of his own marriage, if we keep Vauchez's review of medieval social structure in mind, would not expiate him of his sins but actually put him in even more spiritual debt than he had been in before. Brigitte Cazelle reminds us that in real life people were encouraged to revere, but "were not asked to imitate the saints, for when they did, as in Waldo's case, they were regarded as potentially dangerous social agitators" (26). Valdes does not escape his decisions unscathed and his attempt to live like a saint fails after his wife forcefully confronts him about his behavior. His copying of St. Alexis, then, does not feature a scene that gives women agency as much as it vindicates the marriage union that suppresses them. Perhaps that was the Anonymous of Laon's purpose if we choose to agree with Tolonen's overall theory regarding the chronicler's motivation and audience (which was that the narrative was written to educate the laity in the region of Flanders concerning proper behavior for their class). Valdes is wrong because, unlike St. Alexis, he already accepted marriage for quite some time before deciding to reject it. In relating the story to its readers in such a stylized manner, Tolonen reminds us, Laon was warning that when a layman goes above his status and erroneously copies St. Alexis' actions they will not receive the same results, concluding, "the outcome of the actions of Valdes is bad due to his

ignorance which in turn stems from his social and marital status” (174). If studied from this perspective, the actions of the wife, while still dramatic, can perhaps be deceptive in their feminist appearances and are actually symptomatic of a life gone dysfunctional due to one partner abandoning norms. Although the story of Valdes of Lyons’ marriage seems to be innovative for presenting a brave woman defying her husband, it could have in fact discouraging notions of independence and remind the reader of a lay man’s obligation to his dependent wife.

The same variance appears in the relevance that Clemence gives to the love Maxentius expresses for the Empress after she announces her conversion and he orders her execution. MacBain notes the attention Clemence gives to the scene, how it was covered more than the other vernacular translations (102 lines to Gui’s 16, Picard’s 26 and Aumeric’s 40),<sup>147</sup> and how his love for her surpasses the affection he feels for his advisor Porphiry.<sup>148</sup> In the following line, Maxentius expresses sorrow over his wife before brutally maiming and killing her for converting, morosely professing, “I cannot avoid having you put to death, but thereafter my life will be a living death” (35). He also expresses shame at her conversion, “Because I loved you so much, I assumed the same of you, but now you have proved to me that this was nothing but presumption” (36). But MacBain stops short at attributing such lamenting inclusions to feminist-leaning compensation, insisting the lines were not added “because Clemence is a woman and feels moved to redress the balance between what is owed to the wife and what is owed to the friend” (60). Instead, he believes it is to reestablish the supremacy of love of God over earthly love to her courtly audience. By doing so, Clemence is encouraging her audience to reject the intoxicating appeal of the courtly love genre<sup>149</sup>, and in this sense Maxentius mimics Valdes’ wife in helping to promote perceivably healthier mainstream values. Duncan Robertson writes of

Maxentius' function in the scene, "his lyrics lovers despair is a burlesque, a parody, a travesty of an apology for secular love and marriage, against which Clemence's Catherine victoriously promotes the love of God" and agrees with MacBain, "Rightly, I believe, he reads the Emperor's passionate defense of earthly marriage in the context of Clemence's attack on it" (23). If we allow for this reasonable theory on the scene, then Maxentius' speech serves to remind the courtly audience that mutual love on earth, while strong, is ultimately disappointing and mercurial.<sup>150</sup> Although the Empress is given more consideration in Maxentius' court in Clemence's translation, her marriage to him is ultimately complicit in his slavishness to such love, for MacBain observes, "By having the emperor witness to the mutuality of the love he shared with his wife, we become aware of *her* sacrifice also"(61).<sup>151</sup> Through the amplification of this scene, Clemence could be defending the pure, spiritual love that the Church advocated for religious women and also criticizing the courtly love that had become so fashionable. Her writing, then, is being used to endorse more traditional paradigms.

After studying Clemence's translation and Valdes' conversion from the perspective of gender and marriage, we can conclude that they were innovative in providing women with a level of increased public presence in the twelfth century. The claim is true to an extent, for in both texts there is a raised profile of female evangelical participation, which offer women a visage of agency, as well as renewed attention towards the wives in the respective narratives. However, while both stories show that women could attain a higher level of involvement with preaching, and both stories feature emotionally charged marital controversies in which wives challenge their husbands, Clemence's translation and Valdes' conversion are still restrained by outside conceptions of gender. The accounts' portrayals of marriage aspire to pull the reader

away from the influences of romance and decision making that lacked consideration for one's place in society. Their stories tell us that, on the topic of gender and marriage, innovation could be achieved in the twelfth century. However, that innovation was not a neat presentation and forcibly retained elements of older ideologies.

### *Legacy and Conclusion*

The final section of this paper will study Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon from the perspective of legacy. After studying them from a variety of topics, we must now use the information to deduce what their ultimate innovations were, and also, how their ideas and methods would be recreated later in the Middle Ages in others' actions. We can also postulate what their lives can mean to a modern reader looking for examples of innovation in the twelfth century.

Clemence's work and Valdes' conversion tell us that they were driven by a rather normal contemporary desire to gain salvation for their souls<sup>152</sup>. Clemence certainly was concerned about her eternal state,<sup>153</sup> for she closes her narrative by writing, "For the love of God, I pray and beseech all who will hear this book and who listen to it with a receptive heart to pray to God on my behalf" (43). Her plea tells us that although her process may have been novel, the main goal was standard for its time.<sup>154</sup> Valdes was also consumed with salvation, especially since he was trying to redeem himself for his past indiscretions. The severe measures he took were for the sake of atoning for his sins, even though the initial verdict on his fate was inconclusive: Valdes' later followers, in the council at Bergamo in 1218 between the French Poor of Lyons and Italian Poor Lombards fractions, debated his salvation.<sup>155</sup> The Poor of Lyons wanted Valdes, who according to them had passed at this point, to be granted absolution, but the Poor of Lombards answered he would have only attained salvation if he confessed his sins like any other person (they never were able to come to an agreement).<sup>156</sup> For all of their adaptations, Clemence and Valdes' thoughts were still concerned first and foremost with the medieval priority of reaching heaven. Their stories should remind us, then, that innovation was produced with a serious purpose still ensconced in customary ideas of faith.

In studying their stories through the perspective of innovation, we should study, although not solely rely on, reaction to their works. On the issue of leaving a legacy, history appears to not allot a particularly positive or negative place to Clemence's work. Her translation has survived in three manuscripts, and has also been found in a later thirteenth-century preacher's miscellany.<sup>157</sup> However, her work was not copied in the Middle Ages, even though Catherine's legend continued to be wildly popular.<sup>158</sup> After Clemence's Anglo-Norman translation, vernacular treatment of Saint Catherine would grow for the remainder of the Middle Ages.<sup>159</sup> A Middle English life of the saint was written in the West Midlands around 1220,<sup>160</sup> and later in the thirteenth century a life of Catherine was included in the *South English Legendary*. In England, virgin martyr saints' lives became big in the fifteenth century when political opposition and heretical movements against the Church rose, and the Bokenham, Lydgate, and Capgrave vernacular translations of Catherine would adapt to the late medieval culture and audience.<sup>161</sup> Other women such as Christine de Pizan would continue Clemence's tradition of high medieval female-authored narrative with her own life of St. Catherine.<sup>162</sup> St. Catherine continued to be a latent influence in Reformation and Early Modern drama.<sup>163</sup> In our own time, however, we have come to realize that Clemence's imprint on the life of St. Catherine, which preceded all of these other lives, is special because of its distinctive writing and because it is one of the few pieces of hagiography in the twelfth century with a confirmed female author. Her work is now revered as a rare piece of female-authored hagiography and an example of a learned woman expressing her creativity, articulate gifts, and personal opinion in a male-dominated literary genre. William MacBain exclaims, "Clemence' *Vie de sainte Catherine* is, I believe, one of the most remarkable works of the latter half of the twelfth century, in its originality worthy to stand alongside those of Chretien de Troyes and Marie de France" (63) and Wogan-Browne writes in "Women and



Anglo-Norman Hagiography”, “Clemence of Barking’s *Life of St. Catherine* has recently begun to receive recognition for its poised re-handling of the Latin source and its courtly doctrinal sophistication. It is a text which deserves to be well known and which should be seen alongside such contemporary and comparable works as the *lais of Marie de France*” (68). Barbara Zimbalist notes that while earlier scholarship did not fully respect Clemence’s translation, “Recent scholars, however, such as Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, Duncan Robertson, and Catherine Batt, argue that the life’s narrative innovation and theological complexity reveal a skillful author intimately engaged with Catherine’s persona and the spiritual themes of her *Life*” (108). Clemence’s legacy is her bravery and willingness to expose herself and her talents for posterity. Her work shows us that perhaps there was cognitive dissonance in her life, for she was taking from the past while experimenting with splashes of bold statements relating to the present. She was a woman expressing herself in a world that avowed the superiority of the male mind.

Responses to Valdes’ conversion are more mixed. Although accounts of his conversion vary considerably throughout the Middle Ages, Valdes was not an immediate recipient of adoration in the thirteenth to fifteenth centuries. This is evident in some chronicler’s writings who were clearly writing from a bias standpoint. In the High Middle Ages, when writers such as Bernard Gui were still complaining of his role as a fire starter,<sup>164</sup> it was difficult for Valdes to gain positive recognition; his time would not arrive until the Reformation. In this respect, he differs from Clemence in that there is evidence of him having a direct influence on people in later time periods. As some Waldensians became absorbed into Protestant sects, he became a hero to the likes of John Foxe and Matthias Flacius, with Foxe boasting that he, “was setting forth the true doctrine of Christ against the errors of the Antichrist” (146).<sup>165</sup> It is important to remember, however, that some of these Reformation writers were reading fourteenth-century

sources regarding the Waldensians' beginnings such as Zwicker's 1393 *Cum dormient homines* where Valdes has already been renamed Peter.<sup>166</sup> In these texts, he is not so much the founder of the Waldensians but is rather a vessel sent to continue a group with ancient origins. The Anonymous of Laon's more romanticized and personal account of his life, one that can perhaps be appreciated by a broader audience, was edited in 1786's *Recueil des Historiens des Gaules et de la France* and then edited again in the nineteenth century *Monumenta Germaniae Historica*.<sup>167</sup> In the Early Modern and Victorian eras, Valdes became a point of contention between those such as Joseph Milner, Jean Leger (who was a Waldensian himself), Samuel Morland, and J. A. Wylie, who glorified the Waldensians but did not believe him to be the founder, and those such as Samuel Roffey Maitland and Pius Melia, who compiled evidence and put forth opinions that he was.<sup>168</sup> In the twentieth century Valdes was increasingly recognized as a predecessor to the Franciscans,<sup>169</sup> and in the early twenty first century new works by Merlo, Cameron, and Biller continued to debate the medieval identity of Valdes and the varieties of Waldensianism.<sup>170</sup>

However, the point of this thesis is to study Valdes from the angle of innovation, and one way to do so is to approach his story from a human viewpoint. To constantly shape Valdes' identity and actions from religious standards limits the ways in which we can learn from his life. It may be helpful to think of him in terms that do not romanticize or misunderstand the original ideals of the Reformation, nor demonize the mindset and actions of the medieval. Valdes' story in his most basic form, with or without the long history of the Waldensians, is quite inspiring. He does not need to simply be a convenient hero of a disillusioned group looking for anything contrarian to Catholic rules. Although Clemence's innovation was in the revelation of her gender, and what she wrote under that banner, his innovation perhaps is that ordinary quality so

despised by the pre-modern church. Pekka Tolonen reminds the reader of the medieval mindset in regards to lay founding religious sects, “If the founder is an ordinary man without supporters in high positions and his deeds are not legitimized by miracles, the movement does not have a possibility to succeed” (170). The Archbishop of Turin Claudius Seyssell took this discriminatory mindset into the sixteenth century when informing his readers of Waldensian beginnings:

it is proper to mention the origin of this sect, in order that everybody may know that it did not proceed from a man in any way famous; because its author, whosoever he was, had so low an extraction, and so little learning and reputation, that his very disciples do not dare mention his name publicly; and as regards either holiness of life, or literary pursuits and virtues, and miracles, he had no renown at all”<sup>171</sup>.

Although Seyssell was speaking from a condescending standpoint, it is difficult in my opinion to entirely dismiss his statement that some Waldensians were possibly ashamed of naming the unglamorous Valdes as the founder of their sect.<sup>172</sup> Yet the fact that he was not glamorous, electrifying or qualified enough for some provides him with a level of interest. Valdes is unlike many other religious figures because he had no clerical connection before his conversion and, due to his inability to abide by anyone else’s rules, couldn’t join an existing group. His group had a level of encouragement and support from Alexander III in 1179,<sup>173</sup> but he had no official authorization to preach from the Church at any point in his life. And after 1184, he left society never to be reabsorbed back into it. In his book *The Waldensian Dissent*:

*Persecution and Survival c. 1170-c.1570* Gabriel Audisio notes his life on the fringe by writing, “Vaude’s real originality lies elsewhere. He was a layman and wished to remain so. He refused either to enter an existing religious order or to found a new one. He rejected the idea of a mould in which his own inspiration would lose its uniqueness” (23). Audisio’s observation is well taken, but it chiefly considers where his originality *lies* instead of from where it *came*. Valdes was special because of his layman status and his choices, true, but he in my view he also differed from other religious dissidents because he was an unlikely offender and an unassuming person. Valdes was for the earlier part of his life nondescript and his innovation could be found in this mere fact. Kevin Madigan refers to him as an “unremarkable if successful merchant”,<sup>174</sup> and I would like to apply this observation to my paper. Yes, he was a wealthy man in Lyons, and a wealthy merchant status was not common when compared to the whole of the population. But in my opinion, money in of itself, especially when that money had been given away, could not be enough to draw people to a religious leader. Valdes had no spectacular traits, as far as the sources describe, to induce people to abandon their lives and follow him. He was somebody who should have never been influential in a religious context given the fact he had no theological credibility or religious background. Astonishingly, though, his group has managed to survive even into this time period and has outlived other movements with much more dynamic leaders. While he did not exude a particularly charming personality, I believe he has still managed to leave an incredible legacy due to his willingness to expose his faults and make his inner struggles so public to people who may have been feeling the same way. Moreover, the fact that he, a lay businessman, translated the Bible into his own language hundreds of years before Luther and Wycliffe did is a testament to how far a search for redemption can go even without extraordinary personal traits. When we allow ourselves to separate Valdes from his constantly debated place in

religious history and study him as simply an emotionally damaged human being trying to improve his character and life despite his lack of star quality, we can find an amazing example of innovation from which anybody could gain inspiration.

Finally in my conclusion, I find it noteworthy to conjecture how their actions would be replicated, if not always borrowed from, in later centuries. Certainly, it is impossible to assign to either Clemence or Valdes the task of single-handedly inspiring later generations to propel themselves into revolutionary forces. It is not true and the evidence, especially in Clemence's case, does not support such a large claim. However, their stories provide us at the very least with instructive, personal examples of two people expressing their faith in new ways. Both Clemence and Valdes were able to take what should be mere inherent qualities, her gender and his layman status, and use them to leave their own mark. The striking innovation found in Clemence's translation and in the story of Valdes of Lyons illustrates that independent-mindedness could germinate in the twelfth century from improbable sources. This question of who was worthy of saying what would become more convoluted in the later centuries. Though Clemence was advocating for the Church's supremacy in her vernacular translation, later generations would use their own form of scholastic insight and rhetorical methods to openly question an institution that held so many constraints on others. While Clemence did not share the same values as later medieval figures, and the trends of virgin martyr archetypes would change, she was offering an admirable example of a strong woman in her version of St. Catherine to those who were fortunate enough to hear it. Clemence and Valdes were both insistent on their loyalty to the Church, but inevitably, their streaks of ingenuity crept through and captured the need for reinvention.

In his book *the Implications of Literacy; Written Language and Models of Interpretation*

*in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries* Brian Stock articulates the inability to keep the past from the current, “Only rarely is an idea utilized by a small voluntary association simply because it has deep historical roots; it must also respond to a problem in the here and now; in that sense, all dissident movements, whether heretical or reformist, are contemporaneous phenomena, no matter how they historicize their origins” (101). I believe that Clemence of Barking and Valdes of Lyon epitomize the inescapability of the “now” to which Stock is referring. Valdes did consult others on how to change his life, but his rejection of the acceptable answers show he was looking for God on his own terms, or perhaps, felt the accepted ways were not enough to gain him absolution. He bluntly proclaims that “no man can serve two masters, God and Mammon” (201) and afterwards spent the rest of his life in pursuit of serving God. His self-sufficient measures hint at the desperation to level his soul. Clemence of Barking may have also felt her actions were warranted, for she was seeing an important life, one that she most likely turned to for inspiration, lose ground to more fashionable trends and priorities.<sup>175</sup> As a result, she was driven “to make the times conform to the people” (3). The disquietude of Valdes’ story and the production of Clemence’s narrative are two examples of twelfth-century innovation that could be seen as benefiting their immediate goals. However, they also served as antecedents for others who may have experienced the same apprehensions, for the processes they employed would be adopted by others in larger numbers and reappear in later, more pivotal periods of the Middle Ages.

---

## NOTES

<sup>1</sup> For a comprehensive analysis of modern twelfth-century historiography and its evolving theories regarding the “renaissance” see John Cotts, *Europe's Long Twelfth Century Order, Anxiety and Adaptation, 1095-1229* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012) 1-13.

<sup>2</sup> Jocelyn Wogan-Browne and Glyn S. Burgess provide the background information in their book *Virgin Lives and Holy Deaths: Two Exemplary Biographies for Anglo-Norman Women* (London: J.M. Dent, 1996) xi-xxxv.

<sup>3</sup> William MacBain, “Five Old Renderings of the Passio Sancte Katerine Virginis.” *Medieval Translators and Their Craft*. Ed. Jeanette Beer. Studies in Medieval Culture 25. (Kalamazoo: University of Western Michigan, Medieval Institute Publications, 1989) 42.

<sup>4</sup> Susan Crane gives the date c. 1175 in “Anglo-Norman Cultures in England, 1066-1460.” *The Cambridge History of Medieval English Literature*. Ed. David Wallace (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2002) 46. Maud Burnett McInerney also gives the date c. 1175 in “Virgin Martyrs.” *Women and Gender in Medieval Europe: An Encyclopedia*. Ed. Margaret Schaus. (New York: Routledge, 2006) 815. Catherine Batt puts it between c. 1175-1200 in “The French of the English and Early British Women’s Literary Culture.” *The History of British Women's Writing, 700-1500: Volume One*. Ed. Liz Herbert McAvoy and Diane Watt. (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2012) 52.

<sup>5</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xix-xxv and MacBain 41. For the Latin *Vulgata* text see Herman Knust, *Geschichte der legenden der h. Katharina von Alexandrien und der h. Maria Aegyptiaca nebst unedirten texten* (Halle: M. Niemeyer, 1890) 231-314. See also *Seinte Katherine*. Ed. S. R. T. O d’Ardenne and E.J. Dobson. (Oxford: Early English Text Society, 1981) 132-203.

<sup>6</sup> In their references section of the introduction to *Virgin Lives and Holy Deaths*, lii, note 25, Wogan-Browne and Burgess note an AD 320 writing by Eusebius in *Ecclesiastical History* Book 8 ch.14, who tells the story of a young Christian woman exiled and stripped of her possessions after refusing to be the Emperor’s mistress. However the *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church* (Ed. Frank Leslie Cross and Elizabeth A. Livingstone. Oxford: Oxford UP) and rejects the connection on “insufficient grounds” see “St. Catherine of Alexandria.” 306. Others have noticed the striking similarities between the character of Catherine and the fifth-century pagan mathematician Hypatia. They have posited Catherine may have been intended to be a Christian and therefore “corrected” version of her. See Wogan-Browne and Burgess xxi; and *St. Katherine of Alexandria: Texts and Contexts in Western Medieval Europe*. Eds. Jacqueline Jenkins and Katherine Lewis (Turnhout: Brepols, 2003) 7.

<sup>7</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xix.

<sup>8</sup> Christine Walsh, *Cult of St. Katherine of Alexandria in Early Medieval Europe* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007) 99-101.

---

<sup>9</sup> "Imitating the Imagined: Clemence of Barking's Life of Saint Catherine." *Reading Memory and Identity in the Texts of Medieval European Holy Women*. Eds. M. Cotter-Lynch and B. Herzog (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. 105-35) 110.

<sup>10</sup> *A History of Women's Writing in France*. Ed. Sonya Stephens. (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000) 10-40.

<sup>11</sup> Grado Merlo notes that Peter Waldo is not the correct name in his essay, "Heresy and Dissent." *Medieval Christianity*. Vol.4 of *A People's History of Christianity*. 7 vols. Eds. Daniel Bornstein and Daniel R. Janz (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2007) 238. For more history of Valdes' name, see the opening pages of Walter Mohr, "Waldes Und Das Frühe Waldensertum." *Zeitschrift Für Religions- Und Geistesgeschichte* 9.4 (1957) 337-63. See also Audisio's opinion on the history and usage of Valdes' name in *Waldensian Dissent: Persecution and Survival, c.1170-c.1570* (Trans. Claire Davison. Cambridge UP, 1999) 8-9. Jarrette Allen also notes his various names in his paper, "La Bible en occitan: The Cathars, the Waldensians, and the Heretical Origins of the Reformation in Lyon." *Academia.edu*. 3-4.

<sup>12</sup> For The Anonymous of Laon's account, I will be using the translation published in Walter L. Wakefield and Austin P. Evans, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* (New York: Columbia UP, 1991) 201-202. It was translated from *Chronicon universale anonymi Laudunensis*, edited by George Waitz in *Monumenta Germaniae historica, Scriptores*, XXVI, 447, 449. For Richard of Cluny's account I have chosen to use a nineteenth-century English translation provided by Pius Melia in his book *The Origin Persecution and Doctrines of the Waldenses from Documents, Many Now the First Time Collected and Edited* (London: James Toovey, 1870) 2-3. It was translated from "Rerum Italicarum Scriptores." *Muratori* tom. iii 447, *et seq.* Mediolani, 1723. For another translation of the Richard of Cluny text, see Giorgio Tourn, *You are My Witnesses: The Waldensians Across 800 Years* (Torino: Claudiana, 1989) 11-12.

<sup>13</sup> For Etienne de Bourbon's account, I will be using the translation in Wakefield and Evans *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 209-210. It was translated from Stephani de Borbone *tractatus de diversis materiis praedicabilis*, edited by Albert Lecoy de la Marche in *Anecdotes historiques, legendes et apologues tirees du recueil inedit d'etienne de Bourbon, dominican du XIII siècle* (Societe de l'histoire de France, Publications, CLXXXV (Paris, 1887) 290-92.

<sup>14</sup> Etienne de Bourbon, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 209.

<sup>15</sup> See Peter Biller, "Goodbye to Waldensianism?" *Past & Present* 192 (2006): 3-33.

<sup>16</sup> Audisio, while admitting that some today consider themselves Waldensians, denies there are any true Waldensians and believes Medieval Waldensians, specifically Valdes' original Poor of Lyons division, became Protestants by the sixteenth century. See Gabriel Audisio, *Waldensian Dissent: Persecution and Survival* 4, 186-187, 221 223.



---

<sup>17</sup> Pekka Tolonen, "Medieval Memories of the Origins of the Waldensian Movement." *History and Religion: Narrating a Religious Past*. Ed. Bernd-Christian Otto, Susanne Rau, and Jorg Rupke (Berlin/Boston: W. de Gruyter, 2015) 179-182.

<sup>18</sup> Tolonen 179-182.

<sup>19</sup> Tolonen notes Valdes' absence in some later Waldensian sources. 179. See also Merlo, "Heresy and Dissent." 245.

<sup>20</sup> There have been different estimations regarding Valdes' year of death, but most sources put it around 1205-1218. It is no later than 1218 because the Poor of Lyons themselves mention Valdes death in a letter from 1218. Merlo puts it between A.D. 1205-1207 "Heresy and Dissent." 241.

<sup>21</sup> MacBain 60.

<sup>22</sup> Karen Winstead, *Virgin Martyrs: Legends of Sainthood in Late Medieval England* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell UP, 1997) 14. See also Elizabeth Robertson, *Early English Devotional Prose and the Female Audience* (Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 1990) 1-12; Larissa Tracy, *Torture and Brutality in Medieval Literature: Negotiations of National Identity* (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2012) 32; and Simon Gaunt, *Gender and Genre* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1995) 181.

<sup>23</sup> See Alexander Patschovsky, "The Literacy of Waldensianism from Valdes to C.1400." *Heresy and Literacy, 1000-1530*. Ed. Peter Biller and Anne Hudson. (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996) 114-115. He shows two manuscripts: one is a manuscript of Etienne de Bourbon's account and another is Etienne d'Anse's will that mentions Valdes. Olivier Legendre presents us with the exemplum from *Liber visionum et miraculorum* in his thesis, "Le Liber Visionum Et Miraculorum." (*École Nationale Des Chartes*, 2000). Antoine Dondaine presents us with the profession of faith by Valdes dated c.1180 in *Aux origines du valdéisme: une profession de foi de Valdès, par Antoine Dondaine. Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum 16* (1946): 191-235. And Tourn notes Richard of Cluny's account that was kept in Church archives in Carcassonne, France, *You are My Witnesses: The Waldensians* 11.

<sup>24</sup> Tolonen 174.

<sup>25</sup> Brian McGuire, "A Lost Clairvaux Collection Found: the Liber Visionum et Miraculorum compiled under Prior John of Clairvaux (1171-79)" *Friendship and Faith: Cistercian Men, Women, and their Stories, 1100-1250* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002) 26. For more on manuscript history and background on the exemplum collection, see Legendre, "Le Liber Visionum Et Miraculorum."

<sup>26</sup> Melia p.1. For an excellent piece on Richard of Cluny, see Marc Saurette, "Tracing the Twelfth Century Chronica of Richard of Cluny." *Memini. Travaux et documents, Bulletin de la Société d'Études médiévales du Québec* 9-10 (2005/2006) 303-350.

---

<sup>27</sup> See *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 220-241 for the translated early thirteenth-century accounts of the Chronicler and Premonstratensian provost Burchard as well as an account by Peter of Vaux-de-Cernay. See also Audisio 6-25 and 26-39.

<sup>28</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 220-228.

<sup>29</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 40.

<sup>30</sup> Tolonen 176-177. See also *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 208.

<sup>31</sup> Tolonen 176.

<sup>32</sup> See Edward Peters, *Heresy and Authority in Medieval Europe (The Middle Ages Series)* (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1980) 141-143; and L.J. Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century: The Textual Representations* (Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2011) 138. There has been some confusion regarding the Anonymous of Passau and Reinerius Sacco, or, Rainier Sacconi. The Anonymous of Passau's text regarding the Waldensians has sometimes been mistakenly attributed to the earlier writer Sacconi.

<sup>33</sup> For a thorough survey of these groups and their influence on medieval society see R.W. Southern, *Western Society and the Church in the Middle Ages* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1970). See also Constance H. Berman, "Monastic and Mendicant Communities." *A Companion to the Medieval World*. Ed. Carol Lansing and Edward D. English (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009) 231-256; and Lester K. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Cornell: Cornell UP, 1983). For the Cistercians see Janet E. Burton and Julie Kerr, *The Cistercians in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2011). See also the individual entries on these groups in *The Encyclopedia of Monasticism: A-L*. Ed. William M. Johnston (Chicago: Fitzroy Dearborn, 2000).

<sup>34</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 72-73. See also Heinrich Fichtenau, "Western Heretics in the Eleventh Century." *Heretics and Scholars in the High Middle Ages, 1000-1200* (University Park: Pennsylvania State UP, 1998) 13-51.

<sup>35</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 76-93; and Fichtenau, "Western Heretics in the Eleventh Century."

<sup>36</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* for Tanchelm 96-101, Henry and Peter 107-124. See also Fichtenau, "The Twelfth Century NonCathars." *Heretics and Scholars in the High Middle Ages, 1000-1200* 52-69.

<sup>37</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 141-142 and 146-150.

<sup>38</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 1-55.

---

<sup>39</sup> Lester K. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* 61-69 and 93-96. For more on the Cistercians, see Emilia Jamrozak, *The Cistercian Order in Medieval Europe: 1090- 1500* (New York: Routledge, 2016).

<sup>40</sup> Rory Naismith, “Turpe lucrum? Wealth, Money, and Coinage in the Millennial Church.” 17-39 and Giles E.M. Casper, “Contemplating Money and Wealth in Monastic Writing c.1060-c.1160.” 39-77. *Money and the Church in Medieval Europe, 1000-1200: Practice, Morality and Thought*. Ed. Giles E.M. Casper and Svein H. Gullbeck (London: Routledge, 2016).

<sup>41</sup> See *A History of Twelfth-Century Western Philosophy*. Ed. Peter Dronke (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1992); and *The Twelfth-Century Renaissance: A Reader*. Ed. Alex J. Novikoff (Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2016). For more on St. Bernard of Clairvaux see Brian Patrick McGuire, *A Companion to Bernard of Clairvaux*. (Leiden: Brill, 2011).

<sup>42</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 707, note 5

<sup>43</sup> Little 3-18. For more recent surveys on the economy in Europe at this time see James Paul Masschaele, “Economic Takeoff and the Rise of Markets.” *A Companion to the Medieval World* 89-110. See also Cotts 80-106.

<sup>44</sup> Little 120- 121. See also Andrew P. Roach, *The Devil's World: Heresy and Society, 1100-1300* (Harlow: Pearson Education, 2005) 79-80.

<sup>45</sup> Little 121.

<sup>46</sup> Little 121. For the information regarding Valdes' house, see Melia 2, note 2.

<sup>47</sup> Roach 79-80. There are different reports that speculate Valdes' profession. Michel Rubellin questions the merchant label, which he borrows from Madeleine Verdat (‘Nouvelles recherches sur l’origine et la vie lyonnaise de valdes’), in his chapter “Au temps ou Valdes n’etait pas heretique: hypotheses sue le role de Valdes a Lyon (1170-1183)” *Eglise et societe chretienne d’Agobard a Valdes* (Lyon: Presses Universitaires de Lyon, 2003) 467.

<sup>48</sup> Audisio, *The Waldensian Dissent* 9.

<sup>49</sup> Little 35-41 for more background on the implications of usury.

<sup>50</sup> Richard of Cluny gives the date AD 1170; Anonymous of Laon gives the date AD 1173.

<sup>51</sup> In the story, St. Alexis left his fiancee on his wedding night and ran away to live in poverty before returning many years later unrecognizable to his parents. From that point on, he lived and died in their house without them discovering his true identity. St. Alexis was one of the most famous saints from the Middle Ages and his story was told continuously in different forms, including the tenth- century *Vita Sanctii Alexii*, the eleventh -century Old French classic *La Vie de Saint Alexis*, and the twelfth-century *Chanson of St. Alexis*.

---

<sup>52</sup> *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 201 and 708, note 7.

<sup>53</sup> Valdes' aspirations to be poor fall under a movement known in medieval history as apostolic poverty, or *vita apostolica*. Daniel Bornstein reminds us it had been practiced before in his essay, "Relics, Ascetics, Living Saints." (*Medieval Christianity*) 96. See also Gabor Klaniczky, "Using Saints: Intercession, Healing, Sanctity." *Oxford Handbook of Medieval Christianity*. Ed. John Arnold (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2014) 221-222. In late antiquity there were desert hermits such as St. Antony the Egyptian, St. Athanasius, St. John Chrysostom and Pachomius. See Daniel Caner, *Wandering, Begging Monks: Spiritual Authority and the Promotion of Monasticism in Late Antiquity* (Berkeley: U of California P, 2002). In the tenth century, a merchant, St. Godric of Finchale, sold all of his possessions and lived as a hermit for the rest of his life. Also at this time there was Romuald Ravenna, and later on Benedictine monk and purveyor of austerity Peter Damian. Others from the early twelfth century, from Robert d'Arbrissel to Bernard of Tiron to Vitalis of Savigny, adopted a simple life in the name of Christ. For St. Godric of Finchale see Reginald of Durham, "The Making of a Merchant: St. Godric of Finchale." *The Portable Medieval Reader*. Ed. Mary M. McLaughlin and James Bruce Ross (New York: Viking Press, 1968) 139-144. For a summary of the other men and their chosen life of poverty see Michel Mollat, *The Poor in the Middle Ages: An Essay in Social History* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1986) 74-81. See also Little 70-83.

<sup>54</sup> Tolonen 171. Euan Cameron believes that the Anonymous of Laon was employing a topos in hagiography known as "sudden conversion" to present Valdes' change. Euan Cameron, *Waldenses: Rejections of Holy Church in Medieval Europe* (Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2001) 13. For other theories from Kurt-Victor Selge, Grado Merlo and Christine Thouzellier, see Tolonen 172. Two thirteenth-century accounts actually contradict any sudden conversion origins. Etienne de Bourbon states he simply was inspired by the gospels, while The Anonymous of Passau, an even later source from AD 1260, writes that he was spiritually affected after the sudden death of a townsman. For the Anonymous of Passau's account I will use the translated source document provided by Peter Biller in his essay, "Heresy and Dissent." *The Routledge History of Medieval Christianity 1050-1500*. Ed. R.N. Swanson. (London: Routledge, 2015) 258. Biller's translation is from *Quellen Zur Geschichte der Waldenser*. Ed. Alexander Patschovsky and Kurt-Victor Selge. (Gutersloh: Gutersloher, Verlagshaus Gerd Mohn, 1973) 19.

<sup>55</sup> For a demographic of saints' lives by gender in the Middle Ages see Robert Bartlett, *Why Can the Dead do Such Great Things? Saints and Worshippers from the Martyrs to the Reformation* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2013) 145-148.

<sup>56</sup> Sarah Salih mentions these as among the most popular. *Versions of Virginity in Late Medieval England* (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2001) 108.

<sup>57</sup> For a general background, see Maud Burnett McInerney, "Virgin Martyrs." 814-816.

<sup>58</sup> For more on the vernacular versions see Salih 12 and McInerney 815.

<sup>59</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xiv.

---

<sup>60</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xii.

<sup>61</sup> Sharon K. Elkins, *Holy Women of Twelfth-century England* (Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina, 1988). See also Bruce L. Verner, *Women's Monasticism and Medieval Society: Nunneries in France and England, 890-1215* (Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1997) 1-16.

<sup>62</sup> Katherine Hill McKinley also notes that while we do not know much about Clemence, we do about Barking Abbey. "Clemence of Barking's The Life of St. Catherine." *Ciceronian Rhetoric and the Art of Medieval French Hagiography* (Diss. University of Maryland, 2007) 26.

<sup>63</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xxv; and Duncan Robertson, "Writing in the Textual Community: Clemence of Barking's Life of St. Catherine." *French Forum* 21.1 (1996): 6-7.

<sup>64</sup> For an overview of this time period see Robert Bartlett, *England under the Norman and Angevin Kings, 1075-1225* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2000).

<sup>65</sup> Anne J. Duggan, "Henry II, the English Church and the Papacy, 1154-76." *Henry II: New Interpretations*. Ed. Christopher Harper-Bill and Nicholas Vincent. (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2007) 175.

<sup>66</sup> Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Clerc u lai, muine u dame': women and Anglo-Norman Hagiography in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries." *Women and Literature in Britain, 1150-1500*. Ed. Carol M. Meale. (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996) 83, note 40.

<sup>67</sup> Diane Auslander, "Clemence and Catherine: The Life of St. Catherine in its Norman and Anglo-Norman Context." *Barking Abbey and Medieval Literary Culture: Authorship and Authority in a Female Community*. Ed. Jennifer N. Brown and Donna Alfano Bussell. (Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2012) 164-182.

<sup>68</sup> Wogan-Browne notes that Clemence's St. Catherine is "among the earliest texts in Britain to use the term 'fin'amur' "Women and Anglo-Norman Hagiography." 68.

<sup>69</sup> Oldest is from around 1200. See Wogan-Browne and Burgess for manuscript history xxiv.

<sup>70</sup> William MacBain, "The Apprenticeship of Clemence of Barking." *AUMLA Journal of the Australian Universities Languages and Literature Association* (1958): 3-22. Jennifer N. Brown notes that, "While William MacBain has argued that the anonymous Nun of Barking is actually Clemence of Barking, this has been rejected by most scholars on insufficient evidence." "Translating Edward the Confessor: Feminism, Time, and Hagiography." *Medieval Feminist Forum* 43.1 (2007) 57, note 9. However, Delbert W. Russell revisits the argument that Clemence is the author of Edward the Confessor, "'Sun num n'i vult dire a ore': Identity Matters at Barking Abbey." *Barking Abbey and Medieval Literary Culture: Authorship and Authority in a Female Community*. 117-134. Wogan-Browne writes that, "Because of the nature of the evidence, MacBain's case is possible rather than proven." "Women and Anglo-Norman Hagiography." 83, note 45.

---

<sup>71</sup> See Alex J. Novikoff, *The Medieval Culture of Disputation: Pedagogy, Practice, and Performance* (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2013); and David C. Lindberg, "The Revival of Learning in the West." *The Beginnings of Western Science: The European Scientific Tradition in Philosophical, Religious, and Institutional Context, Prehistory to A.D. 1450, Second Edition* (Chicago: U of Chicago P, 2010) 193-219. See also Cotts 2.

<sup>72</sup> Little 26-27. See also Paul B. Newman, "Formal Education." *Growing Up in the Middle Ages* (Jefferson: McFarland, 2007) 109-135.

<sup>73</sup> Cotts 10 and Newman 119. See also Nicolas Orme, "Lay Literacy in England, 1100-1300." *England and Germany in the High Middle Ages*. Ed. Alfred Haverkamp and Hannah Vollraith. (German Historical Institute London, 1996) 35-56.

<sup>74</sup> Marcia L. Colish, "Scholasticism and the Rise of Universities." *Medieval Foundations of the Western Intellectual Tradition, 400-1400* (New Haven: Yale UP, 1999) 265-273.

<sup>75</sup> For more on "Hagiographic Romance" see Brigitte Cazelle, *The Lady as Saint: A Collection of French Hagiographic Romances of the Thirteenth Century* (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1991).

<sup>76</sup> For a thorough analysis of courtly romance elements in Clemence's work See Catherine Batt, "Clemence of Barking's Transformations of Courtoisie in La Vie de Sainte Catherine d'Alexandrie." *New Comparison* 12 (1991): 102-23; and Duncan Robertson, "Writing in the Textual Community: Clemence of Barking's Life of St. Catherine." 5-28.

<sup>77</sup> Karen Sullivan, *Truth and the Heretic: Crises of Knowledge in Medieval French Literature* (Chicago: U of Chicago P, 2005) 190. For more on the twelfth-century *Chanson de Saint Alexis* as it relates to romance, see Cazelle 32; and Neil Cartlidge, "The Chanson of Saint Alexis and its Treatment of Marriage." *Medieval Marriage: Literary Approaches, 1100-1300* (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 1997) 91-98.

<sup>78</sup> Ian Short, "Language and Literature." *A Companion to the Anglo-Norman World*. Ed. Christopher Harper-Bill and Elisabeth Van Houts. (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2007) 191-215.

<sup>79</sup> *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Women's Writing*. Ed. Carolyn Dinshaw and David Wallace. (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2003) 91-108.

<sup>80</sup> June Hall McCash, "The Role of Women in the Rise of the Vernacular." *Comparative Literature* 60.1, 2008, 45.

<sup>81</sup> Maud Burnett McInerney, "Catherine and Margaret: Vernacular Virgins and the *Golden Legend*." *Eloquent Virgins: The Rhetoric of Virginity from Thecla to Joan of Arc* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003) 180

---

<sup>82</sup> For more on the literacy of women at this time compared to the Anglo-Saxon period, see Elizabeth Robertson, *Early English Devotional Prose and the Female Audience* 16, 22-24. For Barking Abbey specifically, see Wogan-Browne and Burgess xxvi-xxvii; and Duncan Robertson 6-7.

<sup>83</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xxviii.

<sup>84</sup> Wogan-Browne and Burgess xxiii.

<sup>85</sup> The Modern English translation I will be using is Jocelyn Wogan-Browne and Glyn Burgess *Virgin Lives and Holy Deaths: Two Exemplary Biographies for Anglo-Norman Women*.

<sup>86</sup> See Barbara Zimbalist 119-120.

<sup>87</sup> MacBain believes that Clemence deemed the modern audience too immoral to appreciate the Vulgate 46.

<sup>88</sup> Patschovsky 117.

<sup>89</sup> On the term “Pragmatic Literacy”, Patschovsky borrows from M.B. Parkes, “The Literacy of the Laity.” *Literature and Western Civilization: The Medieval World*. Ed. D. Daiches and A. Thorlby. (London: Aldus, 1973) 555-77. In her essay, “Were Women Able to Read and Write in the Middle Ages?” Helen Conrad-O’Briain notes this term could be very broad. *Misconceptions About the Middle Ages*. Ed. Stephen Harris and Bryon L. Grigsby. (New York: Routledge 2010) 236.

<sup>90</sup> Patschovsky 113 and Sullivan 192.

<sup>91</sup> For a picture of the will, see Patschovsky 115.

<sup>92</sup> Patschovsky notes Samuel Berger’s point that other translations were most likely occurring at roughly the same time as Valdes’ translation, 116 8 n. The texts that Patschovsky derives his information from are Samuel Berger, *La Bible francaise au moyen age* (Paris, 1184) 49 and Berger, “Les bibles provencales et vaudoises.” *Romania* 18 (1889), 353-422. Like Patchovsky and Berger, Fichtenau notes the liege priest Lambert’s contemporaneous translation for some Beguine women under his tutelage, not only of the Acts of the Apostles but also the legend of St. Agnes *Heretics and Scholars in the High Middle Ages* 67.

<sup>93</sup> I have borrowed this point from Jarrette Allen 5-6.

<sup>94</sup> Allen 6-7.

<sup>95</sup> Allen 6-7.

<sup>96</sup> Allen 6.

---

<sup>97</sup> For more on the Ubi Sunt theme see Clinton Atchley and Michelle M. Sauer, "Ubi Sunt." *The Facts on File Companion to British Poetry Before 1600*. (Infobase Publishing, 2008) 447. A famous example of the Ubi Sunt theme is the poem, "The Wanderer." Wogan-Browne and Burgess point to A.R. Harden, "The 'Ubi Sunt' Theme in Three Anglo-Norman Lives" *Romance Notes*, I (1959): 53-5 *Virgin Lives and Holy Deaths* 62, note 4.

<sup>98</sup> See my note 53.

<sup>99</sup> *A Companion to Middle English Hagiography*. Ed. Sarah Salih. (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2006). 87-103.

<sup>100</sup> Ed. Jocelyn Wogan-Browne and Bella Millett, *Medieval English Prose for Women: From the Katherine Group and Ancrene Wisse* xx-xxii.

<sup>101</sup> For more on the development of the concept of the *miles Christi*, see Katherine Allen Smith, *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture* (Woodbridge: Boydell, 2011). Katherine Hill McKinley views Katherine as a *miles Christi*, but with intellect being her weapon, "Clemence of Barking's The Life of St. Catherine." 39-40.

<sup>102</sup> Elizabeth Robertson notes St. Anselm's influence on this scene in a Middle English version of St. Katherine in *Early English Devotional Prose and the Female Audience* 103-104. However, Wogan-Browne and Burgess distinguish Clemence from the ME version, believing that, "Clemence maintains a more Anselmian stress on the redemption of humanity in Christ's humanity." Wogan-Browne and Burgess 71 and 72, note 47. For a deeper analysis of St. Anselm's influence on Clemence, see Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Sibyls and soteriology: The Voices of Clemence of Barking." *Saints' Lives and Women's Literary Culture C. 1150-1300: Virginity and Its Authorizations* (Oxford: Oxford UP, 2001) 227-244.

<sup>103</sup> For a more comprehensive survey on the history of warfare and its affect on the different classes in twelfth-century Europe, see John France, "Medieval Irregular Warfare, c. 1000-1300." *Journal of Medieval Military History: Volume 14*. Eds., John France, Kelly DeVries, Clifford J. Rogers Richard. (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2016) 123-132. See also Richard W. Kaeuper, *Chivalry and Violence in Medieval Europe* (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2009).

<sup>104</sup> Little 122.

<sup>105</sup> The translation of this speech from the Laon narrative is provided by James Harvey Robinson, *From the Breaking Up of the Roman Empire to the Protestant Revolt*. Vol.1 of *Readings in European History: A collection of extracts from the sources chosen with the purpose of illustrating the progress of culture in Western Europe since the German Invasions*. 2 Vols. (Boston: Ginn, 1904) 381. I prefer this translation to the one provided by *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*.

<sup>106</sup> See Cazelle 67-68.



- 
- <sup>107</sup> This is a part of the theme of transience found in the *Ubi Sunt* theme.
- <sup>108</sup> *A Companion to Middle English Hagiography* 70-86.
- <sup>109</sup> Wogan Browne and Burgess 72, note 49.
- <sup>110</sup> Wogan Browne and Burgess 77, note 82.
- <sup>111</sup> Wogan Browne and Burgess 77 and 78, note 85.
- <sup>112</sup> Duncan Robertson uses the term “active participants” to describe the audience 25.
- <sup>113</sup> Duncan Robertson 11. See also Samantha Katz, “To Speak of Silence: Clemence of Barking’s Life of St. Catherine and Her Vision of Female Wisdom.” *Magistra* 16. 2 (2010) 12
- <sup>114</sup> Anonymous of Laon from *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 200-202.
- <sup>115</sup> Tolonen gives a similar summary 167. For the exemplum passage, see Michel Rubellin and Olivier Legendre, “Valdes: un exemple a Clairvaux? Le plus ancien texte sur les debuts du pauvre de Lyon.” *Eglise et société chrétienne d'Agobard a Valdès* 502-503. The chapter was published as an article in *Revue Mabillon* 11 (2000): 187-195.
- <sup>116</sup> Rubellin and Legendre 506; and Tolonen 168.
- <sup>117</sup> Jennifer Kolpacoff Deane, *A History of Medieval Heresy and Inquisition* (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2011) 59-60. See also Tolonen 167-168.
- <sup>118</sup> Andrew Roach, *The Devil's World* 79.
- <sup>119</sup> Roach 79.
- <sup>120</sup> Deane 59-60; and Tolonen 167.
- <sup>121</sup> For a more thorough analysis on how Aristotelian thought affected Medieval women specifically, see Elizabeth Robertson 132-143. See also William F. MacLehose, “Aristotelian Concepts of Women and Gender.” *Women and Gender in Medieval Europe: An Encyclopedia* 35-36.
- <sup>122</sup> For more information regarding women in the Middle Ages see *The Oxford Handbook of Women and Gender in Medieval Europe*. Ed. Judith M. Bennett and Ruth Mazo Karras (Oxford: Oxford UP 2013).
- <sup>123</sup> Elizabeth Robertson 15-16.
- <sup>124</sup> Elizabeth Robertson, “An Anchorhold of Her Own: The anchoress in Thirteenth-Century England.”

---

<sup>125</sup> Jocelyn Wogan-Browne notes the significance of the all female dynamic, "Sibyls and soteriology: The Voices of Clemence of Barking." 227. See also Duncan Robertson 17.

<sup>126</sup> Catherine Sanok, *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints' Lives in Late Medieval England* (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2007) 1-2. The glossary in Susan Signe-Morrison *A Medieval Woman's Companion: Women's Lives in the European Middle Ages* (Oxford: Oxbow Books, 2015) gives the definition of Virgin Martyr as, "Maiden who fearlessly stands up to authority and dies for her faith, retaining her purity and defying male authority." n. pag.

<sup>127</sup> Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Women and Anglo-Norman Hagiography." 68.

<sup>128</sup> According to Wogan-Browne and Burgess this was a term used for religious women at this time. Clemence added this word to the translation 76, note 77.

<sup>129</sup> He also discusses how, while this may seem like a feminist message, Clemence was actually trying to reinforce the values of the Church, Duncan Robertson 17-18.

<sup>130</sup> For more on this see Duncan Robertson 17-18.

<sup>131</sup> Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, "Saints' Lives and the Female Reader." *Forum for Modern Language Studies* 27.4 (1991) 314-32; Karen Winstead, *Virgin Martyrs: Legends of Sainthood in Late Medieval England*; Catherine Sanok, *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints' Lives in Late Medieval England*; Larissa Tracy, *Torture and Brutality in Medieval Literature: Negotiations of National Identity* 64-66.

<sup>132</sup> Winstead 115

<sup>133</sup> Ruth Evans and Lesley Johnson, "Introduction." *Feminist Readings in Middle English Literature: The Wife of Bath and All Her Sect* (London: Routledge, 1994) 16.

<sup>134</sup> Valdes' simple allowance of women in his sect was not entirely unique, for the Cathars not only permitted women to participate but made them perfects. But Valdes' welcoming of women should be studied from a different, and perhaps more positive, perspective than the Cathar's allowances regarding women perfects. Peter Biller believes that the Cathars' repulsion for the human body renders female participation a dishonor. Peter Biller, "Through a Glass Darkly: seeing Medieval Heresy." *The Medieval World*. Ed. Peter Linehan and Janet L. Nelson. (Oxon: Routledge, 2013) 322.

<sup>135</sup> Little 79; and Alcuin Blarnires, *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997) 184.

<sup>136</sup> For the source documents concerning Henry and Tanchelm's supposed relationships with female followers and other women, see *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 101, 109 111, 112, 124.

---

<sup>137</sup> For Geoffroy of Auxerre's account, see Jean LeClercq, "Le temoignage de Geoffroy d'Auxerre sur la vie cistercienne." *Analecta Monastica 2, Studia Anselmiana* 31 (1953) 179-180.

<sup>138</sup> Kienzle 101-102.

<sup>139</sup> Kienzle 103-106.

<sup>140</sup> Kienzle 103-106

<sup>141</sup> Patricia Skinner and Elisabeth Van Houts, *Medieval Writings on Secular Women* (London: Penguin Books, 2011) 113-118. For more on dowries in the Middle Ages Europe see Susan Mosher Stuard, "Brideprice, Dowry, and Other Marital Assigns." (*The Oxford Handbook of Women and Gender in Medieval Europe*) 148-162.

<sup>142</sup> Amy Livingstone, "Aristocratic Women in the Chartrain." *Aristocratic Women in Medieval France*. Ed. Theodore Evergates. (Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1999) 53. See also Kathryn Reyerson, "Urban Economies." (*The Oxford Handbook of Women and Gender in Medieval Europe*) 300-301.

<sup>143</sup> Michael Sheehan, "Choice of Marriage Partner in the Middle Ages: Development and Mode of Application of a Theory of Marriage." *Medieval Families: Perspectives on Marriage, Household, & Children*. Ed. Carol Neel. (Toronto: U of Toronto P, 2004) 161-166. See also Martha Howell, "Marriage in Medieval Latin Christendom." *A Companion to the Medieval World* 130-160.

<sup>144</sup> For a deeper analysis of Gratian and Lombard's contribution to the changing dynamics of marriage, see Michael Sheehan 161-166.

<sup>145</sup> Sheehan 166.

<sup>146</sup> Vauchez also notes that clerical celibacy was not always practiced and clerical marriages were not always punished.

<sup>147</sup> MacBain 57.

<sup>148</sup> MacBain 53-60.

<sup>149</sup> Katherine Hill McKinley 19

<sup>150</sup> McBain 62

<sup>151</sup> Duncan Robertson 21.

<sup>152</sup> For more discussion on this see R.N. Swanson, "The Burdens of Purgatory." *Medieval Christianity* 353-380; and Arnold Angenendt, "Fear, Hope, Death, and Salvation." (Trans. Theo Riches) *The Oxford Handbook of Medieval Christianity*. 289-304.

---

<sup>153</sup> Zimbalist 123.

<sup>154</sup> Froese on how Clemence structured Catherine in relation to authority, “Clemence’s method is subversive though her aim remains inclusive” (90).

<sup>155</sup> For the translated source document, see “Dissent between the Poor Lombards and the Poor of Lyons.” *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 279-289. It was translated from William Preger, “Beitrage zur Geschichte der Waldesier im Mittelalter.” *Abhandlungen der historischen Classe der koniglich bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften*, 13 (Munich, 1877), 231-41. Wakefield and Evans also cite Giovanni Gonnet, *Enchiridion fontium Valdensium. recueil critique des sources concernant les Vaudois au moyen age, Du IIIe Concile de Latran au Synode de Chanforan, (1179-1532), aux soins De G. Gonnet, Etc.* (Torre Pellice: Claudiana, 1958) 169-83. The letter indicates that Valdes was alive in the thirteenth century and mentions how he was vehemently opposed to the Italian fractions working.

<sup>156</sup> Audisio 27-28; and Merlo 244-245.

<sup>157</sup> Wogan –Browne and Burgess xxiv.

<sup>158</sup> Katz 8. See also Froese 40.

<sup>159</sup> For English lives of St. Katherine see Jennifer Bray, “The Legend of St. Katherine in Later Middle English Literature.” Diss, University of London, 1984. For other Anglo-Norman and French lives see E.C. Fawtier-Jones, ‘Les Vies de Sainte Catherined’ *Alexandrie en ancien francais’ Romania* 56 (1930).

<sup>160</sup> For more detail regarding the history of scholarship of *Ancrene Wisse* and the Katherine group, which features the Middle English St. Katherine, see *Annotated Bibliographies of Old and Middle English Literature Volume II: Ancrene Wisse, The Katherine Group, and the Wooing Group* (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 1996) 5-15.

<sup>161</sup> Miri Rubin, “Religious Symbols and Political Culture in Fifteenth-Century England.” *The Fifteenth Century IV: Political Culture in Late Medieval Britain*. Ed. Linda Clark, Christine Carpenter. (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2004) 102.

<sup>162</sup> Katz 6

<sup>163</sup> See Tiffany J. Werth, “Saint or Martyr? Reforming the Romance Heroine in the *New Arcadia* and *Pericles*.” *The Fabulous Dark Cloister: Romance in England After the Reformation*. (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 2011) 60-96.

<sup>164</sup> For the source document by Bernard Gui see the translation in *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 386-387.

---

<sup>165</sup> John Foxe, George Townsend, *The Acts and Monuments of John Foxe: A New and Complete Edition* (R. B. Seeley and W. Burnside, sold by L. & G. Seeley, 1837) 264. For more information on the influence Valdes' story and the Waldensians had on Flacius see Luka Ilic, *Theologian of Sin and Grace: The Process of Radicalization in the Theology of Matthias Flacius Illyricus* (Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2014) 122.

<sup>166</sup> Tolonen 181-182. For more discussion see Peter Biller, 'The Anti-Waldensian Treatise Cum Dormirent Homines of 1395 and Its Author.' (*The Waldenses 1170–1530, Between a Religious Order and a Church*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001) 237-269.

<sup>167</sup> Tolonen 174.

<sup>168</sup> See Samuel Morland, *History of the Evangelical Churches of Piedmont* (1658); Jean Leger, *Histoire Generale des Eglises Evangeliques des Vallees de Piemont* (1669); Joseph Milner, *The History of the Church of Christ* (published in numerous volumes from the late 18<sup>th</sup> century to the early 19<sup>th</sup> century); Samuel Maitland, *Facts and Documents Illustrative of the History, Doctrine, and Rites of the Ancient Albigenses and Waldenses* (1832); Pius Melia, *The Origin Persecution and Doctrines of the Waldenses from Documents* (1870); J. A. Wylie, *The History of the Waldenses* (1880). For more on Waldensian Historiography see Dennis McCallum, "The Waldensian Movement from Waldo to the Reformation." *Xenos Christian Fellowship*

<sup>169</sup> For early 20<sup>th</sup> century commentary on Valdes of Lyon as a precursor to St. Francis, see Bernard Marthaler, "Forerunners of the Franciscans." *Franciscan Studies* 18. 2 (1958): 133-142; Ellen Scott Davison *Some Forerunners of St. Francis of Assisi* (Columbia Univeristy, 1907); and G.G. Coulton, "Precursors of St. Francis." *The Friars and the Dead Weight of Tradition, 1200-1400 A.D.* Vol. 2 of *Five Centuries of Religion*. 4 Vols (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1927). For a more recent analysis see Kevin Madigan, *Medieval Christianity* (New Haven: Yale UP, 2015) 189-190.

<sup>170</sup> See Biller, "Goodbye to Waldensianism?"

<sup>171</sup> Melia 27. Melia takes the passage from "Adversus errores et sectam Valdensium." (edition of Paris, 1520).

<sup>172</sup> Grado Merlo makes a similar point in "Heresy and Dissent", noting Valdes' role in the movement was often overlooked for the "far more appealing and empowering" ancient origins story 245.

<sup>173</sup> See the Anonymous of Laon's account in *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 203. See also Walter Map's account from *De nugis curialium* translated in *Heresies of the High Middle Ages* 203-204.

<sup>174</sup> Madigan 188.

<sup>175</sup>

<sup>175</sup> Zimbalist 119. Zimbalist suggests that if Clemence did have this fear, it may have unwarranted due to the high amount of lives of St. Catherine being produced.

---

## WORKS CITED

- Allen, Jarrette. "La Bible en occitan: The Cathars, the Waldensians, and the Heretical Origins of the Reformation in Lyon." *Academia.edu*. Web. Accessed April 30, 2017.
- Arnold, John, ed. *The Oxford Handbook of Medieval Christianity*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2014. Print.
- Audisio, Gabriel. *Waldensian Dissent: Persecution and Survival, C.1170-c.1570*. Trans. by Claire Davison. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1999. Print.
- . *Preachers by Night: The Waldensian Barbes, 15th-16th Centuries*. Trans. by Claire Davison. Leiden: Brill, 2007. Print.
- Barber, Malcolm. *Two Cities: Medieval Europe, 1050-1320*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. London: Routledge, 2004. Print.
- Bartlett, Robert. *England under the Norman and Angevin Kings, 1075-1225*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2000. Print.
- Bassano, Marie. "Normativer l'Anormal: l'Esprit Juridique Des Sommes Anti-Vaudois De La Fin Du XIIe Siecle." *Revue De l'Histoire Des Religions* 228.4 (2011): 541-566. Print.
- Batt, Catherine. "Clemence of Barking's Transformations of Courtoisie in La Vie de Sainte Catherine d'Alexandrie." *New Comparison* 12 (1991): 102-23. Print.
- . "The French of the English and Early British Women's Literary Culture." *The History of British Women's Writing, 700-1500: Volume One*. Ed. Liz Herbert McAvoy and Diane Watt Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2012. 51-59. Print.
- Bennett, Judith M. and Ruth Mazo Karras, eds. *The Oxford Handbook of Women and Gender in Medieval Europe*. Oxford: Oxford UP 2013. Print.
- Berger, Samuel. *La Bible Française Au Moyen Âge: Etude Sur Les plus Anciennes Versions De La Bible Écrites En Prose De Langue D'oïl*. Genève: Slatkine Reprints, 1967. Print.
- Biller, Peter, A. J. Minnis, and Eamon Duffy, eds. *Medieval Theology and the Natural Body*. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 1997. Print.
- Biller, Peter. "Goodbye to Waldensianism?" *Past & Present* 192 (2006): 3-33. Print.

- 
- . *The Waldenses, 1170-1530: Between a Religious Order and a Church*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001. Print.
- Bisson, Thomas. *The Crisis of the Twelfth Century: Power, Lordship, and the Origins of European Government*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 2009. Print.
- Blamires, Alcuin. *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997. Print.
- . "Women and Preaching in Medieval Orthodoxy, Heresy, and Saints' Lives." *Viator* 26 (1995): 135-52. Print.
- Bornstein, Daniel Ethan, and Denis R. Janz, eds. *Medieval Christianity*. Vol.4 of *A People's History of Christianity*. 7 vols. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2007. Print.
- Bouchard, Constance Brittain. *Rewriting Saints and Ancestors: Memory and Forgetting in France, 500-1200*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2014. Print.
- Brock, Peter. *Freedom from Violence: Sectarian Nonresistance from the Middle Ages to the Great War*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1991. Print
- Brown, Jennifer N., and Donna Alfano Bussell, eds. *Barking Abbey and Medieval Literary Culture: Authorship and Authority in a Female Community*. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2012. Print.
- Burton, Janet E., and Julie Kerr. *The Cistercians in the Middle Ages*. Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2011. Print.
- Campbell, Emma. *Medieval Saints' Lives: The Gift, Kinship and Community in Old French Hagiography*. Cambridge: D.S. Brewer, 2008. Print.
- Cameron, Euan. *Waldenses: Rejections of Holy Church in Medieval Europe*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2001. Print.
- Cartlidge, Neil. *Medieval Marriage: Literary Approaches, 1100-1300*. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 1997. Print.
- Casper, Giles E.M and Svein H. Gullbeck, eds. *Money and the Church in Medieval Europe, 1000-1200: Practice, Morality and Thought*. London: Routledge, 2016. Print
- Cazelles, Brigitte. *The Lady as Saint: A Collection of French Hagiographic Romances of the Thirteenth Century*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1991. Print.
- Clemence of Barking, William MacBain, ed. *The Life of St. Catherine by Clemence of Barking*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell for the Anglo-Norman Text Society, 1964. Print.

- 
- Clanchy, M. T. *From Memory to Written Record: England, 1066-1307*. Cambridge: Harvard UP, 1979. Print.
- Colish, Marcia L. *Studies in Scholasticism*. Aldershot: Ashgate Variorum, 2006. Print.
- Comba, Emilio. *History of the Waldenses of Italy, from Their Origin to the Reformation*. Translated by Teofilo Ernest Comba. London: Truslove & Shirley, 1889. Print.
- Constable, Giles. *The Reformation of the Twelfth Century*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1998. Print.
- Cotts, John D. *Europe's Long Twelfth Century Order, Anxiety and Adaptation, 1095-1229*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. Print.
- Coulton, George Gordon. "The Precursors of St. Francis." *The Friars and the Dead Weight of Tradition, 1200-1400 A.D.* Vol. 2 of *Five Centuries of Religion*. 4 Vols. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1927. Print.
- Crane, Susan. "Anglo-Norman Cultures in England, 1066-1460." *The Cambridge History of Medieval English Literature*. Ed. David Wallace. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2002. 35-60. Print.
- Cross, Frank Leslie, and Elizabeth A. Livingstone, eds. *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church*. Rev. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2005. Print.
- Davison, Ellen Scott. *Some Forerunners of St. Francis of Assisi*. Diss. Columbia University, 1907. *Google Books*. Web. 8 May 2017.
- Deane, Jennifer Kolpacoff. *A History of Medieval Heresy and Inquisition*. Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2011. Print.
- Dondaine, Antoine. *Aux origines du valdésisme: une profession de foi de Valdès, par Antoine Dondaine*. *Archivum Fratrum Praedicatorum* 16 (1946): 191-235. Print.
- Elkins, Sharon K. *Holy Women of Twelfth-Century England*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1988. Print.
- Epstein, Steven. *An Economic and Social History of Later Medieval Europe, 1000-1500*. 1st ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2009. Print.
- Fichtenau, Heinrich. *Heretics and Scholars in the High Middle Ages, 1000-1200*. Trans. by Denise A. Kaiser. University Park: Pennsylvania State UP, 1998. Print.
- Foster, Tara. "Clemence of Barking: Reshaping the Legend of Saint Catherine of Alexandria." *Women's Writing* 12.1 (2005): 13-28. Print.



- 
- France, John. "Medieval Irregular Warfare, c. 1000-1300." *Journal of Medieval Military History: Volume 14*. Eds. John France, Kelly DeVries, Clifford J. Rogers. Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2016. Print.
- Froese, Gina J. "Rooting, Subverting, and Reclaiming: An Analysis of Clemence of Barking's Catherine of Alexandria as a Pre-modern Gendered Text." MA Thesis. University of Alberta, 2014. *ERA: University of Alberta Libraries*. Web. 8 May 2017.
- Gaunt, Simon. *Gender and Genre in Medieval French Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1995. Print.
- ., and Sarah Kay, eds. *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval French Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2008. Print.
- Gillingham, John. *The English in the Twelfth Century: Imperialism, National Identity, and Political Values*. Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer Ltd, 2000. Print.
- Gonnet, Giovanni. *Enchiridion fontium Valdensium. recueil critique des sources concernant les Vaudois au moyen age, Du IIIe Concile de Latran au Synode de Chanforan, (1179-1532), aux soins De G. Gonnet, Etc.* Torre Pellice: Claudiana, 1958. Print.
- ., Jean Gonnet, and Amedeo Molnar. *Les Vaudois au Moyen Age*. Torino: Claudiana, 1974. Print.
- Griffiths, Fiona J. *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2007. Print
- Harper-Bill, Christopher, and Elisabeth M. C. Van Houts, eds. *A Companion to the Anglo-Norman World*. Paperback Ed. Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2007. Print.
- Hastings, Adrian, Alistair Mason, and Hugh S. Pyper, eds. *The Oxford Companion to Christian Thought*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000. Print.
- Head, Thomas, ed. *Medieval Hagiography: An Anthology*. New York: Routledge, 2001. Print.
- Hilligus, Annegret Helen. *Die Katharinenlegende von Clemence de Barking: Eine Anglo-Normannische Fassung aus dem 12. Jahrhundert*. Tübingen: Gunter Narr Verlag, 1996. Print
- Jamroziak, Emilia. *The Cistercian Order in Medieval Europe: 1090- 1500*. New York: Routledge, 2013. Print.
- Jenkins, Jacqueline, and Katherine J. Lewis, eds. *St. Katherine of Alexandria: Texts and Contexts in Western Medieval Europe*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2003. Print.

- 
- Johnston, William M, ed. *Encyclopedia of Monasticism*. Chicago: Fitzroy Dearborn, 2000. Print.
- Kaeuper, Richard W. *Holy Warriors: The Religious Ideology of Chivalry*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2009. Print.
- Katz, Samantha L. "To Speak of Silence: Clemence of Barking's Life of St. Catherine and Her Vision of Female Wisdom." *Magistra* 16. 2 (2010): 3-25. Print.
- Kienzle, Beverly Mayne. *Cistercians, Heresy, and Crusade in Occitania, 1145-1229: Preaching in the Lord's Vineyard*. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2001. Print.
- . "The Prostitute-Preacher: Patterns of Polemic against Medieval Waldensian Women Preachers." *Women Preachers and Prophets through Two Millennia of Christianity*. Ed. Beverly Mayne Kienzle and Pamela J. Walker. Berkeley: U of California P, 1998. 99-113. Print.
- . "Holiness and Obedience: Denouncement of Twelfth Century Waldensian Lay Preaching." *The Devil, Heresy, and Witchcraft in the Middle Ages: Essays in Honor of Jeffrey B. Russell*. Ed. Alberto Ferreiro. Leiden: Brill, 1998. 259-278. Print.
- Knust, Hermann. *Geschichte der legenden der h. Katharina von Alexandrien und der h. Maria Aegyptiaca nebst unedirten texten*. Halle: M. Niemeyer, 1890. 231-314. *Google Books*. Web. 8 May 2017.
- Krueger, Roberta L., ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Romance*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000. Print
- Lansing, Carol, and Edward D. English, eds. *A Companion to the Medieval World*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2009. Print.
- Leclercq, Jean. *The Love of Learning and the Desire for God: A Study of Monastic Culture*. New York: Fordham UP, 1961. Print.
- . "Le temoignage de Geoffroy d'Auxerre sur la vie cistercienne." *Analecta Monastica* 2. *Studia Anselmiana* 31 (1953): 174-201. Print.
- Lees, Clare A., ed. with the assistance of Thelma S. Fenster, and Jo Ann McNamara. *Medieval Masculinities: Regarding Men in the Middle Ages*. Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1994. Print.
- Legendre, Olivier. "Le Liber Visionum et Miraculorum Édition du Manuscrit N° 946 de la Bibliothèque Municipale de Troyes." Thesis. Histoire. Ecole nationale des chartes, 2000. <tel-01142504> Web. 8 May 2017.

- 
- Legge, M. Dominica. *Anglo-Norman Literature and its Background*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1963. Print.
- Little, Lester K. *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe*. Cornell UP, 1983. Print.
- MacBain, William "Five Old Renderings of the Passio Sancte Katerine Virginis." *Medieval Translators and Their Craft*. Ed. Jeanette Beer. Studies in Medieval Culture 25. Kalamazoo: University of Western Michigan, Medieval Institute Publications, 1989. 41-63. Print
- . "The Literary Apprenticeship of Clemence of Barking." *AUMLA Journal of the Australian Universities Languages and Literature Association* 9 (1958): 3-22. Print.
- . "Anglo-Norman Women Hagiographers." *Anglo-Norman Anniversary Essays*, ed. Ian Short. London: ANTS, Occasional Publications, 1993. 235-250. Print.
- Madigan, Kevin. *Medieval Christianity: A New History*. New Haven: Yale UP, 2015. Print.
- Maitland, Samuel Roffey. *Facts and Documents Illustrative of the History, Doctrine and Rites, of the Ancient Albigenses & Waldenses*. London: Rivington, 1832. Print.
- Marthaler, Bernard, "Forerunners of the Franciscans: The Waldenses." *Franciscan Studies* 18.2 (1958): 133-42. Print.
- Mayr-Harting, Henry. *Religion, Politics and Society in Britain, 1066-1272*. Harlow: Longman, 2011. Print.
- McAvoy, Liz Herbert, ed. *Anchoritic Traditions of Medieval Europe*. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2010. Print.
- McCallum, Dennis. "The Waldensian Movement From Waldo to the Reformation." *Xenos Christian Fellowship*. Web. 17 May 2016. <[xenos.org/essays/waldensian-movement-waldo-reformation](http://xenos.org/essays/waldensian-movement-waldo-reformation)>
- McCash, June Hall. "The Role of Women in the Rise of the Vernacular." *Comparative Literature* 60.1 (2008): 45-57. Print.
- McGuire, Brian Patrick. *Friendship and Faith: Cistercian Men, Women, and Their Stories, 1100-1250*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2002. Print.
- . *A Companion to Bernard of Clairvaux*. Leiden: Brill, 2011. Print.

- 
- McInerney, Maud Burnett. "Catherine and Margaret: Vernacular Virgins and the *Golden Legend*." *Eloquent Virgins: The Rhetoric of Virginity from Thecla to Joan of Arc*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2003. 165-194. Print.
- Mckinley, Katherine Hill. "Clemence of Barking's The Life of St. Catherine." *Ciceronian Rhetoric and the Art of Medieval French Hagiography*. Diss. University of Maryland, 2007.19-58. *DRUM-University of Maryland*. Web. 8 May 8, 2017.
- Melia, Pius. *The Origin Persecution and Doctrines of the Waldenses from Documents, Many Now the First Time Collected and Edited*. London: James Toovey, 1870. *Google Books*. Web. 8 May 2017.
- Merlo, Giovanni Grado. *Valdo: L'eretico Di Lione*. Torino: Claudiana, 2010. Print.
- . *Valdesi e valdismi medievali, vol I: Itinerari e proposte di ricerca*. (Studi Storici). Turin: Claudiana, 1984. Print.
- . *Valdesi e Valdismi medievali, vol. II: Identita valdesi nella storia e storiographia: Studi e discussioni*. Turin: Claudiana, 1991. Print.
- Mitchell, Emily. "Patrons and Politics at Twelfth-Century Barking Abbey." *Revue Benedictine* 113 (2003): 347-364. Print.
- Millett, Bella, and Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, eds. *Medieval English Prose for Women: Selections from the Katherine Group and Ancrene Wisse*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990. Print.
- Minnis, A. J. *Translations of Authority in Medieval English Literature: Valuing the Vernacular*. 1st ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2009. Print.
- Mohr, Walter. "Waldes Und Das Frühe Waldensertum." *Zeitschrift Für Religions- Und Geistesgeschichte* 9.4 (1957): 337-63. Print.
- Mollat, Michel. *The Poor in the Middle Ages: An Essay in Social History*. Trans. by Arthur Goldhammer. New Haven: Yale UP, 1986. Print.
- Molnár, Amedeo, and Augusto Armand Hugon. *Storia Dei Valdesi*. Torino: Claudiana, 1974. Print.
- Moore, R.I. *The Origins of European Dissent*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1977. Print.
- . *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Authority and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250*. 2nd ed. Malden: Blackwell, 2007. Print.
- . *The War on Heresy*. Cambridge: Belknap of Harvard UP, 2012. Print.

- 
- Morton, Vera Petch and Jocelyn Wogan-Browne. *Guidance for Women in Twelfth-Century Convents*. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2003. Print.
- Mountford, Roxanne. *The Gendered Pulpit: Preaching in American Protestant Spaces*. Carbondale: SIU Press, 2003. Print
- Mula, Stefano. "Twelfth and Thirteenth-Century Cistercian Exempla Collections: Role, Diffusion, and Evolution: Cistercian Exempla." *Academia.edu*. Web. 20 May 2016.
- Noble, Thomas F.X., and John Van Engen, eds. *European Transformations: The Long Twelfth Century (ND Conf Medieval Studies)*. 1st ed. Notre Dame: U of Notre Dame P, 2012. Print.
- Newman, Paul B. *Growing up in the Middle Ages*. Jefferson: McFarland & Company, Inc., 2007. Print.
- Orme, Nicholas "Lay Literacy in England, 1100-1300." Ed. Alfred Haverkamp and Hanna Vollrath. *England and Germany in the High Middle Ages*. German Historical Institute London, 1996. 35-56. Print.
- Papini, Carlo. *Valdo Di Lione E I "poveri Nello Spirito": Il Primo Secolo Del Movimento Valdese, 1170-1270*. Torino: Claudiana, 2001. Print.
- Parkes, Malcolm B. "The Literacy of the Laity." Ed. D. Daiches and A. Thorlby. *Literature and Western Civilization: The Medieval World*. London: Aldus, 1973. 555-77. Print
- Paterson, Linda M. *The World of the Troubadors: Medieval Occitan Society, c.1100-c.1300*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1993. Print.
- Patschovsky, Alexander. "The Literacy of Waldensianism from Valdes to c. 1400." *Heresy and Literacy, 1000-1530*. Ed. Peter Biller and Anne Hudson. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996. 112-136. Print.
- Peters, Christine. *Patterns of Piety: Women, Gender, and Religion in Late Medieval and Reformation England*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2003. Print.
- Peters, Edward. *Heresy and Authority in Medieval Europe*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 1980. Print.
- Pouzet, Philippe. "Les Origines Lyonnaises De La Secte Des Vaudois." *Revue D'histoire De L'Église De France Rhex* 22.94 (1936): 5-37. Print.
- Purser, Toby. *Medieval England 1042-1228*. Oxford: Heinemann, 2004. Print.
- Ranft, Patricia. *Women in Western Intellectual Culture, 600-1500*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002. Print.

- 
- Riches, Samantha, ed. *Gender and Holiness Men, Women, and Saints in Late Medieval Europe*. Paperback ed. London: Routledge, 2011. Print.
- Roach, Andrew P. *The Devil's World: Heresy and Society, 1100-1300*. Harlow: Pearson Education, 2005. Print.
- Roach, Andrew P., and James R. Simpson. *Heresy and the Making of European Culture: Medieval and Modern Perspectives*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2013. Print.
- Robertson, Elizabeth Ann. *Early English Devotional Prose and the Female Audience*. Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 1990. Print.
- Robertson, Duncan. "Writing in the Textual Community: Clemence of Barking's Life of St. Catherine." *French Forum* 21.1 (1996): 5–28. Print.
- . *Medieval Saints' Lives. Spiritual Renewal and Old French Literature*. Lexington, Kentucky: French Forum, 1995. Print.
- Rubellin, Michel. *Eglise Et Société Chrétienne D'Agobard À Valdès*. Lyon: Presses Universitaires De Lyon, 2003. Print.
- Rubin, Miri. "Religious Symbols and Political Culture in Fifteenth-Century England." *The Fifteenth Century IV: Political Culture in Late Medieval Britain*. Ed. Linda Clark and Christine Carpenter. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2004. 97-111. Print.
- . *The Middle Ages: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: OUP, 2014. Print.
- Sackville, L. J. *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century: The Textual Representations*. Woodbridge: York Medieval Press, 2011. Print.
- Salih, Sarah. *A Companion to Middle English Hagiography*. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2006. Print.
- . *Versions of Virginity in Late Medieval England*. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2001. Print.
- Sanok, Catherine. *Her Life Historical: Exemplarity and Female Saints' Lives in Late Medieval England*. Philadelphia: U of Pennsylvania P, 2007. Print.
- Saurette, Marc. "Tracing the Twelfth-Century *Chronica* of Richard of Poitiers, Monk of Cluny." *Memini. Travaux et documents, Bulletin de la Société d'Études médiévales du Québec* 9-10 (2005/2006): 303–350. Print.
- Savage, Anne, and Nicholas Watson, eds. *Anchoritic Spirituality: Ancrene Wisse and Associated Works*. New York: Mahwah, 1991. Print.

- 
- Schaus, Margaret, ed. *Women and Gender in Medieval Europe: An Encyclopedia*. New York: Routledge, 2006. Print.
- Selge, Kurt-Victor. *Die Ersten Waldenser, mit Edition des Liber antiheresis des Durandus von Osca. Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte, 37*. Berlin: Walter De Gruyter, 1967. Print.
- Sheehan, Michael M. "Choice of Marriage Partner in the Middle Ages: Development and Mode of Application of a Theory of Marriage." *Medieval Families: Perspectives on Marriage, Household, and Children*. Ed. Carol Neel. Toronto: University of Toronto P, 2004. 157-191. Print.
- Smith, Katherine Allen. *War and the Making of Medieval Monastic Culture*. Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2011. Print.
- Stephens, Sonya. *A History of Women's Writing in France*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2000. Print.
- Stock, Brian. *The Implications of Literacy: Written Language and Models of Interpretation in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1983. Print.
- Sullivan, Karen. *Truth and the Heretic: Crises of Knowledge in Medieval French Literature*. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 2005. Print.
- Summit, Jennifer. "Women and Authorship." *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Women's Writing*. Ed. Carolyn Dinshaw and David Wallace. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2003. 91-108. Print
- Swanson, R. N. *The Routledge History of Medieval Christianity 1050-1500*. London: Routledge, 2015. Print.
- Thouzellier, Christine. *Catharisme Et Valdéisme En Languedoc À La Fin Du XIIIe Et Au Début Du XIIIe Siècle, Politique Pontificale-controverses*. Louvain: Éditions Nauwelaerts, 1969. Print.
- Tolonen, Pekka. "Medieval Memories of the Origins of the Waldensian Movement." *History and Religion: Narrating a Religious Past*. Ed. Bernd-Christian Otto, Susanne Rau, and Jorg Rupke. Berlin/Boston: W. de Gruyter, 2015. 166-83. Print.
- Tourn, Giorgio. *You are My Witnesses: The Waldensians Across 800 Years*. Torino: Claudiana, 1989. Print.
- Tracy, Larissa. *Torture and Brutality in Medieval Literature: Negotiations of National Identity*. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2012. Print

- 
- Van Houts, Elisabeth M.C. *Memory and Gender in Medieval Europe, 900-1200*. Toronto: U of Toronto P, 1999. Print.
- Vaudois Languedociens Et Pauvres Catholiques*. Toulouse: É. Privat, 1967. Print.
- Venarde, Bruce L. *Women's Monasticism and Medieval Society: Nunneries in France and England, 890-1215*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1997. Print.
- Verdat, Madeleine. "Nouvelles recherches sur l'origine et la vie lyonnaise de Valdo." *BSSV*, 125 (1969): 3-11. Print.
- Wakefield, Walter L., and Austin P. Evans. *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*. Rev. ed. New York: Columbia UP, 1991. Print.
- Wakefield, Walter L. "Notes on Some Antiheretical Writings of the Thirteenth Century." *Franciscan Studies* 27.1 (1967): 285-321. Print.
- Walsh, Christine. *The Cult of St Katherine of Alexandria in Early Medieval Europe*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2007. Print.
- Warren, Ann K. *Anchorites and Their Patrons in Medieval England*. Berkeley: U of California P, 1985. Print.
- Watt, Diane. "Legends and Lives of Women Saints (Late Tenth to Mid-Fifteenth Centuries)." *Medieval Women's Writing: Works by and for Women in England, 1100-1500*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007. 63-90. Print
- Winstead, Karen A. *Chaste Passions: Medieval English Virgin Martyr Legends*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 2000. Print.
- . *Virgin Martyrs: Legends of Sainthood in Late Medieval England*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1997. Print.
- Wogan-Browne, Jocelyn, Glyn S. Burgess, and Clemence of Barking. *Virgin Lives and Holy Deaths: Two Exemplary Biographies for Anglo-Norman Women*. London: J.M. Dent, 1996. Print.
- . " 'Clerc u lai, muine u dame': women and Anglo-Norman hagiography in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries." *Women and Literature in Britain: 1150-1500*. Ed. Carol M. Meale. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1996. 61-85. Print
- . "Sibyls and soteriology: The Voices of Clemence of Barking." *Saints' Lives and Women's Literary Culture C. 1150-1300: Virginity and Its Authorizations*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2001. 227-244. Print.



- 
- . "Saints' Lives and the Female Reader." *Forum for Modern Language Studies* 27.4 (1991): 314-32. Print.
- . "The Apple's Message: Some Post-Conquest Hagiographic Accounts of Textual Transmission" *Late Medieval Religious Texts and their Transmission: Essays in Honor of A.I. Doyle*. Ed. A.J. Minnis. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 1994. 39-54. Print.
- . "Wreaths of Thyme: Translatio and the Female Narrator in Anglo-Norman Hagiography." *The Medieval Translator IV*. Ed. Roger Ellis and Ruth Evans. Binghampton: State University of New York Press, 1994. 46-65. Print.
- . "The Virgin's Tale." *Feminist Readings in Middle English Literature: The Wife of Bath and All Her Sect*. Ed. Ruth Evans and Lesley Johnson. London: Routledge, 1994. 165-194. Print.
- . Fenster, Thelma and Delbert Russell, eds. *Vernacular Literary Theory From the French of Medieval England: Texts and Translations, c.1120-c.1450*. Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer, 2016. Print.
- Wright, Jonathan. *Heretics: The Creation of Christianity from the Gnostics to the Modern Church*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2011. Print.
- Zerner-Chardavoine, Monique. *Inventer L'hérésie ? Discours Polémiques Et Pouvoirs Avant L'Inquisition*. Nice: Centre d'Etudes Medievales, 1998. Print.
- Zimbalist, Barbara. "Imitating the Imagined: Clemence of Barking's Life of Saint Catherine." *Reading Memory and Identity in the Texts of Medieval European Holy Women*. Ed. M. Cotter-Lynch and B. Herzog. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. 105-35. Print.